1958

Problems in the performance of early eighteenth century violin music

Bird, Herbert Allison
Boston University

http://hdl.handle.net/2144/7802

Boston University
PROBLEMS IN THE PERFORMANCE OF EARLY EIGHTEENTH
CENTURY VIOLIN MUSIC

A Document
Presented to
The Faculty of the School of Fine and Applied Arts
Boston University

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Musical Arts

by
Herbert Allison Bird
August, 1958
Approved

by

First Reader  

Second Reader  

Signature

Signature
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of the Problem</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Characteristic Features of Early Eighteenth-Century Violin Music</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Style</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Forms</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Schools of Playing</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. THE PERFORMANCE AND TEACHING OF EARLY EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY VIOLIN MUSIC</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Characteristics of Violin and Bow</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sources</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems in Performance and Teaching</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Principles of Tone Production Applied to Eighteenth-Century Compositions</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Fingering and Bowing in the Eighteenth Century</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Ornamentation</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. PROBLEMS IN THE INTERPRETATION OF EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY EDITIONS AS DISCUSSED IN CONTEMPORARY TREATISES</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fingering and Bowing Problems</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems of Ornamentation</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems in the Realization of the Figured Bass</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IV. NINETEENTH-CENTURY TRANSCRIPTIONS OF EIGHTeenth-CENTURY VIOLIN MUSIC .................. 67
   Available Transcriptions and Editions ............ 67
   Comparison of Nineteenth-Century Transcriptions 
   with Early Editions ................................ 69

V. SOME TWENTIETH-CENTURY ATTEMPTS AT SOLVING 
   THE PROBLEM OF THE BACH BOW ..................... 76

VI. CONCLUSION ............................................. 80
   The Music of the Eighteenth Century for 
   Teaching Purposes ................................ 80
   Bowing Styles ...................................... 81
   Ornamentation .................................... 81

BIBLIOGRAPHY .............................................. 84

APPENDIX ................................................ 90
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Statement of the Problem

Carl Flesch, eminent violinist and teacher and one of the most lucid writers on the subject of present-day violin teaching, has said, "One of the most valuable components of violin literature is the group of works by composers of the eighteenth century violin schools."\(^1\)

Under the influence of Carl Flesch, Fritz Kreisler, Albert Spalding, Efrem Zimbalist, and others, there is a decided revival of interest in the music of Corelli, Albinoni, Vivaldi, and their contemporaries, but this very revival implies a neglect in past years. Many performers and teachers in the twentieth century do not have a clear understanding of the style and performance practices of this music.

The problem with which this document attempts to deal can be stated in the following manner: There is today, readily available for both study and performance, a great body of eighteenth-century violin music. We know that performance practices of the nineteenth century, or those passed on from preceding generations to teachers in our own day, are often inadequate for an understanding of the tradition for the per-

---

formance of this music. What are the principles that should underly the performance of this music? Through a critical study of several violin methods of the period and the analysis of the music of early eighteenth-century composers, is it possible to establish a set of principles which can be applied with a measure of confidence? It is hoped that through a consideration of certain problems, both stylistic and technical, that present themselves, the wealth of eighteenth-century literature may be better understood by, and become a real source of enjoyment to, young students of today.

This paper will consider the salient features of eighteenth-century violin music and the contents of the eighteenth-century treatises on violin playing, and will discuss the application of those treatises in modern times.

Characteristic Features of Early Eighteenth-Century Violin Music

1. Style

Stylistically the instrumental music of the early eighteenth century reveals such late Baroque characteristics as the use of the thorough-bass and the stile concertante and a continuance of the older polyphony.

The thorough-bass technic is essentially homophonic with its composed melody lines, the inner voices which complete the harmony being realized from the figured bass. This technic is embodied in the typically Baroque trio sonata —
a type of composition written in three voices, usually performed by two violins and cello with keyboard instrument added for the realization of the figured bass -- which figured so prominently in the work of such composers as Corelli, Vivaldi, Buxtehude, Purcell, Bach, and Handel.2

"Stile concertoante" is the term applied to the contrasting effects achieved through the competition of solo instrument and tutti, or of the concertoante and tutti, and is one of the dominating characteristics of the period. This concertoante principle is exemplified in the concerti grossi of Corelli, with their many movements contrasting in character, and in the style adopted by Vivaldi with its three movements (slow, fast, slow).3

Finally, counterpoint, which was a heritage from the past, became a harmonic counterpoint in which the voices had a definitely vertical relationship, and in which the individual melodic lines were dictated by the underlying harmony.

It was during this period that the violin reached its highest point of development, inspiring composers to produce a great amount of violin music. Violinists, especially, seemed impelled to create for their own instrument, with the result that an essentially violinistic style emerged. That the violin

lin was found singularly suited to the music of these Baroque composers is seen in their use of (1) singing melodies inherent in the sonority of the instrument, (2) harmonies achieved through double stopping and broken-chord effects, and (3) extended passages of arpeggiated chords across the four strings. They also incorporated in their compositions special effects idiomatic to the violin, such as harmonics, pizzicato, col legno, scordatura, and the use of the mute.

2. Forms

The instrumental forms of the eighteenth century developed along two principal lines, the sonata and the concerto. The term "sonata" covers a wide range of types. Broadly speaking, there are two contrasting styles: the sonata da chiesa (church sonata), and the sonata da camera (chamber sonata). From the standpoint of form the former became standardized into the four-movement cycle, alternating slow-fast-slow-fast, while the latter has the characteristic of the dance suite, with its combination of many stylized dance forms. These works were designed for one, two, three, or more instruments and bass as well as for unaccompanied solo instrument. The complete output of Arcangelo Corelli is almost equally divided between "church sonata" and "chamber sonata." The

---

4Scordatura (literally, mistuning), — abnormal tuning used to produce unusual chords, facilitate difficult passages, and to change tone color.

"church sonata," as Corelli conceived it, became the prototype for the serious instrumental sonatas by his followers, including Geminiani, Locatelli, Tartini, Leclair, Veracini, Bach, and Handel. The term "da chiesa" gradually disappeared, the single word "sonata" usually being applied to the serious type. The chamber sonata is generally lighter in character, the number of movements varying from four to five or occasionally more. The term "sonata da camera" also disappeared, being replaced by the term "suite" or "ballet." The fact that many sonatas of this period displayed characteristics of each style must not be overlooked. The best known today are the sonatas for one instrument and bass, the trio sonatas for two melodic instruments and bass by various composers, and the unaccompanied sonatas for violin and for cello by J. S. Bach.

While several types of the sonata were established by the end of the seventeenth century, the concerto was a product of the eighteenth century. The first concertos were actually "church concertos" and were called "concerti da chiesa." It is in this form that the stile concertante is chiefly exemplified. The favorite concerto became the one in which contrast was achieved by alternating a group of instruments known as the "concertino" with the body of the orchestra as a whole, or "tutti," and was called the "concerto


grosso." The variety of combinations of instruments used in alternation in the concertos of Vivaldi suggests his familiarity with the dramatic style of an opera composer. In his works the concitino is never a stereotyped combination but consists, for example, of groups of two violins and cello, three violins and cello, violin and cello, two violins, or sometimes even a solo violin or cello.8

The organization of the concerto grosso into four or five short movements was adopted by such composers as Corelli, Albinoni, Geminiani, and Handel. The three-movement cycle of Torelli and Vivaldi became the model for, and had considerable influence on, other composers, including Bach.

Then out of the concerto grosso developed the solo concerto. In the works of Torelli the solo violin is treated with as much importance as the orchestra. Vivaldi and succeeding writers emulated Torelli and further developed the soloistic possibilities of the instruments. Finally, the three-movement concerto became the model for the classical concerto of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.

3. Schools of Playing

In this period different national characteristics manifested themselves in the various schools of playing. There was a French style, for instance, a German style, and an Italian style. From the time of Lully in the seventeenth century...

---

century, violin playing in France was characterized by a precise and rhythmic manner of bowing. In the French manner of holding the bow the thumb was placed under the hair and the first three fingers were placed on the stick, the little finger sometimes touching the side of the stick. Since much of the music of the period was composed for the court ballet a bowing style that emphasized rhythm was most prevalent. Not until the time of Leclair (1697-1764) did the French adopt the abstract sonata forms of the Italians.

The Germans of the early eighteenth century tended to exploit the virtuoso or technical aspects of violin playing. This is seen in the works of such an early composer as Biber (1650-1710), whose use of the high positions, of bowing technics in advance of his time, and of eccentric devices such as scordatura gave an effect of brilliance to his compositions. The polyphonic tradition in German music also affected violin style. It was Biber and his South German contemporaries who first found that multiple stopping would give polyphonic texture to music for a solo stringed instrument.

The song-loving Italians were preoccupied principally with the tonal qualities of the violin and expressed themselves in flowing lines of melody as in the beautiful slow movements of Corelli or Tartini. The Italian manner of

---

holding the bow with all four fingers on the stick and the thumb between the stick and the hair was conducive to this sustained melodic style.10

10David D. Boyden, loc. cit.
CHAPTER II

THE PERFORMANCE AND TEACHING OF EARLY EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY VIOLIN MUSIC

Physical Characteristics of the Violin and Bow

For a real understanding of the eighteenth-century style of performance on the violin, a knowledge of the instrument as it existed in that period is essential. The Baroque violin as developed by Amati, Stradivarius, and their contemporaries differed slightly from the violin as we know it today. The general shape of the body, with the deep curve of the middle bouts, the arch of the back and belly, and an over-all length of about 14" was fully established and brought to its highest development in the violins of Antonio Stradivarius (1644-1737).

