

1951

# An analysis of the content of four senior high school American history textbooks

---

<https://hdl.handle.net/2144/20539>

*Downloaded from OpenBU. Boston University's institutional repository.*

Ed  
Thesis  
Hands, R.C.  
1951

STORED

BOSTON UNIVERSITY  
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION

AN ANALYSIS OF THE CONTENT OF FOUR SENIOR  
HIGH SCHOOL AMERICAN HISTORY TEXTBOOKS

A Thesis

Submitted by

Richard C. Hands  
(B.S. in Ed., Boston University, 1949)

In Partial Fulfillment  
of the Requirements for the Degree  
Master of Education

1951

First Reader: William H. Cartwright, Associate Professor  
of Education

*George W. Denemark*  
Second Reader: George W. Denemark, Assistant Professor  
of Education

### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author wishes to express his thanks to his advisor, Dr. William H. Cartwright whose sincerity and sound advice have been of great help.

His gratitude is also expressed to Professor Warren S. Tryon whose lectures and comments proved the motivation for the study.

To Miss Mary Meldrum he feels he owes a debt for her skill, and style, and usage, and her genuine interest.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER	PAGE
I. THE PROBLEM AND ITS PURPOSE .....	1
The problem .....	1
Scope and limitations of the study.....	2
Definition of terms.....	3
II Research procedures used .....	5
II. STUDIES MADE AT BOSTON UNIVERSITY AND ELSEWHERE.....	7
III. RESULTS OF THE ANALYSIS OF DATA STUDIED..	13
IV. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS.....	30
V. LIMITATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER STUDY.....	33
Limitations.....	33
Recommendations.....	33
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	36

## LIST OF TABLES

TABLE	PAGE
I. Space Given to the Period of Discovery and Exploration .....	13
II. Space Given to the Period of Colonial Development .....	14
III. Space Given to the Period of Colonial Wars .....	15
IV. Space Given to the Pre-Revolutionary Period from 1763-1776 .....	16
V. Space Given to the Revolutionary Period .....	17
VI. Space Given to the Period from 1783-1812 .....	18
VII. Space Given to the Period from 1812-1861 .....	19
VIII. Space Given to the Civil War .....	20
IX. Amount of Space Given to the Period from 1865-1917 .....	21
X. Space Given to the Period from 1917 to the Date of Publication of the Books Analyzed ....	22
XI. A Comparison of the Amount of Space Given to all the Periods of all Four Books .....	24
XII. Total Space Given to Military, Political, and Social-Economic History in all Four Books ....	25
XIII. Military Visual Aids Treated of in all of the Four Books .....	26

TABLE	PAGE
XIV. Political Visual Aids Mentioned in All Four Books .....	27
XV. Social-Economic Visual Aids Mentioned in All Four Books .....	v28
XVI. Pictures, Maps, Graphs and Cartoons in All Four Books .....	29

# CHAPTER I

## THE PROBLEM AND ITS PURPOSE

### I. THE PROBLEM

Statement of the problem. The purpose of this study was to make an analysis of the content of four senior high school American history textbooks and find out how they ranked in the space given to social-economic history. To this end, word content was classified into ten chronological periods and into the general categories of military, political, and social-economic history. Visual aid content was also classified into the general categories.

American history textbooks have been and continue to be strong forces in determining what is taught in American history courses. Differences of opinion exist relative to the value of the text in secondary school teaching, but no one can quarrel with Johnson's statement that "In the majority of American schools it determines the facts to be taught and the manner of teaching them."<sup>1</sup> If then, the textbook be so influential, it becomes worth while to study its content.

Teachers accustomed to depending upon the textbook for the foundation of their courses should develop a sense of intelligent criticism toward these books. Such an attitude

---

<sup>1</sup> Henry Johnson, Teaching of History (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1940), p. 241.



must be based upon a knowledge of the latest developments in historical scholarship and in educational psychology. This study is dedicated to this modern concept.

The teacher of American history is reminded that military and political history are swiftly falling into disfavor and that a greater significance is being attached to social-economic history. To the teacher still mired in lessons on elections and wars is addressed the request that he begin to teach other aspects of the history of the American people.

Informed teachers, today, are beginning to demand textbooks with an emphasis on social-economic history. This study purports to show whether or not a selected group of American history textbooks are achieving the desired results.

It also is suggested that educators desiring history suited to the senior high school level of boys and girls might give greater consideration to social history. A youngster encounters difficulty in understanding the intricacies of a disputed election, but not so in the case of facts that deal with the way in which people lived, what they wore, and what they did, which is related to the pupil's own experience.

## II. SCOPE AND LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

Four senior high school American history textbooks were selected for analysis, on the basis of their wide use and recency of publication. These were:

1. Our Nation, by Barker and Commager<sup>1</sup>
2. History of the United States, by Dumond, Dale and Wesley.<sup>2</sup>
3. Story of America, by Harlow<sup>3</sup>; and
4. A History of Our Country, by Muzzey.<sup>4</sup>

The content of each of these four textbooks was analyzed. All introductory paragraphs to chapters were examined, as well as the chapters themselves, and summaries were included at the end of each chapter. Tables of contents, lists of pictures and maps, prefaces, chapter exercises, appendices and indexes, however, were not included in the study. All visual aids, that is, pictures, maps, graphs and cartoons, were classified. Cover decorations were omitted.

### III. DEFINITION OF TERMS

Throughout the study the terms "military," "political," and "social-economic" history were used. In order to be able

1 Eugene C. Barker, and Henry Steele Commager, Our Nation (Evanston, Illinois: Row, Peterson and Company, 1947).

2 Dwight L. Dumond, Edward E. Dale, and Edgar B. Wesley, History of the United States (Boston: Mass.: D.C. Heath and Company, 1948).

3 Ralph Volney Harlow, Story of America (New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1949).

4 David Savelle Muzzey, A History of Our Country (Boston, Mass.: Ginn and Company, 1948).

to appreciate the implications involved in this study, the reader should have a precise understanding of the meaning of these terms.

Military history, as used in this analysis, included all battles, whether in formally-declared warfare or in minor skirmishes distinctly outside the realm of civil rioting. Discussions of the lives of military leaders were also placed in this category.

Under the classification of political events, primarily related to government, were placed election campaigns and their results, international diplomacy, and, in addition, executive, judicial, and congressional activities.

In the broad category of social-economic history was listed discussions of the types of work, habits, and ideas of the American people. This naturally included descriptions of rural and urban life, and also all matters pertaining to religion, education, literature, travel, invention and entertainment.

Obviously, a degree of judgment became necessary in order to be able to correctly place an event in any of the three categories. The general rule followed was simple: If certain lines on a textbook page clearly appeared to be neither military nor political, then they were listed under the social-economic heading. In certain instances, it was found, there were topics which could not be readily classified

into any one group. The tariff, for instance, might receive a political treatment in one text, might be given a social-economic emphasis in a second text, and might be awarded a mixture of both in a third. In an example of the last case, the selection was broken down into single lines, and the political and social-economic sections then were disentangled.

#### IV. RESEARCH PROCEDURES USED

The basic chronological classifications were taken from a study which Rugg<sup>1</sup> designates as "The pioneer analysis of history textbooks." This analysis, which was made by a seminar led by Bagley and Rugg<sup>2</sup>, contains nine of the ten chronological periods which were eventually used in this study of four senior high school American history textbooks. A tenth period, from 1917 to the present date, was added so as to allow the inclusion of recent material in an up-to-date text.

Each of the ten periods was divided twice. One of the subdivisions provided for a specific analysis according to certain topics; the other divided the materials into the broad groups of military, political and social-economic history.

---

<sup>1</sup>Earle U. Rugg, "Curriculum Studies in the Social Sciences and Citizenship (Greeley, Colo.: State Teachers' College Press, 1928), p.120.

<sup>2</sup>W.C. Bagley and H.O. Rugg, "The Content of American History, as Taught in Seventh and Eighth Grades; an Analysis of Typical School Textbooks, Bulletin No.16. (Urbana, Ill., School of Education, University of Illinois, 1915).

For each of the specific and the general categories of the ten chronological periods, a word count was made. The number of lines in a page and the number of uninterrupted pages devoted to each topic were listed. A random sample method determined the number of words in a line: the words in twenty lines, spaced approximately the same distance apart through the text, were counted and an average obtained. By simple counting, the number of lines in an uninterrupted page was found.

Knowing the number of words in a line, and the number of lines in a page, the total number of lines and pages for each of the specific and large groupings of the ten chronological periods were transformed into a common unit: the number of words. After the total number of words in each period, and in the entire book, was known, the calculations of percentages with a slide rule was completed.

Visual aids were counted on a simple check list which provided a means of indicating, for each of the four texts, all pictures, maps, graphs, and cartoons, whether military, political, or social-economic in nature and in full-page, half-page, or less than half-page. Each text had but one or two colored visual aids so that this factor was not deemed worthy of inclusion.

## CHAPTER II

## STUDIES MADE AT BOSTON UNIVERSITY AND ELSEWHERE

Although the Bagley and Rugg<sup>1</sup> study was made thirty-six years ago, the trends revealed are of interest in the present day. It was concluded that American history, as taught in the seventh and eighth grades, was predominantly political and military; however, the emphasis placed upon military affairs was declining. Even in 1915, it was quite apparent that economic and industrial developments were receiving greater emphasis than in earlier books written, but political events continued to remain the core of textbook content. It was also noted that European events prior to the discovery of America, the period from 1783-1912, and non-military affairs from 1912-1961, were being increasingly stressed.

In writing about the influence of textbooks on American history teaching, Meredith remarks that although the power of the text was lessening, "Newer forces are perhaps most influential to the extent that they have been reflected in the texts."<sup>2</sup> American history, in early books such as those by Jedediah Morse and Noah Webster, was largely political and

---

<sup>1</sup> Bagley and Rugg, op.cit.

<sup>2</sup> Dorothy Meredith, "The Changing Content of American History Courses," Chapter III, in The Study and Teaching of American History, Richard E. Thursfield, editor, Seventeenth Yearbook of the National Council for the Social Studies, Washington, D.C. 1946.

military in nature; in fact, many pre-Civil War texts devoted almost no space to social-economic history. In the Eighteen-Eighties, there was still found a preponderance of political history but the beginning of the decline was observed. Even in 1920, political history was still of supreme importance; however, social-economic events were gaining increased space in the upper grades, while a somewhat greater emphasis was being placed upon such happenings in the senior high schools.

Meredith also notes that in the late Nineteen-Thirties and the early Nineteen-Forties, the trend toward more stress on social-economic history continued to grow in the elementary schools, even while it lagged behind in the senior high schools. It is certain that many schools, today, are teaching the kind of history which was in style during the first decade of the Nineteenth Century; that pupils are still being subjected to courses which consist largely of a dull recital of politics and wars.

One of the most thorough recent investigations, that made by Cartwright,<sup>1</sup> reveals that in the history of American history teaching, political and military history have played an outstanding role. Social history is becoming of increasing importance, but political history is still, especially

---

<sup>1</sup> William H. Cartwright, "A History of the Teaching of American History," (unpublished doctor's dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1950)

in the secondary schools, an outstanding feature of the majority of texts. Military history, which once played a large part in the make-up of textbooks, has fallen to third place. In general, the number of words in textbooks has been rising. This may well prove to be a factor in determining what type of history is being taught. It is possible that the teacher who is short of time will select from these very lengthy works only that which she deems "important." There probably are few teachers, however, who would leave out William Jennings Bryan in order to have time for a discussion of baseball.

There has been a considerable amount of textbook analyses done at Boston University, but this review is solely concerned with studies directly related to this study.

Yagjian draws conclusions regarding the significance of the political and military figures in junior high school American history textbooks. He believes that the presidents received more space than was warranted; but he calls attention to the fact that, out of approximately one thousand men, 650, other than statesmen and military men, were mentioned. He says:

Doctors, scientists, religious leaders and literary leaders have made great contributions to the progress of civilization. Their merits should be recognized.<sup>1</sup>

He sees a good omen, for military men were mentioned, he

---

<sup>1</sup> Ralph A. Yagjian, "An Analysis of the People in Junior High School American History Textbooks, (unpublished Master's service paper, Boston University School of Education, Boston, Massachusetts, 1948).



noticed, fewer times, than in earlier studies.

Quint<sup>1</sup> discovered that literary history has been considered at length by some authors while others gave little space to literary developments. In all eight texts that she analyzed, for instance, Longfellow was the only American author mentioned. She remarks that writers of history have given a considerable amount of attention to contemporary leaders in the arts, movies and sports. However, this unusual respect for social history is by no means of common occurrence; for, it will be remembered, in Yagjian's study it was the presidents who constituted the largest group mentioned by all eight texts.

Henderson<sup>2</sup> analyzed texts on the basis of a list of twelve topics suggested by the Committee on American History in Schools and Colleges. Of these twelve topics, four were social-economic in nature, four were political, and four were military; and the usual wide differences were found. The Civil War received the most extensive treatment, together with the drafting of the Constitution, and the War with England in 1812; these latter two ranked high in wordage received. Only once did any one of the four social-economic events rank even third in the space granted.

---

<sup>1</sup> Catherine I Quint, "An Analysis of the People Mentioned in Eight Junior High American History Books," (unpublished Master's thesis, Boston University School of Education, Boston, Massachusetts, 1949)

<sup>2</sup> Georgianna Henderson, "An Analysis and Treatment of Twelve Selected Events in Twelve Junior High School American History Texts," (unpublished Master's thesis, Boston University School of Education, Boston, Massachusetts, 1949).

O'Leary<sup>1</sup>, also, based his study on topics suggested by the Committee on American History in Schools and Colleges, and uses forty-two more specific classifications. He points out that the outstanding feature of one book is represented by the exploits of military men. The supremacy of political history is clearly indicated. But such social-economic phases as social life, music and motion pictures were omitted in some of the books.

With regard to teaching by chronological periods, he indicates, the Committee has pointed out further that a post-1865 emphasis should be placed since many teachers at the senior high school level are neglecting it. Thus there would be avoided the mistake of having pre-1865 events taught to bored students for the third time.

Murphy<sup>2</sup> is especially concerned about the lack of attention being given to sports, recreation and entertainment in the junior high school history textbooks. It is but one more proof, he contends, of the manner in which social history has been neglected.

---

1 James H. O'Leary, "An Analysis of Topics in Junior High School American History Textbooks," (unpublished Master's Service Paper, Boston University School of Education, Boston, Massachusetts, 1948).

2 Charles J. Murphy, "An Analysis of Topics in Junior High School American History Textbooks," (unpublished Master's Service Paper, Boston University School of Education, Boston, Massachusetts, 1948).

Israel <sup>1</sup> investigated the conflicting presentation of controversial points of history in the ten books that he studied. Thirty-five items were analyzed, nearly all of which were either military or political in nature.

The conclusions he offers is that controversial historical topics are amply treated only when they date back far enough into the past. Apparently he thinks that textbook writers insist upon stressing political history, and he implies that they are not even presenting politics in a commendable fashion.

Neenan<sup>2</sup> stresses the importance of visual aids in textbooks. He suggests that visual instruction has been used in an attempt to bring the pupil nearer to real situations. Pictures and cartoons, he considers, 'sell' a book, and he adds, "By the use of visual aids, the social experiences of our ancestry are highlighted in concrete form."<sup>2</sup> It is for this reason that an analysis of visual aids was included in this study of four senior high school American history textbooks.

---

<sup>1</sup> Jay Burton Israel, "Certain Issues in American History and Their Treatment in Ten High School Textbooks, (unpublished Master's thesis, Boston University School of Education, Boston, Massachusetts, 1945).

<sup>2</sup> Alfred C. Neenan, "An Analysis of Visual Aids in Junior High School American History Textbooks, (unpublished Master's service paper, Boston University School of Education, Boston, Massachusetts, 1949)

### CHAPTER III

#### RESULTS OF THE ANALYSIS OF DATA STUDIED

Included in this chapter are sixteen tables. The first ten deal with the periods given to the Bagley and Rugg study, plus one period added so as to bring the list up to date. Table XI shows a general comparison made of the space given to all ten periods by all ten books. Table XII calls for particular attention since it compares the amount of space given in turn to military, political and social-economic history in each book studied. The last four tables, Tables XIII, XIV, XV and XVI, reveal the types of visual aids listed in each of the four books used in this study.

TABLE I\*

#### SPACE GIVEN TO THE PERIOD OF DISCOVERY AND EXPLORATION

Event	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent
America before Columbus	-	-	-	-	-	-	198	1.7
European background	3700	72.2	726	71.6	3245	56.0	2398	21.1
French background	300	6.2	506	36.7	121	2.1	275	2.4
Spanish explorers	580	11.9	-	-	968	16.7	3498	30.8
Portuguese explorers	110	2.3	-	-	506	8.7	1331	11.8
Dutch explorers	80	1.7	-	-	66	1.1	154	1.4
English explorers	80	1.7	176	12.5	429	7.4	594	5.2
Total military history	110	2.3	187	13.3	209	3.6	3245	28.6
Total political hist'y	620	12.7	220	15.6	1089	18.8	2211	19.5
Total social-economic history	4120	85.0	1001	71.1	4499	77.6	5841	51.5

\*Note: The symbols B&C, DD&W, H and M shown on this table have been used throughout on the tables to designate names of the authors of the four textbooks analyzed in this study.

In the period of discovery and exploration, Muzzey is the only author, of the four whose works have been analyzed in this study, who devotes space to the topic America Before Columbus. Barker and Commager, Dumond, Dale and Wesley, and Harlow all gave much space to the topic European Background; while Muzzey devoted the most amount of space to the topic Spanish Explorers, and Dumond, Dale and Wesley gave only one thousand words to this period, eliminating Spanish, Portuguese, and Dutch Explorers and, as well, the topic America Before Columbus. All four books, it is interesting to note, give much space to Social-Economic History in this period, but the percentage of words given to Military History by Muzzey is greater than that given by any of the other three textbooks.

TABLE II  
SPACE GIVEN TO THE PERIOD OF COLONIAL DEVELOPMENT

Events	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent
Political events	4570	26.2	6314	30.3	9053	42.2	7326	45.3
Indian relations	463	2.6	770	3.3	55	.2	143	.9
Religion	550	2.9	2079	10.1	825	3.8	1496	9.2
Education	950	5.5	649	2.8	374	1.7	451	2.8
Other Colonial developments	7760	44.9	10351	50.0	9427	44.0	5247	32.4
Colonial developments, other countries	2270	13.7	1463	7.2	66	.3	-	-
Totals -								
Military history	60	.3	-	-	198	.9	198	1.3
Political history	5090	29.2	5929	28.5	9053	42.2	8239	50.9
Soc-econ. history	12530	70.5	14817	71.5	12188	56.5	7711	47.7

In the period of Colonial Development all three authors, other than Muzzey, give the most space to Miscellaneous Social Colonial events. Muzzey, on the contrary, gives the most space to political events, which, in all the other three books, take second place. Colonial Developments of Other Countries were treated briefly by Barker and Commager, and Dumond, Dale and Wesley; but they received very little attention from Harlow and none at all from Muzzey. All texts, in this period, devoted more words to Social-Economic History than to Military History or Political History, except that of Muzzey which gives a greater percentage of words to Political History. Dumond, Dale and Wesley cite no Military History; and the other three authors devote 1 per cent, or lower, to the topic.

TABLE III

## SPACE GIVEN TO THE PERIOD OF COLONIAL WARS

Events	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent
King William's War	-	-	44	5.0	121	9.6	-	-
Queen Anne's War	-	-	99	11.2	55	4.3	-	-
King George's War	-	-	55	6.2	88	7.0	-	-
French&Indian Wars	1090	91.5	550	62.5	913	72.1	913	1000
Gen. Treatment of all Colonial Wars	100	8.5	132	15.0	88	7.0	-	-
Totals-								
Military history	290	24.4	407	46.2	1463	37.8	572	62.7
Political history	900	75.5	407	46.2	1386	35.6	341	37.7
Social-economic history	-	-	231	26.2	1012	26.2	-	-

The present state of military history can be well seen on Table III, the table which dealt with the period of Colonial wars. Barker and Commager, also Muzzey, failed to mention the wars of King William, Queen Anne or King George. It seems to have been the general practice of history textbooks writers to give space to the French and Indian wars, or to give a general treatment to the topic All Colonial Wars, instead. In this period, more words were given to military history than of any other kind by Dumond, Dale and Wesley, Harlow and Muzzey, Barker and Commager being the exception. The latter writers devoted more words to political history than to military history, in their text; but neither they nor Muzzey laid any stress on social-economic history.

TABLE IV  
THE SPACE GIVEN TO THE PRE-REVOLUTIONARY PERIOD  
FROM 1763 - 1776

Events	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent
Totals-								
Military history	-	-	143	3.6	-	-	638	9.8
Political history	3150	65.2	3223	82.0	3168	84.0	4939	75.5
Social-economic history	1690	34.8	495	12.8	583	16.0	959	14.7

The specific items in this period included the quarrel as to who should pay for the French and Indian wars, James Otis' concern over the Writs of Assistance, the Sugar Act, the

the Stamp Act, the Townshend Acts, the Stamp Act Congress, the Boston Massacre, the Boston Tea Party, the Boston Port Bill, and the first Continental Congress.

The pre-Revolutionary period, from 1763-1776, presented a unique problem, for the number of specific topics was so great and the space given to each was so limited that word count and percentages could not be derived. Military history was eliminated in this period by Barker and Commager and by Harlow. All four texts, however, contain more political history, and political events, than subject matter of any other kind; while social-economic history made up 16 per cent of the total, or less, in all books except the textbook by Barker and Commager.

