2021

Appendices — A meta-synthesis of qualitative research on reading intervention classes in secondary schools

Appendices for the article "A Meta-Synthesis of Qualitative Research on Reading Intervention Classes in Secondary Schools"

Katherine K. Frankel, Maneka Deanna Brooks, & Julie E. Learned

Teachers College Record, 2021

Appendix A. Overview of Methodology

Research Meta-Question	• How do students experience and perceive RICs?
Search Procedures	• Independent searches of major research databases (e.g., Google Scholar, Education Source) • Multiple keyword combinations (e.g., first round searches: *intervention, literacy/reading/writing, secondary school/high school/middle school, students, qualitative*; second round searches: *Read 180, remedial reading, adolescent*) • Inquiries to academic networks on social media (e.g., