1951

An analysis of the relevance of illustrations to text in five basal reading series for grade four.

Brandt, Beverly Marie
Boston University

http://hdl.handle.net/2144/9437
Boston University
BOSTON UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION

THESIS

AN ANALYSIS OF THE RELEVANCE OF ILLUSTRATIONS TO TEXT IN FIVE BASAL READING SERIES FOR GRADE FOUR

Submitted by
Beverly Marie Brandt
(B. S. in Ed., The Teachers College of the City of Boston)
(1947)

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Education

1951
First Reader: Helen A. Murphy, Professor of Education
Second Reader: Donald D. Durrell, Professor of Education
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I PLAN OF STUDY</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II ANALYSIS OF DATA</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF TABLES

Table                                                                 Page
I Fourth Readers Used in the Study........................................ 14
Ginn Basic Readers
II Roads to Everywhere - Fourth Reader................................. 15
III Total Inaccuracies Occurring in the Ginn Basic Readers........... 16
Laidlaw Basic Readers
IV On the Trail of Adventure - Fourth Reader.......................... 17
V Total Inaccuracies Occurring in the Laidlaw Basic Readers......... 18
Today's Work-Play Books
VI Let's Look Around - Fourth Reader...................................... 19
VII Total Inaccuracies Occurring in Today's Work-Play Books........ 20
Reading Foundation Series
VIII Singing Wheels - Fourth Reader........................................ 21
IX Total Inaccuracies Occurring in the Reading Foundation Series... 22
Curriculum Foundation Series
X Times and Places - Fourth Reader........................................ 23
XI Total Inaccuracies Occurring in the Curriculum Foundation Series 24
XII Summary of Illustrations and Inaccuracies in the Five Basal Series Examined in the Study........... 25
INTRODUCTION
INTRODUCTION

A previous study by Peck\(^1\) of five basal reading series on a grade one level disclosed that of the 2,181 illustrations accompanied by text material, 796 illustrations did not accurately or completely reflect the text material.

It is the purpose of this study to analyze the illustrations of the same five basal reading series on a fourth grade level for inaccuracies.

On the subject of illustrations included in books as the grade level increases, Cunningham\(^2\) writes:

> As we scan children's literature in general, we see a diminishing amount of illustrative material as we ascend along the grade levels. This, in itself, helps to prove the point that the informational factor as supplied by pictures is needed less and less with the maturing child. Shall we say the older child understands 'word pictures' as his powers of manipulating language increase. This transition is gradual, to be sure, as the reading material increases in inverse proportion to the illustrated material.

> As the grade level increases, illustrations should be used mainly as a means of increasing understanding. They would be necessary only to help the child supplement what words fail to make clear. Because fewer illustrations are included in the basal series of the upper grades, it is of the utmost importance

---


\(^2\)E. Cunningham. "Informational Aspects of Illustrations in Children's Books." \textit{Childhood Education} 9: 519-22; March 1933.
that those illustrations included be pertinent to the text to justify their presence in the book.

This study is an attempt to make an unbiased, critical analysis of the five basal reading series for grade four to determine to what degree this accuracy and relevance exists in the books examined.

This is one part of a group study.
CHAPTER I

PLAN OF STUDY
CHAPTER I

PLAN OF STUDY

The purpose of this study was to analyze illustrations in five basal reading series for grade four.

William A. Miller\(^1\) writes on the subject of the selection of illustrations: "One of the reasons pictures often do not contribute to understanding may be that the pictures are not focused on the parts of the reading matter which is most difficult to understand."

Another authority shares the same point of view, but expresses it differently. Gardner and Ramsey\(^2\) say: "A good illustrator gets the child's point of view, then gets harmony of color and line, and if we would refine and instruct, he must stock the child's imagination with pictured facts outside the child's experience."

This point of view is important to keep in mind because as the grade level increases, the scope of the child's interests naturally broadens. He wants to read about unfamiliar places and things he is not likely to meet in his everyday experiences.

The writers of the basal readers recognize the challenge and include legends, hero stories, and accounts of life in


pioneer days, all of which experiences the child is able to understand through the median of books and pictures. The illustrators, too, seem to recognize the differences in informative needs at different grade levels by the appearance of illustrations which show greater complexity in the texts in higher grades.

A study completed by Eleanor Peck on a grade one level showed that glaring errors existed in almost thirty-seven percent of the illustrations accompanying the text.

The enlightening fact that eighteen types of errors were found in popular, widely used basal readers for grade one suggested the possibility that these and others might exist in the illustrations used in the basal reading series in grade four.

The following series were examined:


To conduct the analysis, the same check list of eighteen items formulated for the grade one analysis was used. An additional item, that of using black and white when a color is described, was found to be necessary in the grade four analysis, making a check list of nineteen items in all.

Every illustration accompanied by text in the five basal series was examined individually and rated against each item in the check list. Title pages with illustrations were not included. Also excluded from the illustrations examined were those introducing each section of book.

The eighteen items making up the check list were formulated by Eleanor Peck for the same study on a grade one level and were arrived at after examination of the illustrations in the five basal series, revealed the fact that certain discrepancies occurred frequently. The nineteenth item was added because of an error found on the upper grade level.

The following is the check list used in the study.

**Check List for Illustrations**

1) Inaccurate illustration of action words.
2) Inaccurate illustration of size concepts.
3) Inaccurate illustration of position.
4) Inaccurate illustration of color.
5) Inaccurate illustration of word and story concepts.
6) Inaccurate illustration of statement of fact.
7) Inaccurate illustration of real life situations.
8) Inaccurate illustration of people, places, or things.
9) Illustrations which are unrelated to the text.
10) Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas or only a portion of the text content.
11) Illustrations which are placed before the text.
12) Illustrations which are placed after the text.
13) Illustrations which lack clarity in size.
14) Illustrations which lack clarity in shape.
15) Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline.
16) Illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition.
17) Illustrations which show changes within a unit.
18) Illustrations which show results which would be expected from content.
19) Illustrations which use black and white when color is described.

The individual items of the check list used in the study are defined as follows and examples of each are given if that particular error was found any place in the five basal readers for grade four.

1. Inaccurate illustration of action words. Illustrations which show actions different from the actions described in the text.

No sample of this error was found in any of the five fourth readers examined.
2. Inaccurate illustration of size concepts. Illustrations in which the size of the person, place, or thing described in the text is not made clear or obvious.

Page 357 in "On the Trail of Adventure"\(^1\) presents the text: "Larry was rather fat."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 78, does not show very much difference between Larry and the other boy who was supposed to be "lively and thin".

3. Inaccurate illustration of position. Illustrations which do not show position clearly and exactly when position is described in the text.

Page 86 in "Let's Look Around"\(^2\) presents the text: "He came and put his head in Caddie's lap."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 34, shows the dog's nose resting on the child's knee.

4. Inaccurate illustration of color. Illustrations which do not show the exact colors described in the text.

Page 104 in "Times and Places"\(^3\) presents the text: "The cabin was gay with evergreens and red winterberries from the woods."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 49, shows dark green winterberries.

5. Inaccurate word and story concepts. Illustrations which present inaccurate or incorrect ideas, which do not help to clarify the words or ideas of the text, or which convey ideas which have little or no bearing on the text.

Page 295 in "Times and Places"\(^4\) presents the text: "Straight to a lake hidden deep in a forest, the gander piloted his flock of sixty geese."


\(^4\)Ibid.
The accompanying illustration, Illustration 139, fails to show the concept of a lake hidden by a forest. No forest is seen at all.

6. Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact. Illustrations which by their content or appearance belie the statements of fact set forth in the text.

Page 113 in "On the Trail of Adventure"¹ presents the text: "On these trips he wore a great straw hat and carried an umbrella."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 25, shows no umbrella.

7. Inaccurate illustration of real life situations. Illustrations which depict people, places, things, or situations in a way which is not true to life.

No sample of this error was found in any of the five fourth readers examined.

8. Inaccurate illustration of people, places, or things. Illustrations which do not show people, places, or things as they have been described in the text.

