A comparison of silent reading and listening through written recall and multiple choice type tests; grades 6 and 7.

Kelley, Elizabeth V

Boston University

http://hdl.handle.net/2144/10546

Boston University
Boston University
School of Education

Thesis

A Comparison of Silent Reading and Listening
through Written Recall and Multiple Choice Type Tests
Grades 6 and 7

Part I Submitted by:
Elizabeth V. Kelley
(Ph.B., Providence College, 1942)
Edmund F. Loughlin
(B.S. in Education, Boston University, 1948)

Part II Submitted by:
Audrey E. Gill
(B.S., Teachers College of Connecticut, 1943)
Vivian E. Monteith
(B.A., Benedict College, 1928)

In Partial Fulfillment of Requirements for the
Degree of Master of Education
1952
First Reader: Donald D. Durrell, Ed.D., Professor of Education
Boston University

Second Reader: B. Alice Crossley, Ed.D., Assistant Professor of
Education, Boston University
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Summary of Previous Research</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PART I — GRADE 6**

| III. Plan of Study | 11 |
| IV. Analysis of Data | 25 |
| V. Summary and Conclusions | 35 |

**PART II — GRADE 7**

| VI. Plan of Study | 38 |
| VII. Analysis of Data | 52 |
| VIII. Summary and Conclusions | 62 |
| IX. Suggestions for Further Research | 64 |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY | 66 |
| APPENDIX | 68 |
# LIST OF TABLES

## PART I

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Name of Stories</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Chronological and Mental Ages</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Comparison of Total Written Recall of Oral and Silent Presentations</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Comparison of Total Multiple Choice of Oral and Silent Presentations</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Comparison of Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Oral Presentations</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Comparison of Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Silent Presentations</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Comparison of Oral and Silent Presentations by Written Recall of Short Selections</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Comparison of Oral and Silent Presentations by Written Recall of Long Selections</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. Comparison of Oral and Silent Presentations by Written Recall of Long and Short Selections</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X. Comparison of Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Oral Presentation of Short Selections</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI. Comparison of Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Oral Presentation of Long Selections</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII. Comparison of Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Oral Presentations of Long and Short Selections</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIII. Comparison of Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Short Selections Presented Silently</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIV. Comparison of Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Long Selections Read Silently</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XV. Comparison of Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Silent Reading of Long and Short Selections</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF TABLES

## PART II

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Names of Stories</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Chronological and Mental Ages</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Comparison of Total Written Recall of Oral and Silent Presentations</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Comparison of Total Multiple Choice of Oral and Silent Presentations</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Comparison of Total Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Oral Presentation</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Comparison of Total Multiple Choice and Total Written Recall of Silent Presentation</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Comparison of Written Recall of Oral and Silent Presentation of Six Short Selections</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Comparison of Oral and Silent Presentations of Long Selections</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. Comparison of Oral and Silent Presentations by Written Recall of Long and Short Selections</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X. Comparison of Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Oral Presentation of Short Selections</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI. Comparison of Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Oral Presentation of Long Selections</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII. Comparison of Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Oral Presentations in Long and Short Selections</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIII. Comparison of Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Short Selections Presented Silently</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIV. Comparison of Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Long Selections Presented Silently</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XV. Comparison of Multiple Choice and Written Recall of Silent Presentation in Long and Short Selections</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this study is to determine by means of written recall and multiple choice type of test whether silent reading or listening is more effective. Classroom experience with children who have difficulty with recall indicates a need for improving recall. The fact that in every phase of life people have to interpret material heard and read makes apparent a need for improving recall. In discussing the relationship of recall to higher mental process Davis\(^1\) states, "Recall is one of the most common methods of measuring retention. Without retention there can be no basis for thinking nor ability to solve new problems as they arise."

Because of the importance of listening ability in life situations and because of the fact that we have little knowledge of what will help us to know why it is that some people can produce with exacting accuracy a story heard while others find it very difficult to reproduce even the main ideas, it seems important to investigate its use in teaching.

Paul T. Rankin\(^2\) says, "Listening, or ability to understand spoken language, is the most frequently used of the language arts."

---

McKee says:

Because the school presents meaning for the most part in the form of language—oral and written, pupils and students at all levels must be able to make adequate meaning for the language they see and hear. In addition, they must be able to speak and write with enough clearness to enable other people to make the meanings they present in speaking and writing.

This study is an attempt to:

1. Compare written recall of silent reading and listening.
2. Compare multiple choice responses of silent reading and listening.
3. Compare multiple choice and written recall of listening.
4. Compare multiple choice and written recall of silent reading.
5. Compare written recall of silent reading and listening of long and short selections.
6. Compare multiple choice and written recall of listening of long and short selections.
7. Compare multiple choice and written recall of silent reading in long and short selections.

---

CHAPTER II

SUMMARY OF PREVIOUS RESEARCH

Investigations in this particular phase of the language arts have been conducted with university students, adult populations, and public school populations.

The need for facility in recalling in writing material read silently and heard is clearly recognized by teachers of content subjects.

In an experimental study on retention, Spitzer¹ found that immediate recall in the form of a test is an effective method of aiding the retention of learning and should therefore be employed more frequently in the elementary school. His findings supported the fact that a single immediate recall upon retention of factual material enabled students to remember more for two months than was remembered without recall for twenty-four hours.

Germane and Germane² in a discussion of the value of silent reading, say, "It is the ability to retain or recall the points of material read which make the acquisitions and application of knowledge possible. Time and effort spent in developing the skill in rapid reading and in organization are wasted unless the essential ideas are retained."

The significance of reading and listening are apparent in the


I

statements by Dawson¹ when she says,

Intrinsically, reading and listening are much alike. They represent the intake of aspects of the language arts progress. In both situations, the child is following the discourse of another in order to gain information, to achieve understanding, to locate and get a many sided view of issues, to select the main points in the development of a theme or merely to be entertained. Knowledge gained through both reading and listening are second hand; yet, each is active not passive. The reader and listener must react to the printed and the spoken word.

Authorities in the field of reading agree that the ability to produce written recall of material read is one of the important skills that should be learned by children in the middle grades. Contained within this ability to recall are the abilities of locating, selecting, evaluating, organizing, and presenting ideas read.

The following quotations support these statements. Gray² states, "While the importance of recall is generally recognized by psychologists and investigators of problems in reading, it is generally ignored both by pupils and teacher."

McKee³ writes that the outcome of reading should be to give the child ability to locate, select, evaluate, organize, and present. If the child learns to organize his thinking in terms of what he has read, he will be able to present ideas in logical order.

---


The manner of children's thinking is another consideration in the psychology of recalling. Dawson\(^1\) observes that young children sense best an organization based on time sequence: older children can determine the main points in a discourse, make a mental outline of what they hear; or, at least they should have acquired such ability if the teacher provided the proper guidance.

Investigations have been made of the results obtained when aided and unaided methods of recall have been conducted with groups of several levels of learning. The conclusions indicate that recall aided by multiple choice tests produce a larger percentage of ideas recalled. That there is danger in placing too much value on the results of reading tests made up of multiple choice items is observed by Courtney, Bucknam, and Durrell. The multiple choice item requires the identification of the correct response. Questions given in class or in written tests do not offer the same help. Courtney found that many pupils with high recall on multiple choice had very low recall on written reproduction. Bucknam's study showed that multiple choice recall is easier than unaided recall. The opinion of the authors was that there is need for measuring the fluency of oral and written recall when the reading ability of pupils is analyzed. They also feel that though a pupil may earn a test score which indicates high reading comprehension, the same pupil may fail when unaided recall is necessary in oral or written answers.


A study of reading and hearing comprehension of two thousand pupils of grades four, five, and six by Young showed that children learn more from a teacher-oral presentation than from silent reading. The author found that children improve in their ability to comprehend through reading throughout the intermediate grades quite as fast as, if not faster than, they improve in their ability to comprehend through hearing. The coefficients of correlation between results on tests after oral presentation and silent reading were uniformly high.

In summarizing the conclusions of various studies Horn says,

In the early years in school, students understand and remember significantly more of what they hear than of what they read. This superiority decreases as facility in reading is developed, until it disappears in about the sixth or seventh grade. The differences between the visual and oral presentations are very small, but in the case of certain types of material they appear to be statistically significant.

A study by Joney in comparing reading and listening in teaching factual materials in grade four showed that listening was superior to reading, when checked by oral question; silent reading followed by oral questions was slightly superior to silent reading with a silent reading check. Superior readers showed a preference for hearing, although the preference was not as great as in the case of poor readers.


2. Horn, Ernest, Methods of Instruction in the Social Studies, Chapters 5 and 7, Boston: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1937.

In a study of reading and hearing comprehension of university freshmen, Larsen and Feder\(^1\) used selections of 200 words from the Nelson-Denny Reading Test (Form B.) The selections included easy, moderate, and difficult material. Their findings show that the group that was the lowest scholastically was slightly superior in reading and the highest group, scholastically, was definitely superior in reading. Their results showed also that reading was superior, as the difficulty of the selection was increased.

Another study of reading and hearing comprehension, with an adult population made by Goldstein\(^2\) reported similar results in the superiority of listening comprehension as the material increased in difficulty. This study also showed that the speed of reading and listening comprehension are conditioned by the intelligence of the subjects.

Carver's\(^3\) investigation of university undergraduate and adults repeats the findings of Larsen and Feder's\(^4\) and Goldstein's\(^5\) studies in

---


2. Goldstein, Harry, "Reading and Listening Comprehension at Various Controlled Rates," Contributions to Education No. 261, Teacher's College, Columbia University, 1940.


5. Goldstein, Harry, op. cit.
regard to the superiority of hearing comprehension. In his conclusions
Carver\(^1\) says, "The capacity to benefit from auditory presentation tends
to vary with the difficulty of the material presented."

In the same investigation recognition, verbatim recall, and
suggestibility are shown to be more successful in response to auditory
presentation while comprehension, criticalness, and discrimination are
improved by visual presentation.

A study by Miller\(^2\) on children in grades three and four showed that
the children at both grade levels were superior in hearing comprehension.

In an investigation using advertising copy with adults DeWick\(^3\) found
that material presented orally was found to have no loss in retention up
to 120 hours.

Studies have been made on the correlation between reading and hearing
and the correlations of intelligence with reading and with hearing.
Anderson\(^4\) reported that reading vocabulary was more closely related to
intelligence than hearing vocabulary. A correlation of .80 between

\[\text{1. Ibid.}\]

\[\text{2. Miller, Eleanor A., "Relation of Hearing Comprehension to Reading Com-}
\text{prehension in Grades Three and Four," Unpublished Master's Thesis,}
\text{Boston University, 1941.}\]

\[\text{3. DeWick, Henry N., "The Relative Effectiveness of Visual Auditory}
\text{Presentation of Advertising Material," Journal of Applied Psychology,}
\text{19:245-264, April, 1931.}\]

\[\text{4. Anderson, Irving, "Common and Differential Facts in Reading Vocabulary}
\text{and Hearing Vocabulary," Journal of Educational Research, 30:317-}
\text{324, January, 1937.}\]
reading and hearing vocabularies was found.

Larsen and Feder\textsuperscript{1} found a correlation of .62\textsuperscript{z}.04 between reading comprehension and hearing comprehension.

---

Part I

A Comparison of Silent Reading and Listening through Written Recall and Multiple Choice Type Tests

Grade 6
CHAPTER III

PLAN OF STUDY

One hundred twenty children in four sixth grades were studied to find out by means of written recall and multiple choice type test whether more ideas were retained when selections were presented orally by the teacher or read silently by the pupils. Sixty of the children were from Providence, Rhode Island and sixty were from Greenwich, Connecticut.

Most of the children in the Providence part of the study came from an average socio-economic group, while the children in the Greenwich part of the study came from above average homes.

Approval to conduct the study was secured from superintendents and supervisors of both systems.

Materials Used. The material used needed to be unfamiliar to the children, so ten selections were written. Nine were original and one was adapted. Six of the selections were of approximately three hundred words. Both long and short were in no higher than a fourth grade level. The Rinsland\(^1\) Word List was used to check the vocabulary. The selections consisted of various types: history, fiction, adventure, and science. The selections were lettered so that they could be referred to conveniently.

The selections were designed to compare unaided written recall from silent reading and listening. A check list of ideas and a multiple choice

---

type test accompanied each selection.

The lists of ideas included all the ideas presented in the paragraphs. The short selections A, B, C, D, E, F included thirty ideas, while the long selections H, I, J, K included sixty ideas. These lists were constructed in order to check the number of ideas retained as measured by unaided written recall when the paragraphs were presented orally by the teacher or read silently by the pupils.

The written recall was checked against the list of ideas from the selection by numbering the ideas on each pupil's paper in the order in which the recall was written. Page 16 presents a checked sample of a written recall from silent reading of a short selection together with the pupil's test response on the same material. Pages 19 and 20 present a checked sample of written recall of a long selection from listening together with the pupil's responses on the same material.

Multiple choice tests were constructed to measure the number of ideas retained from silent reading or listening. Each test item included three choices and was presented in the same vocabulary as the selection. The purpose of these tests was to compare the number of ideas given when selections were read silently or heard compared with the number of ideas given in written recall when the selections were read silently or heard. The multiple choice tests for selections A, B, C, D, E, F contained fifteen items, for selections H, J twenty items, and G, I, thirty items. Pages 21 and 22 present one of the multiple choice tests and shows a sample of the recording.

Table I shows the names of the selections and whether they were read
by the teacher, or read silently by the pupils.

TABLE I

NAMES OF STORIES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Selections</th>
<th>Class I</th>
<th>Class II</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Short</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Early Stove Industry of Detroit</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Peace with Canada</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Clipper Ship Trade of Boston</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. The Hippopotamus</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Mexican Pottery</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. What the Colonists Learned</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Long</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Tecumseh</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. The Hero</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. The Matterhorn</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J. A Thrilling Experience</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All material used in this study was mimeographed. The selections, lists of ideas, multiple choice tests, and directions to the children will be found in the appendix.

**Handwriting Comparison.** The subjects of this study were given a handwriting test. The speed of handwriting was obtained by the writing of a story for one minute. The number of letters written per minute was recorded. There were eight pupils below age in handwriting speed and one hundred twelve whose handwriting speed equalled that of their age and above according to the table given by Durrell.¹ This study is not concerned primarily with handwriting.

**Audiometric Test.** The subjects were given an audiometric test and

all were found to have normal hearing.

Testing Program. Chronological ages were procured from school records. The mental ages were obtained from the Henmon Nelson Tests of Mental Ability.¹

A few years after the United States won its freedom, a ship, "The Grand Turk", came back from China. It was the first Yankee clipper to have made the voyage. It started an age that was full of excitement. Within six years the merchants had established a new trade route from Boston to the northwest coast. There the ships were loaded with skins from the Indians to trade with the Chinese. They returned to Boston carrying treasures from the Far East. The smell of cinnamon and sandal-wood drifting up from Long Wharf scented the air. Fine china and beautiful silks became common luxuries in Boston. Brave men rounded South America as fearlessly as Cape Cod. An American was greeted in the Far East as "Bostonian." Ships and lives were lost in this bold adventure, but great fortunes were made.
### List of Ideas (C)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Idea</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Idea</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>A few years</td>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Brave men (15)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>after the United States (1)</td>
<td>24.</td>
<td>rounded South America (16)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>won its freedom (2)</td>
<td>25.</td>
<td>as fearlessly as Cape Cod</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>a ship, &quot;The Grand Turk&quot; (3)</td>
<td>26.</td>
<td>An American was greeted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>came back from China (4)</td>
<td>27.</td>
<td>in the Far East as &quot;Bostonian&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>It was the first Yankee clipper</td>
<td>28.</td>
<td>Ships and lives were lost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>to have made the voyage</td>
<td>29.</td>
<td>in this bold adventure (17)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>it started an age (5)</td>
<td>30.</td>
<td>but great fortunes were made (18)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>that was full of excitement (6)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Within six years the merchants</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>had established a new trade route (7)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>from Boston to the northwest coast (8)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>There the ships were loaded</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>with skins from the Indians (9)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>to trade with the Chinese (10)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>They returned to Boston (11)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>carrying treasures from the Far East (12)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>The smell of cinnamon and sandalwood</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>drifting up from Long Wharf</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>scented the air</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>Fine China and beautiful silks (13)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>became common luxuries in Boston (14)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Multiple Choice Test Responses - 15    Written Recall of Silent Reading - 13
1). The name of the ship that came back from China was the
(a) Flying Cloud, (b) Grand Turk, (c) Star of Kansas

2). The clipper returned from China after the United States
(a) won its freedom, (b) lost its freedom, (c) invaded England

3). The first ship to return was the
(a) The Star of Kansas, (b) The Flying Cloud, (c) The Grand Turk

4). The merchants established new trade routes
(a) with England, (b) with the northeast, (c) with the northwest

5). This trading with the Far East started a new age
(a) that was full of calmness, (b) that was full of excitement, (c) that was unimportant

6). The trade routes were established
(a) in six years, (b) in one year, (c) in twenty years

7). The ships were loaded in the northwest
(a) with fish, (b) with skins, (c) with coffee

8). The ships returned from China carrying
(a) articles of little value, (b) corn, (c) treasures

9). The air was scented with the smell of
(a) rubber, (b) cinnamon, (c) violets

10). The smell drifted up from the
(a) factory, (b) wharf, (c) hills

11). From China the merchants brought back
(a) fine china, (b) coffee, (c) rubber

12). A common luxury in Boston at this time was
(a) cotton, (b) silk, (c) rayon

13). An American was greeted in the Far East as
(a) "Virginian", (b) "New Yorker", (c) "Bostonian"

14). Brave men went to China by rounding
(a) North America, (b) South America, (c) Greenland

15). The new trading with China made many merchants in Boston
(a) poor, (b) wealthy, (c) unhappy
A Thrilling Experience

When Tom arrived at his uncle's ranch in Texas, his eyes were wide with excitement. He had just been told that a panther, an animal similar to a lion, had been killing cattle and spreading terror to the village. There had been two of them, but a ranchman had caught the younger one as it had strayed from the woods early in the morning. The older one was very cunning and knew enough to hide during the morning. That night several men were going to set a trap for the wild animal. Tom was invited to go along. This was very exciting for a boy who had just arrived from New York City. A piece of meat was placed near a cave where the panther was believed to hide. Armed with rifles the men waited for the animal to approach. Suddenly there was a great howl from the woods and the fierce animal emerged close to where Tom was standing. The boy was scared and trembled at the sight of the beast. Tom's uncle was an excellent shot as he had been a hunter. Calmly taking his gun, he fired at the animal's head. The animal bounded toward Tom, but his uncle fired again as it was ready to pounce on the boy. It snarled fiercely and with a great thud fell to the ground. While inspecting the animal's body, the men shuddered at the thought of what might have happened to the boy. Tom's uncle promised him that he might take the panther's skin home as a souvenir of their adventure. You should have seen the happy look on Tom's face as they strolled homeward.
A LIST OF IDEAS (J)

1. When Tom (1)
2. arrived at his uncle's ranch (2)
3. in Texas (3)
4. his eyes were wide with excitement
5. He had just been told (4)
6. that a panther (5)
7. an animal similar to a lion
8. had been killing cattle (6)
9. and spreading fear in the village
10. There had been two of them
11. but a ranchman
12. had caught the younger one
13. as it had strayed
14. from the woods
15. early in the morning
16. The older one (7)
17. was very cunning
18. knew enough to hide during the day (8)
19. That night several men (9)
20. were going to set a trap (10)
21. for the wild animal
22. Tom was invited to go (11)
23. This was exciting
24. for a boy who had just arrived
25. from New York City
26. a piece of meat (12)
27. was placed near a cave (13)
28. where the panther was believed to hide
29. Armed with rifles (14)
30. the men eagerly waited (15)
31. for the animal to approach
32. Suddenly there was a great howl
33. from the woods
34. and the fierce animal (15)
35. emerged close to where Tom was standing
36. The boy was scared (16)
37. and trembled at the sight of the beast
38. Tom's uncle
39. was an excellent shot
40. as he had been a hunter
41. Calmly taking his gun
42. he fired at the animal's head
43. The panther bounded toward Tom
44. but his uncle fired again
45. as it was ready to pounce
46. on the boy
47. It snarled fiercely
48. with a great thud fell to the ground (20)
49. While inspecting the animal's body
50. the men shuddered at the thought
51. of what might have happened to the boy
52. Tom's uncle
53. promised him
54. that he might have the panther's skin
55. to take home to New York
56. as a souvenir
57. of their adventure
58. You should have seen the happy look
59. on Tom's face
60. as they strolled homeward
1). The ranch belonged to Tom's  
   (a) father, (b) cousin, (c) uncle  

2). The ranch was  
   (a) in Colorado, (b) in Texas, (c) in Canada  

3). A panther is an animal similar to  
   (a) birds, (b) a gazelle, (c) a lion  

4). The panther killed  
   (a) birds, (b) cattle, (c) natives  

5). The wild animal spread terror  
   (a) in the mountains, (b) in the desert, (c) in the village  

6). There had been at the beginning  
   (a) three of these beasts, (b) two of these beasts, (c) one panther  

7). The younger one had been captured  
   (a) by Tom, (b) by the uncle, (c) by a ranchman  

8). The older panther was  
   (a) cunning, (b) unwise, (c) ill  

9). The younger one had strayed into the village  
   (a) during the night, (b) during the early morning, (c) during the meeting  

10). A group of men decided  
    (a) to tame the older panther, (b) to set a trap for the older panther, (c) to help the older panther  

11). Tom was  
    (a) invited to go, (b) not invited to go, (c) forgotten  

12). The boy thought it would be  
    (a) a thrill, (b) unexciting, (c) unimportant  

13). Tom had come from  
    (a) Boston, (b) New York City, (c) Texas  

14). A piece of meat was placed near  
    (a) a hill, (b) a barn, (c) a cave  

15). The men were  
    (a) unarmed, (b) armed with clubs, (c) armed with rifles
16). The wild animal appeared very close to 
   (a) a ranchman, (b) Tom, (c) the uncle

17). The animal was ready to pounce on 
   (a) the uncle, (b) the ranchman, (c) the uncle

18). The old panther was shot by 
   (a) a ranchman, (b) the boy, (c) the uncle

19). The sight of the beast made the boy 
   (a) bold, (b) courageous, (c) tremble

20). Tom's uncle promised him that he might take home 
   (a) the panther's skin, (b) the rifle, (c) a photograph
Table II shows the comparison of mental and chronological ages.

**TABLE II**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of Pupils</th>
<th>Mean C.A.</th>
<th>S.D. (Mos.)</th>
<th>Mean M.A.</th>
<th>S.D. (Mos.)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>120</td>
<td>11-6</td>
<td>7.21</td>
<td>12-1</td>
<td>13.38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The range of C.A.'s was 9-10 to 13-4 with a mean of 11-6.
The range of M.A.'s was 9-0 to 16-5 with a mean of 12-1 which means that these children were above normal in intelligence.
The range in the Iowa Reading Tests, Elementary AM, (Revised) was 9-5 to 16-2 with a mean of 12-8 and a standard deviation of 26.92 (Mos.).
The selections were used by the classroom teacher with one hundred twenty sixth grade pupils.

Experiment. The selections were presented, two a week, over approximately a five week period in each classroom. Selection A was read to the pupils in Class I in Providence and Class I in Greenwich and the children wrote what they remembered immediately after listening. Selection A was read silently by the pupils in Class II in Providence and Class II in Greenwich and they wrote immediately what they remembered after reading. All the selections were presented in pairs in a similar manner.

There was no time limit on how long a child was allowed to write. As soon as he was finished, his paper was collected.

One point of score was given for each item retained. A copy of the
scoring will be found in the appendix.

