An analysis of the relevance of illustrations to text in five basal reading series for grade six.

Nixon, Theodore Phillips
Boston University

http://hdl.handle.net/2144/10734
Boston University
BOSTON UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION

THESIS

AN ANALYSIS
OF THE RELEVANCE OF ILLUSTRATIONS
TO TEXT IN FIVE BASAL READING SERIES
FOR GRADE SIX

Submitted by
Theodore Phillips Nixon
(A.B., Bowdoin College, 1950)

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
For the Degree of Master of Education

August, 1951
First Reader: Helen A. Murphy, Professor of Education
Second Reader: Donald D. Durrell, Professor of Education
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plan of the Study</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of Data</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary and Conclusions</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

In recent years the illustrations in children's books have played an important role in creating increased sales appeal and increased reader interest. Young people's books are no longer the drab and unimaginative type of texts frequently associated with school work—they are cleverly written, colorfully illustrated, and carefully geared to the particular interests of young people. Regardless of their eye appeal, however, illustrations in children's books have an important function. Wisely used, they may increase the reader's general comprehension of the story by helping him with new word meanings, new concepts, and new experiences. Frequently illustrations do not fulfill this function—they are only incidental where they could be purposeful.

It is with the effectiveness of the illustrations in five basal reader series on the sixth grade level that this thesis is concerned. A basal reader series is a carefully constructed set of books, suitable for use in the elementary grades, designed to help the child learn to read. A series usually consists of two or three primers, a first reader, and one or two books for each grade level up through the sixth grade. The basic words in the primers and successive readers are presented systematically and repeated frequently throughout the remainder of the same book and series so that, with guidance and additional drill provided by the teacher, a child can gradually develop a sound reading ability. In basal readers particularly, illustrations ought to be important aids in helping the child with word meanings, new
concepts, and new experiences, in the general reading program.

This thesis is part of a group project whose purpose is to find and classify the errors in the illustrations in five basal series from the second grade level through the sixth. The project is a follow-up on Peck's thesis,¹ in which the errors in illustrations in primers and first grade readers of five basal series have been located and classified. This thesis, as the others in the group project, makes use of Peck's classification of errors and is specifically concerned with the errors in illustrations in the sixth grade level readers of the same five series. Those series are 1) The Ginn Basic Readers, 2) The Laidlaw Basic Readers, 3) Today's Work-Play Books (The Macmillan Company), 4) The Reading Foundation Series (Row, Peterson and Company), and 5) The Curriculum Foundation Series (Scott, Foresman and Company). Only the most recent editions of the series are used in the analysis. Five books will be used for the study, and a total of 710 illustrations will be analyzed.

This thesis is part of a group study.

CHAPTER I - PLAN OF THE STUDY

The purpose of this study was to analyze illustrations in basal reading series for grade six. The five basal reading series analyzed are identical with those analyzed in Peck's study and are series which are used widely in the teaching of elementary school reading.

The following series were examined:


2) Yoakam, Gerald, Hester, Kathleen, Abney, Louise, Laidlaw Basic Readers, Laidlaw Bros., Inc., New York, 1949. Sixth Reader: From Every Land


To conduct the analysis it was necessary to develop some constant according to which the illustrations used in the study could be

\(^{2}\text{Ibid.}\)
compared. This constant took the form of a check list of eighteen (18) items, and every illustration in the five basal series was examined individually and rated against each item on the check list. The check list used in this study is the same one used by Peck in her analysis\(^3\) of the illustrations in five basal reading series for grade one. The items making up her check list were arrived at after examination of the illustrations in the five basal series revealed the fact that certain discrepancies occurred frequently.

The check list used in the study follows:

**CHECK LIST FOR ILLUSTRATIONS**

1. Inaccurate illustration of action words.
2. Inaccurate illustration of size concepts.
3. Inaccurate illustration of position.
4. Inaccurate illustration of color.
5. Inaccurate word and story concepts.
6. Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact.
7. Inaccurate illustration of real life situations.
8. Inaccurate illustration of people, places, or things.
9. Illustrations which are unrelated to the text.
10. Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas or only a portion of the text content.
11. Illustrations placed before the text.
12. Illustrations placed after the text.

\(^{3}\text{Ibid.}\)
13. Illustrations which lack clarity in size.
14. Illustrations which lack clarity in shape.
15. Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline.
16. Illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition.
17. Illustrations which show changes in a unit.
18. Illustrations which show results which would be expected from text content.

EXAMPLES OF EACH TYPE OF ERROR

1. Inaccurate illustration of action words: Illustrations which show actions different from the actions described in the accompanying text. Page 220 in Let's Go Ahead\(^1\) presents the text,

   "In the fall I'd like to see
   In answer to my whistle,
   A golden spaniel look at me—
   But best of all for rain
   A terrier, hairy as a thistle,
   To trot with fine disdain
   Beside me down the soaked, sweet-smelling lane."

   The accompanying illustration, number 57, shows a girl with a terrier jumping up to her, not trotting beside her as the text indicates.

2. Inaccurate illustration of size concepts: Illustrations in which the size of the person, place, or thing described in the text is not made clear or obvious. No errors of this type were found in the five readers analyzed.

3. Inaccurate illustration of position: Illustrations which do not show positions clearly and exactly, when position is described in

the text. Page 15 in Wings to Adventure⁵ presents the text, "Suddenly a heavy body struck him from the rear, knocking him to the ground." The accompanying illustration, number 7, shows a boy with only his face and legs visible, being upset by a bucking calf, which is in front of him.

4. Inaccurate illustration of color: Illustrations which do not show the exact colors described in the text. Page 199 in Runaway Home⁶ presents the text, "After a while, father came out, followed by a long, thin man with sandy-colored hair and blue eyes." The accompanying illustration, number 73, shows the man with grey hair.

5. Inaccurate word and story concepts; Illustrations which present inaccurate or incorrect ideas, which do not help to clarify the words or ideas of the text, or which convey ideas which have little or no bearing on the text content. Page 404 in People and Progress⁷ presents the text, "All day long a strange sloop had been lying just off shore." A sloop is a fore-and-aft rigged vessel with one mast and a single headsail jib. The accompanying illustration, number 158, shows a three-masted vessel, which is obviously a much larger type of craft than a sloop.


6. Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact: Illustrations which by their content or appearance belie the statements of fact set forth in the text. Page 87 in Let's Go Ahead presents the text, "Down the main street of old Julesburg a cloud of dust arose. Nearer it came and took shape to show a stagecoach with six galloping horses and a driver who sat aloft and cracked his whip." The accompanying illustration, number 22, shows a stagecoach with only two horses.

7. Inaccurate illustration of real life situations: Illustrations which depict people, places, things, or situations in a way which is not true to life. Page 53 in From Every Land presents the text, "John is a boy of twelve. He doesn't like spinach. When his mother has spinach for dinner, John looks injured. He doesn't keep still and let others enjoy this excellent vegetable." The accompanying illustration, number 13, shows the food on John's plate, but everything is brown. Spinach is normally green.

8. Inaccurate illustration of people, places, or things: Illustrations which do not show people, places, or things as they have been described in the text. Page 50 in Wings To Adventure presents the text, "We just got here this morning, and I've got to get the


plate out of our suitcase....I've got....There!" The accompanying illustration, number 26, shows several large packing crates, but no suitcase.

9. Illustrations which are unrelated to the text: Illustrations which have no bearing on the text and no connection with it, but which are used merely as decoration. No errors of this type were found in the five readers analyzed.

10. Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas, or only a portion of the text content: Illustrations which enlarge on the incidental material of the text and neglect the main idea, or which reflect the text incompletely. Page 172 in From Every Land presents part of a text of a play depicting the youth and explorations of Christopher Columbus. Columbus and his men have just landed in the West Indies and are being observed by a group of six Indians (as indicated by the speaking parts in the play). The illustration on page 172, number 41, shows only four Indians.

11. Illustrations placed before the text: Page 155 in Runaway Home presents the text, "From where they waited, they could see the Ferris wheel slowly circling against the sky, and the ceaseless rise and fall of the merry-go-round horses." The appropriate illustration, number 59, is on page 153.


12. Illustrations placed after the text: Page 213 in *Wings To Adventure* presents the text, "Then one day something dreadful happened. The Bascome estate was settled. Jimmy Mason's father, who was a lawyer, told the news at dinner." The appropriate illustration, number 105, is on page 215.

13. Illustrations which lack clarity in size: Pictures which do not show things to be true to size when size is a factor in recognition, or which do not show a proper size relationship among all things or people in a picture. No errors of this type were found in the five readers analyzed.

14. Illustrations which lack clarity in shape: Pictures which do not show things to be of a shape that is natural and true to life, or to be of a shape harmonious with the other objects in the picture. Page 87 in *Wings To Adventure* presents the text, "Widow-maker gave an angry snort. He lifted his four feet off the ground and arched his back. Up, up, up shot Blue-foot Sue. She disappeared into the clouds." The accompanying illustration, number 141, shows a woman being thrown into the air. Although the people on the ground are illustrated clearly, the woman in the air is only an indistinct red and white blur. She is near enough to the ground to be seen clearly.

15. Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline: Illustrations in which people, places, or things are not clear, obvious, or easily

---


14 Ibid.
recognizable by their over-all appearance and outline. No errors of this type were found in the five readers analyzed.

16. Illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition:
Illustrations which do not take advantage of the opportunity to bring about more rapid and ready recognition of words whose form and meaning would be clarified by picture clues. Page 23 in Wings To Adventure\(^{15}\) presents the text, "Slowly he took a coin from his pocket and placed it cautiously in the slot." The accompanying illustration, number 12, shows a brass statue of a Chinese wise man, which is supposed to have a slot between its folded hands. No slot is visible, however.

17. Illustrations which show changes in a unit: Illustrations in which a fixed object does not have exactly the same appearance or color each time it appears in a story unit, or in which there are changes pictured within the units of a book which are not required by the text. On page 137 in People and Progress\(^{16}\) is an illustration, number 60, showing a battered plane with a door partly ripped off its hinges, on the right-hand side of the fuselage. A previous illustration, number 58, shows the damaged door on the left-hand side of the fuselage. The text indicates that there is only one door on the plane.

\(^{15}\)Ibid.

18. Illustrations which show results which should be expected from the text content. Illustrations which depict the circumstances which would follow necessarily as a result of the incident or action described in the text. Page 55 in Runaway Home\(^{17}\) presents the text, "Without paying any more attention to him, the old lady opened the oven door carefully, so as not to jar the pans inside, and took out two cakes. 'There's nothing my sister likes better than Washington pie,' she remarked to Jim. 'That's a good one,' and she went out to put it on a cake stand in the pantry. When she came back, she turned to Jim. 'Your feet are wet,' she said. 'Take off your shoes and put them here by the oven, soles up.' " The accompanying illustration shows the old lady taking the cakes out of the oven and Jim removing his shoes at the same time.

After the illustrations of the five basal reading series had been checked, a table was set up for each book, showing the exact kinds of errors existing in each, and giving the page number and number of the illustrations checked. Numbers were assigned to all illustrations in addition to the numbers of the pages on which they were included, because it was found that many illustrations occupied a double page, or, in a few cases, two illustrations appeared on the same page.

In addition to the table for each book, a table was set up to show the individual books as representing each of the five basal reading series.

series. (There was only one sixth reader to be analyzed in each of the series). This final table gives a composite picture of the results of the study and makes the comparison between the number of illustrations contained in the sixth reader of each series and the number of errors found in the sixth reader of each series.

The results of the analysis are presented in the next chapter.
CHAPTER II - ANALYSIS OF DATA

The purpose of the study was to analyze illustrations in basal reading systems for Grade Six for inaccuracies.

Five basal reading systems for Grade Six were analyzed, and the results are presented in the series of tables found in this chapter.

Table I furnishes all data concerning title, author, publisher, reading series, and copyright on the sixth grade readers used in the study. Beginning with Table II, each of the five (5) books analyzed has its own table, giving the specific inaccuracies for the book, the pages on which they occur, and the number which has been assigned to the accompanying illustration.

The final Table, VII, gives the over-all picture, showing the number of illustrations contained in each of the five basal series, the number of inaccuracies, and the percentage of error in relation to the total number of illustrations for each of the series.
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Books Analyzed in the Study</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II Inaccuracies in the Ginn Series</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III Inaccuracies in the Laidlaw Series</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Inaccuracies in Today’s Work-Play Books</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V Inaccuracies in the Reading Foundation Series</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI Inaccuracies in the Curriculum Foundation Series</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII Summary of Illustrations and Inaccuracies in the Five Series Examined</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### TABLE I - BOOKS ANALYZED

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Russell, David H., Gates, Doris, Snedaker, Mabel</td>
<td>The Ginn Basic Readers</td>
<td>Ginn and Company</td>
<td>New York</td>
<td>1949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sixth Reader: Wings To Adventure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Yoakam, Gerald, Hester, Kathleen, Abney Louise</td>
<td>Laidlaw Basic Readers</td>
<td>Laidlaw Bros., Inc.</td>
<td>New York</td>
<td>1949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sixth Reader: Let's Go Ahead</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Coatsworth, Elizabeth, O'Donnell, Mabel</td>
<td>Reading Foundation Series: The New Alice and Jerry Books</td>
<td>Row, Peterson and Company</td>
<td>Evanston, Illinois</td>
<td>1949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sixth Reader: Runaway Home</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sixth Reader: People and Progress</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### TABLE II

**ERRORS IN WINGS TO ADVENTURE**  
**THE GINN BASIC READERS, BOOK SIX**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PAGE</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>23</th>
<th>36</th>
<th>38</th>
<th>41</th>
<th>44</th>
<th>51</th>
<th>71</th>
<th>83</th>
<th>87</th>
<th>97</th>
<th>100</th>
<th>113</th>
<th>130</th>
<th>146</th>
<th>162</th>
<th>188</th>
<th>215</th>
<th>241</th>
<th>268</th>
<th>30</th>
<th>369</th>
<th>383</th>
<th>391</th>
<th>406</th>
<th>431</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ILLUSTRATION NUMBER</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>184</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TYPE OF ERROR**

- Inaccurate Illustrations of People, Places, or Things
- Inaccurate Illustrations of Statements of Fact
- Inaccurate Illustrations of Position
- Illustration Giving Inadequate Help on Word Recognition
- Illustrations Emphasizing Only a Portion of the Text Content
- Illustration Showing Results Expected from Text Content
- Inaccurate Illustration of Color
- Illustrations Which Show Changes in a Unit
- Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in Shape
- Inaccurate Illustrations of Real Life Situations
- Illustrations Placed After the Text
### TABLE III

**ERRORS IN FROM EVERY LAND,**
**THE LAIDLAW BASIC READERS, BOOK SIX**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PAGE</th>
<th>39</th>
<th>49</th>
<th>53</th>
<th>68</th>
<th>105</th>
<th>124</th>
<th>133</th>
<th>137</th>
<th>172</th>
<th>245</th>
<th>312</th>
<th>341</th>
<th>349</th>
<th>348</th>
<th>391</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ILLUSTRATION NUMBER</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TYPE OF ERROR**

- Illustrations Showing Results Expected from Text Content
  - X X
- Inaccurate Illustrations of Real Life Situations
  - X
- Illustrations Which Show Changes in a Unit
  - X
- Illustrations Emphasize Only a Portion of the Text Content
  - X X X X X X X X
- Illustrations Placed Before the Text
  - X X
- Inaccurate Illustration of Statements of Fact
  - X
### TABLE IV

**ERRORS IN LET'S GO AHEAD, TODAY'S WORK-PLAY BOOKS, BOOK SIX**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PAGE</th>
<th>49</th>
<th>87</th>
<th>99</th>
<th>195</th>
<th>220</th>
<th>246</th>
<th>355</th>
<th>432</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ILLUSTRATION NUMBER</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TYPE OF ERROR**

- Inaccurate Illustrations of Position: X
- Inaccurate Illustrations of Statements of Fact: X X X
- Illustrations Which Show Changes in a Unit: X
- Inaccurate Illustrations of Action Words: X
- Illustrations Emphasize Only a Portion of the Text Content: X X
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PAGE</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>56</th>
<th>62</th>
<th>82</th>
<th>83</th>
<th>92</th>
<th>128</th>
<th>153</th>
<th>201</th>
<th>235</th>
<th>268</th>
<th>363</th>
<th>367</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ILLUSTRATION NUMBER</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TYPE OF ERROR**

- Illustrations Placed Before the Text: X X X
- Illustrations Which Show Changes Within a Unit: X X
- Illustration Showing Results Expected From Text Content: X
- Illustrations Placed After the Text: X X X X X X
- Inaccurate Illustration of Color: X
### TABLE VI

**ERRORS IN PEOPLE AND PROGRESS,**

**THE CURRICULUM FOUNDATION SERIES; BOOK SIX**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PAGE</th>
<th>52</th>
<th>58</th>
<th>124</th>
<th>125</th>
<th>137</th>
<th>139</th>
<th>155</th>
<th>182</th>
<th>191</th>
<th>219</th>
<th>252</th>
<th>277</th>
<th>305</th>
<th>320</th>
<th>404</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ILLUSTRATION NUMBER</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TYPE OF ERROR**

- Inaccurate Illustrations of Action Words
  - X

- Illustrations Which Show Changes in a Unit
  - X

- Illustrations Showing Results Expected from Text Content
  - X

- Illustrations Showing Only a Portion of the Text Content
  - X

- Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts
  - X
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SERIES</th>
<th>TOTAL ILLUSTRATIONS</th>
<th>TOTAL ERRORS</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE OF ERRORS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GINN BASIC READERS</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>15.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAIDLAW BASIC READERS</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>17.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TODAY'S WORK-PLAY BOOKS</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>READING FOUNDATION SERIES</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>11.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CURRICULUM FOUNDATION SERIES</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>8.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTALS</strong></td>
<td><strong>710</strong></td>
<td><strong>85</strong></td>
<td><strong>11.9%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL NUMBER OF PAGES**

- THE GINN BASIC READERS 487
- LAIDLAW BASIC READERS 448
- TODAY'S WORK-PLAY BOOKS 472
- READING FOUNDATION SERIES 384
- CURRICULUM FOUNDATION SERIES 480
CHAPTER III
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

Illustrations in children's books have an important function. Wisely used, they may increase the reader's general comprehension of the story by helping him with new word meanings, new concepts, and new experiences. Frequently illustrations do not fulfill this function—they are only incidental where they should be purposeful.

It is with the effectiveness of the illustrations in five basal series on the sixth grade level that this thesis is concerned. This study is part of a group project whose purpose was to find and classify the errors in five basal series from the second grade level through the sixth.

The following conclusions were reached:
1. Inaccurate illustrations were found in all five basal readers analyzed.
2. The inaccuracy having the highest total frequency in all five basal readers was illustrations emphasizing minor ideas or only a portion of the text content. Its frequency in the individual series was as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Series</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GINN BASIC READERS</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAIDLAW BASIC READERS</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TODAY'S WORK-PLAY BOOKS</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>READING FOUNDATION SERIES</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CURRICULUM FOUNDATION SERIES</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>20</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. Four types of errors in the check list did not appear at all in the five sixth-grade-level readers analyzed. They were a) inaccurate illustrations of size concepts, b) illustrations which are unrelated to the text, c) illustrations which lack clarity in size, and d) illustrations which lack clarity in general outline.

4. Three types of errors appeared only once among the five basal readers analyzed. They were a) inaccurate word and story concepts, b) illustrations which lack clarity in shape, and c) illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition. The first error, inaccurate word and story concepts, appeared in the Curriculum Foundation Series. The second and third errors, illustrations which lack clarity in shape and illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition, appeared in The Ginn Basic Readers.

5. Two types of errors had the greatest frequency in a single series of the five readers analyzed. They were illustrations emphasizing minor ideas or only a portion of the text content and illustrations placed after the text. The first error appeared in the Laidlaw Basic Readers eight (8) times; and the second error in the Reading Foundation Series eight times also.

6. The type of error which had the second greatest frequency in a single series of the readers analyzed was illustrations showing changes in a unit. The error appeared six (6) times in both The Ginn Basic Readers and the Curriculum Foundation Series.

7. The type of error which had the third highest frequency in a single series of the readers analyzed was inaccurate illustrations of
statement of fact. The error appeared five (5) times in The Ginn Basic Readers.

8. Certain inaccuracies did not appear at all in the five readers analyzed.
   
a) Inaccurate illustrations of action words did not appear in the following series: The Ginn Basic Readers, the Laidlaw Basic Readers, and the Reading Foundation Series.

b) Inaccurate illustrations of size concepts did not appear in the following series: The Ginn Basic Readers, the Laidlaw Basic Readers, Today's Work-Play Books, the Reading Foundation Series, and the Curriculum Foundation Series.

c) Inaccurate illustrations of position did not appear in the following series: The Laidlaw Basic Readers, the Reading Foundation Series, and the Curriculum Foundation Series.


e) Inaccurate word and story concepts did not appear in the following series: The Ginn Basic Readers, the Laidlaw Basic Readers, Today's Work-Play Books, and the Reading Foundation Series.

f) Inaccurate illustrations of statements of fact did not appear in the following series: The Reading Foundation Series and the Curriculum Foundation Series.

