1931

Education and better citizenship:

Corcoran, Paul Joseph
Boston University

http://hdl.handle.net/2144/17529

Boston University
Education and better citizenship: the viewpoints of outstanding educational leaders.
School of Education
August 1941
8441
BOSTON UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION

Thesis

EDUCATION AND BETTER CITIZENSHIP: THE VIEWPOINTS
OF OUTSTANDING EDUCATIONAL LEADERS

Submitted by
Paul Joseph Corcoran

(B. S. in Ed., Bridgewater Normal School, 1925)

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
degree of Master of Education.
I. Statement of the Problem:

"Education and Better Citizenship - The Viewpoints of Outstanding Educational Leaders."

A. Current Hypotheses Which Relate to the Problem.
B. Significant Cases Where Hypotheses Have Been Applied.

II. History of the Problem:

A. Shifting Emphases in American Education.
      a. Emphasis on Making People "Good".
   2. 1840 - 1915 ----------------------------------- Page 3.
      a. Emphasis on Education for Aristocracy.
         1. Get Rid of the Unfit.
            1. Train for Success - Power - Supremacy -
               All for Self.
         1. Iowa Plan ------------------------------- Page 5.
         1. Roger Babson.
         2. James J. Davis.
      c. Education of the Emotions ----------------- Page 10.
      d. Education for Citizenship -------------- Page 11.
B. Necessity For Emphasis on Citizenship ------------ Page 11.
   1. Main Business of Public School is to Make Good Citizens.
   2. American Democracy is Complex.
      a. Immigration.
      b. Extended Suffrage.
      c. Multitude of Laws and Question of Obedience.
      a. Graft and Corruption in Public Life.

III. Solution of the Problem:
   A. An Exposition of the Viewpoints of Various Educators
      8. Snedden, David ----------------------------- Page 38.

IV. Criticism of the Above Proposed Solutions ------------ Page 44.
In the history of American education various objectives have received emphasis at different times and the aims of education have changed.

From earliest times in American educational history to the year 1840 (an approximate date) the chief emphasis in education was on making people "good". The first schools in America were very strong in religion and morals and from the modern viewpoint very weak in the field of knowledge. The following excerpts from the New England Primer indicate the religious nature of instruction:

Verses for Children

"Though I am young a little one,
If I can speak and go alone,
Then I must learn to know the Lord,
And learn to read his holy word.
'Tis true to seek to God and pray
For what I want for every day."

Another

"Good children must,
Fear God all day, Love Christ alway,
Parents obey, In secret pray,
No false thing say, Mind little play,
By no sin stray, Make no delay
In doing good."
An extract from the Ordinance of 1787 claims that "religion, morality, and knowledge being necessary for good government and the happiness of mankind, schools and the means of education shall forever be encouraged." A survey of the records and textbooks of the early days will show the religious trend of teaching. "Noah Webster's Spelling Book of the edition of 1843 contains a Moral Catechism, which bases its teaching upon the authority of the Bible, and treats of humility, mercy, peacemaking, purity of heart, anger, revenge, justice, generosity, gratitude, truth, charity, avarice, frugality, industry, and cheerfulness. Selections for reading were chosen for their patriotic or moral sentiment." (1) It is no doubt true that the backbone of education in the common schools of America was from the readers. They were the only "textbooks used in all schools that bore directly and positively upon the formation of character or that provided ethical guidance. The Readers were the proper and indispensable texts for teaching integrity, honesty, temperance, courage, politeness, and all other moral and intellectual virtues." (2)

Every source of information regarding the early history of education in this country indicates that the "chief aim of all teaching was religious and moral." (3) The leaders in education in the early days believed that if people were "good" they would naturally be good American citizens.

The Latin grammar schools in America were originally selective and more or less aristocratic in purpose. They were to be concerned

(1) Vocational and Moral Guidance, p. 13 - J. B. Davis.
(2) Our Times, p. 7 - Mark Sullivan.
(3) Vocational and Moral Guidance, p. 13 - J. B. Davis.
chiefly with "promising lads". Speaking of this situation and of the persistence of aristocratic conditions, Brown writes as follows in his work on "The Making of Our Middle Schools": "It was thought desirable that all should know how to read. And a college training was needed by members of the directive class." (1)

As the Latin grammar school became more and more remote from the needs of practical life, and as democratic conditions and new economic needs grew apace, there developed a demand for a school that would provide training for various practical pursuits. The outcome was the establishment of academies first and high schools later. While these academies commonly taught Latin, they also provided instruction in English, arithmetic, geometry, astronomy, geography, and other subjects. The college preparatory course was the backbone of most of them. The purposes of these high schools were to provide an extension upwards of the work of the English grammar grades and to serve as a public counterpart of certain aspects of the private academy. They were not essentially college-preparatory schools, but were planned to give training for those who would go directly into "Mercantile or Mechanical" pursuits. These ideal purposes did not last very long for "this direct and practical aid became subordinated later to the college preparatory aim which has dominated the high schools until recently". (2)

For about fifty years following the Civil War, despite an increase in school population, we find this emphasis upon education for the select, emphasis upon the individual. The men who made

(2) Teaching in High Schools, p. 10 - S. C. Parker.
their way to the top - men like Gould, Fisk, Vanderbilt, Rockefeller and Carnegie - were pioneers whose daring and courage enabled them to triumph where others failed. From one point of view such a man is a "self made" man, industrious, frugal, able, energetic, bold. This period was an age of materialism and education was bound to be affected. Attention was called to these and to other highly successful men whose success was measured in the degree in which they obtained material and economic supremacy.

It can be readily seen how the emphasis had shifted. In the first instance we find that education was chiefly "moral and religious" and in the second instance we note that it was "aristocratic and material", concerned more with the problem of helping people to succeed in the world than with the problem of developing the element of "good".

Beginning with the World War and continuing to the present time we find that emphasis has been placed on character education, religion in education, education of the emotions, and education for citizenship. There are others, too, of another nature. These receive recognition but some of them should be questioned.

**CHARACTER EDUCATION**

The World War and its concomitant evils was, no doubt, a partial reason for emphasis upon the building of character. In 1917 we find the following viewpoints expressed: "All educators are now giving at least intellectual assent to the doctrine that the end and aim of all education is character". (1) Again we find that "it is necessary that there be a concentration of attention on character education, and it is particularly appropriate to ask for it at this time". (2) (1) Proceedings of the National Education Association, 1917, p.530 C. E. Rugh. (2) Proceedings of the National Education Association, 1917, p.765 Milton Fairchild.
Not many years ago there was instituted a National competition for a system of character education. The winning plan was prepared by educators in the state of Iowa in 1922. "As one of the most usable methods of character instruction it is described as follows:

1. School life must be so enriched that pupils may have experiences in right living. These experiences are to be provided in health, initiative, life in the group, reverence, use of leisure time, civic relations, economic relations, vocations, and family relations.

2. Student participation in school government is regarded as essential. Pupils are to be trusted with powers consistent with their maturity and ability.

3. The curriculum busies itself with problems, projects, and actual situations, rather than with virtues. A catalogue of virtues is provided. The socialized recitation is recommended.

4. The making of character books in which shall be transcribed noble deeds, inspiring quotations, pictures, and other matter of moral worth.

5. All the school studies and activities are to be concentrated on character training." (1)

A list of projects and problems to enrich a character-building curriculum was worked out by this Iowa Committee.

(1) Education for Citizenship, p. 102 - J. C. Almack.
Boston Plan

The city of Boston has been a pioneer city in the field of citizenship through character development. The educators in that city believe that "the good citizen is the one who, because of the nobility of his character and the resulting usefulness of his life, is a constructive force in the community". (1)

To train children in the public schools to be good citizens the conscious and constant aim should be to develop qualities of noble character. This aim must be kept in mind in every lesson of each subject in the curriculum, in every activity of the classroom, and in every situation during the entire day while the teacher is in charge.

To accomplish the aim the children are taught to practice the following fundamental virtues:

1. Self preservation through the observance of the laws of health.
2. Self control.
3. Self reliance.
4. Truthfulness and reliability.
5. Justice as shown in clean, fair play.
6. Faithfulness to duty.
7. Conscientiousness in the doing of one’s work to the best of one’s ability.
8. Willingness to cooperate in working with others.
9. Kindness towards all.
10. Obedience to constituted authority.
11. Loyalty to home, to school, to country, to faith.

(1) School Document #10, p. 17 - Boston Public Schools.
The following suggestions are offered to put this course of study on a working basis:

1. Two weeks should be spent upon each virtue in conjunction with the Code of Morals.

2. The study of these qualities of noble character should include:
   a. Daily discussion directed by the teacher.
   b. The stressing of related matter met in the study of various subjects.
   c. The attempt to encourage pupils to furnish illustrations from their own experience and reading.
   d. The attempt to make the children feel that these qualities of character are the result of right living - to help children to understand that mere talking about these virtues will never bring about the possession of them. They can be gained only through practice.

The complete plan of the Boston system stresses the development of character through the practice of certain virtues. This course is not additional subject matter imposed from without, but a familiar one to be worked out from within.

RELIGION IN EDUCATION

Of no insignificant importance is the emphasis which business men and public leaders are placing upon religion in education. It is not to be construed that they refer to religion in the dogmatic sense but believe that more emphasis should be placed upon spiritual values.
Roger Babson, criticizing education, has this to say, in one of his numerous articles: "If we want to know whether a corporation is earning its way we examine its profit and loss statement and balance sheet. Applying the same methods in a rough way to public school education here is what we find:

On the credit side

1. Practical elimination of illiteracy during the past twenty years and raising the general level of intelligence.

2. Supervision of pupils' physical health and safety to a much greater degree than ever before.

3. Americanization work. Had it not been for education America could not have absorbed the great flood of immigration.

4. Valuable work done in vocational education, i.e., preparing young people for specific trades.

5. Increased earning power of educated over uneducated men.

6. Advance in material prosperity can be ascribed at least in part to higher educational level of the masses.

On the debit side we find

1. Lack of real character building as evidenced by the fact that crime costs this country $16,000,000,000 a year, which is eight times the amount spent on public school education. I maintain that character training is very greatly the function of the school.
2. Tendency to spread out too thin. By that I mean trying to crowd in too many subjects, some of which are inconsequential, with the result that no one thing is learned well and the child comes out with his mind confused. "(1)

Babson concludes by claiming that the crying need of today is not more cultural and scientific knowledge, but more spiritual knowledge. "Our prosperity will collapse of its own weight unless our spiritual growth catches up with our material growth. The old fashioned qualities of reverence, obedience, willingness to do hard and unpleasant tasks, respect for law, integrity, and loyalty must be taught. My own impression is that there is room for much improvement." (1)

Hon. James J. Davis, formerly Secretary of Labor, an ardent believer in religion in education, speaks as follows: "I would plead for a conception of education large enough to take into itself everything that deepens the human consciousness, that inspires the human soul, and gives one a vision of the eternities. This, a moral education, to use the word in its highest sense, will do. As every historian can show, morals divorced from religion are sorry affairs at any point. But morals not so divorced can rise to the height that religion itself has attained. I fear the people of this prosperous and richest of countries run a fearful danger. Our riches in material things are so great that we tend to give ourselves up to the enjoyment of strictly material things. It is more that ever a time to cultivate the riches of the mind and the spirit.

I don't care what particular system is used in teaching morals or religion, but I say the soul of this nation will die if we do not instill in the minds and souls of our children some proper form of moral and religious sense. We shall surely perish in the muck of fleeting material sensations, if we do not begin with our youth and make them understand that life is more than the amassing of money and the tickling of the senses." (1)

EDUCATION OF THE EMOTIONS

Of great importance is the emphasis which is being placed, of late, on the emotions. Many educators believe with Hume that "ambition, avarice, self-love, vanity, friendship, generosity, public spirit; these passions, mixed in various degrees and distributed through society, have been, from the beginning of the world, and still are, the source of all the actions and enterprises which have been observed among mankind." (2)

Many people, well known in the field of education, believe that it is legitimate to expect modern education to deal with the control and direction of some of the social manifestations of the emotional nature, manifestations with which we are all familiar.

"We want to see, as time goes on, more intelligence in politics, more reason in religion, more justice in law, more trust and better credit in business, more honesty in commerce, more brotherhood among nations, more loyalty between men and women, more innocent joy in life down through the youth in college, high school, and grammar grades; in short, more of the spirit of Christ made manifest in a

modern world compelled to be sociable or to step down and out before a more primitive culture. All these actions and enterprises still depend, as they have from the beginning of the world, upon the wise use of the emotional nature of the man animal. With them our educational system must deal if it is to help us to survive the test these years have set for modern society." (l)

The previous viewpoint suggests that we remember that "man is a speck of intellect drowned in a sea of emotion" and that more attention be given to the "feeling" side of man's nature.

This particular phase of education is a relatively new one and many educators are advancing the opinion that we should place less stress on education as "knowledge getting" and place more stress on "education of the heart".

EDUCATION FOR CITIZENSHIP

Citizenship has been the avowed aim of education in stable, civilized states. In our own country, it has been especially emphasized, and never more so than in recent years. The present emphasis upon civic education should not be taken to mean that the education of the past has failed to produce good citizens. It signifies that we have new and difficult problems which our citizens must solve. Because of the changed conditions of modern life, we need to change our instruction so that it will fill the new demands.

The changes which have been responsible for greater emphasis upon citizenship have been numerous. Our earlier unity has been disturbed by the coming of thousands of immigrants, with ideals, culture levels, and experiences that differ widely from our own. These people

must be assimilated. The extending of the franchise to women, the multitude of laws constantly being written upon the statutes, the element of doubt as to whether people should obey these laws - all these changes have made life far more complex and difficult to understand. The expansion of industry and the development of invention have brought many new problems. Population is becoming congested in large cities. There is everywhere a growing disrespect for law, and graft and corruption can be evidenced in public life. Many very responsible thinkers believe that the American democracy is breaking down.

Because of the fact that the main business of the public school is that of making good American citizens - those who know how to live together with their fellows efficiently and harmoniously - this recent emphasis on citizenship is being considered and the viewpoints of various educators are described in the pages which follow.
THE BOBBITT PLAN


In our consideration of the Bobbitt Plan we can see the necessity of definite objectives. Education cannot take the first step in training for citizenship until it has "particularized the characteristics of the good citizen". The task is to develop those characteristics.

Bobbitt believes that "it will be a long time, however, before our profession can have any reasonably complete list upon which to base a system of training". (1)

The problem of citizenship is the development of large-group consciousness. When people have and understand large-group relations and manifest right attitudes toward each other and toward society these automatically impel toward right action.

How do we get this feeling of membership in a group, large or small? There seems to be one method and that is, "To think and feel and act with the group as a part of it as it performs its activities and strives to attain its ends". (2) The plan is chiefly one of activity.

Youth's best civic education must come from "participation along with adults in these activities". It is the belief of the author that all citizens should be interested in problems similar to the following:

(1) The Curriculum, p. 117 - J. Franklin Bobbitt.
(2) The Curriculum, p. 131 - J. Franklin Bobbitt.
1. Keeping the city clean.
2. Making the city beautiful.
3. Control of flies and mosquitoes.
4. Disposal of sewage, ashes, rubbish, etc.
5. Regulating street traffic.
6. Control the smoke evil.
8. Protecting the city from fire.

The list is not exhaustive. It presents only types of problems. The ordinary citizen would not perform the tasks incident to the solution of the above problems but he would have his "community inspectorial function" to perform. The above problems must be talked about, compared, explained, and justified. Out of such discussion comes enlightened public opinion. Pupils would collect facts, make maps, organize statistics, diagrams, models, and this material could be presented at community meetings made up of both adults and young people. Civic training can be healthy and virile only as it involves the things that are being striven for by the community. It must be an organic part of the total civic striving of the community.

Bobbitt would have the schools, as far as possible, "the civic forums of the city". Topics, such as, street-paving, taxes, sanitation, etc., would be discussed in the schools by those experts in charge of these branches of municipal organization.

The chief part-time civic work of youth will be participation in "inspectorial activities"; for this is also the adult's major civic activity. There are other activities not placed in specialized hands and certain specialized activities in which youth can participate.
The following is a partial list in which youth can participate directly:

1. Care and protection of birds.
2. Anti-fly campaigns.
3. Anti-mosquito campaigns.
4. The fight on weeds.
5. Cleaning up vacant lots.
6. Patrolling railroad and street car crossings at hours when kindergarten and primary children are going to and from school.
7. Raising and delivering flowers to the sick and aged.
8. Clearing snow from sidewalks and paths; and sprinkling sand or ashes on icy sidewalks.

These civic labors, like the inspectorial ones previously mentioned, must not be detached and isolated from the rest of the community. The children should see and feel their labors to be but a delegated part of a community responsibility of which the adults are carrying the major portion of the load.

The above discussion relates to local, state, and national problems. Because of the interdependence of nations there should be developed an international consciousness. This phase of the problem would be solved, Bobbitt believes, by "readings that will permit children and youth sympathetically to enter into the actions of men in the various regions of the earth". (1) The readings for the

purpose will be history, biography, travels, geography, and literature. The primary aim will be the reconstruction of life within the lands so that the reader can relive it. Schools need to gather of each type readings that reveal all important present-day nations and peoples. Geography has done this but the principle that is applicable to geography appears to be equally applicable to history and literature.

It must be remembered that knowledge is not the thing aimed at; but rather social attitudes and valuations. It is living experience not memorizing experience. Right accomplishment of this requires not batches of facts, but all the "emotionalized attitudes and valuations that can arise only out of emotionalized experience and readings". (1)

THE BONSER PLAN


It is the contention of Bonser that growth in the qualities of citizenship cannot be secured by the setting apart of a particular period or time for the practice of those qualities. "Citizenship is not an activity separate from other activities any more than honesty is a separate activity. It is rather the quality or character of all of our life activities." (1) The measure of our success in citizenship is the degree in which we are intelligently unselfish and socially mindful in all we do.

Citizenship being the quality of all of one's acts, it follows that the "development of good citizenship in children and young people lies in teaching them the means of performing each act of daily life in such a way that it will serve the common good. If each of the hundreds and thousands of daily activities is so performed with honesty, fairness, and a due regard for the well-being of others, then the abstract quality of citizenship will have been realized". (2) It is the problem of the school in teaching citizenship to show the most desirable ways of performing specific acts for the common good, of inspiring ideals and desires to serve the common good by such acts, and to cultivate habits by practice in performing such acts.

Bonser believes that "there is scarcely a project in the practical arts, in geography, in history, in nature study, or in hygiene

(1) The Elementary School Curriculum, p. 399 - F. G. Bonser.
(2) The Elementary School Curriculum, p. 401 - F. G. Bonser.
which does not contain some significant element of good citizenship".

(1) Their meaning in terms of specific daily situations and problems must be appreciated. They must be understood and practiced in daily situations in order to have practical meaning.

As a summary in general terms, the qualities and activities which should be more prominently illustrated through the concrete projects and situations of school and home life are the following:

1. Manners, Politeness, Kindness, Hospitality.
2. Honesty and Fair Dealing.
3. Loyalty, Patriotism, and Cooperation.
4. Obedience, Reverence, and Respect.
5. Thrift, Self-support, and Generosity.
7. Recreation.
10. Interest in Government.
11. Recognition and Selection of Leadership.

The author believes that there is no need for a separate "course" in citizenship. Emphasis should be placed upon those qualities enumerated here as they appear in life situations in every school grade.

(1) The Elementary School Curriculum, p. 401 - F. G. Bonser.
THE DEWEY PLAN


Prof. Dewey, while he has not formulated any definite scheme for the development of good citizenship, believes that character and moral training should be outcomes of the complete educational process, as the following viewpoint will indicate: "The moral education centers upon this conception of the school as a mode of social life, that the best and deepest moral training is precisely that which one gets through having to enter into proper relations with others in a unity of work and thought. The present educational systems, so far as they destroy or neglect this unity, render it difficult or impossible to get any genuine, regular moral training". (1)

The old fashioned training assumed that morality could be imposed from without. Dewey believes that this was a mistake. We can force external obedience; but a genuine character is always the outcome of what a child wishes at heart to do and to be.

To prepare for the responsibilities of adult citizenship the child must have opportunity to learn through actual participation in some of the activities of citizenship. These should not be make-believe activities but natural activities arising out of every day situations in connection with the home, the school, the church, and civic enterprises. The most important of these in which group action can be employed are in the school.

Dewey has exemplified this in his exposition of the idea that "Education is life!". He deplores school activities arranged purely as school exercises. Every activity in the school should have real significance in the child's own life.
THE HATCH PLAN


The thesis of Roy Hatch is that pupils learn their citizenship by living their citizenship. It is in this way that he hopes for education in citizenship. "If our pupils will themselves, under proper guidance, assume active responsibility for school citizenship enterprises of varied kinds, we can reasonably hope for the increase in knowledge, insight, sensitivity, ideals, attitudes, and habits necessary to make up education in and for citizenship. Being learned thus in actual living conditions, they will, we can hope, more likely be applied when they later may be called for in life. In this way may we expect our pupils to learn citizenship by living citizenship." (1)

Hatch does not believe that there should be any formal course of study in civics for the early grades. "It would be a sad return to the old error of parcelling out the civic virtues if any teacher with such a course in her hands should feel that her particular grade was where 'honesty' or 'courtesy' should be taught." (2) Whatever course of study is used, "let us trust that there will be enough free play so that the teacher may seize the vital situation, incidental to all her classroom work, and drive in her citizenship training through concrete applications". (3) Hatch believes that as teachers we seem to forget the importance of developing character in the many contacts.

(2) Training in Citizenship, p. 9 - R. W. Hatch.
(3) Training in Citizenship, p. 9 - R. W. Hatch.
and reactions that come in just living together.

The following "civic virtues" should be developed in the early grades:

1. Obedience to authority and to law.
2. Respect for the rights of others.
4. Responsibility for those less fortunate than ourselves.
5. Civic pride.

