The evaluation and modification of a YMCA testing and counseling program on the basis of the counselees' reactions to it

Dean, Benjamin Palmer

Boston University
The evaluation and modification of a Y.M.C.A. testing and counseling program on the basis of the counselees' reactions to it.
BOSTON UNIVERSITY

SCHOOL OF EDUCATION

THE EVALUATION AND MODIFICATION OF

A Y.M.C.A. TESTING AND COUNSELING PROGRAM

ON THE BASIS OF THE COUNSELEES' REACTIONS TO IT

A SERVICE STUDY AND A CRITIQUE

Submitted by

Benjamin Palmer Dean
(B.S., Wesleyan University, 1929)
(S.T.E., Harvard University, 1937)

In partial fulfillment of requirements for
the degree of Master of Education

1946

First Reader: Roy O. Billett, Professor of Education
Second Reader: J. Wendell Yeo, Associate Professor of Education
Third Reader: 
Call to B. F. Zorn
School of Education
Feb 2, 1946
2/5/11
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. THE NEED FOR GUIDANCE EVALUATION AND THE SCOPE OF THIS STUDY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The importance of both evaluating guidance work and describing evaluations that have been undertaken</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need for evaluating the guidance carried on in the local branch of the Y.M.C.A.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The general approaches to guidance evaluation that can be used</td>
<td>1a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need for counselee's reactions in guidance evaluation and the advantages in seeking them in situations like those at the Y.M.C.A.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The results that might be obtained from an attempt to discover such counselee reactions</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need for a criticism of such an attempt at evaluation, in the light of its success and in the light of the experience of others who have made comparable efforts</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The scope of the present service study</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. THE SETTING OF THE STUDY: THE &quot;GUIDANCE FOR BOYS&quot; PROGRAM OF THE BOSTON Y.M.C.A. HUNTINGTON AVENUE BRANCH AS IT HAS DEVELOPED AND AS IT IS DEVELOPING</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A brief resume of past efforts at counseling in the Boys' Division at Huntington Avenue</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The counselor and the counselee who took part in the 1943-44 guidance work</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The procedure carried on in the 1943-44 counseling program</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The modifications in the procedure that have been made during the 1944-45 season</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A program for the &quot;Guidance for Boys&quot; that may be followed this next year</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>III. THE STUDY ITSELF—THE EFFORT MADE TO MEASURE THE SUCCESS OF THE 1943-44 PROGRAM, AND TO MODIFY LATER PROGRAMS ON THE BASIS OF THE COUNSELOR REACTIONS RECEIVED</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The evaluation procedure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The preliminary considerations as to purpose and method</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The selection and grouping of items to be used on a questionnaire for the year's counselors</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The preparation of the covering letter</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The collection of the boys' reactions by means of the questionnaire</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The comparison of the individual answer sheets with the individual records on hand</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The original tabulation and the subsequent re-tabulation of the results obtained</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The conclusions derived from the boys' responses and the boys' apparent recommendations for changes in the guidance program</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The individual answer sheets as compared with the individual records already filed</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The tabulated results of the answered questionnaires</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The promotion of the guidance program—reactions and suggestions</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The preliminary form and the testing procedure—reactions to and suggestions</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The first review of the test results and the follow-up counseling—reactions and suggestions</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The letters of summary and follow-up—reactions and suggestions</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The guidance book shelf and group guidance activities—reactions and suggestions</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The program as a whole—final comments, general reactions, and suggestions for the future</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The program modifications put into practice on the basis of the boys' suggestions—or recorded to try out in the future</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes in the promotion of the guidance program</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes in the preliminary form and testing procedure</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modifications in review of test results and follow-up</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes in the handling of summary and follow-up letters</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes in plans for book shelf and group guidance</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes and additions for the program as a whole</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>IV. THE EXPERIENCES OF OTHER INVESTIGATORS WITH SIMILAR PROBLEMS</strong></td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The approaches to guidance evaluation that have been recorded</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summaries of evaluations that have been prepared</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation through the judgment of outsiders</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation in controlled situations</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appraisal through studies of changes in status effected through guidance</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attempts at appraisal through the use of counselee reaction</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The validity and reliability of counselee reactions</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. CRITICAL APPRAISAL OF THE JUNE 1944 EVALUATION</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The objectives, the scope, and the general limitations of the effort</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A criticism of the questionnaire that was prepared</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A criticism of the covering letter that was sent out</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A criticism of the procedure that was followed in obtaining counselee reactions</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A criticism of the tabulation and presentation of the results</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A final appraisal of the work accomplished</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. A SUGGESTED PROGRAM FOR FUTURE EVALUATIONS</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The premises upon which an evaluation through counselee reaction can be made</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The principles upon which such an evaluation can be developed</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A suggested check list questionnaire</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A suggested covering letter</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A suggested method for carrying through the evaluation</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The results that may be expected and their utility for future work</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 A Summary of the Results Obtained on the &quot;Questionnaire on Guidance Work in the Huntington Avenue Y.M.C.A. Boys' Division, November 1943-to June 1944.&quot;</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Channels Through Which Boys were Actually Introduced to the Guidance for Boys Program in 1943-44</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Possible Channels for the Promotion of the Guidance for Boys Program, as Suggested by the Boys Tested and Counseled during the 1943-44 Season</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 The Preliminary Form as Evaluated by the Boys Tested during the 1943-44 Season</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 The Testing Procedure as Evaluated by the Boys Tested during the 1943-44 Season</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 The Preliminary Review of the Test Results as Evaluated by the Counselees of 1943-44</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Actions and Attitude Changes Reported by the Counselees of 1943-44 as Resulting from the Guidance and Counseling Done</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 The Counseling in General as Evaluated by the Counselees of 1943-44</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 What the 1943-44 Counselees Said They Did with the Summary Letters They Received</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 The Letters of Summary and Follow-up as Evaluated by the Counselees of 1943-44</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

THE NEED FOR GUIDANCE EVALUATION AND THE SCOPE OF THIS STUDY

The importance of both evaluating guidance work and describing evaluations that have been undertaken.—Evaluation is a necessary phase of successful guidance work. Wrenn's remark of 1939 is still applicable: "If counseling is to be justified.....we must prove that it works, and must ourselves be aware of its weaknesses." Any attempt at checking the success of a guidance procedure is worthy of record, and suggestions for future efforts at evaluation should be set down in order to help succeeding guidance workers as they try to measure their own success in "helping others to help themselves."

The need for evaluating the guidance work at the local branch of the Y.M.C.A.—In Y.M.C.A.'s and in other agencies throughout the United States young men and young women are being helped to orient themselves, and in these days of veteran readjustment new programs are being established weekly in every state of the union. Leaders in this work are often inadequately trained and usually lack sufficient experience for their tasks. Financial backing and plant facilities are often insufficient for optimal work, and programs are often undertaken in hesitating piecemeal fashion. Both the leaders and the supporters of new

programs wish to know what success is being obtained soon after their programs have begun to operate. There is a desire to appraise the immediate success of an undertaking, so that it can be improved before its long-term effects could be measured. Such a need was felt at the Huntington Avenue Branch of the Boston Y.M.C.A. a few months after the inauguration of a new program of guidance for older boys, during the season of 1943-44. A report of what was done because of that need, and a report of suggestions that developed from a criticism of what was done, may suggest answers to the needs of other educational and social agencies that are engaged in guidance work.

The general approaches to guidance evaluation that can be used.— Evaluation in guidance work can be attempted in many ways. Methods and procedures can be compared with those used by reputable and apparently successful organizations, and diligent leaders will continue to make this sort of appraisal of their activities as they read current literature in the field.1/ A study of the status and opinions of counseled young people years after the counseling has taken place may give some measure of guidance success,2/ but evaluation of this nature is impossible in checking the immediate success of a program. In situations where guidance is an integrated part of a regular educational program, it is possible to check success and failure in school situations soon after

1/ The National Y.M.C.A. has recently established a mimeographed journal "Counseling," which attempts to report the best in both new and old guidance procedures.

2/ Cole's study of guidance work at the Worcester Boys Club, reported in Chapter IV of this service study, illustrates this approach.
guidance has taken place, but evaluation of this sort is inapplicable to agency situations where clients have divergent backgrounds and status. Retests after guidance might be checked against tests before guidance, but there are few objective measures that can be applied to indicated success in any but a few phases of the work carried on in such a field as personal counseling, and many of the most fundamentally healthy modifications in attitude might not become apparent on a test till long after guidance took place. It might be feasible to obtain ratings from employers, parents, and teachers before and after guidance, but the procedure would be arduous and data obtained in this way would be subjective and unsuited to statistical study. The reactions of the counselees themselves might be measured and tabulated to show how the guidance work appealed to those who are the direct customers of personnel programs. Indications of how much these customers themselves felt they gained from the counseling experience might be useful as one phase of evaluation, both soon after guidance has taken place and many years thereafter. This approach in the evaluation of counseling service has been utilized in this study.

The need for counselees' reactions in guidance evaluations and the advantages in seeking them in situations like that at the Y.M.C.A.

Dr. C. Gilbert Wrenn says: "Let us have more studies using student reaction as one factor in the evaluation of counseling. The customer's

McGrath's study of guidance success at Newton, reported in Chapter IV of this study uses this technique. Hutson and Webster's appraisal of work at Ellwood City, Pennsylvania, also reported briefly in Chapter IV, is another example.

C. Gilbert Wrenn, Loc. cit.
attitude is always a factor that deserves evaluation."

It seems that on the whole pupils are consistent and fair in their appraisals of their teachers' work. It is very likely that youthful counselees are equally fair in their comments on the work done by their counselors. Often counselees are unaware of the deeper problems involved in their own total situations, and their viewpoints are indeed immature. However, in an organization like the Y.M.C.A., where the primary responsibility is with the young people themselves and where no compulsion is attempted, the early reactions of those who engage in a new activity or program are most worth while as partial factors in measuring the success of that activity or program. The reactions of counselees a few months after they have been counseled might well be made the subject of study by those who are initiating and carrying through guidance programs in Y.M.C.A.'s and in similar social agencies. Such a study might result in a better understanding of the young people who have been and are being counseled, it might make personnel workers more aware of the relationships between case histories and personal reactions to help given, and it might point out the general reaction tendencies of an entire group of counselees to an entire guidance program. On the basis of such information and increased awareness, pertinent improvements in the programs might be devised and inaugurated by those in charge.

The results that might be obtained from an attempt to discover such counselee reactions.-- A questionnaire sent to counselees might, then,

\[1\] The basis for this statement is considered in the last part of Chapter IV where Dr. Egyan's experiments are criticised.
help counselors to understand their young people better, help them to see how individual histories and peculiar ways of handling the testing and counseling situations affected post-counseling attitudes, and help them to appreciate the general reactions of the counseled group. There might thus result both an improved adaptation of tried techniques to the specific needs of new counselees and also a modification of many phases of the total guidance program so as to match better the needs of the average counselee of the future—as his needs were made patent by the reaction of the average counselee of the past.

The need for a criticism of such an attempt at evaluation, in the light of its success and in the light of the experience of others who have made comparable efforts.—There can be no permanently satisfying or definitive results from a first attempt in a field like personnel program evaluation through counselee reaction. A first effort is in need of careful appraisal. The first procedure suggested, the first questionnaire developed, and the first covering letter prepared may have some value in themselves, and that value may be enhanced when coupled with the data derived from counselees addressed. However, such a first attempt is in need of an objective appraisal in the light of the experience of others who have faced similar problems—after the effort has been made, if not before. A better program for a future effort in the field can then be developed from the combined experiences of all.

The scope of the present service study.—The present service study is an outgrowth of a first impetuous effort at appraising the results of
the "Guidance for Boys" program that was carried on during the season of 1843-44 at the Huntington Avenue Branch of the Boston Y.M.C.A. This study reviews the effort to secure counselee reactions that was made in May of 1944, and it analyses and retabulates the data that was derived at that time. It summarizes what others have done with similar problems, and what others have written about guidance evaluation and student criticism. It criticizes the evaluation effort that was made, and it formulates a better plan for a similar effort that can be used in the future. It, therefore, continues with the following chapters: Chapter II, a statement of the guidance program of the local Y.M.C.A. as it has developed and as it may develop in the future; Chapter III, a history of the May 1944 effort at an evaluation of the work carried on during the season of 1943-44, together with a report of the counselee reactions obtained at that time and the modifications in the program inaugurated immediately thereafter because of these counselee reactions; Chapter IV, a record and appraisal of the work of others who have tackled problems of a somewhat similar nature; Chapter V, a critique of the efforts that were made so hastily in 1944; and Chapter VI, definite suggestions for an improved program of appraisal through counselee reaction, perhaps usable in the local Y.M.C.A. or in a comparable situation at some future date. The total study has assisted the writer in his work; it may prove to be of help to others on the staff of the local Y.M.C.A., as well as to the personnel of other institutions where guidance evaluation is in order.
CHAPTER II

THE SETTING OF THE STUDY: THE "GUIDANCE FOR BOYS" PROGRAM
OF THE BOSTON Y.M.C.A. HUNTINGTON AVENUE BRANCH AS IT HAS
DEVELOPED AND AS IT IS DEVELOPING

A brief resume of past efforts at counseling in The Boys' Division
at Huntington Avenue. -- The Boys' Division of the Huntington Avenue
Branch of the Boston Y.M.C.A. has initiated a number of counseling
programs during the twenty-five years that the Branch has carried on
guidance activities. The Department of Occupational Services, on the
second floor of the Men's Division, has for years performed services
for both Y.M.C.A. members and outsiders, young and old, and it has won
a deserved reputation for its specialized testing and counseling ac-
tivities. The Boys' Division, located in an adjacent part of the mas-
size plant, has made several attempts to establish its own program of
counseling, but few of the projected efforts have been carried through
to success. Counselors came for but a few hours each week, and they were
therefore too loosely associated with the boys they interviewed. Coun-
selors were sometimes too theoretical and abstract to meet the average
"Y" boy's needs, and the testing and counseling techniques that were
employed were often not yet sufficiently well developed. Welfare or-
ganizations often find that leaders leave before they have made most
effective use of the experience they have gained, and the transiency
of counselors in Y.M.C.A. youth work is proverbial. Of the projects tried out prior to the fall of 1943, the most effective was perhaps that carried on in 1942-43, when a member of the Boys' Division staff worked continuously with the boys, set the stage for testing in the Men's Guidance Department, and attended the interviews with tested boys that were given by one of the trained counselors in the Department of Occupational Services—but unfortunately both the Boys' Division leader-counselor and the educational advisor in "Occupational Services" left the local organization at the end of that year.

The Counselor and counsellees who took part in the 1943-44 guidance work.—During the 1943-44 season a new program for boys was established in the Huntington Avenue Boys' Division, under the leadership of Edwin C. Johnson, Director of the Division, and Benjamin P. Dean, the new "Counselor for Boys". Mr. Dean was a graduate of Wesleyan University and Harvard Divinity School, a graduate of many industrial experiences, and a former secondary school teacher and junior college "Dean of Men". While taking courses at the Boston University School of Education, where he was an assistant in guidance, he started working a few hours a week for the Boys' Division, and later in the season he started working a few more hours a week for the Department of Occupational Services. Thirty boys were tested and interviewed during the season, and a number of other boys were counseled without testing,—the boys being an average cross-section of Y.M.C.A. population, drawn from at least ten different schools, ranging in age from 14 to 18, slightly above average in academic aptitude, and slightly below average in
in general adjustment.\footnote{1}{A more complete summary of the tested boys' status as well as an extended history of the year's activities is on file in the Boys' Division of the local "Y" as a report of the 1943-44 guidance work.}

The procedure carried on in the 1943 counseling program.-- Boys in the Division were either selected for testing and counseling by the Boys' Division Director or chose to undertake a testing program as a result of interviews with the counselor—interviews often held at Co-Ed Socials. Each boy who said he would come for tests took a lengthy "preliminary form" to fill out as a first step. The selected boys came to the Guidance Department in the Men's Division on a Saturday or holiday morning at nine o'clock, and for the greater part of a day they followed directions in taking a battery of tests that measured interests, aptitudes, abilities, and personality factors.\footnote{2}{The "X Battery" of tests taken by the boys was that group of tests regularly employed by the Department of Occupational Services with boys of high school age, as selected by the Department's Director, Thomas H. Harris, and the former educational advisor, Robert Peel. The tests included:}

The California Short Form Test of Mental Maturity
The Michigan Vocabulary Profile Test
The Iowa Silent Reading Tests, New Edition
The Wrenn Study Habits Inventory
The Revised Minnesota Paper Form Board Test
The Bennett Test of Mechanical Comprehension
The Minnesota Vocational Test for Clerical Workers
The California Test of Personality, Secondary Form
The Kuder Preference Record
The Strong Vocational Interest Blank

Boys who showed a special interest in art were later given the Meier-Seashore Test of Art Judgment, and boys with other specialized needs were sometimes given other tests, such as O'Connor's Test of Finger Dexterity and Cardall's Test of Primary Business Interests. The cost of the entire program was then $7.50 for outsiders and $2.00 for Boys' Division members. It is now $10.00 for outsiders, $7.50 for "Y" members and $2.50 for Boys' Division members.
later each boy had an hour's interview with the Counselor for Boys in the Occupational Services Office, during which his total picture was discovered, specific application of the test results were developed, and general suggestions for the future were outlined. A few days thereafter there was sent out from the Boys' Division office a rather lengthy letter summarizing both the test results and the main decisions and suggestions arrived at in the course of the interview. Although time and space were devoted to the preparation for suitable work adjustment later, most attention was given to the correction of the personality deficiencies that were noted on the tests as present realities. Further consultations with tested boys were held as desired, some formally in the Guidance Department office and some informally in the Boys' Division lobby, but it is likely that the counselor was not available on some of the occasions when the boys wanted most to talk. The counselor met regularly with the Boys' Division leaders, and both individual cases and the total guidance program were discussed. A folder was prepared with a complete record of each boy, and these folders were studied as a basis for appraising the work done. However, since the boys' own reactions were felt to be of paramount importance in a democratic program like that at the local "Y", it was deemed expedient to use some means of discovering their real opinions, and at the end of the season a questionnaire was hurriedly prepared and sent out—with results as described in the rest of this paper.