TABLE V

## SPACE GIVEN TO THE REVOLUTIONARY PERIOD

FROM 1776 to 1783

Events	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent
Political, social and economic conditions	5340	78.5	2849	69.2	2068	42.0	2178	29.4
European background	110	1.6	165	3.9	605	12.4	869	54.2
Military & naval events	1150	17.0	1089	26.7	1958	39.8	3949	54.2
Totals -								
Military history	1150	17.0	1089	26.7	2211	45.2	3949	54.2
Political history								
Social-economic history	5080	76.5	2651	64.4	2068	42.0	2343	32.1
	460	6.8	363	8.8	605	12.4	1001	13.7



No other writer except Muzzey placed any great emphasis on the military and naval events of the Revolutionary period. Only he gives over 50 per cent of word space to discussions relating to warfare. The other three authors laid more stress upon political, social and economic conditions.

TABLE VI  
SPACE GIVEN TO THE PERIOD FROM 1783 - 1812

Events	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent
"Critical Period" (1783-1789)	6210	34.8	6985	27.0	5203	21.1	7392	30.8
Washington's administration	4490	25.1	6303	24.3	5104	20.9	5566	23.2
Adam's administration	1440	8.1	946	3.8	1914	7.8	1540	6.4
Jefferson's administration	4490	25.1	4048	15.5	5357	21.9	7238	30.2
Madison's administration	-	-	132	.5	1309	5.3	1045	4.4
Transportation	330	1.7	946	3.8	-	-	-	-
Commerce&Industry	230	1.2	1452	5.6	-	-	-	-
Religion	-	-	1221	4.7	-	-	-	-
Slavery&Reform	-	-	1760	6.8	-	-	-	-
Separate chapter on the Constitution and its Growth to 1949	-	-	-	-	5500	22.6	-	-
Totals -								
Military history	-	-	319	1.2	264	1.5	935	3.9
Political history	13850	78.0	13871	53.5	19932	81.5	19882	81.2
Social-economic history	3910	22.0	11660	45.0	4169	17.0	3476	14.5

In the period from 1783 to 1812 Dumond, Dale and Wesley introduce into the pages of their textbook mention of such topics as transportation, commerce and industry, religion, slavery and reform. Other authors either slighted or else eliminated such headings. The favored topic in all of the books treating of this period was the "Critical Period from 1783 to 1789." Much space was devoted to political history in each of the four books; but, however, 45 per cent of all of the space given to this period by Dumond, Dale and Wesley related to social-economic events. Military history received less than 4 per cent in three of the four books, and was not mentioned at all in the text by Barker and Commager.

TABLE VII

SPACE GIVEN TO THE PERIOD FROM 1812 - 1861

Events	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent
War of 1812	1440	2.9	2035	3.9	1661	3.5	4477	11.3
Immigration	600	1.2	770	1.5	352	.7	-	-
Mexican War	1930	3.9	1111	2.1	2068	4.4	1309	51.0
Europe & So. America								
politics & slavery	17750	36.4	13970	27.0	17655	37.6	20250	51.0
City, transportation,								
commerce, industry,								
and invention	9850	20.2	8866	17.2	7766	16.6	2046	5.1
Foreign affairs	2620	5.4	5852	11.3	4070	8.7	2904	7.3
Finance	1120	2.4	2508	4.8	1529	3.2	1441	3.6
Territorial acq.	4120	8.5	1661	3.2	1210	2.5	1551	3.9
Religion, reform	1270	2.6	2629	5.1	2893	6.1	-	-
Westward movement	2060	4.2	5489	10.6	1012	2.1	3432	8.6
Newspaper, literature, education, arts	3080	6.3	4136	8.0	4158	8.8	-	-

TABLE VII  
(Concluded)

Events	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent
Totals -								
Military history	1170	2.4	1870	3.6	1925	4.1	4224	10.5
Political history	23930	49.0	22748	43.5	23254	49.19	25201	63.5
Social-economic history	23730	48.5	26972	52.2	21648	46.0	10351	26.0

The period from 1812 to 1861 has received from all four authors a more general social treatment, although Muzzey leaves out such topics as Immigration, Religion, Reform and Literature. Politics and Slavery received more space than did any other single topic; indeed, in Muzzey's text these topics were given over 50 per cent of the word space allotment.

Political History stands highest in all four texts, except that of Dumond, Dale and Wesley, in which the emphasis was placed on Social-Economic History.

TABLE VIII  
SPACE GIVEN TO THE CIVIL WAR

Events	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent
Totals-								
Military history	3760	49.5	1815	30.8	4510	61.4	5715	71.0
Political history	2600	34.2	3300	56.2	1936	26.2	1331	16.3
Social-economic history	1240	16.5	748	12.7	913	12.4	1023	12.5

It is to be noted that specific items have not been recorded under the foregoing heading because of their great number and their small importance.

In the period of the Civil War, only major groupings were used. It will be seen that all of the four textbooks used most of their space in recording military history, except Dumond, Dale and Wesley, whose textbook emphasizes political history.

TABLE IX  
AMOUNT OF SPACE GIVEN TO THE PERIOD FROM 1865-1917

Events	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent
Reconstruction	6200	6.8	3784	6.0	3542	4.2	2629	4.0
Transportation & Communication	7150	7.8	1397	2.2	4323	5.2	1177	1.8
Industry, labor growth of city	13520	14.8	11506	18.2	14409	17.4	8954	13.4
Foreign affairs	9370	10.3	10428	16.5	19151	22.9	15895	22.6
Westward movement	6030	6.6	3762	5.9	4664	5.6	2420	3.6
Immigration	4750	5.2	2937	4.6	1265	1.5	-	-
Conservation, reform, welfare, humanitarianism, the arts	13410	14.7	7667	12.2	9735	11.6	3179	4.8
Finance in the North	2430	2.6	2145	3.4	3982	4.8	3927	5.9
Non-reconstruction politics in general	5290	5.8	3179	5.0	-	-	-	-
Totals -								
Military history	-	-	1199	1.9	1144	1.3	3960	6.0
Political history	38960	42.8	2510	42.0	4503	50.0	5517	64.2
Social-economic history	52200	57.2	3497	56.0	4502	48.7	19316	29.2

As may be seen by Table IX, there were many topics in

the period of history covered by the years 1865 to 1917, treated to some extent, at least, by the writers of the four textbooks analyzed in this study. Exceptions were: Farm Life which was omitted by Harlow and Muzzey; and Immigration, that Muzzey (once again), has left out. Miscellaneous Political Matters received more space than did any other topic in any of the texts, except that of Harlow, which lays slightly more stress, than do the other works, upon Foreign Affairs. Social-Economic History was given its greatest emphasis by Barker and Commager and by Dumond, Dale and Wesley, while Political History comes highest in the texts by Harlow and Muzzey. Barker and Commager omit Military History altogether.

TABLE X

SPACE GIVEN TO THE PERIOD FROM 1917 TO THE DATE  
OF PUBLICATION OF THE TEXTS ANALYZED

Event	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent
World War I	5470	12.6	2893	6.4	9317	12.4	22000	25.8
World organization & peace plans	3550	8.2	1100	2.4	3839	5.1	6292	7.3
World War II	5270	12.2	1082	23.2	12177	16.1	3575	4.2
Western hemisphere relations	1080	2.5	583	1.3	1408	1.8	2299	2.7
War debts, stock market, finance	1500	3.5	2200	4.8	2915	3.8	3751	4.4
Immigration	820	1.9	1694	3.7	-	-	814	.9
Agricultural de- pression	2170	5.0	2002	4.4	2893	3.8	-	-
UN and "One World" preaching	2490	5.8	1441	3.2	8525	11.3	297	.3
Radicalism in the 1920's	-	-	1342	2.9	814	1.0	1375	1.6

TABLE X  
(Concluded)

Events	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	No.of words	Per cent	No.of words	Per cent	No.of words	Per cent	No.of words	Per cent
Background of World War II	2340	5.4	2112	4.7	6589	8.7	3729	4.3
Politics, elections in general	7710	17.9	8877	19.5	9812	13.0	20999	24.5
City life, entertainment, religion, etc.	4130	9.5	1815	4.0	6237	8.3	-	-
Commerce, labor & industry	1800	4.2	7326	16.2	9339	12.4	10373	12.1
Totals-								
Military history	4700	10.9	5016	11.0	8085	10.8	6226	7.3
Political history	27020	62.5	19030	42.0	38522	51.2	59874	58.5
Social-economic history	11200	26.0	21285	47.0	28688	38.0	29139	34.2

The history of the period from 1917 to the date of the publication of the textbooks studied is found to have at least thirteen distinct topics. Barker and Commager give the most space to Politics and Elections in General; Muzzey dedicates at least one-quarter of his wordage space to the same topics, although he does give slightly more emphasis to a discussion of World War I. Dumond, Dale and Wesley devote the greatest amount of space - of that given to a single topic - to World War II, while Muzzey gives it only slightly more than 4 per cent of his space. The total Political History wordage ranks highest in all of the texts, except that of Dumond, Dale and Wesley, which stresses most Social-Economic History.

TABLE XI  
A COMPARISON OF THE AMOUNT OF SPACE GIVEN TO ALL TEN  
PERIODS BY ALL FOUR BOOKS

Events	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent	No. of words	Per cent
Discovery & Exploration	4850	1.9	1408	.6	5797	2.1	11297	4.2
Colonial Development	17443	7.3	20746	9.3	21439	7.7	16148	6.1
Colonial wars	1190	.4	880	.3	3861	1.5	913	.3
Pre-Revolution, 1763-1776	4840	1.9	3861	1.7	3751	1.4	6534	2.4
Revolution	6780	2.8	4103	1.8	4884	1.7	7293	2.7
Post- Revolution, 1783-1812	17760	7.2	25850	11.6	24365	8.8	23793	8.9
1812-1861	48780	19.8	51590	23.2	46827	17.0	39776	15.0
Civil War	7600	3.1	5863	2.6	7359	2.6	8129	3.0
Period of 1865-1917	91160	38.2	63206	28.4	83254	30.0	65813	32.6
1917 - to the present	43060	17.5	45331	20.4	75213	27.2	85239	32.6
Totals	245,650	100	222,286	100	276,705	100	264,935	100

Table XI is of particular value because of the overall picture it presents. In regard to amounts of wordage, it is seen that Harlow's text ranks highest, the works of Muzzey, Barker and Commager, and Dumond, Dale and Wesley following in the order given. The period, 1865-1917, received the greatest amount of attention in all texts, except that of Muzzey, which gave more wordage to the period, 1917 to the present. None of

the periods prior to 1812-1863 received more than 12 per cent of total space in any book. Clearly, the three periods which received the most stress through wordage were those of 1812-1863, 1865-1917, and 1917 to the present.

TABLE XII

TOTAL SPACE GIVEN TO MILITARY, POLITICAL, AND SOCIAL-  
ECONOMIC HISTORY IN ALL FOUR  
BOOKS

Events	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	No.of words	Per cent	No of words	Per cent	No.of words	Per cent	No.of words	Per cent
Totals -								
Military History	10340	4.0	12045	5.4	20009	7.2	29722	11.2
Polit.History	124820	51.0	97680	44.2	141911	51.2	156398	58.8
Social- Economic History	109830	44.5	112706	51.0	114785	41.2	79815	30.0

According to Table XII, Military History was kept well in the background in all of the four American history textbooks studied. While Muzzey gives it the greatest degree of emphasis, yet the percentage only amounted to 11.2 per cent. Political History comes next, receiving more than 50 per cent of wordage in all of the four texts with the exception of the Dumond, Dale and Wesley textbook.