The data were analyzed and will be presented in the next Chapter.
CHAPTER IV

ANALYSIS OF DATA

The data were analyzed to determine:

1. Comparison of oral and silent presentations by written recall.

2. Comparison of multiple choice responses of oral and silent presentations.

3. Comparison of multiple choice and written recall of oral presentations.

4. Comparison of multiple choice and written recall of silent reading.

5. Comparison of oral and silent presentations by written recall of long and short selections.

6. Comparison of multiple choice and written recall of oral presentations of long and short selections.

7. Comparison of multiple choice and written recall of silent reading of long and short selections.
Table III shows the comparison of written recall of oral and silent presentations for the total population.

**TABLE III**

**COMPARISON OF WRITTEN RECALL OF ORAL AND SILENT PRESENTATION**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>S.D.</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>10.68</td>
<td>5.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silent</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>8.27</td>
<td>6.21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean score for oral presentation was 10.68 compared with 8.27 for silent reading.

The critical ratio was 3.05 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of selections presented orally.

Table IV shows the comparison of multiple choice test scores of oral and silent presentations for the total population.

**TABLE IV**

**COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE OF ORAL AND SILENT PRESENTATIONS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>S.D.</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>15.47</td>
<td>4.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silent</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>13.32</td>
<td>5.22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The mean score of multiple choice tests presented orally was 15.47 compared with 13.32 for multiple choice tests read silently.

The critical ratio was 3.26 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of multiple choice test presented orally.

Table V shows the comparison of multiple choice test response and written recall of oral presentations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE V</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE AND WRITTEN RECALL OF ORAL PRESENTATION</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>S.E. M</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E. Diff.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Choice</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>15.47</td>
<td>4.90</td>
<td>.45</td>
<td>4.79</td>
<td>.70</td>
<td>6.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written Recall</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>10.68</td>
<td>5.92</td>
<td>.54</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean score for multiple choice test scores of oral presentation was 15.47 compared with 10.68 for written recall of oral presentation.

The critical ratio was 6.94 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of multiple choice of oral presentation.

Table VI shows the comparison of multiple choice responses and written recall of silent presentation.
TABLE VI

COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE RESPONSES AND WRITTEN RECALL OF SILENT PRESENTATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Choice</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>13.32</td>
<td>5.22</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td>5.05</td>
<td>.75</td>
<td>6.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written Recall</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>8.27</td>
<td>6.21</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean score for multiple choice test scores of silent presentation was 13.32 compared with 8.27 for written recall of silent presentation.

The critical ratio was 6.73 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of multiple choice responses of silent presentation.

Table VII shows a comparison of oral and silent short stories.

TABLE VII

COMPARISON OF ORAL AND SILENT PRESENTATION OF SHORT SELECTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>8.63</td>
<td>3.26</td>
<td>.30</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>.47</td>
<td>3.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silent</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>6.83</td>
<td>3.73</td>
<td>.35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean score for oral presentation of short selections was 8.63 compared with 6.83 for silent reading of short selections.
The critical ratio was 3.83 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of short selections presented orally.

Table VIII shows a comparison of oral and silent presentations by written recall of long selections.

**TABLE VIII**

COMPARISON OF ORAL AND SILENT PRESENTATIONS BY WRITTEN RECALL OF LONG SELECTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>13.74</td>
<td>7.24</td>
<td>.66</td>
<td>3.34</td>
<td>.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silent</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>10.40</td>
<td>7.77</td>
<td>.71</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean score for oral presentation of long selections was 13.74 compared with 10.40 for silent presentations of long selections.

The critical ratio was 3.44 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of long selections presented orally.

Table IX shows a comparison of the differences of oral and silent presentations by written recall in long and short selections.
TABLE IX

COMPARISON OF ORAL AND SILENT PRESENTATIONS BY WRITTEN RECALL
OF LONG AND SHORT SELECTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D. of Mean</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E. of Diff.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Long Selections</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>3.34</td>
<td>.97</td>
<td>1.54</td>
<td>1.98</td>
<td>1.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short Selections</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>.47</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The differences between the means for oral and silent presentations was 3.34 in favor of oral presentation for long as compared to 1.80 for oral presentation for short selections. The difference between the means was 1.54 in favor of long selections.

The critical ratio was 1.42 which is not statistically significant. The chances are 87 in 100 it is a true difference in favor of long selections.

Table X shows a comparison of multiple choice and written recall of oral presentations of short selections.

TABLE X

COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE AND WRITTEN RECALL OF ORAL PRESENTATIONS
OF SHORT SELECTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>S.E. M Diff.</th>
<th>S.E. Diff.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Choice</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>12.62</td>
<td>2.51</td>
<td>.23</td>
<td>3.99</td>
<td>10.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written Recall</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>8.63</td>
<td>3.26</td>
<td>.30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The mean score for multiple choice of oral presentation of short selections was 12.62 compared with 8.63 for written recall of oral presentation of short selections.

The critical ratio was 10.50 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of multiple choice or oral presentation of short selections.

**TABLE XI**

**COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE AND WRITTEN RECALL OF ORAL PRESENTATION OF LONG SELECTIONS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Choice</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>19.73</td>
<td>4.46</td>
<td>.41</td>
<td>5.99</td>
<td>.78</td>
<td>7.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written Recall</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>13.74</td>
<td>7.24</td>
<td>.66</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean score of multiple choice of oral presentation of long selections was 19.73 compared with 13.74 for written recall of oral presentation of long selections.

The critical ratio was 7.68 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of multiple choice responses of oral presentation of long selections.

Table XII shows a comparison of the differences of multiple choice and written recall or oral presentation in the short and long selections.
The difference between the means of oral presentation of multiple choice and written recall was 5.99 in favor of multiple choice responses for long selections as compared to 3.99 for multiple choice for short selections. The difference between the means was 2.00 in favor of long selections.

The critical ratio was 2.30 which is not statistically significant. The chances are 96 in 100 it is a true difference in favor of long selections.

Table XIII shows a comparison of multiple choice and written recall of short selections read silently.

**TABLE XIII**

**COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE AND WRITTEN RECALL OF SHORT SELECTIONS PRESENTED SILENTLY**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>M.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>Critical</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multiple choice</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>10.64</td>
<td>2.97</td>
<td>.28</td>
<td>3.81</td>
<td>3.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written recall</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>6.83</td>
<td>3.78</td>
<td>.25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The mean score for multiple choice responses of silent reading or short selections was 10.64 compared to 6.83 for written recall of short selections read silently.

The critical ratio was 6.66 which shows statistically significant difference in favor of multiple choice responses of silent reading of short selections.

Table XIV shows the comparison of multiple and written recall of long selections read silently.

### TABLE XIV

**COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE AND WRITTEN RECALL OF LONG SELECTIONS PRESENTED SILENTLY.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>S.E. M</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E. Diff.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Choice</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>17.33</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td>6.93</td>
<td>.36</td>
<td>8.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written Recall</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>10.40</td>
<td>7.77</td>
<td>.71</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean score for multiple choice responses of silent reading of long selections was 17.33 compared to 10.40 for written recall of long selections read silently.

The critical ratio was 8.06 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of multiple choice responses of silent reading of long selections.

Table XV shows a comparison of the differences of multiple choice and written recall of silent presentation in the short and long selections.
TABLE XV

COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE AND WRITTEN RECALL OF SILENT PRESENTATION OF LONG AND SHORT SELECTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D. of Mean</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E. of Diff.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Long Selections</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>6.93</td>
<td>.86</td>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>.97</td>
<td>3.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short Selections</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>3.81</td>
<td>.44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The difference between the means of silent presentation of multiple choice and written recall was 6.93 in favor of multiple choice responses for long selections as compared to 3.81 for multiple choice and written recall for short selections. The difference between the means was 3.12 in favor of long selections.

The critical ratio was 3.22 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of long selections read silently.
CHAPTER V

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

The reason for this investigation was to determine by means of written recall and multiple choice type test whether silent reading or listening is more effective.

One hundred twenty sixth grade children were presented ten selections. The stories were rotated so that the difficulty from the combined testing of listening and silent reading was equalized. Five were read orally by the teacher to the pupils. Five were read silently by the pupils. After each presentation the pupils wrote what they could remember. Then they took a multiple choice test constructed on the same material. The number of memories was used for the comparison.

Conclusion. The following conclusions were made by an analysis of the memories:

1. Written recall of listening was superior to silent reading. A statistically significant difference was shown by the critical ratio of 3.05.
2. Multiple choice responses of listening were superior to multiple choice of silent reading. A statistically significant difference was shown by the critical ratio of 3.26.
3. Multiple choice responses of listening were superior to written recall of listening. The difference was statistically significant; the critical ratio was 6.84.
4. Multiple choice responses of silent reading were superior to
written recall of silent reading. A statistically significant difference was shown by the critical ratio of 6.73.

5. The difference between listening and silent reading by written recall was greater for long selections than for short; the differences between the means for oral and silent presentations was 3.34 in favor of oral presentation for long as compared to 1.80 for oral presentation for short selections, but the difference was not statistically significant.

6. The difference between multiple choice and written recall for listening was greater for long selections than for short selections; the difference between the means of oral presentation of multiple choice and written recall was 5.99 in favor of multiple choice responses for long selections as compared to 3.99 for multiple choice for short selections, but the difference was not statistically significant.

7. The difference between multiple choice and written recall from silent reading was greater for long selections than for short selections. A statistically significant difference was shown by the critical ratio of 3.22.
Part II

A Comparison of Silent Reading and Listening through Written Recall and Multiple Choice Type Tests

Grade 7
CHAPTER VI

PLAN OF STUDY

One hundred twenty children in five seventh grades were studied to find out by means of written recall and multiple choice type tests whether more ideas were retained when selections were presented orally by the teacher or read silently by the pupils. Sixty of the children were from Bristol, Connecticut and sixty were from Columbia, South Carolina.

Most of the children in the Bristol part of the study came from an average socio-economic group in a newly settled section of a chiefly industrial city of about 40,000 population.

Columbia is a city of about 87,000 and is almost entirely residential with several small local industries. The majority of the children tested possessed a true Southern background and represented families of a slightly below average socio-economic status.

From three elementary schools located in different sections of the city twenty children were each tested thereby allowing for representation of three sections of the city. Many of the children attending these schools are transported from the rural areas.

Approval to conduct the study was secured from the superintendent of schools in each community.

Materials used. The material used had to be unfamiliar to the children, so ten selections were written. Nine were original and one was adapted. Six of the selections were of approximately one hundred fifty words. Both long and short were on a level no higher than the fourth
grade. The Rinsland Word List was used to check the vocabulary. The selections consisted of various types: history, fiction, adventure, and science. The selections were lettered so that they could be referred to conveniently.

The selections were designed to compare unaided written recall from silent reading and listening. A check list of ideas and a multiple choice type test accompanied each selection.

The lists of ideas included all the ideas presented in the paragraphs. The short selections A, B, C, D, E, and F included thirty ideas, while the long selections H, I, J, and K included sixty ideas. These lists were constructed in order to check the number of ideas retained as measured by unaided written recall when the paragraphs were presented orally by the teacher or read silently by the pupils.

The written recall was checked against the list of ideas from the selection by numbering the ideas on each pupil's paper in the order in which the recall was written. Page 43 presents a checked sample of a written recall from the silent reading of a short selection together with the pupil's test responses on the same material. Page 46 and 47 presents a checked sample of written recall of a long selection from listening together with the pupil's test responses on the same material.

Multiple choice type tests were constructed to measure the number of ideas retained from silent reading or listening. Each test item included three choices and was presented in the same vocabulary as the

selection. The purpose of these tests was to compare the number of ideas given when selections were read silently or heard compared with the number of ideas given in written recall when selections were read silently or heard. The multiple choice tests for selections A, B, C, D, E, and F contained fifteen items; for selections H, J, twenty items, and G, I, thirty items. Pages 48 and 49 present one of the multiple choice tests and shows a sample of the recording.