The modifications in the procedure that have been made during the 1944-45 season.— At the start of the season of 1944 a few modifications
in the Boys' Division program were immediately inaugurated on the basis of the results of the questionnaire. A mimeographed announcement of the program was prepared for distribution among leaders and boys associated with the Huntington Avenue Branch of the Y.M.C.A. Groups of boys' leaders were told by mail and in person of the testing and counseling work. Slight program changes were tried out to fit individual needs, and a new and shorter testing program was established for those who felt that a full day of testing was impossible for them. Special attention was devoted to testing and assisting the personality development of the members of one small group, and there was prepared for publication a paper dealing with the results of personality testing and improving as indicated in the work that had been carried on at the "Y".

During the year of 1944-45, about 40 boys were counseled and about 15 boys completed a full testing program. Former counselees came in to tell of their experiences and get help with new problems. One boy was placed in a foster home, and many boys had a great number of individual conferences as they gradually improved their personal attitudes and developed more effective life orientation. Magazines and books were added to the book shelf in the Boys' Study, and several pertinent leaflets and volumes were loaned to it for two-week periods. The bulletin board was used both for the advertising of guidance work and for the presentation of vocational and avocational opportunities, reading materials, and attitudes helpful in successful living. Leaders in the Boys' Division cooperated with the Counselor for Boys and helped in the guidance of individuals, but it seemed that the counselor himself was
often located too far from the place where the boys would be most ready to talk, and the Boys' Division leaders who might have helped most successfully were not directly assigned to individual problems and were not well enough acquainted with any one boy's total picture, as it was developed and recorded in the folders on file.

The program for the "Guidance for Boys" that may be followed this next year.-- As the 1944-45 season ends, it seems that another program revision will take place. Next year there may be reestablished a plan similar to that used in 1942-43. One member of the Department of Occupational Services, presumably the former Boys' Division Counselor for Boys, will take charge of the testing and the reviewing of test results, as well as act as consultant and adviser to those who carry through continuous and casual counseling thereafter. One of the Boys' Division leaders, presumably one who has taken several courses in personnel and guidance, will take charge of the close by and regular counseling for boys, both tested and not tested. Other boys' leaders will have special counseling relations with individuals whom they have perhaps already grown to know through club work and group activities. There will still be general advertising of the testing program, the book shelf in the Boys' Study will be expanded and kept up to date, and notices about life management and work and play opportunities will be posted on the bulletin boards. There may be more group discussion and group activity that is primarily focused on guidance and growth, with movies, round table discussions, and practice sessions on educational, vocational, and social subjects.
The Occupational Services Counselor will still interpret test results, write a reporting letter to the boy, and prepare a record of possibilities and suggestions that will be appropriate to the Boys' Division leader-counselors. However, there will be one leader with an office close to the Boys' lobby who will be responsible for the counseling work of the entire division. It will be he who will (1) make arrangements for the testing of boys who are selected or who chose to have themselves measured; (2) attend part of the first conference of tested boys in the office of the Occupational Services Counselor (as parents of outsiders often do with their boys) so as to get a general over-all picture of the boys' situations; (3) consult with the Occupational Services Counselor and arrange for conferences with him and other leaders as required; (4) do regular individual counseling with most of the boys or see that appropriate counseling is carried on between boys who have problems and leaders that appeal to them; and (5) keep a record of each counseled boy, as a continuation of the profile, reporting letter, and notes prepared by the Occupational Services worker. The boys will thus have a single friend and counselor nearby with whom they can talk as special needs arise. They will have not only the advantages of testing and counseling by members of the Occupational Services staff, but they will have at hand a sympathetic and understanding friend to help them to emphasize their assets and overcome their deficiencies, in the actual athletic, social, and educational work and play that goes on in the Division rooms as well as in the extra-association environment.
The proposed program \textsuperscript{1/} for the future grows out of this past year's work, and this in turn is derived from the previous experiences of guidance leaders and from the critical appraisals of previous counselees—as expressed both casually and in response to the study-questionnaire of June 1944. After this sketch of the past history and the future possibilities at the Boys' Division of the Huntington Avenue Branch Y.M.C.A., it is fitting that the June 1944 effort at evaluation be described.

\textsuperscript{1/} A mimeographed statement of the new organization and policy is in the appendix at end of this paper.
CHAPTER III

THE STUDY ITSELF—THE EFFORT MADE TO MEASURE THE SUCCESS OF THE 1943-44 PROGRAM AND TO MODIFY LATER PROGRAMS ON THE BASIS OF THE COUNSELEE REACTIONS RECEIVED

The Evaluation Procedure

The preliminary considerations as to purpose and method.-- In May, 1944, the Counselor for Boys, with the cooperation of the leaders of the Boys' Division, projected an appraisal of his first year's guidance work. It was thought that informal oral appraisal from leaders and observers at the Y.M.C.A. would give enough mature and somewhat impartial reaction to form a partial basis for making a few improvements in guidance techniques used thereafter, but it was considered important to get the reactions of the boys who had undergone the year's testing and counseling program, so as to balance outside and inside mature opinion with the criticisms and suggestions of the client boys themselves.

To obtain this customer reaction it was decided to mail to each of the year's counselees an extensive questionnaire and an appealing covering letter that would invite frank and constructive criticism—together with a stamped return envelope and, if necessary, followed by a subsequent appeal for the return of the questionnaire blank. A fifty percent response was anticipated. There naturally arose a question as to
whether the replies received could be taken as an accurate sample of the total tested population, but after the consideration thought that the returned replies would be sufficiently representative for the practical purpose of program modification. ¹ A covering letter that showed both humility and an anxiety to serve better would, it was thought, enlist just criticism, even though the replies were not anonymous. Appended names and statements as to present status would enhance the value of the criticisms received.

The entire procedure was one that could have wholesome educational effects on both the questioner and the questioned. The proposed questionnaire, therefore, was to include not only spaces for an analysis of reactions to past experiences and suggestions for future work, but also questions and suggestions that might stimulate counseled boys to further efforts toward wholesome and mature self-direction. A check answer simplified questionnaire was considered, and the advantages for a subsequent tabulation of results were perhaps insufficiently weighed. However, as a part of the education and guidance of the boys concerned, it was believed that individually worded responses might be far more meaningful and helpful for their future self-analysis and growth. Each reply received was to be added to the individual file of the boy's past experiences, so as to create a more complete basis for further counseling work with him as carried on by those responsible for his further guidance.

¹ As is indicated later in this chapter, an eighty per cent response was actually received, and talks with many of those who did not submit an answered questionnaire have convinced the counselor that the replies received were indeed representative.
The selection and grouping of items to be used on a questionnaire for the year's counselees. Items selected for the questionnaire were chosen partly to assist leaders to appraise and improve the entire Boys' Division guidance program and partly to stimulate, educate, and further orient the questioned counselees themselves. It was believed that those who had undergone testing and counseling would gain from analyzing critically their own past experiences with guidance, from appraising the work of others, from discovering new ways in which experiences like theirs could be used, and from recording their own present plans and ambitions. Items were selected to have on record at the Y.M.C.A: (1) the name of each counselee who answered the questionnaire; (2) a history of how each counselee was introduced to the program, how his activities and thoughts were modified by the filling out of the preliminary form, by the testing, and by the preliminary review of the test results, what he did after receiving his summary letter, how he modified his ways of thinking and living because of the letter and follow-up counseling, how much study he carried on at the bookshelf, what he was doing at the time of receiving the questionnaire, and what he was planning to do thereafter; (3) a statement of each counselee's recollection of his feelings at the time of introduction to the program, during testing, at consultations, after letters were received, and after the preliminary guidance work was completed; and (4) suggestions from each counselee for improving various phases of the guidance program, as well as the entire organization of the Boys' Division.

The copies of both the questionnaire and the covering letter are appended to the Service Study.
Division, for more complete service to himself and to those who would follow him.

Seven stages in the guidance process were distinguished for the grouping of the sixty-one selected questions. The Introduction to the Testing and Counseling Program, the Test Service Itself, the Preliminary Review of the Test Results, the Letter of Summary, the Follow-up Counseling, the Book Shelf, and (Name, History, and) Final Comments were made the titles for the divisions in the two-page questionnaire. Space was allowed for the extensive comments as to what was done because of the tests, even though such a generous allowance for the discursive thoughts of the past counselees would prevent the possibility of a neatly organized presentation of the results obtained. What books had proved most helpful; what new books might be added to the book itself, and what general impressions and suggestions came to mind. The entire questionnaire was developed with no thought of a future statistical analysis and a tabulation of the results obtained. When the counselor did not take pains to eliminate unnecessary items and when he failed to develop an easy scheme of checking answers that might approximate feelings, he perhaps erred in overestimating the boys' generous impulses, critical ability and verbalizing power, but he perhaps gave a few of the young people more freedom in growing toward mature power in self-expression and self-criticism.

The preparation of the covering letter. The covering letter was written to enlist the hearty cooperation of the boys who had been served. The first abrupt statement and the second paragraph were set down to
give the tested boys a sense of their own personal worth and the value of their own judgments. The third paragraph developed from the sincere and humble desire for assistance that the counselor himself felt before the awesome responsibility of the guidance task, and it made a direct appeal to the best service instincts of the boys whom he had grown to know as friends. The fourth paragraph made specific the request for answers to the questionnaire, and the fifth paragraph gave a clinching note of thanks. The postscript was somewhat educational in nature, inviting the boys to make use of the newly established shelf in the boys' study. The very last sentence was appended to enlist a partial response from those who might otherwise deem the entire task too difficult.

Because of the emphasis on service and the individual responsibility in the local Y.M.C.A. program it was felt that more could be demanded, in time and initiative, than might be asked for in a covering letter and questionnaire sent to members of an organization of another type. The Y.M.C.A. letterhead was to be used, but there was to be employed no appeal to the sponsorship of any outside individual; it was felt that the boys themselves would have a motivating feeling of friendliness toward those who had helped them as well as to those who might follow them to be guided later. The letters were mimeographed, but the name, address, and nickname of each counselee was typed in so as to give the note a personal emphasis. 1/

1/ Copies of both the questionnaire and the covering letter are appended to this Service Study.
The collection of the boys' reactions by means of the questionnaire.— The questionnaire was checked over by the Director of the Boys' Division and mimeographed on two full-sized pages by his secretary. The letters to the thirty boys were checked, mimeographed, and addressed in the office, and the personal signature of the counselor was added to each one. The two pages of questionnaire, the covering letter, and a return, addressed, stamped envelope were mailed out together about the fifth of June. Sixteen returns came in within ten days. A follow-up note that was sent out brought in six more, and because of personal contact, two more questionnaires were returned a few weeks later. Some of the boys were already in the service far away from where they had been counseled. Many were already on full time jobs, for the first time in their lives, and they found it hard to find time for filling out such a lengthy and provocative set of questions. From contacts that were made with those who did not respond, it seemed to the counselor that lack of time and lack of literary and critical interest accounted for most of the failures to respond—rather than from any emotional antipathy or lack of social service desire. The total of twenty-four replies that were submitted (eighty per cent of the total questioned) was deemed more than adequate for making a study of the total counselee reaction.

The comparison of the individual answer sheets with the individual records on hand.— As each questionnaire was received it was read over and then filed in the folder of its sender. A study of the individual reply sheets, in the light of the previously recorded history and
experience of the counselee, proved to be helpful and enlightening to the counselor and to the other Boys' Division leaders during the ensuing year, and as individual cases are reconsidered and brought up to date through further contacts, the value of the attitudes and impressions recorded on the mimeographed answer sheets will continue to help those who do the Boys' Division guidance work.

The original tabulation and the subsequent retabulation of the results obtained. When the twenty-four answer sheets were ready for tabulation, it became at once apparent that the questionnaire was not prepared with an eye toward ease and system in the recording of the total group impression. Very few of the questions were stated so as to elicit definite responses that could be tabulated with ease. The failures to answer several questions, as well as the variations in response wording, prevented the easy checking of results. The original tallying was done from the answer sheets in the boys' own files, and single marks or words recorded on a summary sheet one at a time, whereas it might have been much easier, as well as far more accurate, if all the answer sheets had been stacked together before the group recording was done. The Boys' Division secretary and the counselor tallied the responses on an extra blank questionnaire, completely covering the sheets with tally marks and individual comments. The approximations arrived at served for a first review of the results.

In order to correct minor discrepancies for this report, however, the counselor and a friend made a retabulation of the results on new tally sheets after the questionnaires had been stacked together and
the questions had been numbered to make the totaling easier.) This time both answers and omissions were marked down, making the total number of responses twenty-four for each question. Much time was consumed in the study of individual wordings, to fit them into categories and so make them usable for an analysis of the total group response. Practically all the individual answers were eventually recorded, with statements showing how they were counted in the totals indicated. The final tabulation of results as prepared is inserted later in this chapter for the reference of the reader of this essay and for others who may attempt this sort of appraisal. However, since this summary tabulation proved to be inadequate for the practical purpose of presenting the collected data in a readily readable form, the questions relating to the various phases of the program were sorted out and grouped together. By slightly modifying the wording of some of the questions, it was found that special tables could be prepared for each aspect of the total reaction report. Formal tables with percentage distributions were prepared--the reader can judge with what success.

The entire process of rechecking and tabulating results for this service study had four definite effects: (1) It brought more information and understanding to the counselor and his associates, (2) It showed how important is allowance for individual expression in a general appraisal, (3) It made the author recognize the value in questionnaires.

One questionnaire was only half filled out, the second sheet having been lost, so for none of the questions on page two of the questionnaire is it possible to have more than 23 "satisfactory" or "yes" responses. The tabulated totals may thus present more than normal indifference in the answering of the last half of the questions on the questionnaire.
that have a short answer form, and (4) It gave him a mature realization of the value in the "thinking through" that should precede any attempt at evaluation or research.

The Conclusions Derived from the Boys' Responses and the Boys' Apparent Recommendations for Changes in the Guidance Program

The individual answer sheets as compared with the individual records already filed.-- As has been indicated above, the individual answer sheets were filed in appropriate folders as soon as they were received, so as to create a more complete record for each counseled boy. The study of individual case histories in comparison with the individual responses to the questionnaire will continue as cases are referred to in the future. It might be possible to devote an entire chapter here to a study of the ways that individuals of different classifications reacted to the questions asked. In a service study like this only a few general impressions and individual comments can be set down. Boys who had high interest in social service, literary, and scientific activities answered the questionnaire best. Those with low literary interest made very brief responses or failed to hand in the criticisms. Boys of average and above average aptitude for academic work recorded

1/ See Chapter III, p. 20

2/ It would be interesting to see whether boys of low clerical ability answered more than a very few questions and whether boys of low academic aptitude tended to find the testing too extended and complicated. It would be worthwhile to know how evidence of maladjustment correlated with a demand for a shorter testing period and with the request for counselor initiative in the making of appointments for more interviews. Innumerable problems could be raised, but with such an unscientifically prepared questionnaire as a basis and so few counselees for classification, efforts involved in making correlations would be useless.
most satisfaction with the total program. Duller boys wrote down only sketchy answers on the questionnaire. Two very bright boys showed that they felt the counselor could have improved his techniques and analyses. Boys who showed in their test an obvious personality maladjustment recorded, in general, great satisfaction with the guidance given. Those who scored high in "personal worth" when tests were given did not record, three months later, an outstanding satisfaction with counsel which perhaps disclosed some of their deficiencies.

The tabulated results of the answered questionnaires.-- The following pages present a summary of the questionnaire responses received during the summer of 1944. Table 1. contains practically everything recorded by the boys who returned answered sheets and follows the questionnaire from itself. It is useful for reference. The nine tables that follow this first composite picture have been prepared to present more patently the summarized counselee reaction to the various phases of the program. The remaining paragraphs of this chapter section are written to summarize the conclusions that can be derived from the boys' responses, as well as the recommendations for changes in the local guidance procedures which the boys seem to propose.

Table 1. A Summary of the Results Obtained on the "Questionnaire on Guidance Work in the Huntington Avenue Y.M.C.A. Boys' Division, November 1943 to June 1944."

Introduction to the Testing and Counseling Program

How did you first hear of the program?
    Johnson and mail 7, Dean 4, Burke 3, Friend 3, Leader 2, Mother 1, At the "Y" 4.

Is the Co-Ed Social a good place to talk over the possibilities of testing?
    Yes 7, No 14, Space 3. (Emphatically no 1, counted as No.)
Table 1. (continued)

Where else could introduction to it be made so as to reach boys who might be helped?
   Schools 5, Folders 4, Leaders 4, Other activities 4, Posters and Bulletin Board 4.
Was the idea too forcefully presented to you?
   Yes 2, No 22. (Not forcefully enough 2, counted as No.)
Should older boys be enlisted to encourage new boys to take tests?
   Yes 17, No 5, Space 2.
Did the preliminary form contain so many questions that it discouraged you?
   Yes 7, No 16, Space 1. (Slightly 3, counted as Yes.)
Was filling out the preliminary form a wholesome experience in forcing you to think about your past, present, and future?
   Yes 18, No 4, Space 2. (Too long 1, Enjoyable 1, counted as space.)
Did you feel you were too young for the testing program?
   Yes 1, No 23. (Too old 1) (No, except in some cases 2, counted as No.)
Other Comments
   (Very few comments.) Some questions on the preliminary form were complicated 1, I was too old, the tests are better for boys choosing a school course 1, Boys 14 and over suited to testing 1, Some of the questions were kind of advance for me 1, Too many questions in too round about manner 1, Testing rather boring—an arduous task 1, (None or) Space 18.