Page 67 in "Roads to Everywhere"² presents the text: "The Indians even helped to carry the heavy baskets down to the water's edge and load them before he gave them the buttons."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 28, does not show clearly that the boy has a button in his hand.

9. Illustrations which are unrelated to the text. Illustrations which have no bearing on the text and no connection with it, but which are used merely for decoration.

Page 209 in "Roads to Everywhere"³ presents the text: "The moon was shining brightly and the white pebbles that lay in front of the house shone like pieces of silver. Hansel filled his coat pockets as full as he could."

³Ibid.
The accompanying illustration, Illustration 97, shows Hansel picking up pebbles while a tiny black mouse watches him. A mouse was not mentioned in the text.

10. Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas, or only a portion of the text content. Illustrations which enlarge on the incidental material of the text and neglect the main idea, or which reflect the text incompletely.

Page 8 in "Singing Wheels"\textsuperscript{1} presents the text: "Down over the very edge of the hollow went the right front wheel."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 2, shows only the left side of the carriage and fails to show the hollow or the right side at all.

11. Illustrations placed before the text. The illustration which should accompany the text is sometimes placed a page or two before the text is given.

Page 201 in "On the Trail of Adventure"\textsuperscript{2} presents the text: "For himself Jack secured a fresh horse, one spirited enough for a general to ride."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 41, showing Jack on the spirited horse, appears on page 198, three pages before the text.

12. Illustrations placed after the text. Illustrations which should accompany a text are sometimes placed a page or two after the text is given.

Page 175 in "Singing Wheels"\textsuperscript{3} presents the text: "Tom turned with a start and in the doorway was a big, powerful looking Indian."

The illustration showing the Indian standing in the doorway, Illustration 55, is on page 177, two pages after the text.

13. Illustrations which lack clarity in size. Illustrations which do not show things to be true to size when size is a factor in recognition, or which do not show a proper size relationship among all things or people in a picture.


\textsuperscript{2}Op. cit.

\textsuperscript{3}Op. cit.
Page 385 in "Let's Look Around"\(^1\) describes falling leaves.

In the accompanying illustration, Illustration 132, the leaves appear larger than the people shown near the autumn fire.

14. Illustrations which lack clarity in shape. Illustrations which do not show things to be of a shape that is natural and true to life, or to be of a shape harmonious with the other objects in the picture.

No sample of this error was found in any of the five fourth readers examined.

15. Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline. Illustrations in which people, places, or things are not clear, obvious, or easily recognizable by their all-over appearance and outline.

Page 260 in "Roads to Everywhere"\(^2\) presents the text: "We have a likeness of one of our American animals on one of our coins. It is a bison or a buffalo."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 129, does not make clear what is on the coin.

16. Illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition. Illustrations which do not take advantage of the opportunity to bring about more rapid and ready recognition of words whose form and meaning would be clarified by picture clues.

Page 346 in "Let's Look Around"\(^3\) presents the text: "Look around to see that the rudder and ailerons work properly when you move the stick and rudder bar."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 122, shows only a portion of the aileron, doesn't show enough to completely clarify what an aileron looks like.

17. Illustrations which show changes within a unit. Illustrations in which a fixed object does not have exactly the same appearance or color each time it appears in a story unit, or in which there are changes pictured within the units of a book which are not required by the text.

---

\(^{1}\text{Op. cit.}\)

\(^{2}\text{Op. cit.}\)

\(^{3}\text{Op. cit.}\)
No sample of this error was found in any of the five fourth readers examined.

18. Illustrations which show results which should be expected from the text content. Illustrations which depict the circumstances which would follow necessarily as a result of the incident or the action described in the text.

No sample of this error was found in any of the five fourth readers examined.

19. Illustrations in which black and white is used when color is described. Illustrations which use no color when a specific color or colors are called for.

Page 385 in "Let's Look Around" presents the text: "The red leaves fall upon the lake."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 132, uses a black and white picture.

When the illustrations in the five basal series had been checked individually, each one which presented any doubt was rechecked by another person to insure the reliability of the analysis. In instances where there was a disagreement in points of view, the illustration in question was not included in the error count.

After each of the five basal reading series had been checked for discrepancies between the text and the illustrations, a table was set up for each book showing the types of errors found and giving the page number and the number of the accompanying illustration which contained the errors. Numbers had to be assigned to all illustrations in addition to the page numbers because it was found that many illustrations were not on the same page as the corresponding text, or that many illustrations occupied a double page which counted as one illustration.

---

In addition to the table for each book, a table was set up for each basal reading series, showing the number and kinds of errors occurring in the series.

The final table gives the over-all picture of the results of study, showing the five basal reading series, the total number of illustrations contained in each book, and the total number of errors determined by analysis.

The results of analysis are presented in the next chapter.
CHAPTER II

ANALYSIS OF DATA
CHAPTER II

ANALYSIS OF DATA

The purpose of the study was to analyze illustrations in five basal reading systems for grade four for inaccuracies.

Table I gives all the information concerning the reading series, the title, publisher, author, and copyright on the fourth readers used in the study. Each of the five books examined has its own table, listing the specific inaccuracies for the book, the number of the page of the text on which they were found, and the number of the accompanying illustration which was found to be in error with the text. Tables II, IV, VI, VIII, and X furnish this data.

Tables III, V, VII, IX, and XI show all the inaccuracies which occurred in each of the five basal reading series examined.

The final table, XII, gives the total number of illustrations contained in each of the five basal series and the total number of inaccuracies found in these series.
TABLE I
FOURTH READERS USED IN THE STUDY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Basic Reading Series</th>
<th>Name of Book</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Copyright</th>
<th>No. of Pages</th>
<th>Number of Illustrations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ginn Basic Readers</td>
<td>Roads to Everywhere</td>
<td>Ginn and Company</td>
<td>Russell, Gates</td>
<td>1948</td>
<td>431</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laidlaw Basic Readers</td>
<td>On the Trail of Adventure</td>
<td>Laidlaw Bros., Inc.</td>
<td>Yoakam, Hester, Abney</td>
<td>1949</td>
<td>376</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading Foundation Series</td>
<td>Singing Wheels</td>
<td>Row, Peterson and Co.</td>
<td>O’Donnell</td>
<td>1947</td>
<td>373</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## TABLE II

ROADS TO EVERYWHERE, FOURTH READER, GINN BASIC READERS

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES, ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR

<p>| Number | 7    | 27   | 28   | 29   | 32   | 34   | 35   | 41   | 47   | 55   | 61   | 64   | 65   | 92   | 97   | 100  | 109  | 115  | 117  | 129  | 141  | 174  | 182  | Total |
|--------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|
| Page   | 24   | 64   | 67   | 69   | 73   | 81   | 82   | 94   | 109  | 126  | 140  | 147  | 149  | 203  | 209  | 215  | 227  | 233  | 240  | 260  | 278  | 346  | 359  |       |
| Inaccurate illustration of color | X    |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |       |
| Inaccurate word and story concepts |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      | X 2   |
| Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact | X    | X    |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      | 1   |
| Inaccurate illustration of people, places, or things |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      | 5   |
| Illustrations which are unrelated to the text |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      | 1   |
| Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas or only a portion of text content |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      | 3   |
| Illustrations placed before the text | X    | X    |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      | 1   |
| Illustrations placed after the text |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      | 3   |
| Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      | 1   |
| Illustrations which use black and white when color is described |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      | 6   |
| Illustrations which use black and white when color is described |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      | 2   |
| Total |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      | 25  |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inaccurate illustration of action words</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of size concepts</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of position</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of color</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate word and story concepts</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of real life situations</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of people, places, or things</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which are unrelated to the text</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas or only a portion of the text content</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations placed before the text</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations placed after the text</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which lack clarity in size</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which lack clarity in shape</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which give inadequate help or word recognition</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which show changes within a unit</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which show results which would be expected from text content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which use black and white when color is described</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of size concepts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which are unrelated to the text</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations placed before the text</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which use black and white when color is described</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total: 15
<p>| Inaccurate illustration of action words | 0 |
| Inaccurate illustration of size concepts | 1 |
| Inaccurate illustration of position | 0 |
| Inaccurate illustration of color | 0 |
| Inaccurate word and story concepts | 0 |
| Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact | 4 |
| Inaccurate illustration of real life situations | 0 |
| Inaccurate illustration of people, places, or things | 0 |
| Illustrations which are unrelated to the text | 2 |
| Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas or only a portion of the text content | 0 |
| Illustrations placed before the text | 6 |
| Illustrations placed after the text | 0 |
| Illustrations which lack clarity in size | 0 |
| Illustrations which lack clarity in shape | 0 |
| Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline | 0 |
| Illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition | 0 |
| Illustrations which show changes within a unit | 0 |
| Illustrations which show results which would be expected from the text content | 0 |
| Illustrations which use black and white when color is described | 2 |
| <strong>Total</strong> | 15 |
| Inaccurate illustration of position | X | 1 |
| Inaccurate illustration of color | X | 2 |
| Inaccurate illustration of story concepts | X | 2 |
| Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact | X | 9 |
| Illustrations which are unrelated to the text | X | 3 |
| Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas or only a portion of the text content | X | 1 |
| Illustrations placed before the text | X | 11 |
| Illustrations placed after the text | X | 6 |
| Illustrations which lack clarity in size | X | 1 |
| Illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition | X | 1 |
| Illustrations which use black and white when color is described | X | 38 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of action words</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of size concepts</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of position</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of color</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate word and story concepts</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of real life situations</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of people, places or things</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which are unrelated to the text</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas or only a portion of the text content</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations placed before the text</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations placed after the text</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which lack clarity in size</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which lack clarity in shape</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which show changes within a unit</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which show results which would be expected from text content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which use black and white when color is described</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

38
TABLE VIII

SINGING WHEELS, FOURTH READER, READING FOUNDATION SERIES

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES, ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE

IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>2 4 5 6 9 10 11 13 14 15 17 20 25 28 30 37 44 56 57 62 69 70 72 75 102</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Page</td>
<td>8 16 18 19 30 33 36 38 45 49 54 57 63 81 92 97 124 148 175 182 199 230 233 237 245 325</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Inaccurate illustration of position |  |  | X | X | 2 |
| Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact | X | X | X | 3 |
| Inaccurate illustration of people, places or things | X | 1 |
| Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas or only a portion of the text content | X | X | X | 4 |
| Illustrations placed before the text | X | X | X | X | X | 6 |
| Illustrations placed after the text | X | X | X | X | X | 5 |
| Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline | X | X | X | X | 4 |
| Illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition | X | 1 |

Total: 26
| Inaccurate illustration of action words | 0 |
| Inaccurate illustration of size concepts | 0 |
| Inaccurate illustration of position | 2 |
| Inaccurate illustration of color | 0 |
| Inaccurate word and story concepts | 0 |
| Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact | 3 |
| Inaccurate illustration of real life situations | 0 |
| Inaccurate illustrations of people, places, or things | 1 |
| Illustrations which are unrelated to the text | 0 |
| Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas or only a portion of the text content | 4 |
| Illustrations placed before the text | 6 |
| Illustrations placed after the text | 5 |
| Illustrations which lack clarity in size | 0 |
| Illustrations which lack clarity in shape | 0 |
| Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline | 4 |
| Illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition | 1 |
| Illustrations which show changes within a unit | 0 |
| Illustrations which show results which would be expected from text content | 0 |
| Illustrations which use black and white when color is described | 0 |
TABLE X

TIMES AND PLACES, FOURTH READER, CURRICULUM FOUNDATION SERIES
CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES, ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>27</th>
<th>49</th>
<th>55</th>
<th>56</th>
<th>62</th>
<th>72</th>
<th>92</th>
<th>116</th>
<th>119</th>
<th>122</th>
<th>127</th>
<th>139</th>
<th>145</th>
<th>165</th>
<th>177</th>
<th>185</th>
<th>189</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Page</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>247</td>
<td>253</td>
<td>261</td>
<td>274</td>
<td>295</td>
<td>305</td>
<td>334</td>
<td>365</td>
<td>385</td>
<td>391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of position</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of color</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate word and story concept</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations placed after the text</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which use black and white when color is described</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Inaccurate illustration of position (X 1)