g) Inaccurate illustrations of real life situations did not appear in the following series: Today's Work-Play Books, the Reading
Foundation Series, and the Curriculum Foundation Series.

h) Inaccurate illustrations of people, places, or things did not appear in the following series: The Laidlaw Basic Readers, Today's Work-Play Books, the Reading Foundation Series, and the Curriculum Foundation Series.

i) Illustrations which are unrelated to the text did appear in the following series: The Ginn Basic Readers, the Laidlaw Basic Readers, Today's Work-Play Books, the Reading Foundation Series, and the Curriculum Foundation Series.

j) Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas or only a portion of the text content did not appear in the Reading Foundation Series.

k) Illustrations placed before the text did not appear in the following series: The Ginn Basic Readers, Today's Work-Play Books, and the Curriculum Foundation Series.

l) Illustrations placed after the text did not appear in the following series: Today's Work-Play Books, the Laidlaw Basic Readers, and the Curriculum Foundation Series.

m) Illustrations which lack clarity in size did not appear in the following series: The Ginn Basic Readers, the Laidlaw Basic Readers, Today's Work-Play Books, the Reading Foundation Series, and the Curriculum Foundation Series.

n) Illustrations which lack clarity in shape did not appear in the following series: The Laidlaw Basic Readers, Today's Work-Play Books, the Reading Foundation Series, and the Curriculum Foundation Series.
o) Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline did not appear in the following series: The Ginn Basic Readers, the Laidlaw Basic Readers, the Reading Foundation Series, and the Curriculum Foundation Series.

p) Illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition did not appear in the following series: Today’s Work-Play Books, the Laidlaw Basic Readers, the Reading Foundation Series, and the Curriculum Foundation Series.

q) Illustrations which show changes in a unit appeared in all five series.

r) Illustrations which show results which would be expected from text content did not appear in Today’s Work-Play Books.

9. The series with the greatest number of errors was the sixth reader in The Ginn Basic Readers. The series with the least number of errors was the sixth reader in Today’s Work-Play Books. Total errors for each of the series is given below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Series</th>
<th>Errors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Ginn Basic Readers</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laidlaw Basic Readers</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Today’s Work-Play Books</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading Foundation Series</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum Foundation Series</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>85</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
10. The specific errors in each of the series are indicated below:

THE GINN BASIC READERS

Inaccurate illustrations of position 3
Inaccurate illustration of color 1
Inaccurate illustrations of statements of fact 5
Inaccurate illustrations of real life situations 2
Inaccurate illustrations of people, places, or things 4
Illustrations emphasizing only a portion of text content 6
Illustration placed after the text 1
Illustration which lacks clarity in shape 1
Illustration giving inadequate help on word recognition 1
Illustrations showing changes in a unit 6
Illustration showing results expected from the text 1

Total 31

LAIDLAW BASIC READERS

Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact 1
Inaccurate illustration of real life situation 1
Illustrations which emphasize only a portion of text 8
Illustrations placed before the text 3
Illustration showing changes in a unit 1
Illustrations showing results expected from the text 2

Total 16
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Today’s Work-Play Books</th>
<th>Reading Foundation Series</th>
<th>Curriculum Foundation Series</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of action words</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of position</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustrations of statements of fact</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations emphasizing only a portion of text</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustration showing changes in a unit</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustration showing results expected from the text</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>8</strong></td>
<td><strong>15</strong></td>
<td><strong>15</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
11. A variety of types of errors was found in each of the series analyzed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SERIES</th>
<th>TYPES OF ERRORS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>THE GINN BASIC READERS</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAIDLAW BASIC READERS</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TODAY'S WORK-PLAY BOOKS</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>READING FOUNDATION SERIES</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CURRICULUM FOUNDATION SERIES</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12. The type of inaccuracy which had the highest frequency of occurrence differed from series to series. In The Ginn Basic Readers the errors appearing the largest number of times (both had the same frequency) were illustrations emphasizing only a portion of the text content or minor ideas, and illustrations showing changes in a unit. In the Laidlaw Basic Readers the error appearing the largest number of times was illustrations emphasizing only a portion of the text content or minor ideas. In Today's Work-Play Books the most frequent error was inaccurate illustrations of statements of fact. In the Reading Foundation Series illustrations placed after the text appeared as the most frequent error, and in the Curriculum Foundation Series the error with the greatest frequency was illustrations showing changes in a unit.