The neck of the Baroque violin was wider than today's and would seem awkward to the modern violinist. This was apparently not a problem for the performer of the early eighteenth century,\(^1\) for few extended solo passages for the lower string occur. The length of the neck was also shorter by about 3/8" to 1/4".\(^2\) This was adequate for the early performer, who did not use the higher positions nor make use of shifting as practiced by modern violinists. Correspondingly,

\(^1\)Marc Pincherle, Corelli, p. 82.

the fingerboard was shorter; the customary length, about 2 1/2" shorter than today, enabled the Baroque player to reach the seventh position. In its construction the neck came out straight from the body of the violin and an ingenious wedge between the fingerboard and neck provided an angle to match the height of the bridge.

Precise knowledge of the size, shape, height, and thickness of the bridge in use in the eighteenth century is hard to determine since the design varied with individual makers and was suited to the arch of the violin belly. Generally, the design of the eighteenth-century bridge was established by Stradivarius. In comparison with its modern counterpart the eighteenth-century bridge was somewhat less arched across the top and about 1/12" lower. This, together with less tension of the strings, facilitated the playing of multiple stops.

In the internal structure of the violin a bass bar, affixed to the under side of the belly, reinforced the vibrations of the G string. In eighteenth-century violins this bar was 9 1/2" to 10" long, from 4/16" to 5/16" in height, and 3/16" in thickness.

The present modifications in the violin date from about the beginning of the nineteenth century. Lancetti mentions the Mantegazza brothers as making many repairs on violins,

---

remodeling them to the fashion prevailing in Paris. The most frequent change was the lengthening of the neck. With the rise in pitch noted about the end of the eighteenth century, violin makers found that increased tension on the strings could be compensated for by lengthening the neck and raising the height of the bridge. It is generally accepted that pitch in use during the eighteenth century was one half step lower than today. The use of a wedge between the fingerboard and the neck was abandoned and the angle of the neck was adjusted to facilitate shifting into the higher positions. This is considered by one author to be an improvement in the construction over Stradivarius' own. A slightly larger bass bar was found to add power to the tone. The increase in tension on the strings caused more powerful vibrations and, to help distribute these vibrations, the bass bar was increased in length to 10 1/2", in height to 7/16", and in thickness to 4/16". The advanced technic of position playing necessitated the lengthening of the fingerboard to 10 1/2", which was fully two inches longer than that previously in use.

The chin rest was not known to violinists of the eighteenth century. Its introduction has been attributed to

4Hill, Antonio Stradivari, p. 203.
5Heron-Allen, Violin Making, p. 159.
7Hill, loc. cit.
8Heron-Allen, loc. cit.
Ludwig Spohr (1784-1859). In pictures of violinists of the early eighteenth century the violin is shown to be held by the chin directly over the tailpiece or slightly to the right.\(^9\) Spohr’s model was the type of chin rest that fitted over the tailpiece.

The Baroque bow is difficult to describe because authentic models are so rarely found. It was not the practice of bow makers to mark them as was done with violins, so dates and makers are hard to establish. There was apparently no standard for bow construction, since bows of the period are known to be of varying lengths and weights. Leopold Mozart observes that, in playing with lifted bow, a longer and heavier bow will rebound at a different rate than a shorter and lighter one.\(^10\) Even taking into consideration the varying lengths of Baroque bows, we find that they were generally shorter than the modern bow. The length of the hair was approximately 20", being increased to 25", as standardized later by Francois Tourte. A significant feature of the early bows was the slightly arched or convex curve of the stick. By the beginning of the eighteenth century the stick was nearly straight, the distance between the hair and the stick being determined by the size of the frog (or screw end) and the head (or point).

---


In the late seventeenth century the bow apparently had no provision for altering the tension of the hair. By the beginning of the eighteenth century several crude devices had been developed for altering this tension. One of these was a wire loop that could be hooked into one of a series of teeth, known as the *cremaillere*.\(^{11}\) In an earlier device the frog slides into a slot in the stick and is held in place by the tension of the hair.\(^{12}\) The screw mechanism which adjusts the tension is thought by some to have been developed as early as 1700.\(^{13}\) Others date the screw from about 1750.\(^{14}\)

The bow as developed by François Tourte (1747-1835) follows the principle of the inward (or concave) curve of the stick and has served for the model of bow making ever since. There is evidence that this inward curve of the stick was already evolving early in the eighteenth century. The father

\(^{12}\)Saint-George, *ibid.*
\(^{13}\)Apel, "Bow," *op. cit.*
\(^{14}\)Boyden, *op.cit.*, p. 15.
of François Tourte experimented in various types of bows, and the Englishman John Dodd was carrying on his own experiments independently at this very same time. Several bows found among the effects of Antonio Stradivarius in the possession of his son, Paolo, show a slight inward curve of the stick. François Tourte introduced the gradually tapering stick which follows a logarithmic curve. The length of his bows was fixed at between 29.134" and 29.528". Another feature of the Tourte bow was the development of a ferrule and slide to maintain the even spread of the hair. As a result of his experiments with many kinds of wood, Tourte discovered Pernambuco wood to be especially suited for bow making.

Sources

An important source of information concerning the technic and interpretation of early eighteenth-century violin music is to be found in the numerous treatises and manuals written in the latter half of that century. Among the more valuable and interesting are those by Francesco Geminiani (1751), Leopold Mozart (1756), Johann Joachim Quantz (1752), and Giuseppe Tartini (1754).

Born in Italy in 1687, Francesco Geminiani studied the violin with Corelli. He went to England in 1714 where he concertized and taught until his death in 1762. Besides his violin sonatas and concerti grossi, Geminiani's method, The

\[^{15}\text{Hill, op. cit., p. 202.}\quad ^{16}\text{Saint-George, op. cit., p. 30.}\]
Art of Playing on the Violin, which deals with the principles of violin playing laid down by Corelli,\textsuperscript{17} is known to us today.

Geminiani's work is presented in three sections. In the first section the specific problems of bowing are explained. There is a presentation of the positions—or "orders," as he calls them—with detailed advice on shifting, which he calls "modulating," from one position to another. The treatment of ornamentation, its signs and their interpretation, is very clear. In the second section are musical examples of the material previously explained. This section is followed by the inclusion of a number of original compositions in which there is little or no editing. The student is to apply the principles previously set forth. Each of these compositions is provided with a continuo part.

Apparently unaware of this publication of Geminiani, Leopold Mozart published in Augsburg in 1756 what he thought to be the first violin method, \textit{Versuch einer gründlichen Violinschule}.\textsuperscript{18} The first English translation of this important book, \textit{A Treatise on the Fundamental Principles of Violin Playing}, appeared only in 1948, nearly two hundred years later.


\textsuperscript{18} Leopold Mozart, \textit{Versuch einer gründlichen Violinschule} (Augsburg, 1756).
Leopold Mozart, the father of Wolfgang, was born in 1719 in Augsburg, later moving to Salzburg. He became a fine violinist and composer and finally obtained the position of Vice-Kapellmeister for the Prince-Archbishop. That he was the principal teacher of his great son attests to his fine musicianship, and the fact that many students came to Salzburg to study with him is a tribute to his teaching. The Violsnchule shows that he was a thorough and experienced pedagogue. The interspersing of his explanations with musical examples would be considered by present-day standards as an educationally sound approach. His advice, given freely throughout the work, presents an accurate picture of eighteenth-century performance. The work is written in twelve chapters, beginning with a short history of music and ending with a chapter giving hints on character and style in performance. Chapters are devoted to bowing, fingering and positions, the playing of double stops, and ornamentation.

Johann Joachim Quantz (1697-1773), famous flutist to Frederich the Great and composer of some five hundred compositions for the flute, wrote also a Versuch einer Anweisung, die Flöte traversiere zu spielen (A Method of Playing on the Transverse Flute).\(^{19}\) The title is really misleading. Quantz treats a variety of subjects, such as style and performance practices of the period, and includes a chapter on playing

\(^{19}\) Johann Joachim Quantz, Versuch einer Anweisung die Flöte traversiere zu spielen (Berlin: 1752).
the violin. The references to violin playing and style in Chapter XVII can be considered reliable.

Giuseppe Tartini (1692-1770) was not only an outstanding violin virtuoso of his time, but, also, a great composer and the teacher of important violinists of the next generation. He was known for his mastery of the bow. His compositions are classics of the period. To Tartini is accredited the discovery of the combination tone, the third tone which is present when two tones are sounded simultaneously.

An awareness of this principle used to be recommended as an aid in developing pure intonation. The extent to which bowing technic developed in Tartini’s lifetime is shown in his L’Arte dell’arco (date unknown).

Problems in Performance and Teaching

A study of these sources shows that the basic problems in the technic and interpretation of violin music were the same in the eighteenth century as they are today. These problems are (1) tone production, (2) finger ing and bowing, and (3) ornamentation.

---

20 Giuseppe Tartini, Trattato di Musica secondo la Vera Sienza dell’armonia (Padua: 1754).
1. Principles of Tone Production Applied to Eighteenth-Century Compositions

The fact that violins since their early nineteenth-century alterations are capable of more power and volume than they were in the eighteenth century does not mean that a light weak tone was considered desirable in the earlier period. On the contrary, strength, virility, breadth of tone were sought and apparently achieved-within the limitations of the instruments. Leopold Mozart in his book insists that beginners use a strong loud tone, which later can be refined with "time and patience." The methods indicate very clearly that early violinists used full broad strokes of the bow. Geminiani states that "the best performers are the least sparing of their bow and make use of it from the point to that part of it under and even beyond their fingers."\(^{21}\) This manner of bowing produces that beautiful, flowing style associated with the adagio melodies so characteristic of the sonatas and concertos of the time. The present-day performer can still remain faithful to the eighteenth-century spirit although he uses modern equipment and employs the tonal ideals of today. The eighteenth-century bow, said to be superior to the Tourte bow for a certain "crisp, incisive technic of bowing and clearness of tone,"\(^{22}\) is admirably suited for that

\(^{21}\)Geminiani, Art of Playing, p. 2.

rapid alternation of up and down strokes in the upper part of the bow which results in a clearly articulated succession of tones described by Tartini. With skill a modern violinist can achieve these qualities with a Tourte bow (or bow of similar design).

One of the beauties of the violin, says Geminiani, "is the swelling or increasing of the sound." Leopold Mozart prescribes exercises for practicing crescendo and diminuendo on long tones. In his letter to Signora Maddalena Lombardini, Tartini gives explicit instructions for practicing a swell upon the open string, beginning pianissimo and increasing to fortissimo. This, he says, "is most essential to playing well on the violin." Crescendo and diminuendo were indicated by Vivaldi. In the third concerto of Opus 10, is found "f," "piu f," and "ff" to indicate a crescendo. Likewise, "p," "piu," and "pianissimo" are used to indicate a diminuendo. It would appear that Vivaldi applied to instrumental music an operatic device which was the accepted practice of his day. It is of interest to note that the use of "pp" meant "piu piano" and not "pianissimo," as we understand it today.

Closely associated with tone production is the use of

---

23 Geminiani, Art of Playing.
24 Tartini, loc. cit.
25 Pincherle, Vivaldi, p. 78.
vibrato. On stringed instruments this is described as a fluctuation of pitch by an oscillating motion of the left hand. There are two entirely different opinions concerning the use of vibrato in the eighteenth century: that it should be used continuously or only as an ornament. Leopold Mozart takes the stand that vibrato should be used as an expressive ornament only.  

26 Geminiani, while including it among the ornaments in his method, advocates not only using the vibrato on long swelling tones but using it also on short tones as "it only contributes to make their sound more agreeable and for this reason should be made use of as often as possible."  

27 Here, it seems, is justification for the use today, within reason, of a continuous vibrato in the performance of eighteenth-century music. The modern violinist conceives of vibrato as a part of his technical equipment and can exercise restraint for the desired expressiveness. It is necessary to bear in mind that this in no way sanctions the lush type of romantic tone suitable for a Brahms sonata.

2. Fingering and Bowing in the Eighteenth Century

The use of positions, and of fingering combinations which are the result of change of position, is one of the major problems of left-hand technic. The extent to which the eighteenth-century violinist made use of the positions can be found in the methods. What is meant by playing in positions

26 Mozart, Treatise, p. 203.

27 Geminiani, Art of Playing, p. 2.
is aptly demonstrated by Geminiani in the *Art of Playing on the Violin*. He illustrates seven positions while Mozart defines only three: whole, half, and mixed though he gives examples that require the use of the seventh. His "whole" position is known to us as the third; his "half" position is our second; and his "mixed" position is a combination of second and third. Geminiani methodically represents by a series of scale passages the range of tones which can be played in each of the seven positions.

His term for the positions is "orders." The first tone above the open string, stopped with the first finger, is the first order. The next tone above this, stopped with the first finger, is the second order and so on through the seven orders.

Leopold Mozart, in his treatise, justifies the use of positions on the grounds of "necessity, convenience, and elegance."\(^2\)\(^8\) He states that tones higher than the "b" which can be played with the fourth finger on the "E" string cannot

\(^{28}\)Mozart, *Treatise*, p. 132.
be produced without the necessity of shifting the hand to a higher position. This applies to each of the other strings as well.

It is also necessary to use the positions when playing double stops. When two tones ordinarily occur on the same string it is necessary to find them in another position so that the two tones can be stopped simultaneously.

It is convenient to use the positions to simplify the playing of two adjacent melody tones which otherwise would be very awkward.
Probably the most significant use of the positions in violin playing is to bring about that equality or consistency of tone quality desirable for a sustained melodic line. This is the "elegant" effect approved by Mozart. When two or more tones in a phrase must be played on adjacent strings a change of tone quality results. Therefore it is desirable to make use of the positions to perform the entire phrase on the same string. He gives the following as an example.

The fact that the change from one position to another is given such careful treatment in the methods of both Leopold Mozart and Francesco Geminiani may indicate that this was not as successfully practiced among violinists of their day as they could wish.

The art of bowing must be thought of as including not only the physical mastery of the movements which control the bow, but also the mastery of the infinite combinations of bowing strokes which express the character of the phrase.

29Ibid., p. 159.
The fact that the treatment of bowing styles was given considerable importance in the methods of these eighteenth-century writers indicates to what extent it affects the interpretation of the music. Indeed, modern pedagogues have treated this phase of violin playing with great care. Ottokar Sevcik has written a book which includes 4,000 systematic bowings.30 Carl Flesch has devoted a whole book to Basic Bowing Studies.31 Speaking of the violinist Giaridini and his superb bowing mastery, Charles Burney relates that he played an Air with Variations "in which, by repeating each strain with different bowing, without changing a single note of the melody, he gave it the effect and novelty of a new variation of the passage."32

The basis for understanding bowing problems, lies according to Leopold Mozart, in the use of "up and down strokes."33 He explains that the first note of a measure should begin down-bow if it is not preceded by a rest and that the first note should be down-bow even if it necessitates two down-bows in succession.

33Mozart, Treatise, Ch. 4.
In triple time, because of the uneven number of beats, the "rule of down-bow" does not always apply. To overcome this problem two of the three notes should be taken with one bow; which two of the three to be slurred is dictated by the character of the passage.\(^3^4\)

After an eighth, sixteenth, or thirty-second rest, Mozart advises an upstroke.

It is the passages of consecutive and rapid notes that are given detailed treatment in the methods. Leopold Mozart treats this subject quite exhaustively. Geminiani always favors the bowings which provide nuance over the "straight or plain" bowings.\(^3^5\)

\(^3^4\)Ibid., p. 83.

\(^3^5\)Geminiani, *Art of Playing*, p. 27.
Whether or not to play with a bouncing bow is apparently answered in the affirmative in the eighteenth-century method books. Mozart includes a section on the various combinations of lifted bow. Geminiani explains the use of a sign ('') indicating "lifting the bow" and includes some examples. All of the writers comment that the speed and character of the passage determine the use of the "lifted bow."

The Baroque bow was apparently capable of a bounced stroke. The example in Leopold Mozart would demand a type of involuntary spiccato previously thought to be possible only with the modern bow.

36 Mozart, Treatise, p. 27.
There is a great deal of confusion about the interpretation of the dots and vertical strokes that occur in early editions. Writers of the period used them interchangeably. Boyden believes that there is evidence that they are printers' marks since usually only one type occurs in a single source. According to Quantz eighth notes in allegro or sixteenth notes in allegretto should not be played with lifted bow. Mozart differentiates between dots meaning a slight pressure separation and vertical strokes meaning a lifted bow.

Geminiani seems to ignore the dot and explains the use of the vertical line (') for staccato and a slanting line

38 Ibid.
39 Mozart, Treatise, p. 45.
(\(\)) for "plain" (by which is meant not to remove the bow from the string). The eighteenth-century performer knew many degrees of staccato. The staccato in adagio was not as quick or sharp as in allegro. With respect to the lifted bow, or bounced bow, Mozart says, "Merry and playful passages must be played with light, short and lifted strokes."\(^{40}\) On the other hand from Quantz, "If the passage is in eighth notes in allegro or sixteenth notes in allegretto there is no time to lift the bow and get it down again."\(^{41}\) The fact that the term "staccato" was used for all short notes does not help to clarify this problem. But the care with which these early authors expound this problem of lifting the bow indicates that it was known and used to a great extent.

3. Ornamentation

The whole problem of ornamentation must be viewed as an evolution of the spontaneous embellishment of a simple melodic line in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries to the highly stylized practices of the eighteenth century. This practice was chiefly a characteristic of solo performers. When ensemble music was performed in parts, either instrumental or vocal, ornamentation was necessarily kept at a minimum. Leopold Mozart and Francesco Geminiani comment that the ornaments should be used sparingly and in good taste.