Test Service Itself

Did the testing take too long?
   Yes 15, No 9. (Reasonable 1, counted as No.) (No, but could be divided 1, counted as No.)
What suggestions do you have as to testing procedure?
   Little at a time 5, O.K. 3, Shorter 2.
Do you recall any test which seemed unfair or useless?
   Yes 2, No 13, Space 4.
Which one?
   Space 24.
Would you prefer to have taken some self-administering tests before the time tests?
   Yes 6, No 16, Space 2. (No difference 1, counted as No.)
If it were possible would you prefer to have had a partial report before completing the entire series of tests?
   Yes 8, No 15, Space 1. (No difference 2, counted as No.)
Other comments
   (Very few comments.) Tests were boring 1, Thought paragraph test allowed too short a time 1, Too many similar questions included 1, Partial report might influence remaining tests 1, Give comments in percentage, but get down to more human facts 1, (None or) Space 20.
Table 1. (continued)

Preliminary Review of the Tests

Did you feel at ease at the first review of the tests?
  Yes 22, No 2. (Slightly nervous 1, counted as Yes.)

Was the first interview too long?
  No 24.

Did it point out specific ways that you could advance and solve vocational, educational, and social problems?
  Yes 22, No 1, Space 1. (Ambiguous 1, counted as No.)

Did you write down or take time to review in your own mind what was discussed?
  Yes 21, No 1, Space 2.

What did you do because of the first interview?
  Got hold of myself 1, Began to plan ahead 1, Planned time better 1, More definite plans 1, Planned what to do before entering service 1, Joined service with better understanding 1, Read books on social skill, understanding others, and personality 3, Thought more of others 1, Tried to improve social skills 1, Improved job-seeking skill 1, Practiced reading faster 1, Went on 1, Tried to benefit 1, Nothing of importance 1.

Other comments:
  (Very few comments.) Not enough improvement yet 1, I was drafted too soon to get much help 1, More complete I.Q. helpful 1, Interview very helpful 1, Not enough improvement 1, Made several important decisions as far as work and school are concerned 1, (None or) Space 19.

Letter of Summary

Was letter of summary helpful?
  Yes 16, No 2, Space 6. (None received 4, counted as space.)
  (Very much 2, counted as Yes.) (Not too much 1, and It didn't add anything 1, counted as No.)

Was it too long?
  Yes 1, No 17, Space 6.

Was it too complicated in wording?
  No 19, Space 5.

Did you show it to your parents?
  Yes 13, No 3, Space 8.

Mother?
  Yes 14, No 3, Space 7.

Father?
  Yes 12, No 2, Space 10. (Deceased 2, counted as Space.)

Brothers and sisters?
  Yes 8, No 5, Space 11.

Teacher?
  Yes 2, No 10, Space 12.

Employer?
  No 10, Space 14.
Table 1. (continued)

Friends?
Yes 9, No 5, Space 10.
Have you kept it to look over in future months and years?
Yes 14, No 3, Space 7.
Did you try to follow its suggestions and if so what did you do?
Yes 9, No 3, Space 12. (I had already did change after the inter-
view 1, counted as No. I didn't find any specific enough sugges-
tions to warrant following 1, counted as No. Join the Navy 1,
counted as space. After the Yes answers were the following addi-
tions: I continued with my plans, I am going to look up the
helpful reading material, Change to college course in school, Test
is too recent; applies to 45-43, It helped a little, Went into
the Navy, You know.)
If you received second letters, were these helpful?
Yes 5, Space 19. (None received 2, counted as space.)
What suggestions have you about these letters?
Specific numerical ratings should not be used 2, Put down more
actual results 1, It's a very good idea 1, They're damn good 1,
Contact with boys should not be discontinued 1, Summary and
suggestions should be more specific and practical 1.

Follow-up Counseling

Did your later interviews help you?
Yes 15, No 1, Space 8. (Had none 3, counted as Space.)
Did you feel that you were too strongly urged in one direction?
Yes 1, No 20, Space 3. (Somewhat 1, counted as Yes.) (Not enough
1, counted as No.)
Would you like to have been given a more definite program to follow?
Yes 5, No 12, Space 7.
Did you read books suggested?
Yes 13, No 4, Space 7. (None suggested 4, counted as Space.)
(Partially 1, I looked them over 1, counted as Yes.)
Do you think that these books had any help for you?
Yes 13, No 2, Space 9. (Some 1, counted as Yes.)
Which one particularly?
Getting ready for Induction 2, Personal Problems and Morale 2,
How to Become an Interesting Talker 2, Vocabulary Book 1, How
to Read Faster and Fatter 1, Ben Franklin's Plan for Self-
Improvement 2.)
Did you tend to change your attitudes and ways of thinking into more
effective and mature channels?
Yes 13, No 3, Space 8. (Somewhat 3, counted as Yes.) (Progressing
normally 2, counted as Space.)
Have you started a record of your advances now and of your plans for the
future?
Yes 5, No 15, Space 4. (Plans only 1, counted as Yes.)
Table 1. (continued)

Would it be better to have later interviews more formal or less formal?
Less 13, Space 11. (Just the same 2, Depends 1, counted as Space.)
Were the counselor's suggestions practical?
Yes 20, No 1, Space 3. (Very 1, In some ways 2, counted as Yes.)
Did you feel that the counselor understood you and that you could go
to him with a problem you needed help on?
Yes 21, No 2, Space 1. (Very much 1, Somewhat 1, counted as Yes.)
(I don't think so, counted as No.)
Should he invite you to see him more often?
Yes 21, No 6, Space 5. (Yes, definitely 1, counted as Yes.)
(A question 2, counted as Space.) (I wish he could, counted as Yes.)

Did you feel that you were better able to meet problems yourself be-
cause of interviews?
Yes 13, No 4, Space 2. (No difference 1, counted as No.) (No
problems 1, counted as Space.)

What suggestions do you have for later talks and interviews and con-
versations?
Stress value of education 1, Social improvement 2, Assignments
in the service 1, Less formality 1, Leave out vague suggestions 1,
Follow on ideas and results of past interview 1, Draw a person
out more 1, None 6.

Would you object to having the counselor talk with your parents?
Yes 4, No 17, Space 3.

Other comments
Group discussions on various topics 1, Talks with parents would help
1, Each case is different 1, The "Y" helped me by tests and coun-
seling 1, Let the public know about it 1.

Book Shelf

Have you visited the Boys' Study and read in books and magazines there?
Yes 9, No 14, Space 2.

How would you suggest that these books be made more available, and yet
neither lost nor destroyed?
Library system 2, Keep close touch 2, Instill ideals 1, Depends on
the boys 1, Have them for leaders only, though that is selfish 1,
Distribute more leaflets 1, Advertise 1.

Which books seem most helpful?
Job descriptions and facts 2, Domestic problems 1, Civil Service
books 1, Science News magazines 1, Autobiographies 1, All 1.

What others do you suggest?
Fiction 2, Historical novels 1, Magazines 1, No books on religion
and philosophy 1.
Table 1. (concluded)

Final Comments

What is your name? (Every response was signed.)
What are you doing now?
Working 11 (lab assistant, store, sailboat instruction mentioned),
Student 6 (ASTRP 1 and V-12 1), Camp and counseling 3, Marines 1,
Navy 1, Laid up with injury 1, Space 1.
What are your plans for these next months?
School 12 (Radio 1), School or work 3, Work 2, Vacation 1, Navy 3,
Marines 1, Space 2.
Do you have a definite notion of the sort of vocational and school
activities you will undertake hereafter?
Yes 19, No 4, Space 1. (Yes, definitely 2, counted as Yes.)
What has been the main effect of testing and counseling on you as you
see it now?
More sure of myself 4, More mature in my outlook 1, Set me straight
on many things 1, Helped shape my future 1, Made me prepared for
future 1, Helped me face service tests 1, Brought out natural
abilities 1, Wider variety of choices 1, Made me wary of mechan-
ics as a vocation 1, Made me more conscious of others 2, Convinced
me others want me 1, Suggestive 1, Nothing 1, Space 5.
What other suggestions do you have for either counseling or general boys'
work?
Group discussions on various vocations 1, More athletics 1, Adver-
tise Boys' Study 1, Less formality by counselors 1, Don't have
leaders and counselors leap on boys suddenly 1, Encourage boys
to save selves from bad habits 1, Encourage more work in clubs 1,
Make this kind of a program known to more boys 1, None 5, Space 13.

The original grouping of questions corresponded roughly to the
seven aspects of the counseling program as it was originally conceived.
For the sake of making a more meaningful presentation of data that may
be useful in planning future program modifications, the responses and
recommendations have been organized in the following paragraphs and
tables under the following six headings: Promotion, Preliminary Form
and Testing Procedure, First Review of Test Results and Follow-up Coun-
seling, Letters of Summary and Follow-up, Bookshelf and Bulletin Board,
and General Comments and Criticisms of the Program as a Whole.  

The promotion of the guidance program -- reactions and suggestions. -- The promotion of the guidance program seems to have satisfied the boys, except in the use of the Co-Ed socials as a place of promotion. Table 2 shows how the twenty-four tested boys say they were actually introduced to the program.

Table 2. Channels Through Which Boys were Actually Introduced to the Guidance for Boys Program in 1943-44

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Channel</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Per cent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Director of the Boy's Division</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>29.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Johnson) and Mail</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counselors (Dean and Burke)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>29.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;At the Y&quot;</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leaders</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 shows the reactions of the boys to other promotional possibilities. Nearly three-quarters of the boys thought that older boys should help in promotion, but at least one-fifth opposed the idea. Over half the boys opposed the use of the Co-Ed socials for promotional sales talks on guidance. Folder announcements, schools, posters, bulletin board notices, boys' leaders and other activities were written down in blank spaces as possible promotional channels at least four times each. Only two of the 24 boys thought a bit too much force had been used in promotion. Advertisement and folders were mentioned by boys toward the end of the questionnaire in connection with the Book Shelf,
and, "Let the Public know about it." was one boy's comment under another heading.

Table 3. Possible Channels for the Promotion of the Guidance for Boys Program, as Suggested by the Boys Tested and Counseled during the 1943-44 Season

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Channel</th>
<th>In Favor</th>
<th>Opposed</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per Cent</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Older boys</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>71.0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-Ed Socials</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>29.1</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Folder Announcements</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schools</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posters and Bulletin Board</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boys' Leaders</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Activities</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decreased Force in Presentation</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The preliminary form and the testing procedure—reactions to and suggestions. — The preliminary form seems to have impressed most of the year's counselees as more satisfactory than unsatisfactory. As is indicated in Table 4., three-quarters of the boys thought that filling out the form was a wholesome experience for them, and two-thirds of the boys thought that the form was appropriate in length. However, at least 16 per cent saw no wholesome experience in filling out the form, and nearly 30 per cent thought the form sheet had so many questions that it discouraged them. Comments 1/ that there were "too many questions in too round about manner" and "some of the questions were complicated" may

1/ In the discussions of various aspects of the program and the counselees' reactions to them, occasional reference is made to notes that are to be found in the summary tabulation of Table 1, but are not repeated in the brief special tables.
represent the opinion of many others who followed through the program, as well as the opinion of many who never ventured beyond seeing one of the long printed forms that were to be filled out.

Table 4. The Preliminary Form as Evaluated by the Boys Tested during the 1943-44 Season

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Unsatisfactory</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per Cent</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wholesomeness of the Experience of Filling out the Form</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>76.9</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriateness of the Form's Length</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>66.7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The testing procedure itself seems to have been satisfactory for the counselees except in its extent or length. According to results summarized in Table 5, three-quarters of the boys thought the tests were generally fair and useful. (As can be found from studying Table 1, only one of the boys who disliked the tests could suggest a test that might be unfair because of its time limit.) Two-thirds of the boys liked having the tests in the order given, though one-quarter of them said they would prefer to spend time with the self-administrative tests before taking the timed examinations. Over 60 per cent were apparently glad to wait till the testing was completed before receiving any report, though one-third of them said they would like to have had a partial report before completing the entire series of tests. (One boy suggested that such a partial report might influence the testing done thereafter. Another boy said that he believed that too many similar questions were
included.) Three-eighths of the boys were apparently satisfied with the length of the testing experience, but five-eighths of them stated that they thought the testing took too long. Twenty per cent suggested that the extended program should be given "a little at a time", and eight per cent merely stated that the program should be "shorter". Evidently some means of minimizing and abbreviating the efforts required of testees was definitely indicated in the minds of the boys who had had the testing experience.

Table 5. The Testing Procedure as Evaluated by the Boys Tested during the 1943-44 Season

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th></th>
<th>Unsatisfactory</th>
<th></th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per cent</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per cent</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per cent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General fairness and usefulness of the tests</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>75.0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Order of the timed and self-administrative tests</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>66.7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of interruption for partial reports of results</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>62.5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length of the testing program</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>37.5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>62.3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first review of the test results and the follow-up counseling—reactions and suggestions.—The preliminary review of the test results seems to have been done rather well, from the boys' viewpoint, as it is shown in Tables 5 and 7. One-hundred per cent of the boys thought that the first formal interview was not too long. Over ninety per cent of the boys said that they felt at ease at this first review of test results
and that during its course there were developed and pointed out specific ways for them to advance and solve vocational, educational, and social or personal problems. At least 87 per cent of the boys said they took time to write down or review in their own minds what had been discussed. The question "What did you do because of the first interview?" brought forth a wide variety of responses that are recorded only in the summary, Table 1. More effective planning, better understanding of others, and improvement in the skills of job getting and general social relationships seem to be the most memorable immediate reactions of the counselees. One boy did "nothing of importance," and another only "tried to benefit," but it seems that practically everyone counseled did revise his thought and behavior somewhat, in line with at least one of the accepted goals of counseling.

Table 6. The Preliminary Review of the Test Results as Evaluated by The Counselees of 1943-44 3/

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Unsatisfactory</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per cent</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length of the interview</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ease induced in the counsees</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>91.6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Success in pointing out ways to advance and solve problems</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>91.6</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3/ See Table 1 for a summary of individually worded responses to other questions and see Tables 7 and 8 for further tabulations of reactions to counsel in general.

The counseling in general was apparently rather successful, as is seen in Tables and 8. At least three-quarters of the boys stated that
they were better able to meet problems themselves because of the inter-
views. Only 62 per cent of the boys said they were helped by the later
consultations, but at least 12 per cent added that they had had no fur-
ther interviews, and it is probable that others who left a space had a
little extra counsel. (Four boys said that their ability to meet their
own problems did not grow because of the interviews, and one boy said
he was not helped by the continued consultations.) Over half the boys
said that they did "tend to change [their] attitudes and ways of think-
ing into more effective and mature channels," and only five boys said
they did not tend to do so. Over three-quarters of the boys stated that
they now have a definite notion of the sort of vocational and school
activities they will undertake hereafter, and only one boy said that he
now had no such definite notion. Over half the boys said they read the
books suggested, whereas only 16 per cent said they did not. One-third
of the boys said that they had visited the new Boys' Study (established
long after many of the boys had completed their testing and counseling),
but over half the boys said they had not been there yet. Only 30 per
cent of the boys said they had started a record of their advances now
and of their developing plans for the future, whereas 62 per cent said
they had not done so. The counseling was perhaps successful from the
boys' point of view, but it may be that actions which would concretely
manifest success with groups where controls were more rigorous were
not generally undertaken by boys counseled at the Y.M.C.A.
Table 7. Actions and Attitude Changes Reported by the Counselees of 1943-44 as Resulting from the Guidance and Counseling Done a/

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes.</th>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th></th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per cent</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per cent</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per cent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wrote down notes or re-</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>67.5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>viewed in mind what was</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>said at the first inter-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>view of test results</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gained a definite notion</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>79.4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of vocational, educa-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tional, and social</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>activities to be under-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>taken hereafter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased ability to</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>75.0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>meet personal problems</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Read the books suggested</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>54.2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>29.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed ways of thinking</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>54.2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>32.2 b/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and attitudes into more</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>effective channels</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visited the Boys' Study</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>58.3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started a record of</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>62.5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>advances now and plans</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for future</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a/ See Table 1 (the complete tabulation of responses) for answers to questions like "What did you do because of the first interview?"

b/ "Progressing normally" counted as "neutral".

The counselees' favorable appraisal of the counseling is shown in Table 3. Probably all but two boys thought the counselor understood them and that they could go to him with problems on which they needed help. Only one boy said that he was "somewhat too strongly urged in one direction." Five would like to have been given a more definite program to follow, but twelve would not. 1/ Over half the boys reported

1/ Good counseling aims to help individuals to help themselves, and it often happens that a counselor tries to get counselees to formulate their own definite plans.
that they found the suggested books helpful. A third of the boys were pleased with the amount of invitation for further counsel that was given but 46 per cent said they wanted the counselor to invite them to see him more often. Only one boy stated that the counselor's suggestions were impractical. Over half the boys thought that the later interviews should be less formal. Two boys stressed the need for talks on social improvement and one the need for stimulation toward further education. Good individual suggestions were the omission of "vague suggestions," the following on from the place where most recent interviews ended, and "drawing a person out more."