Table I shows the names of the selections and whether they were read by the teacher or read silently by the pupils.
**TABLE I**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Selections</th>
<th>Class I</th>
<th>Class II</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Short</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Early Stove Industry in Detroit</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Peace with Canada</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Clipper Ship Trade of Boston</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. The Hippopotamus</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Mexican Pottery</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. What the Colonists Learned</td>
<td>Read Silently</td>
<td>Read to Pupils</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Long**                            |                              |                              |
| G. Tecumseh                         | Read Silently                | Read to Pupils               |
| H. The Hero                          | Read Silently                | Read to Pupils               |
| I. The Matterhorn                    | Read to Pupils               | Read Silently                |
| J. A Thrilling Experience           | Read to Pupils               | Read Silently                |

All material used in this study was mimeographed. The selections, lists of ideas, multiple choice tests, and directions to the children will be found in the appendix.

**Handwriting Comparison.** The subjects of this study were given a handwriting test. The speed of handwriting was obtained by the writing of a story for one minute. The number of letters written per minute was recorded. There were twenty-seven pupils below age in handwriting speed and ninety-three whose handwriting speed equaled that of their age or above according to the table given by Durrell. This study is not concerned primarily with handwriting.

**Audiometric Test.** The subjects of this study were given an audiometric test and all were found to have normal hearing.

---

Mexican Pottery

Pedro is a Mexican boy who lives in Puebla. He is part Spanish and part Indian.

Long ago missionaries from Spain settled in Mexico. These Spanish missionaries introduced a coating which is used on pottery that the people of Puebla make. This coating which contains lead and tin is often called glaze. The pottery is baked once, then coated or glazed, and later decorated with bright blue or yellow. Although many kinds of things are made of this pottery, the most important ones are tiles and large jars. These are decorated with colorful designs of birds and flowers. Figures of saints are also used on the tiles.

Some of the pottery of Puebla is copied from the 1700's. It can be recognized by its colors of orange, black, and pale green. Many different designs are drawn on it which make us think of Europe and China. Pedro helps his parents make this pottery.
LIST OF IDEAS

1. Pedro is a Mexican boy (1)
2. Lives in Puebla (2)
3. He is part Indian (3)
4. part Spanish (4)
5. missionaries from Spain (5)
6. settled in Mexico (6)
7. Spanish missionaries introduced a coating (7)
8. used on pottery (6)
9. people of Puebla make (9)
10. coating contains lead (10)
11. and tin (11)
12. is often called glaze (12)
13. pottery is baked once
14. then coated or glazed
15. later decorated (13)
16. bright yellow or blue (14)
17. many kinds of things are made of this pottery
18. most important ones are tiles (15)
19. large jars
20. These are decorated with colorful designs of birds (16)
21. and flowers
22. Figures of saints are used on the tiles (17)
23. pottery is copied from the 1700's (19)
24. its colors are orange, black, and pale green
25. different designs are drawn on it
26. make us think of Europe
27. and China
28. Pedro helps (20)
29. his parents (21)
30. make this pottery (22)
MULTIPLE CHOICE TEST (E)

1. The Mexican boy in this story is called Laredo.
   - Pedro
   - Jose
   - Mexico City

2. He lives in Puebla.
   - Taxco
   - Chinese

3. Mexicans are part Indian.
   - Italian
   - India

4. Missionaries who settled in Mexico in early times came from Mexico.
   - India
   - Spain

5. The people of Puebla make rugs.
   - pottery

6. The glaze used on the pottery contains lead and copper.
   - tin and lead
   - glaze

7. The coating put on the pottery is called copper.
   - yellow
   - once
   - copper and tin

8. The pottery is baked twice.
   - three times
   - decorated

9. After the pottery is baked it is glazed.
   - painted
   - jars

10. Pictures of saints are painted mostly on tiles.
    - birds

11. Some of the pottery is copied from pottery of 1492.
    - 1531
    - 1700

12. Pottery is decorated with birds.
    - Indians

13. Some of the designs make us think of the country of the United States.
    - China
    - Europe

14. Pedro helps his brother make pottery.
    - parents
    - Few

15. Many things are made of pottery in Puebla.
    - No
The Matterhorn  

The Matterhorn is a beautiful glittering mountain peak on the Italian border of the Swiss Alps. Climbing the mountain is often dangerous because fog and snowstorms often occur.

In the village at the foot of the mountain, guides can be hired by the mountain climbers. Leggins, mittens, woolen helmets, mountain shoes, and ice axes are required for climbing.

As one travels up the valley the Matterhorn looks like the paws of a crouching tiger. Along the roadside are broken cliffs and steep slopes. Nearby is a museum containing clothes and ice axes of English climbers. From here the zigzag path stretches on. Behind them is a deep valley with high steep slopes. Along the ice-covered trail is a shelter. Rising above is a huge half circle of rocky crags. The Matterhorn is now an overhanging cliff a mile high. Following the trail the climber must climb up and down pointed rocks and cliffs a thousand feet. The wind blows very hard all the time.

Near the top ropes are tied to iron stakes. The climber has to pull himself up these ice-covered ropes hand over hand. As he reaches the top the snow blows around and it is hard to breathe because of the thin air.

Seven English sportsmen started the hard climb in 1865. On the ice near a snowbank one man slipped. Luckily he was tied to the others by a rope. They all reached the top successfully. The Matterhorn had been conquered!

Adapted from Richard Haliburton's "Royal Road to Romance"
A LIST OF IDEAS

1. The Matterhorn is a beautiful
2. glittering
3. mountain peak
4. on the Italian border
5. of the Swiss Alps
6. Climbing the mountain is often dangerous
7. because of fog
8. and snowstorms
9. guides can be hired
10. in the village
11. at the foot of the mountain
12. by the mountain climbers
13. Leggings
14. mittens
15. woolen helmets
16. mountain shoes
17. ice axes are required
18. one travels up the valley
19. Matterhorn looks like the paws
20. of a crouching tiger
21. Along the roadside are broken cliffs
22. and steep slopes
23. Nearby is a museum
24. containing clothes
25. and ice axes
26. of English climbers
27. zigzag path stretches on
28. Behind is a deep valley
29. with high steep slopes
30. the ice-covered trail
31. is a shelter
32. Rising above is a huge half circle
33. of rocky crags
34. Matterhorn is an overhanging cliff
35. a mile high
36. Following the trail the climber must climb up and down
37. pointed rocks like the teeth on a saw
38. rocks are not more than 20 inches wide
39. he must climb straight upward
40. on rocks and cliffs
41. a thousand feet high
42. wind blows very hard
43. near the top (23)  
44. ropes are tied  
45. to iron stakes  
46. climber has to pull himself up  
47. ice-covered ropes (24)  
48. hand over hand (25)  
49. as he reaches the top (26)  
50. the snow blows around (27)  
51. it is hard to breathe (28)  
52. because of thin air (29)  
53. Seven  
54. English sportsmen  
55. started to climb  
56. in 1865  
57. One man slipped (33)  
58. he was tied to the others by a rope  
59. they reached the top successfully (31)  
60. Matterhorn conquered
MULTIPLE CHOICE TEST

1. The Matterhorn is a mountain peak that is
dismal. low
sparkling
Swiss border
2. The Matterhorn is located on the Italian border.
English border

3. Climbing the mountain is dangerous because of thin air.
crouching tigers

4. Guides can be hired at the foot of the mountain.
Burros

5. Ice axes for the mountain climbers are useful.
useless

6. Along the roadside are broken cliffs.
sticks

7. Near the roadside is a store.
museum

8. The trail up the mountain is covered with snow.
sand

9. For protection from the storms the mountain climbers use the shelter.
museum

10. The overhanging cliff of the Matterhorn from the path is a hundred feet.
    thousand feet
    flat

11. The rocks are smooth.
    pointed

12. The climber must climb on rocks less than 20 inches wide.
    36 inches wide.

13. The wind blows little.
    none at all.

14. Stakes are tied near the top to help the climbers.
    Ropes
    Irons
    Wooden

15. Iron stakes are driven into the rock near the top of the mountain.
Concrete

16. The ropes become coated with ice.
    dust
17. The climbers pull themselves up by ropes at the bottom in the valley.
The climbers pull them selves up by ropes at the top.

18. At the top of the mountain the ice blows around.
At the top of the mountain the ice blows around.

19. At the top of the mountain it is hard to breathe.
At the top of the mountain it is hard to breathe.

20. The air on the top of the mountain is thin.
The air on the top of the mountain is thin.

21. Four men reached the top the first time successfully.
Four men reached the top the first time successfully.

22. These men were Italian.
Two

23. The men who first reached the top were navy.

24. The Matterhorn was first climbed successfully in 1776.
The Matterhorn was first climbed successfully in 1776.

25. The man who slipped was saved by ropes.
The man who slipped was saved by ropes.

26. None of the men reached the top successfully.
None of the men reached the top successfully.

27. The Matterhorn was conquered by these men.
The Matterhorn was conquered by these men.

28. Woolen helmets are used by the climbers.
Woolen helmets are used by the climbers.

29. In some places the mountain resembles the paws of a lion.
In some places the mountain resembles the paws of a lion.

30. The path is very crooked.
The path is very crooked.
Testing Program. Chronological ages were procured from school records. The mental ages were obtained from the Otis Quick-Scoring Mental Ability Tests (Form B).¹

TABLE II

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of Pupils</th>
<th>Mean C.A.</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>Mean M.A.</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>120</td>
<td>12-10</td>
<td>11 mo.</td>
<td>12-10</td>
<td>1-9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The range of C.A.'s was 11-5 to 16-2 with a mean of 12-10.  
The range of M.A.'s was 8-10 to 17-0 with a mean of 12-10.  
The range in the Iowa Reading Tests, Elementary A:1, (Revised) was 7-6 to above 18-2 with a mean of 13-1 and a standard deviation of 3-1.  
The selections were used by the classroom teacher with one hundred twenty seventh grade pupils.

Experiment. The selections were presented, two a week, over approximately a five week period in each classroom. Selection A was read to the pupils in Class I in Bristol and Class I in Columbia and the children wrote what they retained immediately after listening. Selection A was read silently by the pupils in Class II in Bristol and Class II in Columbia and they wrote what they remembered immediately after reading. All the selections were presented in pairs in a similar manner.

There was no time limit set on how long a child was allowed to

read but he was only allowed to read it once. No time limit was set on how long he was allowed to write. Each child was permitted to finish. As soon as he had finished, his paper was collected.

One point of score was given for each item retained. A copy of the scoring will be found in the appendix.
CHAPTER VII

ANALYSIS OF DATA

The data were analyzed to determine:

1. Comparison of oral and silent presentations by written recall.
2. Comparison of multiple choice responses of oral and silent presentations.
3. Comparison of multiple choice and written recall of oral presentations.
4. Comparison of multiple choice and written recall of silent reading.
5. Comparison of oral and silent presentations by written recall of long and short selections.
6. Comparison of multiple choice and written recall of oral presentations of long and short selections.
7. Comparison of multiple choice and written recall of silent reading of long and short selections.
Table III shows the comparison of written recall of oral and silent presentations for the total population.

### TABLE III

**COMPARISON OF WRITTEN RECALL OF ORAL AND SILENT PRESENTATION**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>S.E. M</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E. Diff</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>8.29</td>
<td>5.79</td>
<td>.53</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.71</td>
<td>2.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silent</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>6.63</td>
<td>.61</td>
<td></td>
<td>.81</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean score for oral presentation was 8.29 compared with 10.00 for silent reading.

The critical ratio was 2.11 which is not statistically significant. The chances are 95 in 100 that it is a true difference in favor of silent reading.

Table IV shows the comparison of multiple choice test scores of oral and silent presentations for the total population.

### TABLE IV

**COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE OF ORAL AND SILENT PRESENTATIONS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>S.E. M</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E. Diff</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>13.34</td>
<td>5.04</td>
<td>.46</td>
<td></td>
<td>.37</td>
<td>1.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silent</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>14.71</td>
<td>4.91</td>
<td>.45</td>
<td></td>
<td>.64</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The mean score of multiple choice tests presented orally was 13.84 compared with 14.71 for multiple choice tests read silently.

The critical ratio was 1.36 which is not statistically significant. The chances are 1 in 100 that it is a true difference in favor of silent reading.

Table V shows the comparison of multiple choice test responses and written recall of oral presentation.

### TABLE V

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Choice</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>13.84</td>
<td>5.04</td>
<td>5.55</td>
<td>.46</td>
<td>.70</td>
<td>7.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written Recall</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>8.29</td>
<td>5.79</td>
<td></td>
<td>5.55</td>
<td>.70</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean score of multiple choice test scores of oral presentation was 13.84 compared with 8.29 for written recall of oral presentation.

The critical ratio was 7.92 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of multiple choice of oral presentation.

Table VI shows the comparison of multiple choice responses and written recall of silent presentation.
TABLE VI

COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE RESPONSES AND WRITTEN RECALL OF SILENT PRESENTATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>S.E. M</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E. Diff.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Choice</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>14.71</td>
<td>4.91</td>
<td>.45</td>
<td></td>
<td>4.71</td>
<td>.76 6.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written Recall</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>6.63</td>
<td>.61</td>
<td></td>
<td>4.71</td>
<td>.76 6.20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean score for multiple choice test scores of silent presentation was 14.71 compared with 10.00 for written recall of silent presentation.

The critical ratio was 6.20 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of multiple choice responses of silent presentation.

Table VII shows a comparison of oral and silent short stories.

TABLE VII

COMPARISON OF ORAL AND SILENT PRESENTATION OF SHORT SELECTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>S.E. M</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E. Diff.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>6.50</td>
<td>4.16</td>
<td>.36</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.44</td>
<td>.55 2.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silent</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>7.94</td>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>.37</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.44</td>
<td>.55 2.72</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The mean score for oral presentation of short selections was 6.50 compared with 7.94 for silent reading of short selections.

The critical ratio was 2.72 which is not statistically significant. The chances are 99.7 in 100 that it is a true difference in favor of silent presentation.

Table VIII shows a comparison of oral and silent long selections

**TABLE VIII**

**COMPARISON OF ORAL AND SILENT PRESENTATIONS OF LONG SELECTIONS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>10.37</td>
<td>6.75</td>
<td>.62</td>
<td>2.19</td>
<td>.97</td>
<td>2.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silent</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>13.06</td>
<td>8.25</td>
<td>.75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean score for oral presentation of long selections was 10.87 compared with 13.06 for silent presentation of long selections. The critical ratio was 2.26 which is not statistically significant. The chances are 99.6 in 100 that it is a true difference in favor of silent presentation.

Table IX shows a comparison of oral and silent presentations by written recall in long and short selections.
**TABLE IX**

**COMPARISON OF ORAL AND SILENT PRESENTATIONS BY WRITTEN RECALL OF LONG AND SHORT SELECTIONS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E. of Diff.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Long</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>2.19</td>
<td>.97</td>
<td>.75</td>
<td>1.11</td>
<td>.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>1.44</td>
<td>.53</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The difference between the means for oral and silent presentation was 2.19 in favor of silent presentation for long as compared to 1.44 for silent presentation for short selections. The difference between the means was .75 in favor of long selections.

The critical ratio was .63 which is not statistically significant. The chances are 75 in 100 it is true difference in favor of long selections.

Table X shows the comparison of multiple choice and written recall of oral presentations of short selections.

**TABLE X**

**COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE AND WRITTEN RECALL OF ORAL PRESENTATION OF SHORT SELECTIONS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E. of Diff.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Choice</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>10.94</td>
<td>2.46</td>
<td>.22</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written Recall</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>6.50</td>
<td>4.16</td>
<td>.38</td>
<td>4.44</td>
<td>.44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The mean score for multiple choice of oral presentation of short selections was 10.94 compared with 6.50 for written recall of oral presentation of short selections.

The critical ratio was 10.09 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of multiple choice of oral presentation of short selections.

Table XI shows a comparison of multiple choice and written recall of oral presentation of long selections.

TABLE XI

COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE AND WRITTEN RECALL OF ORAL PRESENTATION OF LONG SELECTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>M Diff.</th>
<th>S.E. Diff.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Choice</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>18.21</td>
<td>4.62</td>
<td>.42</td>
<td>7.34</td>
<td>9.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written Recall</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>10.87</td>
<td>6.75</td>
<td>.62</td>
<td>.75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean score of multiple choice of oral presentation of long selections was 18.21 compared with 10.87 for written recall of oral presentation of long selections.

The critical ratio was 9.79 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of multiple choice responses of oral presentation of long selections.

Table XII shows a comparison of the differences of multiple choice and written recall of oral presentation in the long and short selections.
TABLE XII

COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE AND WRITTEN RECALL OF ORAL PRESENTATIONS IN LONG AND SHORT SELECTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Long Selections</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>7.34</td>
<td>.75</td>
<td>2.90</td>
<td>.37</td>
<td>3.33</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short Selections</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>4.44</td>
<td>.44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The difference between the means of oral presentation of multiple choice and written recall was 7.34 in favor of multiple choice responses for long selections as compared to 4.44 for multiple choice for short selections. The difference between the means was 2.90 in favor of long selections.

The critical ratio was 3.33 which is statistically significant.

Table XIII shows a comparison of multiple choice and written recall of short selections read silently.

TABLE XIII

COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE AND WRITTEN RECALL OF SHORT SELECTIONS PRESENTED SILENTLY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Choice</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>11.95</td>
<td>.27</td>
<td>.21</td>
<td>4.01</td>
<td>.43</td>
<td>9.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written Recall</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>7.94</td>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>.37</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The mean score for multiple choice responses of silent reading of short selections was 11.95 compared with 7.94 for written recall of short selections read silently.

The critical ratio was 9.33 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of multiple choice responses of silent reading of short selections.

Table XIV shows the comparison of multiple choice and written recall of long selections read silently.

| TABLE XIV |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | No. | Mean | S.D. | S.E. |
| | | | M | Diff. |
| | | | | S.E. |
| | | | S.E. | Critical |
| Multiple Choice | 120 | 18.98 | 4.75 | .43 |
| Written Recall | 120 | 13.06 | 3.25 | .75 |

The mean score for multiple choice responses of silent reading of long selections was 18.98 compared to 13.06 for written recall of long selections read silently.

The critical ratio was 6.88 which shows a statistically significant difference in favor of multiple choice responses of silent reading of long selections.

Table XV shows a comparison of the differences of multiple choice and written recall of silent presentation in the short and long selections.
### TABLE XV

**COMPARISON OF MULTIPLE CHOICE AND WRITTEN RECALL OF SILENT PRESENTATION IN LONG AND SHORT SELECTIONS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Long Selections</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>5.92</td>
<td>.36</td>
<td>1.91</td>
<td>.96</td>
<td>1.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short Selections</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>4.01</td>
<td>.43</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The difference between the means of silent presentation of multiple choice and written recall was 5.92 in favor of multiple choice responses for long selections as compared to 4.01 for multiple choice for short selections. The difference between the means was 1.91 in favor of long selections.

The critical ratio was 1.99 which is not statistically significant. The chances are 98 in 100 that it is a true difference in favor of multiple choice responses of long selections read silently.

**Correlation.**

The correlation between Silent Reading and Listening as measured by Written Recall was .837.
CHAPTER VIII

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

The reason for this investigation was to determine by means of written recall and multiple choice type test whether silent reading or listening is more effective.

One hundred twenty seventh grade pupils were presented ten selections. The stories were rotated so that the difficulty from the combined testing of listening and silent reading was equalized. Five were read orally by the teacher to the pupils. Five were read silently by the pupils. After each presentation the pupils wrote what they could remember. Then they took a multiple choice test constructed on the same material. The number of memories was used for the comparison.

Conclusions. The following conclusions were made by an analysis of the memories:

1. The difference between written recall of listening and silent reading was slightly greater for silent reading; the mean score for oral presentation was 8.29 compared with 10.00 for silent reading, but the difference was not statistically significant.

2. Multiple choice responses of silent reading were slightly greater than multiple choice responses of listening; the mean score for multiple choice test scores of oral presentation was 13.84 compared with 14.71 for multiple choice tests read silently, but the difference was not statistically significant.
3. Multiple choice responses of listening were superior to written recall of listening. The difference was statistically significant; the critical ratio was 7.92.

4. Multiple choice responses of silent reading were superior to written recall of silent reading. A statistical difference was shown by the critical ratio of 6.20.

5. The difference between listening and silent reading by written recall was slightly greater for long selections than for short selections; the difference between the means for oral and silent presentation was 2.19 in favor of silent presentation for long as compared to 1.44 for silent presentation for short selections, but the difference was not statistically significant.

6. The difference between multiple choice and written recall for listening was greater for long selections than for short selections. The difference was statistically significant. The critical ratio was 3.33.

7. The difference between multiple choice and written recall from silent reading was greater for long selections than for short selections; the difference between the means of silent presentation of multiple choice and written recall was 5.92 in favor of multiple choice responses for long selections as compared to 4.01 for multiple choice for short selections. The difference was not statistically significant.
CHAPTER IX

SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER STUDY

1. Carry out the same experiment comparing the boys' and girls' scores.
2. Extend the experiment through grades eight and nine.
3. Carry out the same experiment with a control group.
4. Match the pupils according to reading ages.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Goldstein, Harry, "Reading and Listening Comprehension at Various Controlled Rates," Contributions to Education No. 261 Teachers College, Columbia University, 1940.

Horn, Ernest, Methods of Instruction in the Social Studies. Chapters 5 and 7, Boston: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1937.


Miller, Eleanor A., "Retention of Hearing Comprehension to Reading Comprehension in Grades Three and Four." Unpublished Master's Thesis, Boston University, Boston, 1941.


DIRECTIONS FOR CHILDREN

Silent Reading.

1. I am going to put some papers on your desk. Please do not turn them over yet. I am going to give you a piece of composition paper, too.

2. Put your name on the composition paper.

3. When I say "Begin" turn over the large sheet and read the story one time.

4. As soon as you finish, turn the printed sheet over and place it in the corner of the desk.

5. Write on the lined composition paper all that you can remember about what you read.

6. Do not ask questions. Spell words the best you can.

7. When you finish writing place the paper on the corner of the desk.

Oral Presentation.

1. Before reading a story to the class say, "I am going to read a story to you. When I have finished I am going to ask you to write all you can remember about the story."

2. Spell the words the best you can. Do not ask questions.
The Early Stove Industry of Detroit (A)

The first stoves were shipped to Detroit from East on the Erie Canal. This early stove did not satisfy the needs of the people because they were little more than iron boxes with a smaller iron box on top which was used for an oven.

The manufacture of stoves really began in Detroit during the 1830's. The people did not like waiting for a new stove or new parts if their stove became broken or cracked. The new stove and new parts had to be shipped from Albany and Troy, New York. Someone started repairing the parts of the broken stoves under the name of "Iron Works."

Young Jerry Dwyer, who was left alone at the age of eleven years went to work in the "Iron Works." After a long while he decided to go into the stove business for himself. Later because of many hardships he took two partners into his business. The business then became known as the Detroit Stove Works. Other people started making stoves in Detroit, too, thus causing Detroit to become the largest stove-producing center in this country.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHECK LIST</th>
<th>(A)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The first stoves</td>
<td>24. went to work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. were shipped to Detroit</td>
<td>25. in the Iron Works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. from the east</td>
<td>26. into the stove business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. on the Erie Canal</td>
<td>27. because of many hardships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. This early stove</td>
<td>28. took two partners into his business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. did not satisfy</td>
<td>29. The Detroit Stove Works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. the needs of the people</td>
<td>30. largest stove-producing center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. than iron boxes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. a smaller iron box on top</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. used for an oven</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. The manufacture of stoves</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. began in Detroit during the 1830's</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. The people did not like waiting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. for a new stove or new parts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. if theirs became broken or cracked</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. The new stove and new parts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. had to be shipped</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. from Albany and Troy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Someone started repairing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. parts of the broken stoves</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Young Jerry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. was left alone</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. at the age of eleven years</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. The first stoves were shipped to Detroit from
   a. the north   b. the west   c. the east

2. The body of water used to ship the stoves was
   a. Lake Michigan   b. Lake Superior   c. Lake Erie

3. The early stoves shipped to Detroit were like
   a. an iron box   b. a round tube   c. a large tub

4. The oven on these early stoves was
   a. on the side   b. on the top   c. in the middle

5. This early stove
   a. pleased the people   b. did not satisfy the people
   c. was very small

6. The people did not like to wait for
   a. old parts   b. new parts   c. iron kettles

7. Very often these early stoves became
   a. very hot   b. broken   c. dirty

8. These early stoves were made of
   a. copper   b. steel   c. iron

9. Young Jerry Dwyer was left
   a. on the street   b. alone   c. in a house

10. When the stoves became broken or cracked they were
    a. thrown away   b. repaired   c. sent back

11. Because young Jerry was alone he went
    a. away   b. to play   c. into business

12. In his business Jerry had
    a. many hardships   b. many friends   c. many buildings

13. The number of partners Jerry had in his business was
    a. six   b. three   c. two

14. The name of Jerry's business was

15. Detroit became the stove-produing center in this country because
    a. more stoves were shipped   b. many people started making stoves
    c. more people bought stoves
Peace with Canada (B)

Part of our second war with Great Britain in 1812 was fought on the Great Lakes. This was quite natural, because they lie between the U.S. and Canada and Canada belonged to Great Britain. The position of the lakes makes them an easy road into either country. When the war ended, and the treaty was signed in 1815, both nations had gunboats on the lakes, and each side continued to build more boats at a great rate. However, in 1815 Congress told President Madison to sell or lay up all the lake fleet not needed to prevent smuggling. England was asked to do the same thing, so she sent over Charles Bagot to discuss such an arrangement. He and the American representative signed a treaty which put a limit to the number of ships each country might have. This was the beginning of what has turned out to be a long peace with good feeling between the United States and Canada.
1. Part of our second war
2. with Great Britain in 1812
3. was fought on the Great Lakes
4. This was quite natural
5. because they lie between the U.S. and Canada
6. Canada belonged to Great Britain
7. The position of the lakes
8. makes them an easy road into either country.
9. When the war ended
10. and the treaty was signed in 1815
11. both nations had gunboats on the lakes
12. each side continued
13. to build more boats
14. at a great rate
15. In 1815 Congress told President Madison
16. to sell or lay up
17. all the lake fleet
18. not needed to prevent smuggling
19. England was asked to do the same thing.
20. so she sent over Charles Bagot
21. to discuss such an arrangement
22. He and the American representative
23. signed a treaty
24. which put a limit
25. on the number of boats
26. each country might have
27. This was the beginning
28. of what turned out to be
29. a long peace with good feelings
30. between the United States and Canada
1. The second war was fought with (a) Great Britain (b) France (c) Canada
2. This war was fought in (a) 1815 (b) 1812 (c) 1817
3. Part of the war was fought on (a) England's shore (b) United States (c) Great Lakes
4. This was natural because (a) the lakes are a good way into either country (b) the two countries wanted to fight (c) the lakes always have water
5. The lakes lie between (a) Canada and Spain (b) Canada and England (c) Canada and the United States
6. When the war started (a) both nations built more boats (b) both nations stopped building boats (c) both nations did nothing
7. Some gun boats belonged to (a) Canada and the United States (b) Canada and Spain (c) Canada and the Great Lakes
8. The President at the time was (a) Adams (b) Madison (c) Jefferson
9. The President was told by (a) the King (b) the Congress (c) the people
10. England was asked (a) to build more boats (b) limit the number of boats (c) scrap all her boats
11. England's representative was (a) William Harrison (b) Charles Bagot (c) James Polk
12. Both representative signed (a) a truce (b) a treaty (c) a check
13. This agreed to (a) sink all the boats left (b) keep no boats (c) limit the number of boats
14. The boats kept were used to (a) stop smuggling (b) hold the boundary (c) hold war games
15. Both countries then had (a) a long period of war (b) a long period of peace (c) a long period of selling
A few years after the United States won its freedom, a ship, "The Grand Turk", came back from China. It was the first Yankee clipper to have made the voyage. It started an age that was full of excitement. Within six years the merchants had established a new trade route from Boston to the northwest coast. There the ships were loaded with skins from the Indians to trade with the Chinese. They returned to Boston carrying treasures from the Far East. The smell of cinnamon and sandalwood drifting up from Long Wharf scented the air. Fine china and beautiful silks became common luxuries in Boston. Brave men rounded South America as fearlessly as Cape Cod. An American was greeted in the Far East as "Bostonian". Ships and lives were lost in this bold adventure, but great fortunes were made.
A LIST OF IDEAS (C)

1. A few years
2. after the United States
3. won its freedom
4. a ship, "The Grand Turk"
5. came back from China
6. It was the first Yankee clipper
7. to have made the voyage
8. It started an age
9. that was full of excitement
10. Within six years the merchants
11. had established a new trade route
12. from Boston to the northwest coast
13. There the ships were loaded
14. with skins from the Indians
15. to trade with the Chinese
16. They returned to Boston
17. carrying treasures from the Far East
18. The smell of cinnamon and sandalwood
19. drifting up from Long Wharf
20. scented the air
21. Fine china and beautiful silks
22. became common luxuries in Boston
23. Brave men
24. rounded South America
25. as fearlessly as Cape Cod
26. An American was greeted
27. in the Far East as "Bostonian"
28. Ships and lives were lost
29. in this bold adventure
30. but great fortunes were made
1. The name of the ship that came back from China was the
   (a) Flying Cloud, (b) Grand Turk, (c) Star of Kansas

2. The clipper returned from China after the United States
   (a) won its freedom, (b) lost its freedom, (c) invaded England

3. The first ship to return was the
   (a) The Star of Kansas, (b) The Flying Cloud, (c) The Grand Turk

4. The merchants established new trade routes
   (a) with England, (b) with the northeast, (c) with the northwest

5. This trading with the Far East started a new age
   (a) that was full of calmness, (b) that was full of excitement,
   (c) that was unimportant

6. The trade routes were established
   (a) in six years, (b) with skins, (c) with coffee

7. The ships were loaded in the northwest
   (a) with fish, (b) with skins, (c) with coffee

8. The ships returned from China carrying
   (a) articles of little value, (b) corn, (c) treasures

9. The air was scented with the smell of
   (a) rubber, (b) cinnamon, (c) violets

10. The smell drifted up from the
    (a) factory, (b) wharf, (c) hills

11. From China the merchants brought back
    (a) fine china, (b) coffee, (c) rubber

12. A common luxury in Boston at this time was
    (a) cotton, (b) silk, (c) rayon

13. An American was greeted in the Far East as
    (a) "Virginian", (b) "New Yorker", (c) "Bostonian"

14. Brave men went to China by rounding
    (a) North America, (b) South America, (c) Greenland

15. The new trading with China made many merchants in Boston
    (a) poor, (b) wealthy, (c) unhappy
The Hippopotamus (C)

In the dense forest hidden behind the vines, the jungle friends dwelt. The bravest of all the animals was the hippopotamus who called himself king of the animal kingdom. Perched high in the tree was an owl who seemed to guard the forest by night. As the hippopotamus lay near the pool the owl gave a weird shriek, "Who gave you the right to rule the kingdom? This forest rightfully belongs to my father. I am commanding you to release your kingship at once. All day you give orders to the forest dwellers and they follow your orders. In the name of Sir Owl the Great, I bid you dismount the throne."

Boldly the hippopotamus spoke, "Just one whisk at you my fine feathered friend and all this kingdom would come to pass. I absolutely refuse to take orders from one as small and commanding as you. This native home I will never leave."

As the last words faded from the hippo's lips, the owl landed on the hippopotamus' back and pierced his claws near the king's heart. This brought immediate death to the ruler of the kingdom.
1. In the dense forest  
2. hidden behind the vines  
3. the jungle friends dwelt  
4. the bravest of all the animals  
5. was the hippopotamus  
6. king of animal kingdom  
7. perched high in the tree  
8. was an owl who seemed  
9. to guard the forest by night  
10. as the hippopotamus lay near the pool  
11. the Owl gave a weird shriek  
12. who gave you the right to rule the kingdom  
13. this forest rightfully belongs to my father  
14. I am commanding you to release your kingship at once  
15. All day you give orders  
16. to the forest dwellers  
17. and they follow your orders  
18. in the name of Sir Owl the Great  
19. I bid you dismount the throne  
20. boldly the hippopotamus spoke  
21. just one whisk at you my fine feathered friend  
22. and all this kingdom would come to pass  
23. I absolutely refuse to take orders  
24. from one as small and commanding as you  
25. this native home I will never leave  
26. As last words faded from hippo’s lips  
27. the owl landed on hippopotamus' back  
28. pierced his claws near king's heart  
29. brought immediate death to ruler of kingdom  
30.
A MULTIPLE CHOICE TEST (D)

1. The forest rightfully belonged to the
   (a) owl's uncle, (b) owl's father, (c) hippopotamus

2. The jungle friends dwelt
   (a) in the woods, (b) in the dense forest, (c) in the kingdom

3. The hippopotamus was killed by
   (a) owl's beak, (b) owl's claws, (c) another animal

4. Sir Owl the Great bade the hippopotamus
   (a) come out of the pool, (b) dismount the throne, (c) follow his orders

5. Very still the hippopotamus lay near
   (a) the river, (b) the lake, (c) the pool

6. The owl guarded the forest
   (a) all day, (b) all night, (c) day and night

7. The kingdom would come to pass from
   (a) whisk, (b) battle, (c) death

8. When last words faded from Owl's lips
   (a) owl fell dead, (b) hippopotamus fell dead, (c) pierced claws in hippopotamus

9. The bravest of all the animals was
   (a) lion, (b) owl, (c) hippopotamus

10. All day the "hippo" gave orders to
    (a) cave dwellers, (b) forest dwellers, (c) tree dwellers

11. The owl gave a
    (a) funny laugh, (b) forest dwellers, (c) tree dwellers

12. Sir Owl the Great was called
    (a) high feathered friend, (b) fine feathered friend, (c) feathered friend

13. The hippopotamus spoke to the owl
    (a) friendly, (b) pleasantly, (c) boldly

14. The hippopotamus was pierced by the owl
    (a) near his brain, (b) near his heart, (c) in his back

15. The hippopotamus told Sir Owl the Great
    (a) that he would never leave his native home, (b) that he was happy to leave home, (c) that he was afraid to leave home.
Pedro is a Mexican boy who lives in Puebla. He is part Spanish and Indian.

Long ago missionaries from Spain settled in Mexico. These Spanish missionaries introduced a coating which is used on pottery that the people of Puebla make. This coating which contains lead and tin is often called glaze. The pottery is baked once, then coated or glazed, and later decorated with bright blue or yellow. Although many kinds of things are made of this pottery, the most important ones are tiles and large jars. These are decorated with colorful designs of birds and flowers. Figures of saints are also used on the tiles.

Some of the pottery of Puebla is copies from the 1700's. It can be recognized by its colors of orange, black, and pale green. Many different designs are drawn on it which make us think of Europe and China. Pedro helps his parents make this pottery.
A LIST OF IDEAS

1. Pedro is a Mexican boy
2. lives in Puebla
3. He is part Indian
4. part Spanish
5. missionaries from Spain
6. settled in Mexico
7. Spanish missionaries introduced a coating
8. used on pottery
9. people of Puebla make
10. coating contains lead
11. and tin
12. is often called glaze
13. pottery is baked once
14. then coated or glazed
15. later decorated
16. bright yellow or blue
17. many kinds of things are made of this pottery
18. most important ones are tiles
19. large jars
20. These are decorated with colorful designs of birds
21. and flowers
22. Figures of saints are used on the tiles
23. pottery is copied from the 1700’s
24. its colors are orange, black, and pale green
25. different designs are drawn on it
26. make us think of Europe
27. and China
28. Pedro helps
29. his parents
30. make this pottery
1. The Mexican boy in this story is called (a) Pedro, (b) Laredo, (c) Jose
2. He lives in (a) Mexico City, (b) Puebla, (c) Taxco
3. Mexicans are part (a) Chinese, (b) Indian, (c) Italian
4. Missionaries who settled in Mexico in early times came from (a) India, (b) Mexico, (c) Spain
5. The people of Puebla make (a) coats, (b) rugs, (c) pottery
6. The glaze used on the pottery contains (a) copper and tin, (b) lead and copper, (c) tin and lead
7. The coating put on the pottery is called (a) glaze, (b) copper, (c) yellow
8. The pottery is baked (a) once, (b) twice, (c) three times
9. After the pottery is baked it is (a) decorated, (b) glazed, (c) painted
10. Pictures of saints are painted mostly on (a) jars, (b) tiles, (c) birds
11. Some of the pottery is copied from pottery of (a) 1492, (b) 1951, (c) 1700
12. Pottery is decorated with (a) ships, (b) birds, (c) Indians
13. Some of the designs make us think of (a) China, (b) United States, (c) Europe
14. Pedro helps his (a) friends, (b) brother make pottery, (c) parents
15. Few things are made of pottery in Puebla.
What the Colonists Learned from the Indians (F)

The Indians taught the white man many valuable things, -- the worth of Indian corn, the way of hunting and fishing, the value of the canoe, the wigwam form of tent, the use of the moccasin for traveling in the forest, and of the snowshoe for walking on the surface of the snow in winter in search of food.

They also taught the colonists how to make corn grow in the forest by burning or girdling the trees, thereby killing them and letting in the sunshine. Thus the crops grew without the hard labor of cutting down the trees. The colonists were also taught by the red man how to hunt and trap game and to fish through the ice of the lakes and rivers. When treated with kindness the Indian was a friend and often warned the colonists of the approach of Indian war parties.
A LIST OF IDEAS

1. Indians taught
2. white man
3. many valuable things
4. worth of Indian corn
5. way of hunting
6. and fishing
7. value of the canoe
8. wigwam form of tent
9. use of moccasin for traveling
10. in the forest
11. snowshoe for walking
12. on surface of snow
13. in winter
14. in search of food
15. how to make corn grow
16. in forest
17. by burning
18. or girdling the trees
19. thereby killing them
20. letting in the sunshine
21. Thus crops grow
22. without hard labor
23. of cutting down trees
24. to hunt
25. to fish
26. through ice of lakes and rivers
27. when treated with kindness
28. Indian was a friend
29. often warned the colonists
30. of the approach of Indian War Parties
MULTIPLE CHOICE  (F)

1. The things which the Indians taught the colonists were (a) harmful, (b) valuable, (c) unimportant

2. Indians taught the white man the worth of Indian (a) corn, (b) wigwams, (c) cooking

3. The value of the canoe was learned from the Indians

4. The Indians cleared the forest by (a) burning the trees, (b) chopping the trees, (c) growing corn in the forest

5. They planted corn (a) in plowed fields, (b) in cleared forest land, (c) on hilly land

6. The colonists learned better ways of hunting and (a) trapping, (b) shooting, (c) fishing

7. For traveling through the forest the Indians (a) walked barefoot, (b) wore snowshoes (c) wore moccasins

8. Girdling the trees (a) destroys them, (b) weakens them, (c) strengthens them

9. When we say "colonists" we mean (a) natives, (b) red men, (c) white men

10. The Indians were always a friend of the white man

11. Burning and girdling the trees let in (a) heat, (b) rain, (c) sun

12. The approach of Indian parties was often a sign of (a) rejoicing, (b) war, (c) friendship

13. Indians broke through the ice of lakes and rivers so that they could (a) obtain water for drinking, (b) fish, (c) paddle their canoes

14. Indian methods of growing corn made the colonists work (a) harder, (b) about the same, (c) easier

15. The Indians were friendly if they were (a) treated with kindness, (b) paid with corn, (c) allowed to hunt
Tecumseh (g)

As the white men pushed steadily westward after the Louisiana Purchase, the Indians found themselves deprived more and more of their hunting grounds. The pioneers were woodsmen, and they needed much timber to supply buildings, fences and fuel. When the timber was gone in one place, the pioneer moved to a new supply. The new land usually belonged to some Indian tribe, but the Indians were fast losing it by dishonest means. This came to a halt for a time in 1809 because of the work of Tecumseh, and his brother. These two Shawnees tried to save their people by reforming their habits, keeping them from the whites, and joining together all the tribes east of the Mississippi. Even with the joining of all the tribes east of the Mississippi there were fewer than 4,000 warriors. Against them were at least 200,000 white men in the Ohio Valley. Tecumseh was the warrior, and his brother the religious leader. This was a strange combination and quite new to the frontier. Many Indians, under their influence, actually gave up all dealings with the white, except for necessary trade. The brothers began a settlement at Tippecanoe on the Wabash river. This action alarmed the whole frontier. Governor Harrison, in answer, made a treaty with a few Indians of that section and took away the hunting ground from Tecumseh. Harrison made more allies and marched to the camp of Tecumseh. Although Tecumseh sent messages of peace to the whites, it was of no use. A large party of pale faces in the neighborhood was too much for the young Indian braves who loved fighting, and a battle broke out. After a fight of two hours the Indian camp was destroyed. The work of Tecumseh collapsed and Governor Harrison became so popular as a result of the victory, that he was later elected president.
1. As the white man pushed steadily westward
2. after the Louisiana Purchase
3. the Indians found themselves
4. deprived more and more
5. of their hunting ground
6. The pioneers were woodsmen
7. They needed much timber
8. to supply buildings fences and fuel
9. When the timber was gone in one place
10. The pioneer moved
11. to a new supply
12. The land usually belonged
13. to some Indian tribe
14. but the Indians were fast losing it
15. by dishonest means
16. This came to a halt for a time in 1809
17. because of the work of Tecumseh and his brother
18. These two Shawnees
19. tried to save their people
20. by reforming their habits
21. keeping them from the white
22. and joining together all of the tribes
23. east of the Mississippi
24. Even with the joining of the tribes
25. there were fewer than 4,000 warriors
26. against them were 200,000 white men
27. in the Ohio valley
28. Tecumseh was the warrior
29. his brother the religious leader
30. This was a strange combination
31. and quite new to the frontier
32. Many Indians
33. under their influence
34. actually gave up
35. all dealings with whites
36. except for necessary trade
37. The two brothers began a settlement
38. at Tippecanoe
39. on the Wabash River
This action alarmed the whole frontier

Gov. Harrison, in answer made a treaty with a few Indians

of the section and took away the hunting ground from Tecumseh

He made more allies and marched to the camp of Tecumseh

Although Tecumseh sent messages of peace to the white

it was of no use A large party of palefaces

in the neighborhood was too much for the young Indian braves who loved fighting

A battle broke out

After a fight of two hours The Indian camp was destroyed the work of Tecumseh collapsed

Gov. Harrison became so popular as a result of the victory

he was later elected president
1. The white men were pushing (a) eastward, (b) southward, (c) westward

2. The Indians were (a) losing their land, (b) keeping their land, (c) finding new land

3. Pioneers used much wood because (a) it soon wore out, (b) most things were made of it, (c) it was easy to cut

4. When timber was gone in one place (a) they moved to a new section, (b) planted new trees, (c) used the old wood

5. The lands belonged to (a) the United States, (b) the people near it, (c) the Indian tribes

6. The white men got the land (a) by buying it, (b) by taking it, (c) by leasing it

7. This came to a halt (a) for a time, (b) for always, (c) only recently

8. The person who helped stop it was (a) Tippecanoe, (b) Harrison, (c) Tecumseh

9. He had the help of (a) his cousin, (b) his brother, (c) his father

10. They belonged to the tribe called (a) Iroquois, (b) Pawnee, (c) Shawnee

11. They tried to help their people by (a) joining them with the whites, (b) keeping them from the whites, (c) moving them away

12. He joined together (a) the tribes east of the Mississippi, (b) the tribes west of the Mississippi, (c) the tribes east and west of the Mississippi

13. This gave the Indians (a) 4,000 warriors, (b) 150,000 warriors, (c) 200,000 warriors

14. The white men had (a) 100,000 warriors, (b) 4,000 warriors, (c) 200,000 warriors

15. These forces were in the (a) Wabash Valley, (b) Mississippi Valley, (c) Ohio Valley
16. One leader was the warrior, the other (a) the political leader, (b) the religious leader, (c) the industrial leader.

17. This combination was (a) strange to the frontier, (b) common to the frontier, (c) necessary to the frontier.

18. The Indians were allowed (a) to mingle with the whites, (b) to trade with the whites, (c) to speak with the whites.

19. The frontier was (a) pleased at the idea, (b) alarmed at the idea, (c) disgusted at the idea.

20. The governor at the time was (a) Standish, (b) Warren, (c) Harrison.

21. The Indian leaders made a settlement (a) on the Ohio river, (b) on the Wabash river, (c) on the Mississippi river.

22. The governor in answer (a) made a new treaty, (b) sent a note, (c) declared war.

23. The Indians now had (a) lost their hunting ground, (b) gained new land, (c) became good friends.

24. The Indian chief tried (a) to start a war, (b) to have no battle, (c) to get away.

25. Trouble began because (a) whites fired first, (b) both fired together, (c) braves loved to fight.

26. The battle lasted (a) six hours, (b) two hours, (c) ten hours.

27. As a result of the battle (a) the Indian camp was destroyed, (b) the braves beat off the attack, (c) the whites were defeated.

28. The work of the Indian chief (a) became more important, (b) collapsed, (c) kept peace for six years.

29. The governor became (a) very sick, (b) very unpopular, (c) very popular.

30. He was later elected (a) president, (b) senator, (c) king.
The Hero (H)

It was the last half of the ninth inning. The Simburg Eagles were trailing the Tilton Tigers by a score of four to three.

Jimmy Brown was playing his first game at third base for the Eagles. The season was almost half over and this was Jimmy's first chance to play in a game. Up until today he had sat on the bench hoping for a chance to play. His chance came in the very first inning of today's game. The regular third baseman, Tod Henning, had sprained his ankle sliding into second base.

Jimmy wanted to make good. He had played fairly well in the field but he hadn't got a hit in three times at bat. He knew he was trying too hard, but he wanted to show Manager Johnny Miller that he was a good ball player.

Lanny Trent had led off this inning by hitting a high fly to center field. The next man up, Chick Lund, had singled over the shortstop's head. The third man up, Tommy Parker, had hit a slow grounder to third. He was thrown out at first on a very close play.

Now it was Jimmy Brown's turn at bat. As he stepped into the batter's box he could hear his team-mates shouting encouragement to him. With a man on second base, two out and his team behind by one run, it was up to him.

The first pitch curved right over the plate for a called strike. Jimmy swung at the next pitch and hit a foul ball into the Tigers' dugout. Now he had two strikes on him. He had to make good on his first day, he kept telling himself.

He got ready for the next pitch. The pitcher reared back and threw the ball. Jimmy swung hard and felt the bat meet the ball. He heard the
crowd cheer wildly. The ball sailed up and over the left field fence. A home run! He had won the game!
A LIST OF IDEAS

1. It was the last half of the ninth inning
2. The Simburg Eagles were trailing the Tilton Tigers
3. By a score of four to three
4. Jimmy Brown was playing his first game
5. At third base
6. For the Eagles
7. The season was almost half over
8. This was Jimmy's first chance to play in a game
9. Up until today he had sat on the bench
10. Hoping for a chance to play
11. His chance came in the first inning
12. Of today's game
13. The regular third baseman, Tod Hennig
14. Had sprained his ankle
15. Sliding into second base
16. Jimmy wanted to make good
17. He had played fairly well
18. In the field
19. He hadn't got a hit
20. In three times at bat
21. He knew he was trying too hard
22. He wanted to show Manager Johnny Miller
23. That he was a good ball player
24. Lanny Trent
25. Had led off this inning
26. By hitting a high fly
27. To center field
28. The next man up, Chick Lund
29. Had singled
30. Over the shortstop's head
31. The third man up
32. Tommy Parker
33. Had hit a slow grounder
34. To third
35. He was thrown out
36. At first on a very close play
37. Now it was Jimmy Brown's turn at bat
38. As he stepped into the batter's box
39. He could hear his team-mates shouting encouragement to him
40. With a man on second
41. Two out
42. His team behind by one run
43. It was up to him
44. The first pitch curved right over the plate
45. For a called strike
46. Jimmy swung at the next pitch
47. Hit a foul ball
48. Into the Tigers' dugout
49. He had two strikes on him
50. He had to make good on his first day
51. He kept telling himself
52. He got ready for the next pitch
53. The pitcher reared back
54. Threw the ball
55. Jimmy swung hard
56. Felt the bat meet the ball
57. "I heard the crowd cheer wildly"
58. The ball sailed up and over the left field fence
59. A home run
60. He had won the ball game
MULTIPLE CHOICE (II)

1. It was the last half of the (a) first inning, (b) seventh inning, (c) ninth inning

2. The score was (a) four to three, (b) two to one, (c) three to one

3. Jimmy Brown was playing (a) third base, (b) first base, (c) second base

4. Jimmy played for the (a) Tilton Tigers, (b) Simburg Eagles, (c) Simburg Tigers

5. The season was almost (a) two thirds over, (b) half over, (c) one third over

6. Up until today he had (a) played left field, (b) played first base, (c) sat on the bench

7. His chance to play came in the (a) fifth inning, (b) second inning, (c) first inning

8. The regular third baseman had (a) broken his arm, (b) sprained his ankle, (c) broken his ankle

9. The regular third baseman's name was (a) Tod Henning, (b) Johnny Miller, (c) Chick Lund

10. Jimmy hadn't got a hit in (a) three times at bat, (b) four times at bat, (c) two times at bat

11. The manager's name was (a) Tod Henning, (b) Chick Lund, (c) Johnny Miller

12. Larry Trent led off the inning by hitting (a) a single to center field, (b) a single to left field, (c) a high fly to center field

13. The next man up had singled (a) over the short-stop's head, (b) through the first baseman's legs, (c) over the second base bag

14. The third man up, Tommy Parker, hit a slow grounder to (a) first base, (b) second base, (c) third base

15. On a close play, Tommy was thrown out at (a) first base, (b) second base, (c) third base
16. As Jimmy Brown came to bat, the situation was (a) bases loaded, no outs, (b) man on second, two outs, (c) a man on first, one out

17. The first pitch thrown to him was a (a) fast ball, (b) slow ball, (c) curve

18. Jimmy hit a foul ball on the (a) second pitch, (b) third pitch, (c) first pitch

19. The foul ball went into the (a) Eagles' dugout, (b) Tigers' dugout, (c) box seats

20. Jimmy hit the home run (a) over the right field fence, (b) over the left field fence, (c) over the center field fence
The Matterhorn (I)

The Matterhorn is a beautiful glittering mountain peak on the Italian border of the Swiss Alps. Climbing the mountain is often dangerous because fog and snowstorms often occur.

In the village at the foot of the mountain, guides can be hired by the mountain climbers. Leggings, mittens, woolen helmets, mountain shoes, and ice axes are required for climbing.

As one travels up the valley the Matterhorn looks like the paws of a crouching tiger. Along the roadside are broken cliffs and steep slopes. Nearby is a museum containing clothes and ice axes of English climbers. From here the zigzag path stretches on. Behind them is a deep valley with high steep slopes. Along the ice-covered trail is a shelter. Rising above is a huge half circle of rocky crags. The Matterhorn is now an overhanging cliff a mile high. Following the trail the climber must climb up and down pointed rocks which are like the teeth on a saw. These rocks are not more than twenty inches wide. He must then climb straight upward on rocks and cliffs a thousand feet. The wind blows very hard all the time.

Near the top ropes are tied to iron stakes. The climber has to pull himself up these ice-covered ropes hand over hand. As he reaches the top the snow blows around and it is hard to breathe because of the thin air.

Seven English sportsmen started the hard climb in 1865. On the ice near a snowbank one man slipped. Luckily he was tied to the other by a rope. They all reached the top successfully. The Matterhorn had been conquered.

Adapted from Richard Haliburton's "Royal Road to Romance"
1. The Matterhorn is a beautiful glittering mountain peak on the Italian border of the Swiss Alps. Climbing the mountain is often dangerous because of fog and snowstorms. Guides can be hired in the village at the foot of the mountain by the mountain climbers. Leggings and mittens are necessary. Woolen helmets and mountain shoes are required. Ice axes are needed. One travels up the valley. The Matterhorn looks like the paws of a crouching tiger. Along the roadside are broken cliffs and steep slopes.

23. Nearby is a museum containing clothes and ice axes. Of English climbers, zigzag path stretches on. Behind is a deep valley with high steep slopes. The ice-covered trail is a shelter. Rising above is a huge half circle. Of rocky crags, Matterhorn is an overhanging cliff. A mile high, following the trail the climber must climb up and down. Pointed rocks like the teeth on a saw. Rocks are not more than 20 inches wide. He must climb straight upward on rocks and cliffs. A thousand feet high, wind blows very hard.
43. near the top
44. ropes are tied
45. to iron stakes
46. climber has to pull himself up
47. ice-covered ropes
48. hand over hand
49. as he reaches the top
50. the snow blows around
51. it is hard to breathe
52. because of thin air
53. Seven
54. English sportsmen
55. started to climb
56. in 1865
57. One man slipped
58. he was tied to the others by a rope
59. they reached the top successfully
60. Mitterhorn conquered
1. The Matterhorn is a mountain peak that is (a) low, (b) dismal, (c) sparkling.

2. The Matterhorn is located on the (a) Swiss border, (b) Italian border, (c) English border.

3. Climbing the mountain is dangerous because of (a) fog, (b) thin air, (c) crouching tigers.

4. (A) Climbers, (b) Guides, (c) Burros can be hired at the foot of the mountain.

5. Ice axes for the mountain climbers are (a) required, (b) useful, (c) useless.

6. Along the roadside are broken (a) valleys, (b) cliffs, (c) sticks.

7. Near the roadside is a (a) restaurant, (b) store, (c) museum.

8. The trail up the mountain is covered with (a) ice, (b) snow, (c) sand.

9. For protection from the storms the mountain climbers use the (a) museum, (b) shelter, (c) ropes.

10. The overhanging cliff of the Matterhorn from the path is (a) a mile high, (b) a thousand feet, (c) a hundred feet.

11. The rocks are (a) flat, (b) smooth, (c) pointed.

12. The climber must climb on rocks less than (a) 12 inches wide, (b) 20 inches wide, (c) 36 inches wide.

13. The wind blows (a) hard, (b) little, (c) none at all.

14. (a) Ropes, (b) Stakes, (c) Irons are tied near the top to help the climbers.

15. (a) Wooden, (b) Iron, (c) Concrete stakes are driven into the rock near the top of the mountain.

16. The ropes become coated with (a) iron, (b) ice, (c) dust.

17. The climbers pull themselves up by ropes (a) at the bottom, (b) at the top, (c) in the valley.
18. At the top of the mountain the (a) snow blows around (b) ice (c) rain
19. At the top of the mountain it is hard to (a) hear, (b) breathe, (c) see
20. The air on the top of the mountain is (a) heavy, (b) thin, (c) quiet
21. (a) Seven, (b) Four, (c) Two men reached the top the first time successfully
22. These men were (a) English, (b) Italian, (c) Swiss
23. The men who first reached the top were (a) army, (b) navy, (c) sports men
24. The Matterhorn was first climbed successfully in (a) 1492, (b) 1776, (c) 1865
25. The man who slipped was (a) injured, (b) saved, (c) tangled by ropes
26. (a) Few, (b) None, (c) All of the men reached the top
27. The Matterhorn was (a) explored, (b) conquered, (c) exploited
28. (a) Steel, (b) Woolen, (c) Brass helmets are used by the climbers
29. In some places the mountain resembles the paws of a (a) tiger, (b) lion, (c) cat
30. The path is very (a) straight, (b) crooked, (c) smooth
When Tom arrived at his uncle's ranch in Texas, his eyes were wide with excitement. He had just been told that a panther, an animal similar to a lion, had been killing cattle and spreading terror in the village. There had been two of them, but a ranchman had caught the younger one as it had strayed from the woods early in the morning. The older one was very cunning and knew enough to hide during the morning. That night several men were going to set a trap for the wild animal. Tom was invited to go along. This was very exciting for a boy who had just arrived from New York City. A piece of meat was placed near a cave where the panther was believed to hide. Armed with rifles the men waited for the animal to approach. Suddenly there was a great howl from the woods and the fierce animal emerged close to where Tom was standing. The boy was scared and trembled at the sight of the beast. Tom's uncle was an excellent shot as he had been a hunter. Calmly taking his gun, he fired at the animal's head. The animal bounded toward Tom, but his uncle fired again as it was ready to pounce on the boy. It snarled fiercely and with a great thud fell to the ground. While inspecting the animal's body, the men shuddered at the thought of what might have happened to the boy. Tom's uncle promised him that he might take the panther's skin home as a souvenir of their adventure. You should have seen the happy look on Tom's face as they strolled homeward.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A LIST OF IDEAS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. When Tom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. arrived at his uncle's ranch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. in Texas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. his eyes were wide with excitement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. He had just been told</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. that a panther</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. an animal similar to a lion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. had been killing cattle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. and spreading fear in the village</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. There had been two of them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. but a ranchman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. had caught the younger one</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. as it had strayed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. from the woods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. early in the morning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. The older one</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. was very cunning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. knew enough to hide during the day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. That night several men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. were going to set a trap</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. for the wild animal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Tom was invited to go</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
but his uncle fired again
as it was ready to pounce
on the boy
It snarled fiercely
with a great thud fell to the ground
While inspecting the animal's body
the men shuddered at the thought
of what might have happened to the boy
Tom's uncle
promised him
that he might have the panther's skin
to take home to New York
as a souvenir
of their adventure
You should have seen the happy look
on Tom's face
as they strolled homeward
MULTIPLE CHOICE  

1. The ranch belonged to Tom's (a) father, (b) cousin, (c) uncle
2. The ranch was (a) in Colorado, (b) in Texas, (c) in Canada
3. A panther is an animal similar to (a) a deer, (b) a gazelle, (c) a lion
4. The panther killed (a) birds, (b) cattle, (c) natives
5. The wild animal spread terror (a) in the mountains, (b) in the desert, (c) in the village
6. There had been at the beginning (a) three of these beasts, (b) two of these beasts, (c) one panther
7. The younger one had been captured (a) by Tom, (b) by the uncle, (c) by a ranchman
8. The older panther was (a) cunning, (b) unwise, (c) ill
9. The younger one had strayed into the village (a) during the night, (b) during the early morning, (c) during the night
10. A group of men decided (a) to tame the older panther, (b) to set a trap for the older panther, (c) to help the older panther
11. Tom was (a) invited to go, (b) not invited to go, (c) forgotten
12. The boy thought it would be (a) a thrill, (b) unexciting, (c) unimportant
13. Tom had come from (a) Boston, (b) New York City, (c) Texas
14. A piece of meat was placed near (a) a hill, (b) a barn, (c) a cave
15. The men were (a) unarmed, (b) armed with clubs, (c) armed with rifles
16. The wild animal appeared very close to (a) a ranchman, (b) Tom, (c) the uncle
17. The animal was ready to pounce on (a) the uncle, (b) the ranchman, (c) Tom
18. The old panther was shot by (a) a ranchman, (b) the boy, (c) the uncle
19. The sight of the beast made the boy (a) bold, (b) courageous, (c) tremble.

20. Tom's uncle promised him that he might take home (a) the panther's skin, (b) the rifle, (c) a photograph.
KINTU

Up and up Kintu climbed, with his spear between his strong teeth, and his fingers and toes holding tight until he nearly reached the top of the big tree.

Then he sat down on a big branch with his spear across his knees. He was hot and out of breath, but he felt a little safer.

Soon the moon came up, big and round above the trees. Each leaf shone brightly in its light. Hours passed. Kintu, too tired to think of fear any longer, settled himself against the tree trunk and slept.

This is a test for handwriting.