The general subject or ornamentation can be divided

\(^{40}\)Mozart, Treatise, p. 223.

\(^{41}\)Boyden, loc. cit.
into two categories: (1) the most common ornaments - the trill, appoggiatura, turn, and mordent with their accompanying signs - and (2) the somewhat free type of ornamentation of a melody as found in the slow movements of the sonata and concerto.

The important consideration in the performance of trills is the beginning tone and the type of afterbeat. In the eighteenth century trills began from either above or below the principal note. Carl Flesch gives three rules deduced from the eighteenth-century method books, principally Leopold Mozart's and Francesco Geminiani's. (1) When the note preceding the trill is identical with the principal note of the trill, the trill must necessarily begin with the upper note. (2) If the note preceding the trill is a second higher than the principal note of the trill, the trill must begin on the principal note or a note lower. (3) If the note preceding the trill is a second lower, the principal note or the note higher must be taken into account.

In general, the question of whether or not to use afterbeats is answered in the affirmative, but not without exception. Leopold Mozart states that a short trill is always accompanied by a turn. Corelli provided trills with a turn according to the 1710 edition of Opus V Sonatas. Bach often prescribes a trill with no afterbeat, apparently in accordance with a Corelli tradition.

\[41\] Carl Flesch, The Art, p. 28.
The interpretation of the appoggiatura in eighteenth-century music concerns itself with two alternatives in performance. (1) When should it be played short and when long? (2) When should it be anticipated and when subtracted from the value of the main note? In performance the long appoggiatura assumes half of the value of the main note. An appoggiatura before a dotted note receives two thirds of its value, and when a dotted note is tied into another beat an appoggiatura receives the whole value of the dotted note. Among the more unusual applications of the appoggiatura Mozart includes the appoggiatura before a quarter note tied to a sixteenth.

The appoggiatura before a final quarter note followed by a

42 Mozart, Treatise, p. 169.
rest is to be performed thus:

![Musical notation](image)

The appoggiatura assumes the value of the quarter note and the main note takes the place of the rest.

Short appoggiaturas are generally interpreted as taking their time from the preceding beat, although there is some difference of opinion concerning the proper accent. A Mozart recommends that the accent fall upon the principal note and not the appoggiatura. The long appoggiatura may be taken from either above, below, or on the same note as its main note and is always accented. Violinists are instructed that the appoggiatura will always be slurred to its main tone.

Eighteenth-century authorities are generally agreed on these points. That many composers of the period have used various kinds of notation for the appoggiatura, even leaving the choice of appoggiatura to the discretion of the performer, has contributed to making this whole problem most confusing.

The mordent was considered by the eighteenth-century musician a very important ornament. The very idea of a mordent was to lend emphasis to a held tone. Two factors are

---

43 Flesch, The Art, p. 29.

44 I.e., Leopold Mozart, Johann Quantz, and Giuseppe Tartini.
observed consistently: (1) the mordent is always subtracted from its main note and (2) it consists of the alternation of the main note with its lower auxiliary. From 1700 to 1750 this was always considered a whole step unless otherwise indicated. The writers admit two variations: the double mordent and the inverted mordent. The inverted mordent becomes in reality a quick trill:

\[ \text{\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{mordent.png}} \]

Ornaments which were seldom prescribed by the composers but used by solo performers included: the battement, ribattuta, gruppo, tirata, mezzo circulo, and others.\(^{46}\) Mozart's description of these ornaments gives the modern violinist an insight into the tradition of adding extemporaneous embellishments.

The battement was an ornament to be substituted for a mordent, consisting of the rapid alternation of two neighboring half tones always begun from below. Mozart warns against using the battement too frequently.

\[ \text{\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{battement.png}} \]

\(^{45}\)Flesch, The Art, p. 33. \(^{46}\)Mozart, Treatise, p. 209.
The ribattuta was employed in the sustaining of a very long note. It consisted of an alternation of neighboring tones in dotted rhythm. 47

The groppo is described as a means of connecting several tones by the insertion of a rapid figure resembling a turn. 48

The mezzo-circulo (half circle) is closely related to the groppo, so-called, because it resembles a half circle. When two half circles are used successively they make a circle. 49

To connect tones a wide interval apart a rapid scale passage, which was termed a *tirata*, was used. This could assume many forms depending upon the interval to be encompassed and the imagination of the performer. According to Leopold Mozart the *tirata* could be slow or fast, ascending or descending, in triplets, through half steps, and through a passage of broken thirds.

These ornaments provided the technical means for realizing the florid embellishments of adagios and even allegros, which were an inherited tradition employed by singers of the previous century. There was little resemblance between the composer's own score and the embellished rendition. In 1750 when Leopold Mozart was writing, he comments upon the "absurd" practice of embellishing every note, and admonishes violinists to exercise judgment in choosing just enough ornaments to be in good taste. By the middle of the eighteenth century composers were already writing out many embellishments rather than leaving them to the caprice of the performer. Thus, gradually, the whole tradition of embellishing a melody extemporaneously became a lost art. It must be remembered that the violinist of the early eighteenth century followed a tra-
dition inherited from singers of the previous century in modifying the sustained melodies, sometimes completely obscuring the melodic line. The violinist who was most successful in this art relied as much upon intuition as upon training in such matters. Examples do exist which provide reasonably accurate evidence of the extent to which this tradition was developed. Marc Pincherle cites the Amsterdam edition by Pierre Mortier and Estienne Roger of Corelli's Opus V with embellished adagios "as Corelli wished them to be played." An adagio movement of a Corelli sonata, with the traditional embellishments played by Geminiani, is to be found in Sir John Hawkins, A General History of the Science and Practice of Music. Also one should mention the Tartini ornamented sonata, Op. 1, No. 10, and Dubourg's ornaments for Corelli.

Two significant trends seem to account for the disappearance of the practice of extemporaneous embellishment

(1) We are aware of the critical remarks of the writers of the early eighteenth century, including Geminiani and Mozart, about the distortions and evidences of lack of taste in the art of ornamentation. Mozart remarks, "Those unmusicianly violinists who wish to befrill each note, can see here why a sensible composer is indignant when the notes set down by him

50Pincherle, Corelli, p. 110.
52Pincherle, Corelli, p. 117.
are not played as they are written."\textsuperscript{53} And again, "I know how it frightens one, when one hears the most melodious pieces distorted so pitifully by means of unnecessary ornamentation."\textsuperscript{54} Charles Avison (1752) says, "Let the solo violinist in a concerto avoid all extravagant Decorations, since every attempt of this kind must utterly destroy whatever Passion the composer may have designed to express."\textsuperscript{55}

(2) Composers such as Johann Sebastian Bach were accurately prescribing such ornaments as were desired until nothing was left to the imagination of the performer. Just as the eighteenth-century performer was expected to modify the printed page, it has been the practice of present-day performers to adhere scrupulously to the printed page following the exact intentions of the composer. Should a present-day violinist learn note for note an ornamented version of a Baroque composition for public performance? According to Thurston Dart, "The music will lack all spontaneity and brio that spring from true extemporization; the performer will be embarrassed; the editor will acquire a specious reputation for scholarliness; and the audience will be either deluded or amused."\textsuperscript{56}

\textsuperscript{53}Mozart, \textit{Treatise}, p. 180.

\textsuperscript{54}Ibid., p. 214.


\textsuperscript{56}Ibid., p. 65.
The technical device of crossing the strings with the bow, producing the tones of a chord in rapid succession is called arpeggio playing, also referred to in the early methods as "batterie" technic. In the music of the early eighteenth-century composers a chord written as a sustained three note chord was to be played in any number of variations which are included in the methods of the period, such as in the following:

Leopold Mozart shows a number of these variations which were employed by the performers of his century. The composer usually indicated the style he intended by writing out one measure, merely outlining the chords for the remainder of the passage. In extended passages such as the famous arpeggio passage from the Chaconne from the D minor Partita by Bach, the composer gives one measure to set the style and the performer was expected to change the style in succeeding variations according to his own taste. This explains the seeming discrepancies among the various editions of the Bach sonatas.

57Mozart, Treatise, p. 161.
CHAPTER III

PROBLEMS IN THE INTERPRETATION OF EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY EDITIONS AS DISCUSSED IN TREATISES OF THE TIME

Fingering and Bowing Problems

Eighteenth-century editions of Corelli, Tartini, Locatelli, Leclair, Bach, and others, provide no fingerings and very few bowing indications for the modern violinist. The violinist of that day was expected to supply such fingerings and bowings according to his training and experience. Following Leopold Mozart's three categories (necessity, convenience, and elegance), for the use of the positions,

---

Musical examples for this study will be chosen from the following editions:


F. M. Veracini, Sonate a violino e Basso, Opera Prima (Dresda: 1721) original manuscript.
the following passage from Corelli's Sonata Op. V, No. 1 in the first allegro, demonstrates the necessity of playing in third position from measure five through measure seven because there are notes lying above the "b" on the "E" string.

The following passage from the first movement of Bonporti's Invention No. 3 demonstrates the necessity for using the third position in measures seven and eight.

In the same movement, measure nine, it is necessary to remain in the third position throughout the measure.