Table 8. The Counseling in General as Evaluated by the Counselees of 1943-44

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Un satisfactory</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per cent</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding nature of the counselor</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>87.5</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate lack of force in counseling</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practicality of the counselor's suggestions</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Success in creating in the counselees a definite notion of educational, vocational, and social activities to undertake</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>79.4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Success in increasing the counselees' ability to meet their own problems</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>75.0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a/ Since many boys failed to complete the questionnaire and one boy handed in only the first sheet, several of the neutral or space responses may indicate positive or favorable feelings. The complete tabulation of results in Table 1 gives individual responses to these and other questions.
Table 3. (concluded)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th></th>
<th>Unsatisfactory</th>
<th></th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per cent</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per cent</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per cent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General helpfulness of</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>62.5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>33.3 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the follow-up counseling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helpfulness of the books</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>54.2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>37.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>suggested</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Success in changing coun-</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>54.2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>33.3 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>selors' attitudes for</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the better</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definiteness of the pro-</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>29.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gram suggested</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formality of succeeding</td>
<td>(11)d</td>
<td>45.2</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>54.2</td>
<td>(11)d</td>
<td>45.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>interviews</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adequate invitation for</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>11f</td>
<td>45.8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>more counsel</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a/ Since many boys failed to complete the questionnaire and one boy handed in only the first sheet, several of the neutral or space responses may indicate positive or favorable feelings. The complete tabulation or results in Table 1 gives individual responses to these and other questions.

b/ "Progressing normally" counted as "neutral."

c/ The five boys wanted a more definite program suggested.

d/ Because of the wording of the question, it is impossible to say whether the eleven favored the status quo or were neutral. The thirteen said it would be better to have later interviews less formal, but they may have felt satisfied with the formality of their own conferences.

e/ The eleven boys wanted more invitation to further counsel.

The letters of summary and follow-up—reactions and suggestions—

Those who received letters of summary and follow-up seem to have been satisfied with what was written. Only 19 of the 24 counselees received summary letters, and only eight received follow-up notes from November to the first of June. Tables 9 and 10 summarize the way that the
counseled boys answered questions pertaining to the letters. Individual answers are given under the appropriate heading in Table 1.

Table 9. What the 1943-44 Counselees Said They Did with the Summary Letters They Received

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>No answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kept the letters for future reference</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per cent</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>73.7(58.3)</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Showed the letters to their parents</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>68.4(54.2)</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Showed the letters to their mothers</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>73.7(58.3)</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Showed the letters to their fathers</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>63.2(50.0)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Showed the letters to their brothers and sisters</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>42.1(33.3)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Showed the letters to their friends</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>47.4(37.5)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Showed the letters to their teachers</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10.5(8.4)</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Showed the letters to their employers</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0(0.0)</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tried to follow the letters' suggestions</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>47.4(37.5)</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a/ See Table 1 for specific comments.

b/ Five of the counseled boys received no summary letter and 16 of them received no follow-up note. The percentages in parenthesis refer to the total number of counseled boys, whereas the percentages out of parenthesis refer to the 19 boys who received letters of summary.

c/ "Deceased" counted as no answer.

d/ It is possible that this question was overlooked by some of those who filled out most of the rest of the questionnaire.
Table 10. The letters of Summary and Follow-up as Evaluated by the Counselees of 1943-44

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Simplicity of the wording in the first letter of summary</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Unsatisfactory</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per cent</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Per cent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>100.0(79.4)b</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length of the first letter of summary</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>89.5(71.0)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General helpfulness of the first letter of summary</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>84.2(66.7)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General helpfulness of the succeeding letters</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>62.5(20.6)c</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a/ See Table 1 for specific suggestions.

b/ Five of the counseled boys received no summary letter and 16 of them received no follow-up notes. The percentages in parenthesis refer to the total number of counseled boys, whereas the percentages out of parenthesis refer to the total number of boys receiving letters (i.e., 19 for the letters of summary and 8 for the letters of follow-up.)

c/ It is possible that this question was overlooked by some of those who filled out most of the rest of the questionnaire. ("Neutral" means no response.)

In this age of adolescent irresponsibility it is significant that nearly three-quarters of the summary letters sent out have been kept for future reference. The boys appear to have recognized that the letters have more than transient value, and the Y.W.C.A. guidance may have focused counseled boys' attention on the gathering of such helps toward long-term life planning. The proportion may not be as high as is warranted by the effort put into letter writing, however, and it may be that if careful letter writing is to continue, the boys should be
warned that they may want to refer to letters later, and, more important, the letters themselves should be modified so that nearly all the coun-
selees will decide for themselves that the letters warrant preservation.

Nearly three-quarters of the boys showed the letters to their parents and nearly half the boys showed them to their brothers, sisters, and friends; but only 10 per cent showed them to teachers and none showed them to employers. Since the letters often recorded deficiencies in areas like vocabulary and social grace, it may be natural that many boys did not chose to have others read them—especially others not closely related and sympathetic. Even though Y.M.C.A. boys often come from homes where families are not too well adjusted, the boys' parents seem to have their boys' confidence in a majority of cases. Mothers might seem to be more intimate than fathers with their sons, but the statistical difference may be due to the fact that the fathers of at least two of the boys are "deceased." So, too, the fact that many boys did not show their letters to "brothers and sisters" may be due to the fact that these boys had no siblings. It is significant, however, that over 40 per cent of the boys who received letters did show them to some people of approximately their own age, since it is recognized that young people are usually more influenced by their contemporaries' opin-
ions than they are by the sage counsel of grown-ups. The small number of counselees who showed their letters to teachers and employers might indicate that teachers and employers were uninterested or that they had failed to develop confident relationships with their pupils and employees.

1/ This is the feeling of local leaders in Y.M.C.A boys' work, and this particular group of counseled boys displayed on one of their tests mediocre "family relations."
However, some boys received their notes when either out of school or out of work, very likely neither teachers nor employers knew that boys were being guided at the Y.M.C.A, and certainly the indications of deficiency that have been mentioned above might be a strong deterrent against forcing letters on older people who had the power to help or hinder the boys advance. A great deal of study should be given to individual cases before more definite conclusions can be drawn from the data and before further implications can be stated.

The mediocre percentage who "tried to follow the suggestions" in the letters may be accounted for by the fact that the letters were, in many cases, too indefinite in their statement of concrete activities that could be followed immediately. Actually, it often seemed that concrete suggestions for changes were not in order. In such cases none was recorded in the letters, and so the boys responses to the question about following suggestions do not form a satisfactory measure of the letters' success. Of course a study of the boys' success in following suggestions and a later appraisal of the pertinence of the suggestions given, whether followed or not followed, would be most worth while. In the middle of Table 1 are recorded the specific statements as to what was done by the boys who tried to follow the proposals given in the letters received. Individual letters varied so greatly and individual interpretations of both letters and questions differed so much that there would be little meaning in an attempted synthesized summary of what the boys did after the letters were received. The impression derived from reading the responses is not heartening, but it must be
recalled that many of the responses were set down by inarticulate boys who were doing what seemed a far too extended labor of love. Some lads may not have recorded the most significant things they did because of stimulation received from the letters they were sent. Some of the letters may have been sent out without enough consideration of the immediate reactions that might be roused. It is a question how much concrete and dated suggestion should be included in a letter of summary with "future reference" value. It is a question how much specific suggestion should be included in a program of extra-academic training for independent self-reliance. Apparently counseling and letter writing should be correlated to produce in counselees more definition in thinking and more specific activities that tend toward rounded self-development.

Not one of the boys who received a summary letter felt that it was too complicated in wording, and only one of them thought that his letter was too long. Eighty-four per cent called the first letters generally helpful, 62 per cent the next letters so. The counselor had apparently been successful in varying the wording so as never to make his ideas seem too complicated, though it is possible that boys who did not understand what was written would still write down that the wording was simple. Letters of four hundred words did not seem to be too long; the procedure of dealing with interests, capacities, habits, and adjustment in an extended personalized first letter seems to have been approved. "The reasons why two boys found the letters other than generally helpful should be studied through the comparison of case histories, notes, and the carbons of the letters sent."

Subsequent letters, in a few cases, were written to start
a modification in deeply entrenched anti-social ways of thinking, so it is natural that boys receiving them would not judge them "generally helpful" till months or years later. A 60 per cent record of success in the adjudged helpfulness of follow-up notes is satisfactory.

The few final "suggestions...about these letters" that were gathered from the boys indicate that the letters are often found adequate as they are -- "They're damn good" says one boy -- that they help in contact and should be continued, but that their summaries and suggestions should be made more specific and practical. Apparently a happy medium is demanded in the use of ratings and comparisons; specific numerical ratings are not welcome, but broad generalizations are also disliked.

The guidance bookshelf and group guidance activities--reactions and suggestions.-- The Boys' Study and bookshelf were not opened till long after many of the boys had completed their counseling experience. The questions were inserted to call attention to opportunities for reading and to gain suggestions for future preparations for boys' reading. No special table of responses in this area has been prepared because most of the questions demanded individually worded suggestions. Table 1 contains this total reaction.

Only one-quarter of the counseled boys said they had visited the Boys' Study and had read in the books and magazines there, but well over one-half the boys left the question without answer. The "most helpful" books recorded were apparently "job descriptions and facts", civil service data, autobiographies, and books about personal problems. Personal Problems and Morale, Franklin's Plan for Self-Improvement, How to Become
an Interesting Talker, and Setting Ready for Induction were books men-
tioned, under follow-up counseling, as having given special help to
at least two boys each. A few boys suggested that scientific, histor-
ical, and fictional works be added. A library system, close super-
vision, and ethical instruction were noted as ways to insure against
the loss of books and magazines. It seems apparent that there is oppor-
tunity for further development in the book shelf and Boys' Study.

Group guidance was not done during the 1943-44 season, but as one
reads through the questionnaire responses, one gathers hints that group
discussion of vocational, educational, and personal problems would be
in order and would be welcomed.

The program as a whole--final comments, general reactions, and
suggestions for the future.-- The last section of the questionnaire
dealt with "final comments." All the returned questionnaires were
signed, and all but one of the replying boys recorded what they were
doing at the time they filled out the question sheets. A study of the
pertinence of the jobs at which they were working, in relation to advice
and counsel given at the "Y", might prove valuable, even though little
significance could be attached to the group trends that could be de-
sired. Early placements in industry are often made for reasons of con-
venience and growth in areas of personal and social adjustment; and re-
sponses on the questionnaire that was used are often not specific enough
to indicate how far boys were following in their actual temporary

1/ See Table 1.

2/ A carefully prepared check list of preferences, at this point in the
questionnaire, might have brought forth more complete response and might
have given more definitely representative data to use in book selection
later.
placement, their own best interests as they had come to see them under
the guidance afforded at the Y.M.C.A. Much of the same sort of comment
can be made in relation to the boys' statements as to what they intended
to do during the forthcoming year. It may seem significant that 79 per
cent of the boys had, when they replied, a "definite notion" of the sort
of vocational and school activities they would undertake thereafter.
However, the word "definite" can have various interpretations, and trial
and error is an important part of adolescent growth even under best
guidance, so one can not say that the Y.M.C.A. program should have pro-
duced on this question a negative response from less than four boys.

Statements by the counselees as to the main effect of the counsel-
ing and testing program for them indicate that many were indeed helped
as guided people should be. Four wrote down that they were more sure of
themselves and two that they started thinking more about others, while
others worded their own versions of what seemed the most significant
aid, information, or stimulation for them. The final suggestion asked
for included remarks pertaining to the entire boys' work program. Some
had to do with athletics and club life in general. (One in particular
bears repeating: "Don't have leaders and counselors leap on boys sud-
denly.") Certainly the note that leaders should "make the program
known to more boys" indicates that some success had been attained, and
the fact that five boys wrote that they had no suggestions for program
changes indicates some satisfaction by the clients and gives some in-
spiration for continued efforts by the leaders.

To summarize briefly we may say that the counseled boys favored a
continuation of the past program with only minor changes. They suggested extensive promotion everywhere except at Co-Ed socials, and they considered that they themselves had not been too strongly forced into the program. The preliminary form, they thought, might be abbreviated without losing its value for self-analysis and stimulation; the testing itself, though fair and useful, should be abbreviated and minimized if at all possible. They considered the counseling practical and the interviews easy, helpful, and of appropriate length; but they thought later interviews should be less formal, more invitation for continued counsel should be made, and more specific suggestions should be given, and more encouraging and regular follow-up should be carried on. They thought the letters were helpful, sufficiently simple, and worthy of both perusal by close relatives and friends and preservation for future reference, but not written so that suggestions would be followed by all and not written so as to be usable in enlisting best cooperation with the boys' employers, teachers, and contemporaries. Those who knew the book shelf in the Boys' Study favored its amplification, and most of those who replied seemed to show a vague need for some sort of group guidance. The counseled boys found that they had gotten hold of themselves, started better habits of planning for the future, and increased their capacity for handling human relations very largely because of the guidance that they had received and that they recommended for others.

The Program Modifications Put into Practice on the Basis of the Boys' Suggestions-- or Recorded to Try out in the Future

Changes in the promotion of the guidance program.-- On the basis
of the counseled boys’ suggestions, coupled with the impressions of leaders closely associated with the guidance work, the promotion of the program was somewhat modified this past season and will be further amplified in the future. The director of the division and the counselor have continued to make personal contacts and to send out letters of invitation to selected boys who seemed to need help in self appraisal. The leaders of both the church groups and the local "Y" clubs were addressed at their fall get-togethers, and the possibilities in the guidance program were kept before them through mail notices on at least two occasions. (Two ministers studied the program carefully this past year and sent boys from their parishes for testing.) This sort of promotion can be continued with personal contacts and telephone conversations, as well as through reports by boys who have been tested. Leaders may gradually introduce the guidance idea to their boys while they lead them in other activities. Some clubs may undertake special projects in group guidance, with individual testing as a basis.

Older boys, just now, are called into service, but those that are in the vicinity cooperate in telling younger boys about the advantages to be gained from measurement and counsel. Since some boys showed that they felt that older boys should not be enlisted as promoters, care has been exercised in discovering hearty enthusiasm before any special promotional assignments are made to those who have been tested. Promotion at Co-Ed socials has been discontinued, except for individual conversations that are carried on only when boys themselves show a definite interest.
An important development in promotion, this past season, was the preparation of a blue folder announcement entitled "Guidance for Boys", and containing both an inviting statement of the need for testing and counsel and also a description of the actual procedure followed in the complete program. A copy of this folder is appended to this service study. Copies were mailed to club leaders and prospective counselees, and copies are kept on hand at the Boys' Division desk for distribution to all who are interested. Nearby schools may receive copies of a revised edition that will probably be prepared later.

The bulletin board has been used more effectively, since the questionnaire reports were studied, and increased attention will be given to advertisement at places where boys look for notices of interest to them. Group movies and round tables may be used next year for general guidance, as well as for the promotion of the individual testing and counseling.

Changes in the preliminary form and testing procedure.-- The four-page preliminary form has been used again this past year, but it has not been imposed on boys who were merely considering the advantages of guidance for themselves. The form has been made one of the tests, in many cases, or it has been given to testees as a home assignment at the time they finished the testing itself. The form contains much information that should be on hand, and the self-analysis involved in filling it out has had a healthy influence on many who have been guided. It may be that in the future a shorter form can be used with the younger boys' division members (and boys low in literary interest), or it may be that
those who make appointments can help by setting down the boys' spoken answers to its many questions.

The standard testing procedure has been continued, but variations have been allowed to match the needs of individual boys. A special short three and a half hour battery of tests has been designated as available for those who do not want to take a full day of testing. On some occasions self-administered tests are given first and partial reports are implied in conversations before measurement is completed, but it is still definitely recommended that boys come for either an entire day, or for two three and a half hour periods, and that timed tests be taken before the self-administrative measures. It is difficult for an outside counselor to have a sufficiently complete picture of a boy's status unless he has both preliminary form data and the results of tests in several areas of interest, ability, and general adjustment. It may be that as club leaders and boys' division workers take over more of the actual counseling, fewer tests at a given time will be indicated for many of the boys, and it may be that as boys have less urge to leave for parts unknown, their guidance can start earlier, continue longer, and be regularly punctuated and focused by tests taken at several stages in their Y.M.C.A. careers.

(Special non-battery tests, like the test of finger dexterity, the Revised Stanford-Binet and the Wechsler-Bellevue, are now more readily available for special case study. The Occupational Interest Inventory is now used in place of the Strong Vocational Interest Blank with younger boys and with young men who have special disabilities in areas of reading and clerical detail.)
Modifications in the review of the test results and the follow-up counseling. -- Because a single person did both the first reviewing of test results and the follow-up counseling these past two years, the two sorts of counseling have been discussed together in this paper. As has already been indicated, \( \frac{\text{1}}{\text{1}} \) it is now planned that hereafter a boys' leader, permanently located in the Boys' Division, will be in direct charge of informal counseling and special leaders will have assignments for the counsel of individual boys. The former Boys' Division Counselor, now located in the Department of Occupational Services, will give the preliminary review of test results, confer with individual counselors, and collaborate in the organizing of additional boys' guidance activities.

The general procedure in the first review of test results has been continued this year and will be continued in the future. It may be that the counselor is gaining experience in inducing ease and in making interviews more satisfying, as he shows definite ways that problems can be solved. If boys' division leaders attend part of these first conferences and talk with the counselor later, it is felt that new and definite approaches to problems can be more successfully used later by the boys themselves. In single interviews too much is sometimes attempted; a boy's appreciation of the implications in his scores may be somewhat hazy at the end of an hour, and a single emotionally tinged area may seem to have received undue stress. When a boys' division leader is scheduled to take over the guidance work thereafter, it will \( \text{1/} \) See Chapter II, p. 11.
be possible for the Occupational Services counselor to be more definite in certain areas and to leave others for a more gradual development, after more immediate concerns are settled and a program of self-development is begun.

The boys' suggestions for the counseling in general have proved helpful and should prove even more useful as the new program of counseling is undertaken. There is being attempted an increase in the definiteness of suggestions that can be followed through—"not expecting what is too difficult and allowing ample opportunity for the celebration of successful efforts." The new organization for guidance should certainly allow more time for the "Drawing out" of hidden conflicts and desires, and it should also make for less formality and adequate invitation to continued counsel.