TABLE XIII  
MILITARY VISUAL AIDS TREATED OF IN ALL  
OF THE  
FOUR BOOKS

Visual Aids	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	Number	Per cent	Number	Per cent	Number	Per cent	Number	Per cent
Pictures:								
Full page	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Half page	4	1.1	5	1.5	2	.6	8	3.9
Less than half	12	3.5	33	9.9	30	9.3	10	4.4
Maps:								
Full page	3	8.0	8	2.4	7	1.8	5	2.2
Half page	1	.2	3	.9	1	.3	5	2.2
Less than half	-	-	2	.6	2	.6	6	2.6
Graphs:								
Full page	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Half page	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Less than half	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Cartoons:								
Full page	1	.2	-	-	-	-	-	-
Half page	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Less than half	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total Military Visual Aids	26	7.5	51	15.4	42	13.0	40	17.5

TABLE XIV  
POLITICAL VISUAL AIDS MENTIONED IN ALL  
FOUR BOOKS

Visual aids	B&O		DD&W		H		M	
	Number	Per cent	Number	Per cent	Number	Per cent	Number	Per cent
<b>Pictures:</b>								
Full page	2	.5	-	-	-	-	8	3.5
Half page	21	6.1	5	1.5	5	1.5	12	5.3
Less than half	28	8.1	44	13.2	80	25.0	39	17.1
<b>Maps:</b>								
Full page	10	2.9	8	2.4	12	3.7	22	9.7
Half page	1	.2	9	2.7	3	.9	8	3.5
Less than half	18	5.2	21	6.3	13	4.0	10	4.4
<b>Graphs:</b>								
Full page	-	-	-	-	3	.9	-	-
Half page	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	.4
Less than half	-	-	-	-	1	.3	1	.4
<b>Cartoons:</b>								
Full page	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Half page	2	.5	-	-	-	-	2	.8
Less than half	3	.8	12	3.6	13	4.0	14	6.1
<b>Total</b>								
Political visual aids	85	24.8	99	30.0	130	40.5	117	51.2

TABLE XV  
SOCIAL-ECONOMIC VISUAL AIDS MENTIONED IN ALL THE  
FOUR BOOKS

Visual Aids	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	Number	Per cent	Number	Per cent	Number	Per cent	Number	Per cent
Pictures:								
Full page	5	1.3	2	.6	1	.3	10	4.4
Half page	45	13.1	9	2.7	11	3.4	11	4.8
Less than half	156	45.5	153	46.0	118	36.8	27	11.9
Maps:								
Full page	5	1.3	2	.6	7	1.8	8	3.5
Half page	8	2.3	2	.6	2	.6	6	2.6
Less than half	6	1.7	10	3.2	1	.3	1	.4
Graphs:								
Full page	2	.5	-	-	-	-	-	-
Half page	3	.8	-	-	4	1.2	-	-
Less than half	3	.8	-	-	3	.9	6	2.6
Cartoons:								
Full pages	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Half pages	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Less than half	-	-	4	1.2	2	.6	2	.8
Total Social-Economic aids								
	233	67.5	182	54.6	149	46.5	71	31.2

TABLE XVI  
PICTURES, MAPS, GRAPHS, AND CARTOONS  
IN ALL FOUR BOOKS

Visual Aids	B&C		DD&W		H		M	
	Number	Per cent	Number	Per cent	Number	per cent	Number	Per cent
Pictures	253	79.5	251	75.7	247	76.2	131	57.5
Maps	52	15.0	65	19.5	48	14.4	71	31.2
Graphs	8	23.0	-	-	11	3.4	8	3.5
Cartoons	11	3.2	16	4.8	15	4.6	18	7.8

A running commentary on Tables XIII, XIV, XV, and XVI nets the following conclusions:

Military Visual Aids were the fewest in all of the four books analyzed in this study. The number of the Social-Economic Visual Aids ~~were~~ greater than were the Political Visual Aids in all of the books except that of Muzzey, which contains a greater amount of space devoted to Political History.

Pictures are the most frequent form of Visual Aid that appears. In all cases, pictures comprise over 50 per cent of the total. In the books by Barker and Commager, Dumond, Dale and Wesley, and Harlow, they totaled over 75 per cent. Maps won a second place, except in the case of Muzzey's work, in which they constituted slightly more than 31 per cent. Cartoons come second, and Graphs constituted a weak third. There were no graphs in the Dumond, Dale and Wesley text.

## CHAPTER IV

### SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

In building up classifications necessary to the study, it was found there was a need to add to the Bagley and Rugg pattern that had been chosen, a fourth period, as based on the time 1917 to the present, so as to allow of the inclusion of recent material in up-to-date texts. From the specific and general categories that emerged, it became possible to make a word count.

It became necessary to exert a considerable amount of judgment in order to be able to place correctly, in the categories chosen for use in this study, the different events of history.

It was the original purpose of this study to see how the four American history textbooks ranked in space given to social-economic history.

The rank in treatment of social-economic history in the four books chosen for analysis has been found to be in the order given, as follows: Dumond, Dale and Wesley came first, Barker and Commager came second, Harlow came third, and Muzzey gave the subject the least amount of treatment.

The text of Harlow, which has the greatest total number of words, contains 276,705; Muzzey's text has 264,935 words; that of Barker and Commager comes third

with 245,650 words, and Dumond, Dale, and Wesley's text has but 222,286 words.

These findings indicate that senior high school American history textbook writers still continue to stress politics and wars to the detriment of social-economic history; however, the text that was shortest in length gave more of its space to social-economic history than to either political or military history.

Cartwright's study sheds light on the nature of texts at other grade levels. This dissertation shows that books at the elementary and junior high school stages are giving greater importance to social history. The trend toward more social-economic history appears to be reasonably well established in the American educational scene.

Visual aids in the teaching of history tend to bring the pupil nearer to what should be his objective in studying history, namely, the real situations that arose in the experience of his ancestry. For this reason, the visual aid content of textbooks should be of a special interest to the teacher of American history.

In analyzing this important visual aid content it was found that military visual aids are fewest in number, in all of the four texts evaluated, with the exception of that of Muzzey.

Muzzey's emphasis upon political visual aids,

to the exclusion of social-economic aids, would seem to indicate an awareness of the motivation problem encountered in the teaching of political history.

## CHAPTER V

### LIMITATIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER STUDY

#### I. LIMITATIONS

The greatest single difficulty in this study consisted in the necessity to use judgment in classifying topics into the three classifications, military, political and social-economic. Care was taken, however, to properly set criteria by which an event could properly be placed. Minor errors may have occurred in the study, but the degree of caution used eliminated major mistakes.

It is amusing to note that although this study expected to reveal a decline of military history, it was built around a traditional chronological outline which went from the Revolution to the War of 1812, to the Civil War, and on to World War I, with an unswerving fidelity to the details of military history.

#### II. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER STUDY

It is realized that there is a crying need of devoting time to the object of seeing that rationalization of events and personalities takes place in right perspective.

1. The first and most important recommendation to be made is that future research students shall keep a



record of the pulse-beats of American history teaching. The make-up of history texts may well change more in the next decade than it has in the past five decades, hence, such a change, or changes, should be scientifically reported.

2. A set of surveys also might be made with the object of revealing two things: as to, whether or not teachers are regularly 'weeding out' social history from their texts in teaching in order to be able to teach political details; also what percentages of these more than 200,000-word books are actually being used?

3. It is suggested that a post-1865 emphasis in American history be placed, since many teachers at the senior high school level are neglecting this part of our history. This would avoid the danger of having pre-1865 events taught to bored students for the third time, simply because a book "must be covered" from the front cover to the back, in the September to June year.

4. A commendable graduate project would be to create a series of books, or pamphlets, on American social history, a phase of American life which texts persist in neglecting. It would seem as if some one should take the initiative in such a valuable task. Moreover, these new writings should be at the correct reading level, and should connect the social life of the past with that of the present. While this suggestion may sound like an over-energetic project,

nevertheless, it is one designed to remedy present miseries. Is it not high time that someone reminded American history writers and teachers that Bowditch, Slater and McKay, for example, are as worthy of being labeled as heroes as were Buchanan, Grant, McKinley and Harding?

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

## A. BOOKS

- Barker, Eugene C., and Henry Steele Commager, Our Nation. Evanston, Illinois: Row, Peterson and Company, 1947. (pp.n.f.)
- Dumond, Dwight L., Edward E. Dale, and Edgar B. Wesley, A History of the United States. Boston: D.C. Heath and Company, 1948. (pp.n.f.)
- Harlow, Ralph Volney, Story of America. New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1949. (pp.n.f.)
- Johnson, Henry. Teaching of History. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1940. 497 pp.
- Muzzey, David Savelle, A History of Our Country. Boston, Massachusetts: Ginn and Company, 1948. 715 pp.
- Rugg, Earle U., Curriculum Studies in the Social Studies and Citizenship. Greeley, Colorado: Colorado State Teachers College Press, 1928. (n.f.)

## B. PUBLICATIONS OF LEARNED ORGANIZATIONS

- Bagley, W.C., and Earle U Rugg. The Content of American History as Taught in the Seventh and Eighth Grades; an Analysis of Typical School Textbooks, Bulletin No.16. Urbana, Illinois, School of Education, University of Illinois, 1915. (pp.n.f.)
- Meredith, Dorothy, "The Changing Content of American History Courses," Chapter III, The Study and Teaching of American History, Richard E. Thursfield, editor. Seventeenth Yearbook of the National Council for the Social Studies, Washington, D.C. (1946), pp.35-58.

## C. UNPUBLISHED MATERIALS

- Cartwright, William H., "A History of the Teaching of American History," unpublished doctor's dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1950. (pp.n.f.)
- Henderson, Georgianna, "An Analysis and Teatment of Selected Events in Twelve Junior High School American History Texts," unpublished Master's thesis, Boston University School of Education, Boston, Massachusetts, 1949. 129 pp.

Israel, Jay Burton, "Certain Issues in American History and Their Treatment in Ten High School Textbooks," unpublished Master's thesis, Boston University School of Education, Boston, Massachusetts, 1948. 102pp.

Murphy, Charles J., "An Analysis of Topics in Junior High School American History Textbooks," unpublished Master's thesis paper, Boston University School of Education, Boston, Massachusetts, 1948. 56 pp.

Neenan, Alfred C., "An Analysis of Visual Aids in Junior High School American History Textbooks," unpublished Master's service paper, Boston University School of Education, Boston, Massachusetts, 1949. (p.n.f.)

O'Leary, James H., "An Analysis of Topics in Junior High School American History Textbooks," unpublished Master's service paper, Boston University School of Education, Boston, Massachusetts, 1948. 67 pp.

Quint, Catherine I., "An Analysis of the People Mentioned in Eight Junior High American History Books," unpublished Master's thesis, Boston University School of Education, Boston, Massachusetts, 1949. 134 pp.

Yagjian, Ralph A., "An Analysis of the People in Junior High School American History Texts," unpublished Master's service paper, Boston University School of Education, Boston, Massachusetts, 1949. 86 pp.