The fifth position is used in playing the following passage from the Tartini Pastoral, at measure sixteen of the first movement, marked Grave.
In the Bach Sonata No. 2 in A minor a passage requiring the use of the third position is found in the next to the last measure.

In the Locatelli Sonata Op. VII, No. 1 the use of the third position with extension of the fourth finger is necessary in playing the following passage at measure five in the Allegro movement.

In the Bonporti Invention, the passage at measure thirty-eight of the Largo movement is one in which the use of the positions is necessary in order for the musician to
remain on one string for tonal consistency.

In the Corelli Sonata Op. V, No. 1, the first Adagio, at measure two of the following example, a desirable fingering would enable the performer to remain on the "A" string. There would then be a consistent tone throughout the phrase:

Or in the Tartini Sonata Op. I, No. 10, the first movement, for the opening phrase the performer should remain on the "A" string until measure two:

From the same Sonata, the last movement, it is convenient to remain in the third position:
In double-stopping, when two tones normally occur on the same string, a fingering must be found which makes it possible for the two tones to be played simultaneously. This example is from the Corelli Sonata Op. V, No. 1.

A passage from the Tartini Sonata Op. I, No. 10, involves a similar fingering problem:

In the last two measures of the Andante of Locatelli's Sonata Op. VI, No. 4, the fingering must be in positions in order that the two tones can be played simultaneously.
It is necessary to use the third position in order to play the three-note chord at measure ten of the Bonporti Invention No. 2 in the first movement.

The extensive use of the higher positions is not encountered until the works of the composers following Corelli and Tartini. It is only in the Capriccio of Sonata Op. VI, No. 12, that Locatelli demands the eighth position, as in the following passage:

In Leclair's Sonata Op. IV, No. 4, Allegro, seventh position is called for:
In his Op. I, No. 1, in an Allegro movement, Veracini would require the use of the seventh position for the accompanying example:

The passage of sixteenth notes from the Tartini Sonata Op. I, No. 2, in measures seventeen through twenty, indicates a style of bowing which would add vigor to the phrase.

In the Locatelli Sonata Op. VI, No. 1, the following passage of rapid notes in the Allegro movement is interesting partly because of the variety in bowing indicated.
The passages of continuous sixteenth notes or eighth notes described by Geminiani and Mozart can be illustrated in the following manner (Corelli Sonata Op. V, No.2, third movement):

The following passage illustrates that type of clearly articulated tone described by Tartini in his letter to Signora Lombardini (Corelli Sonata Op. V, No. 5, second movement):

In the Sonata Op. V, No. 5, second movement, are Corelli's own bowing indications:
Several bowing styles occur in the Corrente from the Sonata Op. I, No. 5, by Veracini in the original manuscript:

Mozart explains that the first note of a measure should be down-bow even if it necessitates two down-bows in a row. Such an example can be found in the Corelli Sonata Op. V, No. 12 (La Folia); Var. 4:

or from Tartini, Pastorale (Op. I), the following passage:
In the following passage from Bonporti Invention No. 2, the opening four measures of the Aria, two successive down-bows bring the accent of measure three on a down-bow:

\[ \text{Music notation image} \]

In the passage from the Locatelli Sonata Op. VII, No. 4, the first four measures of the Menuetto would be played in the same manner:

\[ \text{Music notation image} \]

In the following passage from the Bonporti Invention No. 4, Scherzo movement, first four measures, a lifted bow on the eighth notes would give a vigorous character to the phrase:

\[ \text{Music notation image} \]
In a rhythmic passage in triple meter the accent can be maintained by regulating the bowing so that each measure begins with a down-bow. Such a passage occurs in the final allegro movement of the Corelli Sonata Op. V, No. 1:

\[ \text{music notation} \]

In an adagio passage the alternation of up and down strokes will be taken as they occur, and the rhythmic advantage of a down-bow will be disregarded. From the same work here is a passage in the Adagio movement:

\[ \text{music notation} \]

Since the method books of Geminiani and Mozart discuss the lifted bow, some examples will be cited in which such an interpretation seems to be implied - Corelli, La Folia, Var. 13:

\[ \text{music notation} \]
In the final Allegro of Tartini Sonata Op. I, No. 10, a type of lifted bow would seem appropriate:

![Musical notation image]

The above type of phrasing could be accomplished also by using the upper half of the bow with a semi-detached stroke.

A similar style of lifted bow is obviously suggested in this passage from the Locatelli Sonata Op. VI, No. 12:

![Musical notation image]

As stated earlier in this document, the use of dots and "strokes" to indicate lifted bow seemed to be a matter for the printer. No such marks occur in the I. Walsh Edition, (174?), of Corelli Sonatas, Op. V. In the Amsterdam edition of Tartini Sonatas, Op. I, the following occurs in Sonata No. 2, last movement, Allegro Assai:

![Musical notation image]
and again in Sonata No. 12. This would very likely be a lifted bow in Allegro:

The Paris edition of Locatelli Op. 6 uses dots under slurs. Two examples will show different interpretation of the same signs. (1) Sonata No. 1, first movement, would seem to indicate the pressure separation described in Mozart:

(2) From the second movement of the same work, such passages would indicate a lifted stroke.
In the Aria from the Sonata Op. I, No. 12, of Veracini the bowing marks in the following passage would be interpreted as the pressure separation:

In the English edition of the VI Sonatas for 2 violins and bass by Martini, short notes are marked with strokes. The character of the following phrase would not indicate a voluntary lifting of the bow (Sonata Op.I, No. 1, Allegro):

In the same Sonata, however, this passage clearly calls for a lifted stroke:

In the Leclair Sonata Op. I, No. 3, the use of lifted bow is indicated in this passage with dots:
Problems of Ornamentation

The eighteenth-century methods were very clear on the interpretation of trills. Almost invariably the trill is finished with an afterbeat. There are three rules for the beginning tone.

(1) When the note preceding the trill is identical with the principal note of the trill, the trill must begin with the upper note. In the Amsterdam edition of Tartini's Sonatas trills are indicated with the sign "tr":

In the Paris edition of Locatelli's Sonatas, the trill is indicated with the sign (+). In the Sonata Op. VI, No. 5, the following passage occurs in the first movement, Andante:
In the Sonata No. 1, in G minor of the unaccompanied Sonatas of Bach, one finds in measure two of the Adagio:

A trill begun on the same note as the preceding one is shown in the following example from the Bonporti Invention No. 1, in the Scherzo movement (Andante), measure one:

The following passage occurs in the Adagio from Bach’s Sonata in G minor:

(2) When the note preceding the trill is a second higher than the principal note of the trill, the trill must begin on the principal note or on the lower note. The Tartini Sonata, Op. I, No. 8, the first movement at measure
seven, contains the following:

The following illustration, taken from the Bonporti Invention No. 4, third measure of the Largo movement, shows the trill approached from above, beginning on the principal note:

(3) If the note preceding the principal note of the trill is a second lower, the principal note of the trill or the note above it must be taken into account. In the Adagio of the Bach Sonata in A minor, measure four, one finds:

The opening movement of the Sonata No. 12, of Tartini concludes:
A passage from the Adagio of Leclair's Sonata No. 1, would seem to indicate the trill (+) without afterbeat:

In the Bonporti Invention No. 3 is another example of the trill approached from the note below, occurring in the first movement:

The following example, the concluding measure of Variation I in the first movement, taken from the Locatelli Sonata, Op. VI, No. 10, shows a trill approached from the note below:
The problem of the interpretation of the appoggiatura revolves around two alternatives: (1) Should it be played long or short or (2) should it be subtracted from the main note? The long appoggiatura occurs in the following passage from the Sonata No. 1, of Locatelli, the third movement, measure three:

In Veracini's Sonata No. 1, the appoggiatura is indicated in the following manner (Menuet, fourth movement):
The following is a clearly written-out appoggiatura in Bach's Sonata No. 1, in G minor, two measures from the end:

![Appoggiatura Example](image)

The problem of the appoggiatura on a dotted note would have been interpreted in the following manner. This example is found in the Adagio of Leclair's Sonata No. 1, at measure twenty-one:

![Appoggiatura Example](image)

Mozart explains that an appoggiatura before a dotted note is given two thirds of the value of the note. The following illustration from the Locatelli Sonata, Op.VI, No. 2, the opening Andante at measure eleven, would be interpreted in this manner:
The appoggiatura which assumes half of the main note and one which assumes two thirds of the main note occur in the following passage from the Sonata Op. I, No. 6, by Martini in the Presto movement, measures nine through eleven after the double bar (First Violin part):

In the Locatelli Sonata, Op. VI, No. 5, the first measure of the Aria (Vivace), the appoggiatura would be interpreted as short, bringing the emphasis on the main note:

Tartini's Sonata Op. I, No. 10, first movement, illustrates the appoggiatura on a dotted note tied to the next beat:
The opening measure of the Presto movement of the same sonata is an example of the use of the mordent. The marking is "(tr)" which at this tempo would be understood to mean an inverted mordent:

Another inverted mordent is found in the same movement:

A double mordent would be used in the opening bars of the Gavotte from the E major Partita of Bach:

A few passages from Bach, Corelli, and Leclair will serve to demonstrate some of the devices used in the ornamentation of slow movements. In the opening measure of the Sonata
No. 1 in G minor of Bach, the interval of an octave is encompassed by a scale passage called a tirata. On the third beat is a written appoggiatura, and on the fourth beat another tirata. In measure two a turn followed by a trill with an afterbeat brings the phrase to a close:

In the Chaconne from the Partita No. 2 in D minor, the original manuscript indicates the famous arpeggio passage in the following manner - the performer is at liberty to change the style every eight measures:

In Veracini's manuscript no indication of style is given, but one finds merely the term "arpeggio battuto." The example is from the Sonata Op. I, No. 7, Allegro.
The opening of the third Sonata of Corelli is written without embellishment. In the embellished version published in Amsterdam, the following ornaments occur:\(^2\)

In the Leclair Sonata Op. I, No. 3, the written-out embellishments include a turn, followed by a downward leap; then the succeeding interval is filled in with a tirata, and followed by an appoggiatura:

---

\(^2\)Pincherle, Corelli, p. 112.
Problems in the Realization of the Figured Bass

The performance today of Late Baroque violin music entails problems relating not only to style and technic of violin playing, but also to the appropriate manner of realizing the accompaniment from the figured bass (basso continuo). This practice in the eighteenth century was in reality an integral part of the tradition of extemporization known since the sixteenth century. ³

The vast literature of Late Baroque violin music consists of compositions for one, two, three, or more instruments and figured bass. (Basso continuo and thorough-bass are synonymous terms.) This, in effect, was a system of shorthand to indicate the intention of the composers, who never wrote out accompaniments for these instrumental solos. That this practice was universally known throughout the eighteenth century is manifested in the number of treatises on the art of thorough-bass. The authors of such works include Geminiani, C.P.E. Bach, Quantz, and others.

Geminiani treats this subject in his Op. 11, The Art of Accompaniment on the Harpsichord (1755). In this treatise he gives examples of the freedom and variety with which simple basses may be treated. The Essay on the True Method of Playing on the Clavier (1762), by C.P.E. Bach, is an invaluable authority for the problems of accompaniment. Quantz deals

with the duties of an accompanist on the clavier in his "Versuch," and, according to G.M. Telemann, this work "deserves to be learned by heart by every budding accompanist." 4

The practical application, rather than the purely technical aspects, of the principles of realizing a thorough-bass accompaniment will be dealt with here.

Instruments in general use by the mid-eighteenth century for providing accompaniments, were the organ, harpsichord, pianoforte, and clavichord (all keyboard instruments). 5 In addition the continuo instrument was the violoncello or the viola da gamba. To quote C.P.E. Bach, "No piece, therefore, can be performed satisfactorily without the accompaniment of a keyed instrument." 6 Pieces for two violins and bass were always performed with cello (or gamba) and harpsichord in addition to the solo instruments. Often the cello, instead of duplicating the bass line of the keyboard instrument, played a more or less ornate variation.

In general, one expected to hear a sonata for violin and thorough-bass performed by three instruments, and a sonata for two violins and thorough-bass performed by four instruments. 7 F.T. Arnold calls attention to a Leclair Sonata, for

---

6 Ibid.
7 Apel, "Thorough-bass".
which an ornate part was provided for a cello in addition to the basso continuo:

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{\textbf{\textit{Example 1}}} \\
\text{} \\
\text{} \\
\end{array}
\]

The basso continuo in the Capriccio of Veracini's Sonata Op. I, No. 12, has an arpeggiated figure which obviously indicates the use of a cello (or gamba):

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{\textbf{\textit{Example 2}}} \\
\text{} \\
\text{} \\
\end{array}
\]

Early examples of accompaniment show the parts divided between the hands, but by the beginning of the eighteenth century, the practice of playing the bass in the left hand and adding the harmony in the right hand was quite common. It was customary to change at will from three to four parts or vice versa.⁹


The accompanist might use some imitative passages especially if the principal part were stationary or silent. Ornamental devices such as passing tones might be employed in the bass line to promote a certain continuity in the harmony. Sometimes the harmonies might be broken up into arpeggios.

Among the various devices deemed acceptable by the writers of the eighteenth-century methods is the use of unison and doubling the bass in octaves. The term "unison" (all'unisono) refers to playing with both hands in octaves, whereas one plays the left hand alone when the passage is marked *tasto solo*. Such a passage occurs in the Corelli Sonata No. 1 in D, measure three, Allegro:

![Musical notation](image)

C.P.E. Bach can be cited as evidence for the performance of eighteenth-century violin music with pianoforte accompaniment. He states that "the pianoforte and the clavichord give the best support to a performance in which the greatest refinements of taste occur. Only certain singers like to be accompanied on the clavichord or harpsichord rather than the instrument first named."¹⁰

The comparison of a passage from an early eighteenth-century edition with a "realized" accompaniment from the figured bass will graphically show the difference between what the composer wrote and what was performed. The following example is from the Corelli Sonata No. 1. in D, Allegro, measures five through seven:
CHAPTER IV

NINETEENTH-CENTURY TRANSCRIPTIONS OF EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY VIOLIN MUSIC

Available Transcriptions and Editions

The original editions provide a figured bass accompaniment, which poses a problem for the modern violinist. He must have sufficient knowledge to realize a figured bass or he must resort to the use of a reliable transcription. Two nineteenth-century violinists have made a very significant contribution in this field — namely, Delphin Alard and Ferdinand David.

Delphin Alard (1815-1888), eminent violinist of his day, represented the epitome of the French school of violin playing. As a teacher at the Paris Conservatoire he had considerable influence upon violinists of his time. In his Les Maîtres Classiques du Violon, he has edited a collection of the works of many eighteenth-century masters.1 Ferdinand David (1815-1873), teaching at Leipzig Conservatory, influenced many violinists through his editions of the classical repertory, for which he supplied both accompaniments and various expressive markings. His Hohe Schule des Violinspiels is credited with bringing about a revival of the works of eighteenth-century masters of the Italian, French, and German schools.2 Until the works of these two men appeared in the nineteenth century,

1 Paul David, "Delphin Alard," Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, I.

2 J. A. Fuller-Maitland, "Ferdinand David," Ibid., II.
the compositions of these eighteenth-century composers were
highly neglected and had "almost vanished from human memory." 3
Alfred Moffat (1866-1950) was another late-nineteenth-century
figure who made a significant contribution to this body of
eighteenth-century literature with his Meisterschule dir alten
Zeit Kammersonaten. The obvious discrepancy between Alard's
and David's embellishments, in comparison with the original
intentions of the composer, brings up the whole question of
the desirability of transcriptions and new editions. Certain-
ly, since the art of realizing an accompaniment from a fig-
ured bass is no longer practiced, a transcription becomes
a necessity. One must take into consideration that the tech-
nic and taste of the present-day performer no longer permits
acceptance of some of the technical markings, such as bowings
and fingerings, found in the original editions. The bowings
were intended for the bow in use in the early eighteenth cen-
tury and the fingerings were possible only on the violin with
the original short neck and given the eighteenth-century man-
ner of holding the violin. New editions, then, are not only
welcomed by the modern performer but have become a necessity.
However, it need hardly be stated that faithfulness to the
original in regard to the composer's intentions is an impor-
tant criterion of the worth of the edition. Further resources
include the transcriptions of "Old Masters" by Sam Franko,

3Flesch, The Art, p. 118.
whose concerts of "Music of the Masters in New York (1900-1909) introduced many seventeenth- and eighteenth-century works for the first time in America. In more recent times Fritz Kreisler, Efrem Zimbalist, Albert Spalding, and Joseph Szigeti have provided the repertoire with editions and transcriptions of eighteenth-century compositions which possess a high degree of artistic merit.

Comparisons of Nineteenth-Century Transcriptions
With Early Editions

Moffat's transcription of the Locatelli Sonata Op. VI, No. 1, follows the Paris edition (1750) very faithfully. In the violin part he writes out the appoggiatura in the following manner:

\[ \text{Staff notation image} \]

He also substitutes "tr" for "+". In the third variation of the last movement the violin part is transposed an octave higher than in the early manuscript. Even though this is technically in the range of the ninth position and could have been played by eighteenth-century violinists, it seems to take unwarranted liberty with eighteenth-century style. The second movement (measure seven) of the early manuscript clearly shows the diatonic whole step in the lower note of the
turn. Moffat changes this to the chromatic half step, which is definitely nineteenth-century style. The final measure of the last variation is transcribed as a four-note chord in place of the double stop of the earlier edition:

The realization of the figured bass, as transcribed by Moffat, follows the original figuring faithfully. The contrapuntal treatment of the right-hand part seems to be in characteristic eighteenth-century keyboard style. Occasionally, the octave doubling in the bass would produce a heaviness somewhat out of character.