Changes in the handling of the summary and follow-up letters.--The practice of writing summary letters to the counseled boys has been and will be continued, but there may now be introduced certain modifications that will make them more appropriate in a situation where continued counsel is more readily available. During the guidance process the boys will probably be told that the summary letters may prove valuable in the future, and the introductions in these letters may be so worded that tested boys will want to preserve what is recorded for them. More attention can be given to discussing with counselees outside influences and the value of sharing a test record with intimate relatives and friends. Because there will be a leader-counselor nearby for the continued counsel, some of the counselees' deficiencies need not be mentioned in the first
letters of the future. A "notation of emphasis" to the leader-counselor may touch on these negative aspects of the test records, and make their correction more likely. It is hoped that the leader-counselors will at some time get in touch with some of the relatives and close friends of the boys in their direct charge and that parents and others will come to the counselor if they have particular questions as to how to help their children. The summary letters now attempt to strike a medium between the unwelcome and invidious specific numerical ratings and the broad generalizations that are nearly meaningless. The wording will continue to be adapted to the individual boys. Suggestions that are given will be as definite as is advisable in letters that are to be preserved for future rereading and future inspiration, and as definite as is proper when individuals are being helped to help themselves toward independent self-reliance. It is hoped that counseling and follow-up letter writing will be correlated with summary letters to produce in counselees more definition in thinking, more self-confidence, and more self-reliant effort in the undertaking of activities that tend to bring well-rounded self and social development.

Changes in plans for the book shelf and group guidance.— During the past season the Boys' Study has been available to responsible boys, and extensions in the opportunities it affords have been advertised on the bulletin board. It has become customary to make a special point of telling each counseled boy about books and pamphlets in the study that would be useful to him, and as time has gone by more and more boys have visited the Boys' Study, spending at least an hour or two surveying what
is on hand. Boys who want to spend time in the study ask permission from a leader or desk clerk and either obtain a key or have the door opened for them. Most of the books and valuable magazines have been marked with a special notice requesting that books never leave the study, so that they be permanently available to all who want to use them. Besides the book shelf itself, a large magazine rack has been added to the room and slightly used magazines from the Men's Division library, as well as from friends, have been made available to the boys periodically. The Boys' Division Counselor and some of the other leaders have loaned permanently a few books, such as Your High School Record, Does it Count? and Adventures with Amateur Adults. Books in threes, one on science or sports, one on vocations, and one on adjustment to life, have been loaned for two-week periods from the libraries of the Boys' Division Counselor and friends—usually with accompanying advertising on the Division bulletin board. The small amount of money that could be used was invested in a subscription to the "Occupational Briefs of War and Post-War Jobs" that are published by Science Research Associates and are filed together in a loose-leaf folder.

During succeeding seasons the Boys' Study may become a more popular and influential place as the pertinence and amplitude of its reading and study materials are improved. The appointment of a special boys' leader and the selection of a boys' library committee may help in bettering both the quality and the quantity of the study's offerings. Special promotional work may follow, and it may be that more friends will make contributions and that more funds will be made available for the purchase
of up-to-date material that will be appreciated and used. Some histori-
cal, scientific, and fictional works may be added to the Boys' Study
shelves, but to increase the room's effectiveness in fostering growth
toward better adjustment and the selection of satisfying life vocations
and avocations, money should be found for the purchase of modern books
that make for broad physical, mental, and spiritual growth and for sub-
scriptions to pertinent periodicals like "Vocational Trends" and "Career
News".

Correlated closely with the "book shelf" that was started in March
1944 would be a file of occupational information. "Job descriptions and
facts" that were asked for by boys who responded to the questionnaire
are often most readily available in pamphlet form. A letter-size file
should and probably will be obtained, and some boys working with a
leader may be able to make a small subsidy go far in bringing together
in a file varied material that will prove useful to many.

Group guidance that seemed to be indicated as a need among past
counselors and other boys may be attempted during the coming season.
The occupational information file mentioned above may be one project of
a club of boys who specialize in studying occupations and local job
opportunities—a field of inquiry so important in preparation for life
and so grossly overlooked in the curricula of the nearby high schools.
Many boys who have been counseled show that they thereby become increas-
ingly aware of others and start seeking better ways of organizing their
own personal habits in relation to others. This area of life—also too
much overlooked in the scholastic programs in nearby educational institu-
tions—may be made the study of another group who could develop a mutually helpful program of activities that would help boys to grow without feeling themselves under too penetrating surveillance. "Leaders' Conferences" for the preparation of boys who may assume program responsibility have been group guidance meetings of a sort, but they have but touched on work which should be greatly extended as time goes by. "Co-Ed Social Committee" meetings have been the source of much growth in understanding and self-reliance on the part of those who participated, but more groups should be formed where this type of growth is possible. Group and individual guidance should go hand in hand, each contributing to and causing an interest in and an understanding of the other.

Changes and additions for the program as a whole.— In summary, it can be noted that the following trends are taking place in the guidance work of the Boys' Division of the Huntington Avenue Branch of the Boston Y.M.C.A., largely because of suggestions derived from the counseled boys of the past and recorded on the questionnaire studied in this paper. The organization is being improved with a responsible Chief Counselor in the Boys' Division. The program is being promoted with more vigor through staff and club leaders, through older counseled boys, through folders and bulletin board announcements, and through personal contacts and the mail. The Co-Ed socials are being used less for public promotion. The preliminary form and testing procedure are being continued with less rigidity, and both an abbreviation of the average number of tests and an extension to special areas for those especially interested can be noted. The preliminary reviewing of the test results is being made a
special function of a member of the Department of Occupational Services, while the preliminary and succeeding counseling is being made a function of a chief counselor and various leader-counselors who are drawn, for the most part, from the Boys' Division staff and so are near the boys themselves. The preliminary review of test results is thus becoming less diffuse and all-inclusive, since less significant tendencies that are noted by the reviewing "Consultant Counselor" can be presented to the leader-counselors for future development after immediate concerns are better settled. There is an increasing definiteness in the presentation of some suggestions, but there is often more "drawing out" and more effort to help boys to arrive at a state of mature self-determination as well as religious and social responsibility. Formality in later interviews tends to decrease and more opportunity for continued counsel is presented. Letters, too, are more adapted to special needs, less all-inclusive, yet worthy of preservation and presentation to others. They may have a few more definite suggestions, but the new "notations of emphasis" may present to leader-counselors notice of deficiencies that are best omitted from the letter-summaries of test results.

The Boys' Study is being used more and more, and plans for enlargement of the bookshelf into a small library with a file of occupational information may be carried out before long. Group guidance may be introduced gradually as handmaid and parallel emphasis.

The organizational modifications that have been proposed during the summer of 1945 are presented in mimeographed sheets at the end of this service study. Time alone can tell whether the modified and
refined organization for the local Y.M.C.A.'s "Guidance for Boys" will be as successful as is now anticipated.
CHAPTER IV

THE EXPERIENCES OF OTHER INVESTIGATORS WITH SIMILAR PROBLEMS

The approaches to guidance evaluation that have been recorded.— In Chapter I it was pointed out that counseling and guidance work can be evaluated in many ways. Four approaches to the problem seem to be common. (1) Comparison can be made between the guidance techniques used and the guidance techniques employed in reputable and successful institutions or suggested by both common sense and eminent authorities in the field of personnel work. Outside critics can sometimes be called upon to make this sort of comparison in appraising a program that is being followed. (2) When counselees continue in the more or less regimented existence of institutional life, studies can be made to show whether what people are doing a year or two after guidance is in line with suggestions given and whether consequent success is as had been anticipated at the time that guidance was given. (3) When only a part of a general group is guided and when life after guidance is diversified, follow-up studies can be carried on several years after counseling contacts to show how well the status and opinion of guided people compare with the status and opinion of people who received no guidance but were otherwise comparable. (4) When a more immediate appraisal of success is required, counselee opinion and reaction can be sought and used to give at least one measure of the results of the counseling experience.
It appears that in the guidance evaluation literature that is available there are many suggestions for the use of the first approach; there is an increasing amount of direct study of guidance effects in controlled situations; there have been recorded a few significant attempts to measure the long time effects of guidance work in terms of modified activities, attitudes, and habits; and several organizations have found it worth while to try to measure the immediate reactions of counselees who have been guided under their auspices.

Although in this paper the author is primarily concerned with the last named approach to the problem, he at first found too meagre a selection of material in his own field. He discovered helpful suggestions in theses and reports that had been written about evaluation approached in different ways. He found that a few writers gave fresh insights that were most pertinent. In this chapter he classifies and summarizes a few studies that relate to guidance evaluation in general, sometimes treating parts of a single thesis under two or more headings as seemed in accord with the classification scheme—and naturally dwelling on those aspects that most pertain to the subject at hand.

Summaries of evaluations that have been made.— Andrée, in a doctoral thesis for Harvard University, School of Education, investigated five hundred distinct follow-up studies made during the years 1940 and 1941. He found that most of these centered attention on flaws in educational practice and tended to lose individuals in a maze of statistics. He shows that few deal with school guidance results, and he

indicated that because of the present attitude of educators, post-school guidance is most necessary.

Williamson and Bordin have presented a well organized analysis of the various ways that guidance success can be measured. After an analysis of the forty-four studies listed in an appended bibliography, the authors conclude that "all available methods of evaluation have weaknesses," that "composite criteria which avoid arithmetic combination of the part-criteria are at present least open to question (although still being crude measures)," and that "the methods of studying students in general may not be applied to the study of individual students with particular problems." They write the following paragraph about student opinion as a basis of evaluation:

"While the student's report is the easiest way to determine satisfaction and cannot be ignored as one type of satisfaction response, it has many weaknesses. For example, it may conceal real dissatisfaction behind a rationalization process. It may be a reflection of dissatisfaction in some other area that education or vocation, e.g., social recreations, sex. The desire to please the counselor because of fixation or gratefulness may lead to a report of satisfaction. In some cases, it seems too much to expect a feeling of complete satisfaction even with the most successful counseling..."

Stohr, in a most recent service study for the Boston University School of Education, records attempts at evaluation in the field of guidance for young people at counseling services similar to that of Boston University—besides making the evaluation of the local work that is reported.


later in this chapter. She finds that other leaders feel that guidance for out-of-school youth is valuable, but she quotes from other studies to show that counselors know too little about the results of their own labors—that they are so preoccupied with routine duties that they do not obtain the follow-up information that would aid materially in the improvement of the standards and techniques they use.

Evaluation through the judgment of outsiders.—An example of evaluation through outside appraisal is that which was done for the extensive and famous Adjustment Service of New York City in 1934. Three observers, an educator, an industrialist, and a social worker, spent a week as invited guests appraising the service as a whole. The reports seem to be unbiased in their careful appraisal. They agree in the opinion that the service was effective in meeting its objectives as well as was possible under the prevailing conditions.

Nearly every description of guidance work has some appraisal through reference to reputed authorities or common sense. The recent Strayer reports on educational systems contain such appraisals of organizations for guidance.

Evaluation in controlled situations.—Hutson and Webster published in the spring of 1943 the results of a typical educational guidance appraisal, through a comparison of the guidance given in the tenth grade and the ratings made by counselees in the subjects that they took.


2/ Percival Hutson and Arthur Webster, "An Experiment in the Educational Guidance of Tenth Grade Pupils" Educational and Psychological Measurement III (Spring, 1943), 3-21.
during the following semester. French prognosis examinations and past subject ratings seem to have been used effectively in helping young people to choose courses wisely. The young people themselves were helped to see the chances they had for success, as shown by the histories of others for whom the same prognostic measurements had been made before.

Ellen McGrath, in a Boston University thesis, attempts to measure the success of educational guidance at the Weeks Junior High School in Newton, through a study of the success of guided pupils in the senior high school programs that were selected under guidance. Miss McGrath uses a normative-survey through documentary study to show that 85 per cent of the Weeks pupils that were promoted during the three years studied succeeded in the high school curriculum selected (or in an equally difficult curriculum). The causal-comparative method is used in demonstrating that 91 per cent of the pupils whose curriculum was approved by the ninth grade teachers were successful in high school, and 74 per cent of those whose curriculum choice was not approved were not successful.

Appraisals though studies of changes in status effected through guidance.—Robert Cole attempted a two-group control technique in evaluating the guidance service of the Boys' Club of Worcester, Massachusetts. The effects of guidance given as an elective activity in 1931 were studied through a comparison of the achievements and the opinions of 100 boys who received guidance and the achievements and opinions


of an equivalent 100 boys who did not receive it. The two groups, which were alike in age, intelligence, class grades, school marks, physical development, health, and social and economic status in 1931, were found to differ considerably in 1936. The guided group showed more school attainment (45 as opposed to 22 were in school) and less school retardation. The guided group were employed in positions that presented better opportunities for advancement and their weekly earnings were higher. They changed jobs less frequently and they expressed more satisfaction with their work than did those who were not counseled. Only one-tenth as many of the advised boys had been judged criminal or delinquent during the intervening period.

Evaluating guidance through a study of the present status of previously guided people is another aspect of the evaluation done for the Adjustment Service of New York City. Emma Seipp made a careful study of 100 selected clients of the Adjustment Service, using record material, questionnaires, and, in some cases, personal interviews. She found that about 57 per cent of the clients studied had adopted definite objectives commensurate with their abilities and interests and were experiencing satisfaction in the pursuit of their goals.

Frank Burt, writing before the New York Adjustment Service had been evaluated, tried to use statements about present education and work as an evidence of the success of past counseling, as a part of his appraisal of the Boston Y.M.C.A. Job Counseling Service—an appraisal and


study which is reported and criticized later in this chapter.

Hazel Lewis,1 in a doctoral dissertation on the guidance facilities for out-of-school young women of Boston, describes an attempt to measure the success of the Y.W.C.A. counseling service by the same means. She first tried to discover the adjustment attained by former clients through a study of a group of counselees' statements as to their present vocational and educational status. She found that, of the 66 per cent who reported, 24 per cent had attained a satisfactory goal, 54 per cent were making good progress toward a satisfactory goal, 13 per cent were making efforts but with unsatisfactory results, and 6 per cent showed little evidence of effort in their own behalf. She analyzed the number of jobs held by those who were successful and unsuccessful in adjustments, and she made several other comparisons based on data obtained from the counselees' cards of registration. However, she later shows that it is unsatisfactory to try "to show the results of counseling in terms of progress made by clients as judged by such objective evidence as employment or enrollment in a suitable course of study." She suggests that (1) since there is no control group, one can not estimate how much adjustment is due to guidance, (2) economic conditions (such as existed in 1937) may prevent people from getting the job and studying the course they want, (3) counseling benefits often take a long period of time to show themselves, and (4) insight and leisure time growth may be more important than the jobs that have been secured and the courses that have been started.

Attempts at appraisal through the use of counselee reactions.--

Many counseling agencies have sought evaluation through the opinions of those who have been counseled. In the excellent doctoral dissertation on guidance facilities for out-of-school young women of Boston just referred to, Hazel Lewis continued her evaluation of the Y.W.C.A. service with a search for the opinions of the clients who had been counseled. She writes: 1/

"No completely satisfactory way to measure the value of a counseling program in terms of results has yet been devised. There are tangible values for which fairly objective criteria can be established, but there are also equally important intangible values which are much more difficult to measure."

The deficiencies in her "somewhat objective" measurements have been stated earlier in this chapter. She went on in her appraisal by sending out a questionnaire and covering letter to the 1178 counselees of 1937, to get at "intangible" reactions and effects. On the basis of a 30 per cent response to her single letter she gathered data and collected individual comments to conclude that the clients had been helped in making better vocational choices, in finding jobs, and in learning to use available resources in the solution of their problems. She shows that the girls themselves felt more confident and knew themselves better because of the counseling they had received.

One of the evaluation studies of the Adjustment Service of New York City uses this same approach. In the small pamphlet Clients' Opinions of the Adjustment Service, 2/ Hawkins reports the careful procedure used

1/ Hazel Lewis, Op.Cit. p. 64.

in questioning and following up 2629 of the first 9000 who registered for the New York guidance service. He concludes that at least two-thirds of the clients felt that the service had been of value—especially in helping them to a better understanding of themselves. Two quotations are interesting: 1/

"In terms of problem presented, the Service was reported as most useful to those recently out of school on the threshold of their first jobs and least useful to those whose sole problem was finding a job."

"Those who received value were those to whom a vocational plan was suggested, to whom a training class was suggested, and with whom more than the usual number of interviews were held."

In order to measure Certain Results of the Job Counseling Service of the Boston Y.M.C.A 2/ Frank Burt made use of the questionnaire technique. His thesis presents copious data on the job counseling "course" that was given to 1600 male high school graduates who were tested and counseled in the Huntington Avenue building during the three years before the writing of the 1935 report. It describes the young men who took the "course" as well as the program that was followed and the testing instruments that were used, and it presents the results of an evaluation through the questioning of past counselees. The thesis is loosely put together and includes too many discursive criticisms and opinions. It contains no survey of previous experience in the field and shows no clearly conceived view of the problems at hand. However, it does contain stimulating pioneer thought, and it concludes with "recommendations and prophecy" which have proved influential in the development of the present Occupational Services of the local Y.M.C.A.

Mr. Burt chose to question 200 men who seemed typical and who had been "graduated" from the course two years before. A nine-question questionnaire was sent out "with a request" that the counselee fill out the form and "return it to the Job Counseling Office." Fifty-two replies were soon received. A follow-up return post card with an abbreviated questionnaire of six questions was sent to 99 who did not reply, and 26 more reactions were obtained. Telephone follow-up brought in 25 more, and personal letters resulted in replies from 2 more laggards, bringing the total number of replies to 105. On the basis of a study of these replies, Mr. Burt concludes that in spite of handicaps "The Job Counseling Service is doing a worthwhile work in the community and one that well merits continuance and expansion." He says that 33 per cent of those who replied secured jobs based on test results, that 72 per cent had their morale improved, that 42 per cent were encouraged to start further study, and that 75 per cent secured jobs (possibly) through better techniques. Differences in wording between the original questionnaire and the card follow-up make it difficult to gather meaningful data about counselee reaction to the service that was done, but according to tabulated results it seems that 62 per cent got a clearer picture of their "aptitudes, abilities, and personality," 80 per cent found the evening lectures valuable, 32 per cent thought group meetings helped, and 43 per cent counted counselor contacts valuable—though as Mr. Burt suggests, reaction-opinions might have been different if they had been requested by a disinterested "party".