It is apparent that Hatch believes that all of the activities of the school contain potential citizenship material. "If we would train our children in right civic habits we must do it in some such way as this. Seize the vital situation and drive in our citizenship training through specific applications in school and out. Inspiration - information - participation, these are the aims to be constantly held in mind in training young citizens and the greatest of these is participation - activity - doing the thing." (1)

In the junior and senior high schools the problem changes. We are now more in the field of "knowledges" and there is need for definiteness in the course of study. "It would be a grievous blunder if any of our young citizens should leave the VIIIth Grade without a knowledge of our forms of government. Later on should come the study of comparative government, and the student should realize as he advances that he will be expected to help in the solution of some of the many problems of a political, social, and economic nature that perplex our people today. In the study of history during these years, there are many fine opportunities for training in citizenship." (2)

(2) Training in Citizenship, p. 46 - R. W. Hatch.
Hatch believes that in these later years there are splendid materials and opportunities for direct citizenship training in the everyday activities of the school and community. These opportunities can be found in the "General Association, The Students' Council, The Debating Societies, Literary and Social Clubs, Organizations for Charitable Purposes, Participation in Community Activities, Self-Government in the school as exemplified in Supervised Study Halls; Traffic Squads, Election of Class Officers, etc." (1)

In summary, Hatch, in his citizenship teaching, stresses pupil enterprise and pupil responsibility. "A wholesome pupil enterprise, felt by the pupils to be theirs, prosecuted by them with a full sense of responsibility for its success - such a pupil enterprise so conducted with wise guidance promises the conditions seen to be necessary for the kind of learning we wish." (2)

THE KILPATRICK PLAN


Prof. Kilpatrick has no direct plan for training in citizenship. The Kilpatrick idea is embodied in his "project" theory. The purposeful act should be made the typical unit of school procedure.

The project idea is one of "pupil purpose" and involves the practical disappearance of "subjects", as such, for the pure project will flow beyond the bounds of subject matter.

The Kilpatrick idea suggests pronounced emphasis on learning outcomes that are sometimes subordinated in other schemes of teaching.

In so far as character and good citizenship are concerned, Kilpatrick believes that his educational procedure lends itself admirably to the growth of these traits.

The following excerpt supports the assertion: "I dare assert that no other type of school procedure so adequately provides the conditions for good character growth as does procedure based on purposeful acts. Our ordinary school, so far as it excludes the element of purpose on the part of the child, exactly excludes the conditions under which moral character is best developed. To expect a child to gain self control by denying to him the opportunity to exercise responsibility is like expecting him to learn to swim out of water. Many skillful teachers all over this country are able to testify to the changed moral attitude that accompanies the wise use of what I am here advocating. Instead of being a weak
point in the program, the moral character aspect is one of the strong points. The purposeful act under wise guidance amid a social environment makes for the building of exactly that strong and resourceful moral character which democracy so much needs". (1)

Mahoney, John Joseph, educator; prof. edn., Boston U., since 1922; also dir. extension courses for Boston Univ. Sch. of Edn. and Harvard Grad. Sch. of Edn.

Professor Mahoney believes that the "main business of the public school is that of making good American citizens; those who know how to live together with their fellows efficiently and harmoniously". The problem is the "pioneer task of finding out what changes, if any, must be made in the aims, the subject matter, the methods, the general spirit and conduct of the American public school in order to enable it to realize its fundamental function - the making of good American citizens".

Democracy is defined as a "blanket term intended to cover all those tendencies and movements in human relationship that make for the elimination of inequalities, whether caused by nature or by man".

This authority particularizes with reference to democracy and defines political and social democracy as follows:

1. Political democracy is "best expressed in Lincoln's words 'a government of the people, by the people, and for the people'. It suggests rights and privileges, duties and obligations".

2. Social democracy is an "affirmation of Burns' stirring challenge 'a man's a man for 'ere that'. It denies an aristocracy of birth, wealth or intelligence. It recognizes an aristocracy of individual and social worth only".

The task is started with a "recognition of the most significant problem of the public school - of causing people to live together efficiently and harmoniously in the various democracies defined". In
analyzing how to begin this task we must first of all be careful to delimit our field.

The following diagram shows the curriculum divided into blocks of work:

There must be a foundation on which to build and we find evidence of the necessity for religion. This task is not the job of the public school. Outside agencies would supply this particular want.

Moral-civic education concerns itself with small-group relationships.

The "cultural" block concerns itself with the development of certain aesthetic appreciations in the fields of literature and history.

The practical worth of the "health" and "vocations" blocks is self evident.

Civic education is defined as "the sum total of all those specific teachings, activities, and procedures that the school may utilize for the purpose of developing those understandings, appreciations, and behavior tendencies that make for better living in large-group relationships".

These understandings, appreciations, and behavior tendencies would be determined by analyzing the civic shortages in the fields of political, industrial, and social democracy. All the understandings needed would be listed, together with needed behavior tendencies, and
certain appreciations or emotional appeals.

The following is a partial list of tentative objectives:

I. Behavior Tendencies.
   a. Taking an active part whether as leader or in the ranks in "politics".
   b. Forming one's own opinion, in so far as possible, as a guide in voting.
   c. Demanding a higher standard of intelligence and honesty in public officials.
   d. Taking a strong stand against the disposition to "sentimentalize" over criminals.
   e. Searching out and being guided by expert opinion, in dealing with political and social questions that clearly call for the expert's knowledge. (Attitude of respect for leadership).

II. Understandings.
   a. Political.
      2. Ideal of nationalism as contrasted with that of internationalism.
b. Social.

1. Racial differences; superior and inferior races; racial antipathies.

2. Effect of group antagonisms on our social life - racial antagonisms - "social caste" antagonisms - religious antagonisms. The present trend.

3. Significance of legislation in the field of private morals. The trend.

c. Industrial.