Inaccurate illustration of color (X 2)

Inaccurate word and story concept (X 1)

Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact (X X X X X X X X X 9)

Illustrations placed after the text (X 2)

Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline (X 2)

Illustrations which use black and white when color is described (X 1)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of action words</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of size concepts</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of position</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of color</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate word and story concepts</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of statements of fact</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of real life situations</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inaccurate illustration of people, places, or things</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which are unrelated to the text</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas or only a portion of the text content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations placed before the text</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations placed after the text</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which lack clarity in size</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which lack clarity in shape</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition (0)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which show changes within a unit</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which show results which would be expected from text content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations which use black and white when color is described</td>
<td>(\frac{1}{18})</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### TABLE XII

**SUMMARY OF ILLUSTRATIONS AND INACCURACIES IN THE FIVE BASAL SERIES EXAMINED IN THE STUDY**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fourth Readers</th>
<th>Illustrations</th>
<th>Total Inaccuracies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ginn Basic Readers</td>
<td>227</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laidlaw Basic Readers</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Today's Work-Play Books</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading Foundation Series</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum Foundation Series</td>
<td>206</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>762</strong></td>
<td><strong>122</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER III

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS
CHAPTER III

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

The appearance of illustrations in the basal reading systems for grade four can be justified if these illustrations are focused on the part of the reading matter which is hard to understand. If illustrations are used of things which are commonplace to children, they cannot be expected to make any new contribution to an already familiar concept.

Since children are keen observers, accurate illustrations can build accurate concepts. If skillfully used by the teacher, they can be used as a fine teaching aid. Since the value of any illustration is its accuracy, relevancy, and clarification of the author's words, this study was undertaken on the fourth grade level, for the purpose of determining whether or not inaccuracies and irrelevancies did exist in the illustrations of the basal series examined and if so, to determine their nature and frequency.

The following conclusions were reached.

1. Certain inaccuracies and irrelevancies were found to exist in each book of the five basal series examined.

2. The inaccuracy which occurred with the greatest frequency throughout the entire five series was Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact. The individual totals for the occurrence of this inaccuracy were:
3. The inaccuracies which did not occur at all throughout the entire five series were:

- Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words
- Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in Shape
- Illustrations Which Show Changes Within a Unit
- Illustrations Which Show Results Which Would Be Expected from Text Content

4. The inaccuracy which occurred with the least frequency throughout the entire five series was Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts. This inaccuracy occurred only once in the Laidlaw Basic Readers.

5. The inaccuracy which occurred with the greatest frequency in one particular series was Placement of Illustrations Before the Text which occurred in Today's Work-Play Books eleven times. The individual totals for the occurrence of this inaccuracy were:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Series</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ginn Basic Readers</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laidlaw Basic Readers</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Today's Work-Play Books</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading Foundation Series</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum Foundation Series</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>26</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. The inaccuracy which occurred with the next highest degree of frequency in two particular series was Inaccurate
Illustration of Fact which occurred in both the Curriculum Foundation Series and the Today's Work-Play Books nine times. The individual totals for the occurrence of this inaccuracy have already been given.

7. The inaccuracy which occurred with the third highest degree of frequency in one particular series was Placement of Illustration After the Text which occurred in the Today's Work-Play Books six times. The individual totals for the occurrence of this inaccuracy were:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Series</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ginn Basic Readers</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laidlaw Basic Readers</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Today's Work-Play Books</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading Foundation Series</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum Foundation Series</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>14</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8. Of the fifteen types of errors which were found in some of the fourth readers, certain inaccuracies did not occur at all in some of the basic readers examined.

a. **Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts** did not occur in the following series:

   Ginn Basic Readers
   Today's Work-Play Books
   Reading Foundation Series
   Curriculum Foundation Series

b. **Inaccurate Illustration of Position** did not occur at all in the following series:

   Ginn Basic Readers
   Laidlaw Basic Readers
c. **Inaccurate Illustration of Color** did not occur at all in the following series:
   - Laidlaw Basic Readers
   - Reading Foundation Series

d. **Inaccurate Illustration of Word-Story Concepts**
did not occur at all in the following series:
   - Laidlaw Basic Readers
   - Reading Foundation Series

e. **Inaccurate Illustrations of People, Places, or Things** did not occur at all in the following series:
   - Laidlaw Basic Readers
   - Today's Work-Play Books
   - Curriculum Foundation Series

f. **Illustrations Which Are Unrelated to the Text**
did not occur at all in the following series:
   - Reading Foundation Series
   - Curriculum Foundation Series

g. **Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of the Text Content** did not occur at all in the following series:
   - Laidlaw Basic Readers
   - Curriculum Foundation Series

h. **Placement of Illustration Before the Text** did not occur at all in the following series:
   - Curriculum Foundation Series

i. **Placement of Illustration After the Text** did not occur in the following series:
   - Laidlaw Basic Readers
j. **Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in Size** did not occur in the following series:
   - Ginn Basic Readers
   - Laidlaw Basic Readers
   - Reading Foundation Series
   - Curriculum Foundation Series

k. **Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline** did not occur at all in the following series:
   - Laidlaw Basic Readers
   - Today's Work-Play Books

l. **Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition** did not occur at all in the following series:
   - Ginn Basic Readers
   - Laidlaw Basic Readers
   - Curriculum Foundation Series

m. **Illustrations Which Use Black and White When Color is Described** did not occur at all in the following series:
   - Reading Foundation Series

9. The greatest number of inaccuracies, thirty-eight, occurred in Today's Work-Play Books. The fewest number of inaccuracies, fifteen, occurred in the Laidlaw Basic Readers. The total number of inaccuracies for each of the five basal reading series examined follows:
10. The list which follows gives the major inaccuracies existing in each series:

Ginn Basic Readers
Lack of Clarity in General Outline  6
Inaccurate Illustration of Statements of Fact  4
All other inaccuracies occurred three times or less.

Laidlaw Basic Readers
Illustrations Place Before the Text  6
Inaccurate Illustration of Statements of Fact  4
All other inaccuracies in this series appear only two times or less.

Today's Work-Play Books
Illustrations Placed Before the Text  11
Inaccurate Illustration of Statements of Fact  9
Illustrations Placed After the Text  6
All other inaccuracies in this series appear only three times or less.

Reading Foundation Series
Illustrations Placed Before the Text  6
Illustrations Placed After the Text  5
Illustrations Which Emphasizes Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of the Text  4
Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline  4
All other inaccuracies in this series appear three times or less.

**Curriculum Foundation Series**

Inaccurate Illustration of Statements of Fact 9

All other inaccuracies in this series appear two times or less.

11. The Ginn Basic Readers showed inaccuracies in eleven items of the check list.

The Laidlaw Basic Readers showed inaccuracies in five items of the check list.

Today's Work-Play Books showed inaccuracies in eleven items of the check list.

Reading Foundation Series showed inaccuracies in eight items of the check list.

Curriculum Foundation Series showed inaccuracies in seven items of the check list.

12. The type of inaccuracy which showed the highest frequency of occurrence was the same in some of the series analyzed.

The Ginn Basic Readers showed highest frequency in Lack of Clarity in General Outline.

The Laidlaw Basic Readers showed highest frequency in Placement of Illustration Before the Text.

Today's Work-Play Books showed highest frequency in Placement of Illustration Before the Text.
The Reading Foundation Series showed highest frequency in Placement of Illustration Before the Text with a one-point difference between that and Placement of Illustration After the Text.

Curriculum Foundation Series showed the highest frequency in Inaccurate Illustration of Statements of Fact.

13. The items on the check list which showed low frequencies of occurrence did so consistently in all five series.

14. Results of study show that there is a definite decrease of inaccuracies as the grade level increases.
BIBLIOGRAPHY
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Cunningham, Elizabeth M. "Informational Aspects of Illustrations in Children's Books." Childhood Education 9: 319-22; March 1933.