A significant sidelight is suggested by Mr. Burt on the basis of
his analysis of the status and opinion of clients who replied to the questionnaire. He groups together clients who replied promptly and clients who replied only with prodding and shows that a larger percentage of those who replied promptly had been studying since they were counseled, were working at the time they replied, and stated that their morale had been improved as a result of the Job Counseling contacts they had had. Mr. Burt implies that people who answer questionnaires promptly are apt to be those who are in a good condition of general adjustment and who feel well disposed toward the institution that sends out the questionnaire—that surveys based on a small number of prompt questionnaire-responses may paint pictures that are too optimistic.

Most recently, Thelma Stohr has used the response-questionnaire in making An Evaluation of the Services of the Boston University Department of Counseling to its Non-university Clients.\footnote{Thelma Stohr, An Evaluation of the Services of the Boston University Department of Counseling to its Non-university Clients, Unpublished Service Study, Boston University, School of Education, 1945.} Although her fine thesis contains data on the counselees and gives arm-chair evaluation of the kind described earlier in this chapter, the most pertinent aspect of her work is her survey of counselee opinion. She prepared a questionnaire of twenty questions, tried it out on fifteen recent clients, and, after modifying its construction, sent it with a covering letter to the 216 outside clients who had been completely serviced by the department during the year preceding her study of 1945. She made her request in the name of the department and invited counselees back for further free
service. By following up this original request with both a reminding card and another letter and duplicate questionnaire, she obtained a 70 per cent response upon which to base her conclusions. The questionnaire itself asked for data on the present educational and vocational situation of the counselee, on the results of the counsel given in terms of changed objectives, on the areas where most help had been given, on inadequacies in the program, and on general suggestions that might prove helpful in the future. Miss Stohr concludes from an analysis of the replies received, that, a year after the counseling experience, many were attending schools that had been suggested to them, 50 per cent were working toward goals suggested or reaffirmed in counsel, 50 per cent or more believed they had received most benefit in understanding their interests and aptitudes, less than 50 per cent felt the need of further testing, but about 30 per cent thought they would like to have more interpretation and more information about relevant vocational and educational possibilities. She shows that nearly 90 per cent of those replying indicated some degree of benefit from the counseling experience, and she gives many individual comments to show how real was the benefit derived by some.

In these and other studies of counselee appraisal there are included several pages of individual quotations. Although notations can be tabulated to show trends, individual comments often give most insight into the way that a counseling program has affected the lives and thoughts of those for whom it has been established. Apparently questionnaires that do include space for individual comments call forth opinion that is valuable to those who would review a counseling service that has been rendered.
The validity and reliability of counselee reactions. Although the writer could find no study of the validity of the opinions of counselees who criticise their counselors and the counseling that has been done for them, he found many studies of pupil criticism in the more routine teaching situations. Roy Bryan \(^1\) has written prolifically on the subject.

In his Contribution to Education for Teachers College, Columbia University, he summed up previous experience in the field and reports an experiment that proved how reliable and valid pupil opinion can be—at least when the pupils do not have any reason to believe that their opinions will be read by those they criticise. In more recent articles he reports a further definitive experiment.

In his Columbia thesis \(^1\) Bryan emphasizes personality conditioning and states that, regardless of the attitudes of teachers and administrators, pupils do judge their teachers and pupil judgments help determine teachers' reputations as well as the effectiveness of teachers' instruction. He reviews past literature as well as arguments for and against official pupil rating. He describes his own instrument, a rating scale with eleven question items, fifty-five suggested responses, and space for additional comments. He shows how this instrument allows pupils to make checks that rate each of their teachers on a five-step scale in several significant aspects of the instruction process, as well as indicate their own attitudes in matters that competent judges thought had weight in determining pupil judgments. He explains how data were obtained from 3000 pupils in a Brooklyn high school and from

800 pupils in a junior high school near Cincinnati. He draws the following conclusions: (1) There is a wide range between the ratings of the best and the poorest teachers; (2) Median averages are remarkably stable; (3) Reliability coefficients of a 0.90 or more can be obtained for most items when forty responses are used; (4) Pupil ratings give a valid measure of something real that must be dealt with by teachers, whether they like it or not; (5) Average ratings of individual teachers show great similarity; (6) Average ratings of individual high school teachers differ more from item to item than ratings of junior high school teachers; (7) Extra comments give valuable clues as to the reason for ratings; (8) Pupils are less inclined than administrators to give the same rating from item to item; (9) The ratings of high and low mental capacity pupils differ little in accuracy; (10) There is a slight tendency for boys to rate men teachers high and for girls to rate women teachers high.

In considering the entire problem of evaluation through student rating, he recommends that: (1) Care be exercised in selecting instrument items of tested and known merit; (2) The rating instrument include space for favorable and unfavorable comments beyond those specifically suggested; (3) The ratings be obtained under conditions that encourage frankness, honesty, and careful thought, possibly by preserving pupils' anonymity, removing fear, allowing time, and encouraging diverse ratings for specific teachers; (4) Each pupil have time to know a teacher before being called upon to rate him—probably three or four months; (5) Ratings be called for repeatedly, so that teachers can note changes.

Since the publication of the "Columbia Contribution to Education"
summarized above, Bryan has carried on an experiment in which 86 teachers tried "Evaluating Student Reactions to Themselves" with results that show how reliable, valid, and needful such reactions are, as well as how much the teachers themselves thought they gained from the experiment. In this new four-fold study Bryan again used rating scales that asked for the checked choice of one of five progressively favorable responses for each question item, in addition to extra individualized comments; he gives rather complete instructions for dealing with responses to a questionnaire of this type, and he suggests a way of obtaining for each question a point value which can prove useful as an index of effectiveness of each aspect of the instruction asked about.

1/ Roy C. Bryan, Eighty-six Teachers Try Evaluating Student Reaction to Themselves, Educational Administration and Supervision, XXVII (October, 1941) p. 513-526. Why Student Reactions to Teachers Should Be Evaluated, Educational Administration and Supervision, XXVII (November, 1941) p. 590-603. Reliability, Validity, and Needfulness of Written Student Reactions to Teachers, Educational Supervision and Administration, XXII (December, 1941) p. 655-665. Benefits Reported by Teachers Who Obtained Written Student Reactions, Educational Supervision and Administration, XXIII (January, 1942) p. 69-73.
CHAPTER V
A CRITICAL APPRAISAL OF THE JUNE 1944 EVALUATION

The objectives, the scope, and the general limitations of the effort. — The June 1944 effort at the Huntington Avenue Branch of the Boston Y.M.C.A. was, from a critical point of view, a rather amateurish attempt at evaluation. It may have had some beneficial effects on both the questioned boys and the evaluating counselor and leaders, but it did not result in data that could be presented and used with utmost effect. It was neither pure education nor pure evaluation, and it had neither definite aim nor definite limits. It probably failed in its best possibilities because it was preceded by no careful survey of the experiences of others who had worked with similar problems and because it was preceded by no clear-cut analysis of possible objectives and scope. It failed because its author did not start by thinking through what would be most useful in the immediate circumstances, what would be usable in the formulation of a pertinent and worthwhile report, and what could reasonably be expected from the boys whose opinions he was to seek.

There are several possible purposes for follow-up questionnaires after counseling, but a question blank is probably most effective in yielding results suitable for research when it is built to serve but a single purpose. Questioning can be used for education and guidance itself, to stimulate those who answer to recognize new viewpoints and therefore
to modify their attitudes and behavior. (Questionnaires that allow room for individual responses may cause the verbalizations that make for growth and so may continue a guidance service.) Questionnaires can be used to ascertain general opinion and attitude, so that others can try to discover what ideas and feelings were derived from a guidance experience, as well as what is likely to be the future behavior of those responding. Questionnaires can be used to elicit statements as to present activity and behavior which may be checked against statements of activity that were set down before counseling began, so that somewhat "objective effects of counseling" can perhaps be derived. Questionnaires can be prepared to gain counselee appraisals of the various phases of a counseling experience, so that others can measure the reactions and guidance-attitudes of those who have been counseled--so that guidance techniques can be improved later. Although there may be distinct advantages in questionnaires that touch on many of these things at once, for purposes of scientific research it may be best to single out one special objective and limit the scope of a given questionnaire and research problem to a complete treatment of that one aspect of a total situation. When a questionnaire is suggested, it should be decided what purpose is to be achieved through its use; and the number and nature of its individual items, as well as the name of the questioner and research agency, should probably be chosen with that single purpose constantly in mind.

Since there was no clear-cut analysis of purpose prior to the preparation of the June 1944 questionnaire, it is natural that the
material in the question blank and covering letter spreads over too broad an area and almost too many targets, that the questions are too uneven and too diverse, and that the results derived from the returned sheets are both unsuited to any systematic analysis of data and unsuited to the development of any sharp and well-founded conclusions. The work was begun too hurriedly. The viewpoint of the boys to be questioned was insufficiently considered, and the suggestion that the counselor himself send out the letters was not even seriously questioned. It was not decided whether the questionnaire was to be an effort in education, whether it was to be an attempt to determine general opinion only, whether it was to ask for statements of present status, or whether it was to be purely and simply a request for opinion about the various phases of the counseling experience undergone; the scope of the entire work was not sufficiently limited. The individual items were not prepared so that responses could be tabulated to give an objective measure of what was sought. But, in spite of the lack of forethought that is everywhere apparent, the work was carried through as well as might be expected, and there were derived some semi-objective results of the counseling that had been done and some rather definite indications of tendencies in counselee reaction toward the counseling experience. As a practical service study for the immediate improvement of the local program it proved adequate.

A criticism of the questionnaire that was prepared.-- Although the questionnaire was reasonably well worded, although it elicited a high percentage of replies, and although it brought forth answers that have
been tabulated to show the definite trends of thought that were sought, most of what must be said about it is indeed negative. It was too broad in scope. It had too many questions. It required more provocative self-expression than could be reasonably be expected from school boys who were just starting a summer of work or vacation. Its questions were not uniform, in many cases they were not followed by enough room for adequate replies, and very often they were not definite enough to require answers that could be analyzed with ease.

The division into the seven aspects of the counseling process had advantages, but it became evident from the replies received that many boys failed to understand the divisions of critical appraisal that were intended. There was not enough that distinguished the replies sought under the headings "Preliminary Review of the Tests," "Letter of Summary," "Follow-up Counseling," and "Final Comments." The questions listed under "Final Comments" were weak in that the words "now" and "next few months" were not defined, so the responses that trickled in throughout the summer had little meaning when tabulated together.

The entire document of sixty-one different items contained questions in many areas where the expression of counselee reaction would prove worthwhile, but it presented to the questioned counselees such an extended task, such discursive thoughts, and such poorly planned specific questions that it could not be expected to call forth results that would make a good summary and report.

A criticism of the covering letter that was sent out.— The covering letter, though not well written, was in general satisfactory for the
situation. It seems to have elicited good response from the counseled boys, even though it did not contain the customary promise to mail to those who replied a report of the final results of the study.

The abruptness of the first sentence paragraph makes a good stimulating introduction. The second paragraph continues well, but its thoughts should be divided into two sentences. The third paragraph is weak and unorganized. Its first affirmation is unnecessary; there are errors in punctuation and construction in the sentences that follow it; there is no central thought developed throughout. The fourth paragraph contains an unnecessary shift from the plural to the singular, and it contains expressions like "definite questions of policy" and "if you will check the list" which are not closely correlated with the questionnaire for which the letter was prepared. The post script is disjointed and the new suggestions presented in it tend to dissuade the counselees who receive the note from the main purpose of the communication. (The very last sentence might have been placed in one of the last paragraphs of the letter itself, and recommendations for book shelf reading might be made the subject of another note.)

The entire letter probably makes an appeal that is much too personal for the enlistment of objective questionnaire responses—especially when the questionnaire contains a space where the critic should sign his own name. There is displayed in the letter the same lack of forethought that is in evidence throughout the questionnaire.

A criticism of the procedure that was followed in obtaining counselee reactions.-- Enough has been written about the lack of forethought
that preceded the drafting of the questionnaire and the inception of this study. There had been insufficient study of the work of others at the time that the details of this study-procedure were being worked out and carried through. The mimeographing and mailing of the original requesting letters was satisfactory, but the replies were not dated as they came in and the number of replies received each day was not recorded. The one reminding letter that was mailed to delinquents was conceived on the spur of the moment, sent out at no previously appointed time, and not even copied down for a report like this. (Since some boys undoubtedly would lose their lengthy question sheets, more should have been prepared and duplicates should have been included with the reminding note. The system used by Miss Stohr 1/ could have been a model.)

The assumption that the 80 per cent of the boys who replied represent a fair cross section of the entire group of counselees may be justified, but in line with the results of Mr. Burt's study, 2/ it would have been well to have made an additional check to see whether the last replies received came from boys who were least well adjusted and least content with the counseling—and therefore whether boys who did not reply might be less well adjusted and least well disposed toward what had been done for them. It is unfortunate that replies were not dated so that such research could be carried on even at this late date. It might have shown that the report based on an 30 per cent response was too optimistic.

1/ See the outline of procedure reported in Chapter IV, p. 68, 69.
2/ See the "significant sidelight" reported in Chapter IV, p. 67.
The description of the procedure that is recorded in Chapter III indicates the difficulties that developed as the study continued and as the results were revised and revamped for this more formal treatment. The statements in the same chapter that have to do with program modifications that were proposed and carried through seem to show as much care as was warranted by the practical situation at the Y.M.C.A.

A criticism of the tabulation and the presentation of the results.--

The questionnaire sent out in June 1944 did not lend itself to a systematic tabulation of results and formal presentation of findings. At the time that the project began the author had not reviewed the work of others in the field, he had not studied completely enough the general principles of research presentation, and he did not have that "sine qua non" of all good presentation, a single dominant purpose.

The recording of everything that was set down by the responding counselees is a natural reaction to the conglomerate mass of data received. Ingenuity was required to derive tables of data based on the counselees' individually worded answers. Probably enough tables have been prepared. The paragraph comments and the tables seem to show what the counselees thought and were doing without any glaring distortion of the original evidence. (Because of the small number of responses it was not worth while to organize and group for table presentation the individually worded "Comments," at the end of each division of the questionnaire, and the individual answers to questions like "What did you do because of the first interview?" The questionnaire itself should have been prepared so that the difficulties would be less acute.)
A final appraisal of the work accomplished.-- The final results of the effort at evaluation carried on by the writer during and after the summer of 1944 proved as satisfactory as could be expected from the use of the questionnaire and covering letter originally prepared. There developed in the counselor and fellow leaders an increased understanding of the individual boys who had been counseled and of the way that boys react to extended questionnaires. There developed a better understanding of the attitudes of Y.M.C.A boys toward counseling as well as an increased knowledge of what changes were effected through guidance. The "Guidance for Boys" program is now being modified effectively, largely on the basis of what was learned through this study and its results.1/ The counselor and author is better prepared for educational and guidance work because he has had to present and criticize his own impulsive efforts.

1/ A mimeographed statement of the new policy and procedure at the local "F" is in the appendix at the end of this service study.
CHAPTER VI

A SUGGESTED PROGRAM FOR FUTURE EVALUATIONS

The premises upon which an evaluation through counselee reaction can be made.—Before any evaluation is made, general principles and objectives should be established. It should be determined whether the effort is to be one of evaluation or education. It should be determined just what is to be evaluated and what standards are to be used in the evaluation. It should be determined whether the long-time effects, recent attitudes, or present practices are to be the basis of appraisal.

In the evaluation of guidance it should be determined whether the appraisal is to be made by (1) a comparison with accepted standards, by (2) a measure of how well those who were guided followed advice, and succeeded as the counselors envisaged, by (3) a comparison of the activities and opinions of guided and unguided people, or by (4) a survey of the opinions and indicative actions of those who have had a guidance experience.

(The enlisting of counselee reactions to a guidance procedure, a few months after guidance has taken place, is at best an inadequate manner of making a complete appraisal of the guidance that has been done, but it does have a definite value as a partial appraisal—especially in situations where the democratic spirit prevails and where favorable client reaction is required for the continuance of a program.) The discovery of such counselee reaction is then a suitable subject for a
partial study of the guidance program at the local or Huntington Avenue Branch of the Boston Y.M.C.A.

An appraisal through counselee reaction is primarily an evaluation of the immediate effectiveness of the local program—of its effectiveness in the opinions of those for whom it has been constructed. It aims to show whether counselees are pleased with what has happened to them and whether they think it has been effective in helping them to gain a better adjustment to life. Other studies should be used to measure the program's actual effectiveness from more objective and longer ranged viewpoints.

The principles upon which such an evaluation can be developed.--The reactions of counselees can be sought by means of personal interviews, by an essay type examination or questionnaire, and by a quick-answer measuring instrument prepared to give counselees a chance to check statements that tell how they feel and what they have actually done in reaction to the guidance experiences they have had. The check answer questionnaire technique seems to give promise of results that can be used effectively in consequent reporting and consequent improvement of the guidance procedure criticised.

In preparing a questionnaire and covering letter to be sent to recent counselees, the task of response imposed must not be too difficult, and the wording and demand must be in line with the age and status of the most poorly prepared counselee from whom a response is asked. The filling out of a questionnaire should be presented so that it appeals as an interesting game, in which the counselee can find satisfaction in
self-expression that is not too difficult. The number of items asked should be small and the manner of response should be as simple as possible, if full assistance is to be elicited and if the results are to be amenable to the future tabulation of meaningful group results. Only the questions upon which there might be expected a decided difference of opinion should be included, and answers suggested for checking should be set down in a form that is comprehensible and natural to the dullest boy questioned. (Probably the original form of any questionnaire and letter should be submitted to several recent counselees for trial before a final form is prepared and sent out to all counselees.)