1. Significance of "Equal Pay for Equal Work".

2. Significance of government regulation of economic life.

3. Traditional American attitude toward private property. The present trend.

III. Appreciations - Emotional Appeals.

1. "Hero-respect" directed toward those who, in all history, have died for an ideal.
   a. In our land - in other lands.

2. Contributions of all outstanding people of all races toward America's making.

3. What we owe to those who, through all history, have "pioneered". Present day pioneers.
   a. Frontier adventurers.
   b. Moral and economic leaders.

4. Heroes of today in every walk of life.
He suggests the following as an experimental course in moral-civic education for grades 1 - 6:

Objectives:

A. Enlightened obedience in the interests of the group.

B. Honesty in word and action.

C. Teamwork in promoting worthy school and community enterprises.

1. Community projects.
   a. Policing streets to protect young children.
   b. Decorating soldiers' graves.
   c. Clean up campaigns.
   d. School gardening.

2. School Activities.
   a. Careful handling of books.
   b. Throwing refuse in places provided.
   c. Beautifying school and grounds.

3. Literature.

4. Geography.
   a. Sweeping readings of the episode variety.
      2. How the World is Clothed.

5. History.
   a. Gripping readings.

6. Civics.
   a. How the community, the state and the nation cooperate to promote public health.
7. Conduct of the School.

D. Kindness, Neighborliness, Good-will, Reliability, Dependability.

1. Community Projects.
   a. Collecting clothes - collecting toys for unfortunates.
   b. Providing a bed in a children's hospital.
   c. Giving musical programs in homes for the aged.

2. Junior Red Cross Activities.

3. Literature.
   a. All selections that help realize the objective.

4. Geography.
   a. Little children in other lands - readings about them. No facts in first six grades.

5. History.
   a. Collect episodes.
      1. How America has been kind to other people.

6. Civics.
   a. How community cares for unfortunates.
      1. The poor.
      2. Disabled veterans.
      3. Health clinics.
In order to follow the plan of Prof. Mahoney we need objectives that are specific and have some scientific validity. Subject matter would be selected with these civic objectives in mind. The whole curriculum, as we know it, would be changed.
THE PETERS PLAN


Professor Peters is somewhat disturbed relative to the longevity of America as a democratic state, but believes that our ability to keep democracy intact "will depend upon our ability to equip all individuals with the insight, the ideals, the information and the skills necessary for making them safe as their own masters and as directors of the destiny of society". (1)

In a way attempting to approach the scientific he has "blue-printed" certain outcomes that are necessary in a democratic state and the attainment of these preadjustments will constitute the objectives of education for citizenship. These outcomes, to be treated by school and non-school educational procedures, are in the fields of political, social, and industrial democracy. It is expected that all school subjects will be freely drawn upon in an attempt to realize these objectives.

The following is a summary of the objectives in education for citizenship at the various grade levels: (2)

I. Objectives of civic education in the kindergarten and primary grades.

a. To make the child conscious of his surroundings - home, school, neighborhood - and to show him his

dependence upon others and his ability to help others.

b. To develop in him personal virtues as a basis for civic ones - self-control, cleanliness, orderliness, helpfulness, kindness, etc.

c. To arouse a feeling of love of country.

d. To provide the child experiences basic to later generalizations bearing upon civic relations.

e. To introduce the child to historical personages as a basis for his better apprehension of later social science study.

II. Objectives of civic education in the intermediate grades.

a. To supplement and get organized into definite information what the pupil knows about city, county and township - its officers, activities and institutions.

b. To develop in him a conception of the privilege of being an American citizen and the duty he has as such citizen.

c. To acquaint him with the operation of public functions and of public service corporations - as elections, taxation, street railway, and telephone.

d. To awaken in him attitudes, ideals, and biases demanded by democracy - justice, fairness, openmindedness, consideration of other's rights.
e. To lay further bases for a stable patriotism - admiration of our great men, of our great events and of the genius of our nation.

f. To introduce the child to the peoples of the world in such a way that he may know them and deal with them as fellow human beings.

g. To equip him with the minimum factual information from history and geography needed as a background for reacting upon statements about civic matters.

h. To develop further habits and ideals of conservation of property.

i. To get rationalized his attitude of obedience to law and his participation in its enforcement.

j. To initiate him into a technique of thinking and of inquiry needed for the solution of civic problems.

III. Objectives of civic education in the junior high school.

a. To develop a clear understanding of the structure and functioning of our local, state and national government in its various aspects.

b. To develop a fuller understanding of our national ideals and aspirations and a will to help carry them toward their highest culmination.

c. To carry to the stage of an effective working tool the acquisition of techniques initiated in the grades below.
d. To acquire a more complete understanding of the operation of public service corporations and of public functions.

e. To prepare him to utilize governmental agencies effectively.

f. To acquaint him in general terms with his duties and rights as a citizen.

g. To have him make a beginning in the technique of matching ideas with others in groups.

h. To have him glimpse the importance of leadership in civic matters and acquire right ideals regarding true leadership and some skill in discriminating between good and bad leaders.

i. To develop further the personal and social ideals and habits initiated in the lower grades.

IV. Objectives of civic education in the senior high school.

a. Teachers of all subjects should alertly watch for opportunities to drive incidentally toward civic objectives.

b. The disciplinary policies of the school should be decided in the light of their probable effect upon preparation of people for life within a democratic state, and teachers should remember that they teach as much by example as by formal instruction.

c. Through personal counseling the pupils should be helped to orient themselves in regard to their personal and social problems and in the choice of a vocation.
d. Such extra-curricular activities as clubs, parties, and athletics should be so set up as to make them contribute maximally toward training for life in a democracy.

e. A number of social science courses should undoubtedly be offered which deal directly with problems relating to citizenship. Among these are economics, sociology, ethics, political science, and practical psychology.

Dr. Peters does not believe that the school should carry the whole burden of civic education as the following excerpt will show: "By no means the whole responsibility for civic education falls upon the school. The school's function is merely a residual one; it does whatever threatens to be left undone by other agencies". (1)

THE SNEDDEN PLAN


"America needs and wants more and better education for citizenship. The majority of adult Americans are, of course, not bad citizens, as judged by historic standards; but it is apparent to all careful observers of social life that the task of citizenship in a democracy as large and economically complex as ours imposes heavier responsibilities every year." (1)

The arguments in support of more and better civic education are summarized, by Snedden, as follows:

1. Under favorable conditions in simple societies the individual receives only an imperfect civic education from extra-school agencies.

2. Even when this developmental civic education is supplemented by a "common school education" thus assuring general literacy and some appreciation of history and social geography, results are far from satisfactory, as every modern state with a well developed public school testifies.

3. The functions of public education have heretofore been individualistic, rather than social. Schools have been organized to help the individual succeed in life rather than to help the state and other

(1) Civic Education, p. 7 - David Snedden.
social groupings to succeed. It is now the obligation of society to extend and improve the social objectives of public education, of which civic education toward political competency is among the most important. The social science studies should receive increased emphasis.

4. The materials for civic education are now better organized and more available than ever before.

5. A constantly increasing proportion of children attend school between the ages of 12 and 18 - the years peculiarly suited to the establishment of civic appreciations and ideals and the fixing of some important civic habits and attitudes.

The objectives of civic education "must be sought in the first instance from a study of social needs, especially as these manifest themselves among adults. But these objectives cannot be made the bases of school programs until they shall have been selected and adapted to the educational possibilities of various levels or other groupings of learners". (1) In order to ascertain what these "social needs" are all adult social groups would be studied for the purpose of determining certain defects or "civic shortages". These "civic shortages" peculiar to this or that social group would be corrected by educational means.

The following courses are suggested by the author as practical, yet experimental, in the field of citizenship:

Children 6 to 9 years of age - school day of 6 hours - 20% of the time to be given to social education.

(1) Civic Education, p. 142 - David Snedden.
Short courses in the following are recommended:

a. Dramatized projects - festivals, masques, etc.
   With these may be included training in flag salutes and patriotic singing.

b. Service projects that center around maintenance of school order and cleanliness. The ideals of moral education should probably control.

c. Developmental talks and readings, ranging from inspirational tales of heroes and events to attractively given talks on law observance, clean town, good citizenship, patriotism, and the like.

d. Community civics through exploratory contacts with public service agencies in the neighborhood - including agencies of government (post office - water supply - fire protection) and private general utilities (stores, street cars, lighting, newspapers, etc.).

e. Salient or framework history. For these grades definite memorization of central facts as to perhaps ten or twenty salient dates, names, and events in American history, together with a smaller number in world history, should be the goals of one or more "short unit" courses each year.

Children 9 to 12 - 20% of time to be given to civic education.

a. Dramatic projects utilizing elections, commemorations, simple pageants, naturalization, patriotic devotion, all of broader scope than those suggested for earlier grades.

b. Service projects that may well include beginnings of purposive school government, closing exercises of
cooperative nature, group organization of games, simple relief projects for poor at holiday time, Red Cross participation, and others.

c. Exploratory projects, visits to agencies of government (fire, police, street repair, street cleaning, etc.), and also visits to factories, cold storage plants, street car transportation, etc.

d. Readings. Periodic readings by teachers and pupils about founders, significant events, contemporary enterprises with beginnings of critical and friendly evaluation of governmental agencies and public utilities.

e. Social-science problems. These must await development of printed matter to guide teachers.

f. Salient or framework history - key dates, events, and a few broad historical findings to be made matters of memorization.

Second six grades - ages 12 - 18.

The really great opportunities for the development of genuine civic education in American public schools are to be found between the age levels of 12 and 18. It is agreed that departmental or specialized teaching service can be provided. The following suggestive, experimental courses are available for the first two years or grades of the junior high school. About 20% of the school time would be devoted to all forms of civic education and every pupil would be required to give that amount of time to this field.

The offerings of civic education would be of several kinds each organized on some convenient "short unit" basis hereafter to be
determined experimentally. For present purposes a "short unit" course will measure 60 hours or twelve weeks.

Offerings for civic education shall be divided into two groups, developmental and projective. Each pupil must during his two years take not less than three short courses of each type.

The following shall be the projective offerings:

1. Salient or frame work American history; (elective by all pupils); 30 hours each year.

2. Salient American history; an advanced "hard" course recommended for pupils of superior abilities; 60 hours, eighth grade.

3. Civil government or formal civics, 60 hours, either year.

4. Social problems, adapted to seventh grade pupils of less than average ability; 60 hours.

5. Social problems, adapted to seventh grade pupils of more than average ability; 60 hours.

6. Politico-economic problems of contemporary importance but studied with reference to historical origins (recommended for abler pupils in eighth grade).

7. Political or civic problems of contemporary interest (recommended for less able pupils in eighth grade).

The following shall be the "developmental" offerings:

1. Sixty hours of "service projects", to be varied from year to year and to include maintenance of school self-government under specified conditions.

2. Sixty hours of scouting.

3. Sixty hours of developmental readings in fields of contemporary civic problems.
4. Sixty hours of developmental readings in fields of history related to contemporary civic problems.

5. Sixty hours of debating and civic dramatization.

6. An advanced course in economic readings, open to gifted pupils.

7. A reading course in world political history, open to pupils of talent.

8. A current-events course in politics for pupils of less than average ability.

The purposes and procedures suggested for the above courses may for the present suffice to suggest proposals for higher grades. Problem courses and reading courses will become more difficult and serious in higher grades.
CRITICISM OF THE DESCRIBED PLANS

In an attempt to state the reactions to these various studies it should be understood that many of the problems confronting the American people are of a civic nature and that the public school should be directly concerned with these problems. The American democracy is becoming increasingly complex and certain understandings and attitudes are needed in order that the march of democracy may continue. Some course of study in citizenship is necessary where these understandings and attitudes can be developed. Any vague and indefinite attempt will not suffice.

It is very obvious that conditions in America today, in the social field, and in the political field are not very favorable for future growth. As a matter of fact, many responsible publicists, including Will Durant, Frank Kent, and Howard Lee McBain, consider the future of America with a great deal of discouragement.

The courses described in the preceding pages were written in an attempt to preserve the best in American tradition - to save America from decay - to make America a better place in which to live - in short, to develop a better citizen, one who would carry on and upward. Many difficulties must be overcome.

Bobbitt sees the necessity for definite objectives in citizenship and that is a step in the right direction. It is apparent that he has too many objectives listed and some are certainly repetitions. He believes that young people should participate with adults in solving community problems. How do we know that young people will not be given false ideas and questionable viewpoints and poor example, by the adult population, in the administration of civic affairs?
Bonser has no definite set of objectives and there is no scientific approach in his plan. He suggests that we teach children the means of performing each act in the interests of society. Most teachers have always labored to teach right from wrong and to inculcate certain virtues and yet good citizenship is lacking today. Why should children be particularly concerned with the "common good" when leaders in civic life, whom they imitate, care very little about the "common good"?

The plans of Dewey and Kilpatrick do not provide for a definite course of study in citizenship. These men believe that good citizenship will be an outcome of their own pedagogical schemes. This educational philosophy will not be adopted universally in America for some time to come and it seems apparent that some provision should be made for the present day societal ills in this country. There is no attempt in these plans to scientifically state certain qualities of good citizenship and no attempt to establish educational objectives which would develop a good citizen.

Hatch would have no formal course in the early grades but believes that good citizenship qualities should be driven in at every opportunity. Teachers have been doing this very thing for years. He assumes that children will, of their own accord, carry a great deal of responsibility and yet experience seems to prove that it is doubtful if children will carry civic responsibility out of purely high motives and not because of some personal reward. Hatch's scheme is too vague and indefinite. He provides that the pupil shall participate in the attempt to solve present day problems of a political, social, and economic nature, and that is certainly most beneficial.

There is a great amount of similarity in the plans of Mahoney, Peters, and Snedden. These plans approach the scientific in that
society would be studied and the defects of citizenship would be analyzed and tabulated and all educational materials would be freely drawn upon in an attempt to correct these defects. These theories appear to be most sound. Professor Mahoney takes an advanced step and provides for religion in education. This religion would be of an ethical and spiritual nature rather than denominational. Professor Peters states that his course would not carry all the responsibility for civic education, implying that it would be an aid to outside agencies, such as, the home, the church, and various fraternal organizations.

The younger generation is highly influenced by the actions of the adult population and any defects in the civic order are due to the shortcomings of the adult population. The adult population is beyond the reach of the American public school but the school can reach the younger generation.

Any course, which endeavors to discover those civic defects in the political, social, and industrial relationship and then provides for the correction of those shortages by developing certain understandings and appreciations and emotional appeals, is a highly commendable course and a step in the right direction.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Almack, John C. - Education for Citizenship.
Houghton Mifflin Co., 1924.

Bobbitt, J. Franklin - The Curriculum.
Houghton Mifflin Co., 1918.

Bonser, F. G. - The Elementary School Curriculum.
Macmillan Co., 1922.

Brown, E. E. - The Making of Our Middle Schools.

Chapman and Counts - Principles of Education.
Houghton Mifflin Co., 1924.

Charters, W. W. - Aims and Methods of Character Training in the Public Schools.

Davis, J. B. - Vocational and Moral Guidance.
Ginn and Co., 1914.

Dewey, John - Democracy and Education.
Macmillan Co., 1916.

Dewey, John - School and Society.

Dewey, John - Schools of To-Morrow.

Fairchild, Milton - Character - Education - Methods Competition.

Hatch, R. W. - Training in Citizenship.
Charles Scribner's Sons, 1926.
   Macmillan Co., 1926.  
Kilpatrick, W. H. - The Problem - Project Attack in Organization.  
   N. E. A. Proceedings, 1918. p. 529  
Mahoney, John J. - Education for Citizenship.  
   Second Conference on Social Studies, Harvard Summer School, 1923.  
New England Primer - Printed by Edward Draper, Boston, 1777.  
Parker, S. C. - Teaching in High Schools.  
Peters, Charles C. - Objectives and Procedures in Civic Education.  
Rugh, C. E. - The Physical Bases of Character.  
School Document #10 - Course in Citizenship Through Character Development.  
   Boston Public Schools.  
Snedden, David - Educational Sociology.  
   The Century Co., 1922.  
Snedden, David - Civic Education.  
   World Book Co., 1923.  
Sullivan, Mark - Our Times.  
   Charles Scribner's Sons, 1927.  
Sutton, W. A. - What the Schools Can Do in Character and Religious Education.  
PERIODICALS

Babson, Roger - Mr. Babson Explains What He Means by Religion.  
American Magazine, March, 1926.

Davis, James J. - Religion in Education.  
Good Housekeeping, Oct., 1927.

Smith W. B. - Education of the Emotions.  

Snedden, David - Good Citizenship, how Good?  
Educational Review, March, 1925.

Snedden, David - Can We Get Good Civic Education?  
School and Society, Nov. 17, 1923.