The David transcription of the Tartini Sonata No. VI, Op. 1, in the Hohe Schule, compared to the 1734 Amsterdam edition, is faithful to the earlier edition except in a few minor details. In the first movement, four measures from the end, David adds a tirata which would be an entirely acceptable eighteenth-century device but somewhat out of character in this particular situation:
A mezzo-circulo, somewhat expanded, might be closer to the prevailing style:

\[ \text{\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{mezzo-circulo.png}} \]

A transcription by Dessoff (G. Schirmer) of the Corelli Sonata Op. V, No. 1 in D, follows very faithfully the early edition. No ornamentation is added to the Adagio movements, leaving the performer free to add his own. There are, however, several discrepancies such as:

\[ \text{\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{transcribed.png}} \]

Sir John Hawkins gives us an excellent example of Geminiani’s ornaments for the Corelli Sonata, Op. V, No. 9:

\[ \text{\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{hawkins.png}} \]

Another transcriber of the Corelli Sonata No. 1, Gustav Jensen, follows this same florid style. He includes many contemporary devices which can be identified:

1. tirata (measure two, Grave):

2. double mordent plus mezzo-circulo (same measure):

3. turn plus anschlag, followed by a trill with after-beat (measure four of the first Adagio):

In the same Sonata, the conclusion of the Allegro movement, traditionally the polyphonic movement, illustrates two contemporary practices: (1) the arpeggiated chord playing and (2) the use of the cadenza.
(1) Measure 31:

![Musical notation image]

(2) Corelli's notation (I. Walsh edition, 174?):

![Musical notation image]

In the Dessoff transcription (G. Schirmer), a cadenza by Joseph Hellmesberger is inserted at this point. For the most part it can be considered to be in eighteenth-century style but might warrant the famous remark of Handel, "Welcome home, Mr. Dubourg." ⁴

David based his transcription of a Locatelli Sonata da Camera on a manuscript in the possession of the King of Saxony. In his edition he includes a movement from an earlier Sonata which appears in the 1750 Paris edition of Locatelli's Op. VI. This was, of course, a practice which could be justified by tradition. Composers in the preface to their

⁴Pincherle, Corelli, p. 117.
works often recommended that the performer could combine several movements from various sonatas. Veracini prefaces his "Sonate academiche" (1744) with the following "Intentione dell'Autore":

Each of these twelve sonatas comprises four or five movements: may you be informed that it is for the richness and ornamentation of the collection, and in order to give more joy to music lovers and dilettantes. However, two or three movements from each sonata, selected according to your pleasure, will be sufficient to compose a sonata of proper dimensions.

Leopold Auer's edition (Carl Fischer) of Tartini's Sonata No. X in G minor includes as the third movement a free transcription of the first movement of the Sonata No. V, transposed from E minor to G minor. Some liberties are taken with the original harmonization. In measure eleven, a C7 chord is substituted for a Bb going to an F chord:

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{measure seventeen, F7 going to Bb instead of C7 going to C:}
\end{array}
\]
two measures after the double bar has been transposed an octave lower than the earlier edition:
CHAPTER V

SOME TWENTIETH-CENTURY ATTEMPTS AT SOLVING
THE PROBLEM OF THE BACH BOW

Spearheaded by Dr. Albert Schweitzer's interest in the Bach bow, a number of attempts to investigate the interpretation of early eighteenth-century music and to construct a bow capable of playing "polyphonically" on the violin have been made. Several of these attempts will be reviewed.

Well known are the experiments which resulted in the Vega bow, the Bach bow of Ralph Schroeder, and the John Bolander bow used by Roman Totenberg. The Vega bow, which was developed by a Danish violin maker, Knud Vestergaard, in collaboration with Emil Telmanyi, has the special characteristics of (1) producing a strong tone in monophonic passages, (2) being capable of sustaining three- and four-note chords, and (3) possessing a patented device for tightening and loosening the hairs by merely pressing a button on the frog. This bow has a very high arch (convex), which makes it quite possible to play sustained four-note chords, since the relaxed hairs are capable of touching the four strings simultaneously.

Some weaknesses in Dr. Telmanyi's arguments for the use

---


of the Vega bow have been noted by Sol Babitz.\(^3\) Can it be that it was not possible to play the unaccompanied solos of Bach with the contemporary eighteenth-century bow? Dr. Babitz expresses the opinion that he can find no supporting historical evidence that eighteenth-century performers ever played sustained four-note chords, furthermore, that there is substantial evidence that chords were arpeggiated, and, finally, that eighteenth-century bows used on eighteenth-century violins cannot produce sustained chords.\(^4\) Johann Joachim Quantz, Francesco Geminiani, and Leopold Mozart all give ample evidence for the playing of arpeggiated chords. Dr. Telmanyi cites several examples of chords which cannot be played as written if they are to be sustained. If all four tones are to be held, the fingered combinations are impossible. He even suggests using the left thumb. But, according to the Baroque tradition of arpeggiating chords, they would be entirely possible. Historically speaking, then, there is little evidence to justify the need for the development of such a bow as the Vega bow.

Another attempt at producing a bow for playing polyphonic music, made by Ralph Schroeder, concertmaster of the orchestra in Cassel, is discussed by Albert Schweitzer in the *Musical Times*.\(^5\) This bow is arched extremely high and the


tension of the hair is also controlled by a lever at the frog end of the bow and operated by the performer while playing. In this way, by a slight pressure of the thumb, the hair is taut for playing single-note passages and relaxed for polyphonic passages. Dr. Schweitzer claims that at last with this bow, Bach's music may be played as it was written. Then, immediately, he points out that there are problems in fingering which make it impossible to play certain chords as written. He suggests that some alterations and even omissions are desirable in such cases. Schroeder has recorded the Bach unaccompanied sonatas with the use of this bow. Again, there is no historical evidence with which to evaluate this as an eighteenth-century tonal ideal.

Roman Totenberg, violinist, has presented many performances of early music, using a Baroque-type bow developed by John Bolander. This bow, too, is based on the principle of the convex arch, but no attempt was made to allow for varying the tension while performing polyphonic or single-note passages. The assumption, according to Mr. Totenberg, that eighteenth-century violinists played chords with a relaxed hair, and pressed the hair with the thumb when playing single notes, must be false. For, as he says, "Due to the amount of pressure needed for balance, the law of physics

---

6Columbia Masterworks, Recorded in 1952, Parish Church, Gunsbach, Alsace.

would indicate the opposite." It is Mr. Totenberg's conviction that the experiments with a "Bach bow" for playing polyphonic music is a one-sided solution. The Bolander bow is capable of striking several strings simultaneously, playing extremely soft chordal effects, and producing a smooth legato and a light half-bounce. But most important, according to Mr. Totenberg, is its ability to make possible the proper accentuation in musical phrasing. It would seem that the solution to an authentic performance of Bach's unaccompanied violin music lay not in the development of a twentieth-century brain child but in letting the eighteenth-century violin and bow speak through the contemporary practices as seen in the methods of the time.
CHAPTER VI

CONCLUSION

The Music of the Eighteenth-Century Composers

for Teaching Purposes

An artist and teacher of our time has said, "The inexhaustible literature of the golden age in Italy, when Corelli, Vivaldi, Geminiani, Tartini, and many others were writing for the violin forms a keystone for the players repertoire."¹ This vast literature of eighteenth-century composers can provide a wealth of material for developing a basic technic well within the grasp of young students and a much needed discipline in style. The fact that this music demands a purity of tone production and intonation as well as an incisive rhythmic precision makes it an indispensable part of the young violinist's training. One could hope that more young people today could have the benefit of this kind of training. It might be well here to summarize the points of style emphasized by the eighteenth-century writers which are definitely applicable to performance today. The two main subjects obviously in need of clarification are bowing styles and ornamentation.

Bowing Styles

(1) Generally, in fast movements, quarter notes should be played detached and sixteenth notes should be played, as Geminiani states, "without lifting the bow." (2) A continuous passage of sixteenth notes should be varied by different combinations of bowings. (3) A clear accented type of tone is desirable, never heavy nor lacking in energy. (4) A lifted bow at the frog is clearly expounded in the early methods and therefore can be employed as an acceptable style in interpretation. (5) If the rule of down-bow (recommended by Leopold Mozart) is generally followed in fast passages, a rhythmic clarity will likely be the result. (6) A continuous vibrato used with restraint (recommended by Geminiani) is quite acceptable.

Ornamentation

From the discussion in the earlier section of this paper, a student of Baroque music should bear in mind these basic principles of ornamentation: (1) when trills should be followed by an afterbeat and when not, (2) the duration of appoggiaturas and how to distinguish between long and short, anticipated or subtracted from the main note, (3) the use of the mordent: always subtracted from the main note, and finally, (4) the ornamented slow movement. Use the various ornaments in moderation and good taste.
To produce an "authentic" performance of early eighteenth-century music involves more than an understanding of technical problems and stylistic characteristics. The understanding of these main points of style, and tonal ideals, the knowledge of phrasing and special ornaments, and the observance of tempos constitute a large part of what is considered the spirit of the eighteenth century. But in addition the "authentic" performance should take into consideration the problems of old instruments, pitch, acoustical properties, and, not least, the audience reaction. Therefore does a so-called "authentic" eighteenth-century performance have a valid place in the concert hall today? The sound of Baroque instruments from the standpoint of tone quality and the effect of some form of mean tone tuning would be very strange to the ears of modern audiences. Investigations in this field will likely remain with the specialist in a laboratory situation. But, the violin student of today can use the violin and bow as we know it today to express the spirit of the eighteenth-century style, and this group of magnificent works will remain a fresh, vital part of his repertoire.