Although it has apparently never been used in guidance evaluation, an effective way of arranging questions may be that employed by Bryan 1/ in his study of pupil appraisals of the effectiveness of teachers and teaching. For each of a group of pertinent questions counselees may be given a series of five possible answers, usually ranging from an excessively favorable reaction to an excessively unfavorable one, with one reaction representing the anticipated healthiest norm. Evaluation of the program itself can then develop after a tabulation of the responses submitted in answer to the questionnaire. When, for a given question representing one aspect of the guidance program, there is attained a normal distribution of checked answers, with the largest number of checks in front of the middle healthy and normal response, then the aspect of the guidance program represented by that question can be considered as adequately managed in the opinion of the counselees. When, for another

1/ The last paragraphs in Chapter IV summarize Bryan's contributions
question representing another aspect of the guidance program, the dis-
tribution of checked responses shows a skew in a negative direction--i.e.
with an abnormally large number of checks in front of responses that
suggest unfavorable reaction--this aspect of the guidance program may
be said to need improvement in the opinion of the client counselees.
When a distribution shows a skew in a positive direction it may show that
the aspect in question may impress too favorably the counselee customers
for which it is set up.

A suggested check list questionnaire.-- The questionnaire suggested
below has been prepared for possible use at the Huntington Avenue Branch
Boys' Division, with boys who have had counseling and guidance within
recent months. It contains twelve questions touching on various aspects
of the program, as it will probably be carried on in the future, and pre-
senting areas where differences in response might lead to a wholesome
criticism of techniques employed by those in charge. (Most of the twelve
questions ask for opinion only; a few ask for activities which demon-
strate attitude. It may be that at a given time only eight of the
twelve suggested questions should be used. Probably more care can be
given to choosing words that match both best guidance theory and the
current usage of youth.)

Under each of the twelve questions are listed five responses that
represent degrees of success or satisfaction felt or derived from the
aspect of the guidance in question. Although it should be easy for
each person to find in one of the suggested responses an approximation
of his own attitude and activity at the time implied, there is allowed
after each question space for the valuable "comments" that may shed
further light on the counselees' feelings and habits. As has been indicated in the discussion above, the five responses are supposed to be ranged around a normal to give ratings that might correspond to A, B, C, D, E, with 38 per cent in C, 24 per cent in B and D, and 7 per cent in A and E. The general principle in selecting the answers was to make them so that in an average group of replies, the number of checks would follow the normal distribution, with about 7 per cent checking the first response, 24 per cent checking the second response, 38 per cent checking the third response, 24 per cent checking the fourth response, and 7 per cent checking the last suggested answer. (It might have been best for all the series to show a regular gradation from least to most success, pleasure, or joy. However, as in the questionnaire used by Bryan,1 some of the questions seemed to suit better a series of answers in which the first two responses suggested the unfortunate too much, the last two responses the equally unfortunate too little, and the third response the ideal golden mean.)

Roy C. Bryan, Op Cit. p. 70
THE PROPOSED QUESTIONNAIRE FOR COUNSELED BOYS

***************

YOUR REACTIONS TO THE "GUIDANCE FOR BOYS" DONE AT THE BOSTON Y.M.C.A.

HUNTINGTON AVENUE BRANCH

Please check for each question the one answer that matches best your own reaction.

(Put a check mark in front of one of the five suggested answers.) Then add, on the line below, any further comments you may care to make—or another answer that expresses better your own viewpoint.

1. How successful was your introduction to the testing program?
   I was forced into it altogether too strongly.
   I was somewhat overurged to take it
   I was gradually introduced in a pleasing way.
   I was not urged enough. I nearly missed taking it.
   I heard so much about its inadequacies that I felt urged not to take it.

Comments:

2. Did filling out the preliminary form prove a help or hindrance to you?
   I was bored and bothered by it.
   I was mildly irritated by its many questions.
   I found it a helpful way to give information to the counselor for our talk.
   I was somewhat helped to see and understand myself better because of the form.
   It stimulated me to a healthy analysis of myself and my own ambitions.

Comments:

3. Was the test service itself satisfactory?
   There were too many tests, and the testing was a nuisance.
   The testing was a bit tiresome and tedious.
   The testing was "o.k." or satisfactory.
   The tests were rather interesting and varied.
   The testing was fun, and it taught me a great deal.

Comments:

4. How successful was the first review of the test results?
   It was confusing—too abstract, too indefinite, and too spread out.
   It was rather indefinite, and it did not point out just what I should do.
   It was "o.k.". It helped me to understand myself and plan my future better.
   It was bothersome because the counselor said too much about things I didn't like.
   It was too sharp in its criticism, too definite, and too opposed to my ideas.
5. What was the immediate effect of the first review of the test results?
I did nothing, or I went against the suggestions worked out in the interview.
I made some good resolutions, but I did little.
I started thinking more directly about my status, and I made some practical improvements in my ways of work and play.
I got a new and better way of thinking, and I started to improve many of my habits.
I found great relief, and I organized my life and thought far better thereafter.

Comments:

6. How did you react to the letter of summary?
I found it too confused and too much beside the point to be worthwhile.
I found it interesting, but it didn't add or help much.
I found it a worthy summary to be kept for the future.
I found it a very useful document to show to others and to keep myself.
I found it most helpful as a guide and inspiration for the present and the future.

Comments:

7. How did the follow-up counseling affect you?
I was annoyed and bothered by further attempts to guide me.
I was mildly irritated by efforts "for my good," but I probably got some good ideas.
I received some benefit; I was glad to have a counselor near at hand.
I found a friend who helped me to make practical use of the test results and to get a better slant on life.
I was consistently helped to get a firm basis for living a better life later, and I found a great satisfaction in having a single friend who knew me well.

Comments:

8. How did you react to the round table group discussions on educational, vocational and social problems?
I practically never went, and I feel that they were nearly useless.
I did not go much, because I thought they were not very interesting.
I went rather often, and I found that they gave me help in my growth and development, as well as giving us a chance to talk things over.
I tried to go often, because I found them most stimulating and valuable.
I went as often as possible, because they gave me an excellent chance to work out in my own mind better answers to my own problems of all sorts.

Comments:
9. How did you react to the bulletin board notices?
I never read them.
I skimmed them over, but I found little of value for me.
I found them useful rather often, and they did suggest good ideas.
I was often stimulated, and I sometimes followed the suggestions given.
I was usually glad to read them, and I often copied notes and followed the ideas suggested.

Comments:

10. How did you react to the book shelf and the boys' study?
I went in once or twice, but I found little of interest or value there.
I went rather often, and occasionally I found good articles and books.
I went often, and I found helpful books and magazines.
I went regularly, and I found the selection of materials excellent.

Comments:

11. How did you change your attitudes and actions because of the program?
I did not change, but I sometimes felt such resentment that I did the opposite of what was suggested.
I changed very little, but I gained a few new viewpoints which may help later.
I followed some of the suggestions that were worked out with the counselor; I made some changes in my attitudes and in my methods of attacking problems.
I followed many of the suggestions developed during the interviews and in the group discussions, and I recognize improvement in my thought and life now.
I followed most of the suggestions developed in interviews and group meetings, and I made a decided improvement in my ways of thinking and acting.

Comments:

12. What was the general effect of the entire program for you?
It made me resentful.
It made me mildly irritated, though it may have helped.
It gave me more confidence and more meaning in life, and helped me to organize my future more realistically.
It helped me understand myself, so as to fit better into the educational, vocational, and social opportunities of the future.
It gave life a new wholeness for me, so that I can now use my abilities far better and plan my future far more effectively.

Comments:
A suggested covering letter.— The covering letter for such a questionaire should be appealing, but it should be so objective that those who have had guidance experiences will be inclined to criticise them with neither fear nor prejudice. The letter of appeal should recognize the position of the counseled boys, and true expressions of opinion should be encouraged by promises of secrecy and by an explanation of the values to be derived from frank response. It should point out how the boys themselves can recognize the results of their criticism in reports and in future guidance improvements. However, although the Y.M.C.A. boys do belong to a service organization, and although they have been given more service than they have paid for, the letter should not assume that they will do more than a minimum of "service for generations to come" in the way of the criticism and constructive appraisal that is so foreign to the average boy's thought. The boys should be given over-recognition of their judgment and the criticism should be described as a sort of a game.

Although it is likely that the most impartial appraising responses would be made in answer to a letter of appeal coming from an outsider or a disinterested member of the Y.M.C.A. staff,¹ it seems that in the local situation the director of the Boys' Division is a person to whom the young people would be willing to present their unbiased opinions. Personal reference should be held to a minimum in the letter. The heading of the Y.M.C.A. should be used, the personal address and nickname

¹As noted in Chapter IV, Frank Burt suggested that appeals for appraising comments come from outsiders, rather than from the Y.M.C.A. counselors themselves.
salutation should be employed, and the signature of the division director should be appended; the counselor's names need not be employed, and no other name need be added for authority.

The following is a brief note that might be used to cover and accompany the questionnaire suggested earlier in this chapter:

-----------

(Regular Y.M.C.A. heading)

-----------

Dear Jim:

Your opinions and judgments are valuable.

What you think of a program you have followed, and what you did because of a program you followed, are and should be important considerations to those who plan and organize such programs.

This past year you followed the "Guidance for Boys" program of our Boys' Division. You perhaps read notices, talked with counselors, filled out forms, took tests, received letters, read booklets, and attended group discussions, in an effort to get your life organized for more success and satisfaction later.

The enclosed questionnaire gives you an opportunity to express your opinions of what happened by checking the question answers that seem to correspond most closely to your feelings about the guidance program as you experienced it this year. It gives you a chance to make additional comments in spaces below the suggested answers.

Those who plan the guidance activities here are anxious to find out what you think of what you did and what was done for you, -- to find out what you did or how you changed because of the guidance work, -- to know what your suggestions are for making such programs more effective in the future.

Your answers and comments will be kept secret and will be used only for the help they will give in the improvement of future programming. Your frank answers may suggest changes that will be a distinct benefit to those who follow the guidance programs later. You will thus help in
making our Y.M.C.A. service better, and if you keep in touch with us, you will be able to see a report of this study and the inauguration of improvements suggested by you and your friends.

We shall appreciate your taking a few minutes now to check the enclosed sheets, to add the comments you wish, and to mail the papers to the "Y" in the enclosed, return addressed envelope.

Thank you very much.

Cordially yours,

Director, Boys' Division

---------------------

A suggested method for carrying through the evaluation.--To make possible needed refinements, the form of the new, proposed questionnaire, suggested earlier in this chapter, can be carbon copied and tried out on ten recent counselees. Covering letter and questionnaire can be presented casually, perhaps by the secretary of the Boys' Division, so that the boys' immediate reactions can be set down and the boys' reaction sheets can be immediately collected for study by the counselor and guidance committee. Revisions of wording can then be made, and from the group of twelve questions, eight or nine may be selected as the ones most likely to elicit most usable reaction.

The letters and questionnaires can then be sent out to the entire group of boys counseled in the recent months selected. The questionnaire can be mimeographed on one or two sheets; the letters can be multigraphed and the individual names, addresses, and nicknames typewritten in. A small-sized, stamped envelope can be mimeographed with the division director's name and address. Questionnaire, letter, and envelope can

---This idea was tried by Thelma Stohr, is reported in study reviewed in Chapter IV.
be folded together and sent out en masse in individually addressed envelopes, on a designated date at the end of the guidance season.

Returned questionnaires should be dated as soon as they are received, and a record of returns should be kept. There might be prepared a graph to show just how many letters come in each day, in answer to the original request and to the follow-up reminders. It might prove important to collect and keep data that could be used in a study of the differences in attitude shown by the first versus the last received responses. A post card reminder could be sent out to all who had not replied by the end of the first week. A more lengthy letter-reminder with an enclosed duplicate questionnaire and return, addressed envelope could be sent after two-and-a-half weeks to those who had not by that time made answer. Since the number of individual counselees is small, it is important to get reactions from as many as possible.

The results can be tabulated and reported without undue effort. Extra questionnaires can be used to check off the answers marked by the boys, thus forming immediately for each of the questions a small histogram composed of black marks. An index figure can be prepared for each item, and a complicated statistical study can be made. However a bar graph or histogram report, perhaps arranged on a spare blank questionnaire, will show clearly where there is normal distribution and where there

1/ Thelma Stohr and others have made such graphs. Lindsay reported an interesting experiment a dozen years ago.
2/ In the discussion of Burt's study, Chapter IV, this was suggested.
3/ Roy C. Bryan has used an index figure in his recent study of answers checked on such a questionnaire—a scheme explained in a note on the next page. He made extended statistical analyses in his Columbia Contribution to Education.
are skewed and bimodal distributions which designate abnormal and so unsatisfactory reactions.

For example, if thirty boys return their question blanks, it might be found that on the totaled response sheet there were the following totals. For question one, 2 checks for the first answer, 8 checks for the second answer, 11 checks for the third answer, 7 checks for the fourth answer, and 2 checks for the fifth answer. For question two, 6 checks for the first answer, 10 checks for the second answer, 9 checks for the third answer, 4 checks for the fourth answer, and 2 checks for the fifth answer. The first histogram, Figure 1, would then show at a glance that the distribution was normal in the first case, and that the counselor reaction indicated adequate satisfaction with the introduction to the testing program. On the other hand, the second histogram, Figure 2, would show that the distribution of replies to the second question was abnormal, that more than a normal number of boys objected to the preliminary form or the way it was presented to them.1

1/ The index number scheme proposed by Bryan would work as follows: By using a point scale, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, for the five responses, by multiplying the number of responses given for each suggested answer by the point value, by totaling, and by averaging, a useful index can be obtained—perhaps in most cases as valuable as the histogram suggested above. For example in the two cases suggested, there would be the following tabulation:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question One</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Steps in Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Index number (89 divided by 30) = 2.967

(continued on page 94.)
Figure 1. Possible Counselor Reaction to Question One, relating to the Introduction to the Guidance Program

This nearly normal distribution shows a satisfactory reaction to this phase of the program.

Figure 2. Possible Counselor Reaction to Question Two, relating to the "Preliminary Form" in the Guidance Program

This skewed distribution shows an unsatisfactory reaction to this phase of the program.
Individual written-in comments on all items can be collected for special study. They will prove especially valuable in areas where skews in response distribution have pointed out an unsatisfactory reaction to some special phase of the total program. In the above example the individually worded comments under question two would be considered carefully so that the "preliminary form" step in the counseling procedure would be improved. Both individual comments and checked answers will be useful in the development of a further improved questionnaire to be used in succeeding seasons.

The results that may be expected and their utility for future work.

The results obtained by means of the above-suggested questionnaire, covering letter, and general procedure, may prove to have a great value for the local Y.W.C.A. both in the further counseling of the replying counselees themselves and in the evaluating and improving of the entire

(continued from page 92.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Two</th>
<th>Steps in Scale</th>
<th>Point Value</th>
<th>No. of Answers</th>
<th>Point value times no. of answers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>30</strong></td>
<td><strong>75</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Index number (75 divided by 30) = 2.53

This would show that in question one the index number of about three indicated normal reaction, whereas in question two the abnormally low index number of 2.53 showed the need for giving special attention to this area.

Although such an index figure might present an incomplete picture, as in the case of an equally balanced bimodal distribution, the average of a number of such index figures might show well the summarized feelings of the counselees toward several phases of the program at once, or toward the program as a whole.
program of "Guidance for Boys." Written-in comments will help in the understanding of the individual boys who make them and also present a salty and spontaneous commentary on all the guidance given. Histogram pictures of the boys' reactions to the different aspects of the guidance process will point out clearly where special attention should be given. A combined histogram or index figure may give a generalized estimate of the program as it is evaluated by the counseled boys.

This proposed method of gaining counselee opinion, as a check on guidance practice, may prove to be far more useful than the haphazard means employed a year ago. The suggested procedure may be tried out in the local Y.M.C.A. at the end of this 1945-46 season. Time alone will tell whether it will bear fruits that justify the writer's optimistic expectations. This outline of a projected procedure may prove helpful to the directors of other institutions where client reaction is deemed desirable. A report on its success in practice may prove worthy of publication at a later date.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


, "Eighty-six Teachers Try Evaluating Student Reactions to Themselves," Educational Administration and Supervision, XXVII, October, 1941, p. 513-528.

, "Why Student Reactions to Teachers Should be Evaluated," Educational Administration and Supervision, XXVII, November, 1941. p. 590-603.

, Reliability, Validity, and Needfulness of Written Student Reactions to Teachers, Educational Supervision and Administration, XXII, December, 1941. p. 655-665.

, "Benefits Reported by Teachers Who Obtain Written Student Reactions," Educational Supervision and Administration, XXIII, January, 1942. p. 69-75.


Whitman, H.W., "Is Counseling Worthwhile?" Teacher-Education Journal, VI, June 1944, p. 28-30

APPENDIX
We are writing you because we want your advice and counsel.

You were one of thirty selected older boys who took the Guidance Program of the Boys' Division of the "Y" this past school year, and as such you certainly have some impressions as to its usefulness and some suggestions as to ways that it can be improved.

This season there have been several changes in both the Guidance Department and in the Boys' Division. In this, my first experience in "Y" work, I have learned a great deal from you and I have grown to like you all as individuals. I have learned a great deal about testing and counseling both from you boys and from Mr. Johnson and the other leaders who have been with you for several seasons. Before plans for next season's work are made I would like to have from you definite statements as to what the testing and counseling experience has meant for you so far--what changes you would like to have us consider and what aspects you would like to have us add or eliminate--in order that the program may be more effectively carried through for those who want to be tested in succeeding years.

We shall always appreciate your comments, given either orally or in writing. However, at this time, I am asking that you fill out and mail in the enclosed criticism sheet so that we can get a composite picture of expressions of opinions on definite questions of policy. I hope you will check the list, add what you want on the back, and mail it in now while it is fresh in mind.

Thank you for helping us here at the "Y" to do a better job for boys who will come to us later.

Cordially yours,

Benjamin P. Dean,
Counselor for Boys

P.S. - You will note the question about the book shelf. Perhaps you will come in some afternoon to read a bit in the Boys' Study. The shelf includes books on educational, vocational and social problems of interest to older boys. Please send in the answered questionnaire even though you do not fill it out completely.
QUESTIONNAIRE ON GUIDANCE WORK IN THE HUNTINGTON AVENUE Y.M.C.A.  
BOYS' DIVISION, NOVEMBER, 1943 TO JUNE, 1944

Introduction to the Testing and Counseling Program:

How did you first hear of the program?

Is the Co-Ed Social a good place to talk over the possibilities of testing?

Where else could introduction to it be made so as to reach boys who might be helped?

Was the idea too forcefully presented to you?

Should older boys be enlisted to encourage new boys to take tests?

Did the preliminary form contain so many questions that it discouraged you?

Did you feel you were too young for the testing program?

Other comments:

Test Service Itself:

Did the testing take too long?

What suggestions do you have as to testing procedure?

Do you recall any test which seemed unfair or useless? Which one?

Would you prefer to have taken some self-administering tests before the time tests?

If it were possible would you prefer to have had a partial report before completing the entire series of tests?

Other comments:

Preliminary Review of the Tests:

Did you feel at ease at the first review of the tests?

Was the first interview too long?

Did it point out specific ways that you could advance and solve vocational, educational and social problems?

Did you write down or take time to review in your own mind what was discussed?

What did you do because of the first interview?

Other comments:

Letter of Summary

Was the letter of summary helpful?

Was it too long? Was it too complicated in wording?

Did you show it to your parents? Mother? Father?

Brothers and Sisters? Teacher? Employer? Friends?

Have you kept it to look over in future months and years?

Did you try to follow its suggestions and if so, what did you do?

If you received second letters, were these helpful?

What suggestions do you have about these letters?
Follow Up Counseling:

Did later interviews help you?

Did you feel that you were too strongly urged in one direction?

Would you like to have been given a more definite program to follow?

Did you read books suggested?

Do you think that these books had help for you? Which one particularly?

Did you tend to change your attitudes and ways of thinking into more effective and mature channels?

Have you started a record of your advances now and of your plans for the future?

Would it be better to have later interviews more formal or less formal?

Were the counselor's suggestions practical?

Did you feel that the counselor understood you and that you could go to him with a problem you needed help on?

Should he invite you to see him more often?

Did you feel that you were better able to meet problems yourself because of interviews?

What suggestions do you have for later talks and interviews and conversations?

Would you object to having the counselor talk with your parents?

Other comments:

Book Shelf:

Have you visited the Boys' Study and read in books and magazines there?

How would you suggest that these books be made more available, and yet neither lost nor destroyed?

Which books seem most helpful?

What others do you suggest?

Final Comments:

What is your name?

What are you doing now?

What are your plans for these next months?

Do you now have a definite notion of the sort of vocational and school activities you will undertake hereafter?

What has been the main effect of testing and counseling on you as you see it now?

What other suggestions do you have for either counseling or general boys' work?
AFTER MAKING AN APPOINTMENT, a boy goes to the Guidance Department on the second floor of the "Y", just over the Men's Division entrance, and is greeted by a cordial secretary. He sits down to fill out a preliminary self-description form and to follow directions in marking preferences, reading, judging, checking and performing other interesting tasks as required.

A few days later, after the tests have been scored and reviewed, the Counselor sees the boy in his office. There is an easy conversation, during which the boy tells more of his interests and often learns of abilities and aptitudes he never recognized before. He attains a more complete view of himself as an individual. He becomes better prepared to develop and improve his ways of living both now and later. He may get a pamphlet or two before he leaves. He has been encouraged to study further, in books and from people, the areas of work and play for which he seems more suited.

LATER ON each boy receives a letter of summary and probably more interviews of a less formal nature, and perhaps another test or two, as he wishes and as he finds worthwhile. Data is kept on hand so leaders in the Boys' Division can help with problems immediately thereafter and at any time in the future. In this way each boy tested has established a base to which he can return for help in all his problems of growing up--achieving full maturity--in the world of work and play.

Edwin C. Johnson  Benjamin F. Dean
Boys' Work Secretary  Boys' Counselor

BOYS' DIVISION, BOSTON Y.M.C.A.
316 Huntington Avenue
KENmore 7800

GUIDANCE FOR BOYS

EDUCATIONAL, VOCATIONAL & SOCIAL

TEN YEARS FROM NOW you will have a job and perhaps be supporting a family. Will you be prepared for your work and will you find it easy and interesting? Will you be happy while on the job and also happy in your home and social relations?

Will you be irritated and nagged out every night--anxious to quit entirely or at least to get away as far as possible during off hours? Or will you feel satisfied when the day's whistle sounds, ready for an evening of healthy avocations, yet anxious to go back the next day to give your best? Will you be certain that you are in the right niche and that you are advancing steadily as the years go by? Will you have the basic understanding and practice for happy family and social relationships? The answers to these questions will very likely depend on the decisions and plans that you make now.

Happy adjustment to life is possible but it does not just happen. To become happily adjusted: (1) you must discover yourself--your abilities, aptitudes, interests, resources and deficiencies. (2) you must discover the world about you--the nature of jobs, trends in areas where you want to work, people's differences and the basic rules of satisfying personal adjustment. (3) you must fit the two together and through practice develop vocational abilities and tools of behavior that will yield permanently satisfying results.
The book report in the boys' study books on jobs
and vocational training is a part of the boys' future plan.

The book reports on occupations may prove to be a salutory
way of dealing with vocational guidance and race. Such
books may also show what most men work.

The boys who do not work may find out more
of the boys' plan. Such books may also show what
most men work and what they are doing to help
them get work. Boys who do not work
may find out more of the boys' plan. Such
books may also show what most men work.

The book reports on occupations may prove to be a salutory
way of dealing with vocational guidance and race. Such
books may also show what most men work.

The boys who do not work may find out more
of the boys' plan. Such books may also show what
most men work and what they are doing to help
them get work. Boys who do not work
may find out more of the boys' plan. Such
books may also show what most men work.

The book reports on occupations may prove to be a salutory
way of dealing with vocational guidance and race. Such
books may also show what most men work.

The boys who do not work may find out more
of the boys' plan. Such books may also show what
most men work and what they are doing to help
them get work. Boys who do not work
may find out more of the boys' plan. Such
books may also show what most men work.

The book reports on occupations may prove to be a salutory
way of dealing with vocational guidance and race. Such
books may also show what most men work.

The boys who do not work may find out more
of the boys' plan. Such books may also show what
most men work and what they are doing to help
them get work. Boys who do not work
may find out more of the boys' plan. Such
books may also show what most men work.
STATEMENT OF GENERAL POLICY
TESTING, COUNSELING AND GUIDANCE PROGRAM FOR OLDER BOYS

Boys' Division, Huntington Avenue Y.M.C.A.,
Boston, Massachusetts.

I Purpose:

The purpose of the Testing and Counseling Program of the Boys' Division is to aid selected older boys in making wise choices and decisions so that they may experience happy and effective adjustment both during the time of their youth as well as during their adult years. These choices and decisions, while primarily educational and vocational, may also concern personal and social questions arising out of other phases of boy life. For this reason, this guidance program, in addition to testing and counseling services, provides opportunity for close, friendly relations between tested boys and understanding Leader-Counselors. The total program is designed to provide selected older boys with opportunity for maximum development in body, mind and spirit and thus help them to contribute more in Christian service both now and in the future.

II Organization:

The Guidance for Boys Program of the Boston Y.M.C.A. Huntington Avenue Branch will be under the direction of the Director of the Boys' Division, now Edwin C. Johnson, a Consultant Counselor and member of the staff of the Department of Occupational Services; now Benjamin P. Dean, and a Chief Counselor, a member of the Boys' Division staff, now Edward J. Beyor. These three men will comprise the Guidance Committee of the Boys' Division.

The Consultant Counselor is a member of the staff of the Department of Occupational Services where he is under the director of the department, now Thomas H. Harris. He serves a few hours a week as Consultant Counselor of the Boys' Division, at which time he is under Edwin C. Johnson, Director of the Division. The Chief Counselor is a member of the Boys' Division staff and is directly under the Boys' Division Director.

The Boys' Division staff leaders and the other group leaders who cooperate in the Guidance Program are called Leader-Counselors. They are under the Boys' Division Director for most of their activities, but in counseling work they are under the Chief Counselor and the Guidance Committee. (The Boys' Division Director may act as an individual Leader-Counselor and in his counseling relations he is under the Chief Counselor.)

These Leader-Counselors are assigned to individual boys by the Chief Counselor and the Guidance Committee. They will meet with the Chief Counselor and the Consultant Counselor for the consideration of individual cases and group practices. They may accept individual responsibilities for special areas of guidance work, such as the bulletin board, a group guidance meeting, or the occupational information file. They will be the friendly, understanding guides for the particular boys assigned to them. They will be close at hand to encourage and help their boys as they grow to Christian maturity, as they learn to use effectively the self-knowledge they have acquired through testing, and as they solve their own immediate problems.
The set-up can be diagrammed as follows:

II Personnel and Duties:

(A) Director of the Boys' Division

Supervise the entire guidance program, as an integral part of the Boys' Division work.

Attend Guidance Committee meetings and Leader-Counselor meetings as he sees fit.

Take a few special counselees and act as a Leader-Counselor for them.

(B) Consultant Counselor (A Counselor in the Department of Occupational Services)

Attend the meetings of the Guidance Committee and collaborate with the Chief Counselor in arranging group guidance, Leader-Counselor meetings, bulletin board care, etc.

Attend the meetings of the Leader-Counselors that are scheduled by the Chief Counselor, and give general counsel on guidance as seems appropriate.

Submit to the Chief Counselor a list of dates available for testing in the Department of Occupational Services.

Take test and interview appointments as made by the Chief Counselor, and see that testing is done in the Department of Occupational Services.

Study test scores and copy personality scores and other significant test results on the history sheets of each boy tested.

Give a preliminary review of test results to each boy and his Leader-Counselor.

Make a "Notation of Emphasis" for the help of the Leader-Counselor in each case—one copy for the file, one copy for the Leader-Counselor.

Arrange for the secretary or Leader-Counselor to copy significant data about each boy on his history sheets.

Dictate to each boy a letter summarizing his test scores and the suggestions developed during the preliminary review of test results.

Confer further with Leader-Counselors, as particular situations warrant.
Chief Counselor (A regular member of the Boys' Division Staff)

Counsel boys who are not in need of tests.

Do promotional work and find boys for testing.

Make arrangements for testing. In cooperation with Consultant Counselor, decide upon the battery of tests that is to be given.

Give each prospective testee a personal history blank and perhaps give assistance to some boys in the filling out of this form.

Send to the Department of Occupational Services a card showing what tests will be used, when tests will be taken, and who will be the Leader-Counselor.

After discussion with the Guidance Committee and the Leader-Counselor in question, assign to each boy a Leader-Counselor who is appropriate and congenial to him.

Make arrangements for the date of the preliminary review of test results for each boy tested.

Remind the appropriate Leader-Counselor to be at the preliminary review of test results of his counselee.

Act as Leader-Counselor for a few counselees.

Oversee the counseling program. See that the Leader-Counselors keep in close touch with their counselees, reading records, having rather regular consultations, and perhaps obtaining maximum family cooperation and understanding. Be ready to help Leader-Counselors with problems.

Write follow-up letters as required, or get the Leader-Counselors to do so.

Keep up to date the filed records of all counseled boys. Encourage the counselors to make pertinent entries. See that there is in the files a progressive cumulative record of significant things said and done in the case of each boy.

Arrange and conduct bi-weekly meetings of Guidance Committee and staff Leader-Counselors.

Plan and supervise group guidance work and lead some of the group guidance activities undertaken.

Supervise the bulletin board, perhaps having some Leader-Counselor and some one boy take charge.

Supervise the Boys' Study and the occupational information file, perhaps having one Leader-Counselor and a group of boys take the responsibility.

Make new advertising folders and new preliminary forms as seem necessary.

Collect money when boys want to pay or submit to the Secretary a list of counseled boys for billing.

Keep a record of interviews, meetings, number of boys counseled, etc., so that periodic reports can be made.
Write a report at the end of the season.

(D) **Leader-Counselor** (Each one either a member of the Boys' Division Staff or a registered Boys' Division leader.)

Advertise the guidance services at activities.

Bring prospective counselees to the Chief Counselor so that test appointments can be made.

Accept as an assignment the responsibility for the regular counseling of boys assigned to him after a conference with the Chief Counselor.

Attend the preliminary test result conference of each boy assigned to him or, if this is impossible, have conferences with the boy and the Consultant Counselor as soon as possible thereafter.

Study the "Notation of Emphasis" and cumulative record prepared by the Consultant Counselor, for each boy assigned to him.

Keep in continuous counseling touch with his own counselees, having rather regular consultations and perhaps enlisting maximum family cooperation and understanding.

Write follow-up letters as circumstances make necessary.

Attend group meetings of Leader-Counselors as called and consult with the Chief Counselor and the Consultant Counselor as circumstances demand.

Record significant facts and impressions in the folder of each counseled boy.

Take individual responsibilities in the group guidance and bulletin board programs that are developed and approved by the Guidance Committee.

(E) **Secretary** to the Director of the Boys' Division

Send out promotional material, etc.

Copy on to the history sheets the personal data from the preliminary form, as directed by the Consultant Counselor.

Write letters, summary reports and notations of emphasis as dictated.

File occupational information and bulletin board materials as required.

Copy other reports and notices as required.

Bill the boys who have not paid for the counseling service, as decided by the Guidance Committee.

### III Procedure:

The Director, the Chief Counselor, the Leader-Counselors and friends will contact boys who are or should be interested in testing and counseling, giving them a copy of the folder "Guidance for Boys".
The Leader-Counselors and the boys will arrange test appointments through the Chief-Counselor, in accordance with a list of dates submitted by the Consultant Counselor and Department of Occupational Services.

A special Leader-Counselor will be appointed or approved by the Chief Counselor and the Guidance Committee for each boy to be tested. The Chief Counselor will give to each prospective testee a preliminary form or personal history for him to bring to the tests, though the Chief Counselor may fill out the preliminary form on the basis of spoken answers, if it seems advisable.

The Chief Counselor will clinch each appointment and notify the Department of Occupational Services as to what tests are to be given and who will be the assigned Leader-Counselor.

The testee will take the scheduled tests in the Department of Occupational Services and fill out or hand in the preliminary form already prepared.

The Secretaries in the Department of Occupational Services will make a copy of the profile of test results.

The Consultant Counselor will study the test results and fill out the cumulative record with significant test notations and personality data.

The Chief Counselor will arrange with each tested boy a date for the preliminary review of his test results.

The Consultant-Counselor will hold a preliminary review of the test results with each boy and his Leader-Counselor.

The Secretary will copy down on the boy's cumulative record personal data from the preliminary form as directed by the Consultant Counselor.

The Consultant Counselor will dictate a letter to the testee and a "Notation of Emphasis" for the appropriate Leader-Counselor.

The Secretary will type the letter and "Notation of Emphasis" for each boy, send them out, and file duplicates in the appropriate folders.

Each Leader-Counselor will study the "Notation of Emphasis" and cumulative record on each of his own counselees.

The Leader-Counselor will then carry on counseling as a personal friend and advisor. He will make periodic notations in the folders.

Whenever necessary the Leader-Counselor will confer with other counseling staff members regarding the boy's home and community affiliations and whatever recommendations he may have in mind for him, as well as with reference to counseling techniques, therapy resources and related matters.

The Guidance Committee and staff Leader-Counselors will meet bi-weekly on Fridays at 11:00 A.M.

IV Finances:

The tested boys will pay $2.50 when possible.

The Boys' Division will pay the Occupational Services Department $2.00 for each boy. It is anticipated that about four out of five boys will eventually pay the $2.50 for their own testing.
The Chief Counselor and Leader-Counselors, Secretary and Boys' Division Director will be paid as members of the Boys' Division staff.

The Consultant Counselor is working 3/4 time for the Department of Occupational Services. He will now receive payment for four hours of Boys' Division work each week.

A student at one of the local universities may be enlisted on a nominal salary to organize a job exploration institute and to carry through a plan for building up a file of occupational information.

The Boys' Study Book Shelf will need periodic additions in books and magazines on education, vocations and personal adjustment.

For an adequate file of occupational information a standard size letter file should be obtained and money should be allocated for inexpensive current leaflets on jobs, job trends, and general adjustment.

V Correlating Activities:

The Leader-Counselors will themselves take the tests to obtain a better understanding of the program and to have real sympathy for what their counselees have done.

The Boys' Division group leaders, staff members and Boys' Work Committee men will be notified and kept informed of progress that is made.

Group Guidance programs of two sorts may be established: (1) A job exploration group, meeting regularly and restricted in membership, for those who have enough interest to make individual efforts toward discovering more about the world of work and ways of getting and keeping appropriate jobs, and (2) A personal and social development group, possibly coeducational, meeting less regularly, concentrating its attention on ways of achieving more mature, wholesome, cooperative and Christian living.

Book Shelf and Occupational Information File may be kept in order by some of the members of the job exploration group under an appropriate Leader-Counselor.

Bulletin Board notices in regard to testing and counseling, occupational information and placement, and personal growth and orientation, will be discovered and posted by interested boys and Leader-Counselors.