A list of available transcriptions and editions of violin music of early eighteenth-century composers is included in the Appendix. This is not intended to be a complete listing, but is offered as a suggested list for study and performance. Publishers included are: G. Schirmer (GS), Associated Music Publishers (AMP), Carl Fischer (CF), Peters
(P), and International Music Co. (IMP). When so indicated in the catalogues, the editor has been included. Catalogues are up to date as of 1957.
BIBLIOGRAPHY
BIBLIOGRAPHY


---


---


Dolmetsch, Arnold. The Interpretation of the Music of the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries Revealed by Contemporary Evidence. London: Novello and Co., Ltd.


**Trattato di Musica secondo la Vera Scienza dell'Armonia.** Padua: 1754.


**Early Editions of Music**


A LIST OF LATE BAROQUE COMPOSITIONS OF THE EARLY EIGHTEENTH CENTURY WHICH ARE AVAILABLE IN PRESENT-DAY EDITIONS

Albinoni, Tommaso (1671-1750)
- Sonata in a (Schaffler) AMP
- 2 Sonatas da Camera AMP

Bach, Carl Phillip Emanuel (1714-1788)
- Sonata in D (Klengel) AMP
- Sonata in C (Klengel) AMP

Bach, Johann Christian (1735-1782)
- 5 Sonatas (Landschoff) P
  - Sonata in A Op. 10, No. 4 AMP
  - E AMP
  - F AMP
  - Op. 16, Nos. 1, 2, 4 AMP

Bach, Johann Sebastian (1685-1750)
- 6 Sonatas for unaccompained Violin (Herrmann) GS
  - (Flesch plus unedited Bach text) P
  - (Joachim plus original text) IMC
  - (Rose, Busch, Joachim-Moser) AMP
  - (Leopold Auer) CF
- 6 Sonatas for Violin and Piano (Kortschak-Hughes) GS AMP
  - (David) IMC
  - (David) P
- Concerto No. 1 in a P
  - No. 2 in E P
  - No. 5 in g (Szijegi with the original Bach text) Reconstructed version of the piano Concerto in f. P
  - No 1. in a AMP
  - No. 2 in D AMP
  - No. 3 in D (one movement only) AMP
    - in g (Abbado) AMP
    - in E (Herrmann) GS
    - in g (Nacehez) GS
    - in a (Herrmann) GS
    - in E (Spiering) CF
    - in a (Spiering) CF

Biber, Heinrich (1644-1704)
- 15 Mysteries on Biblical Engravings (Reitz) AMP
- Sonata in c (David-Petri) AMP
Corelli, Arcangelo (1653-1713)
La Folia (Leonard-Lichtenberg) GS
   (David-Auer), (A. Spalding), (Leonard with pre-
   face by Musin), (Leonard-Thibaud) CF
   (Leonard-Jacobson) P
   (David-Petri), (Leonard-Marteau) AMP
12 Sonatas Op. V AMP
   (Jensen) IMC
Sonata in A Op. V, No. 6 (A. Spalding) CF
   in D (Dessoff-Franko) GS
   in d (Moffat) AMP

Handel, George Frederick (1685-1759)
6 Sonatas (Betti) GS
   (Urtext), (Davisson-Ramin) P
   (Doflein) AMP
   (L. Auer) CF

Leclair, Jean Marie (1697-1764)
Sonata in G AMP
   in D (Moffat) AMP
   No. 3 in D (Lichtenberg) GS
   in b (A. Reyes) CF
12 Sonatas Op. 3 AMP
Sonata "Le Tombeau" (David) IMC

Locatelli, Pietro (1695-1764)
Sonata in F (Zellner-Powell) GS AMP

Loelillet, Jean Baptiste (1680-1730)
Sonata in D (Moffat-Mlynarczyk) AMP

Martini, Giovanni Battista (Padre) (1706-1784)
Sonata in D (Endicott-Spalding) CF
   in E (""") CF

Nardini, Pietro (1722-1793)
Sonata in D (David-Schradeck) GS
   in D (David-Spiering) CF
   in D (Flesch) P
Concerto in A (Nachez) AMP
   in E (Pente) AMP
   in e (Hauser) CF
   in e (David-Franko) GS

Pergolesi, Giovanni Battista (1710-1736)
Sonata No. 12 in E IMC
Concertino in B (Dushkin) AMP
Senailles, Jean Baptiste (1687-1730)
Sonata in G (Moffat) AMP

Tartini, Giuseppe (1692-1770)
Sonatas Nos. 2, 4, 5, 6, 10 P
in C P
in G (L. Auer) CF
in e (Lichtenberg) GS
in G (" " ) GS
The Devil's Trill (L. Auer) CF
in GS
(Kreisler) P
Concerto in E (Scherchen) P
in d, G (Pente) AMP
in a (M. Corti) CF
in d (Szigeti) CF

Torelli, Giuseppe (1658-1709)
Concerto in e Op. 8, No. 9 P

Veracini, Francesco Maria (1690-1750)
Sonata in e (David) IMC
in d (Moffat-Winn) CF
in e P

Vitali, Tomasso (1665-?)
Ciaconna in g (David-Petri) CF
(Charlier-David-Auer) CF
(David-Schradeck) GS
(Charlier) AMP

Vivaldi, Antonio (1675-1741)
Sonata in g Op. 13a No. 6 (Fussan) AMP
in A, C, F, G AMP
Op. 2, 12 Sonatas (Hillman) AMP
Op. 3, Nos. 3, 6, 10 (Hillman), No. 1 (Moffat) AMP
Op. 5, Nos. 13, 14, 16, 17 AMP
No. 6 (Faithful Shepherd) P
in A (David) IMC
in g (Moffat) IMC
Concerto in A (Nachez) AMP
in a Op. 3, No. 6 (Nachez) AMP
in a Op. 3, No. 6 (Perlman) CF
in a Op. 3, No. 6 P
in a (Authentic Edition-Glammian) IMC
in A (David) IMC
in Bb (Nachez) AMP
in c Op. 9 (Cassella) AMP
in c (Moffat) AMP
in D Op. 3, No. 9 (Dandelot) AMP
in d (Nachez) AMP
### Vivaldi (cont'd.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Piece</th>
<th>Collection</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Concerto in G (Dandelin) AMP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concerto in G (Moffat) IMC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in E Op. 12 P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in G (Franco) P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in G (Nachez) AMP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in G (Lenzewski) AMP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in G (Nachez) AMP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Collections

- Old Fiddle Pieces (Moffat) AMP
- Old Masters for Young Players (Moffat) AMP
- Sonatas by Old Masters (Karl Geiringer) AMP
- Charming Airs and Old Dance Forms (E. L. Winn) CF

### Trio Sonatas

#### Albinoni, Tommaso (1671-1750)
- **Trio Sonata in A** Op. 1, Nos. 3, 6 AMP
- **Sonata da Chiesa a 3 in G** Op. 8, No. 4a AMP
  - in B♭ Op. 8, No. 4b AMP

#### Bach, Carl Philipp Emanuel (1714-1788)
- **Sonata in B♭** (Schumann) AMP
- **Trio in F** (Brandts-Buys) AMP
  - in G (Riemann), (Hinze-Reinhold) AMP
  - in D No. 2 P
  - in G No. 3 P
  - in b♭ P
  - in E P

#### Bach, Johann Sebastian (1685-1750)
- **Trio Sonatas (Urtexic) P** including the Musical Offering
- **Trio Sonata in C** AMP
  - in D AMP
  - in G AMP (Geehl-Lebell)
  - **Trio from the Musical Offering (Seiffert)** AMP

#### Bach, Wilhelm Friedemann (1710-1784)
- **Sonata in F** (Urtexic) P
  - in F P
  - in D, B♭, A AMP

#### Handel, George Frederick (1685-1759)
- **Trio Sonatas (Urtexic) Op. 5 in 3 vols.** P

#### Locatelli, Pietro (1695-1764)
- **Trio Sonata in D** AMP
Pergolesi, Giovanni Battista (1710-1736)
  Trio Sonatas in d, No. 11, Nos. 5, 10 AMP
  2 Trio Sonatas in G and Bb P

Purcell, Henry (1659-1695)
  5 Sonatas of 3 Parts AMP
  The Golden Sonata

Tartini, Giuseppe (1692-1770)
  Sonata a 3 in D Op. 6, No. 6 AMP

Vivaldi, Antonio (1675-1741)
  Sonata a 3 in g AMP
  Trio Sonata in d AMP
  Sonata Op. 5, Nos. 5, 6 AMP
  Trio Sonata in e AMP

Concerti Grossi

Albinoni, Tommaso
  Concerto a cinque Op. 5, No. 5; Op. 7, No. 5; Op. 9,
  No. 2 P

Bach, J.S.
  Brandenburg (Urtext) P

Corelli, Arcangelo
  Op. 6 (Urtext) P

Geminiani, Francesco
  Op. 3 P

Handel, George Frederick
  Op. 6 (Urtext) P

Telemann, Georg Philipp, (1681-1767)
  Concerti in Bb, f, E, P

Vivaldi, Antonio
  Op. 3, Nos. 2, 8, 10, 11 P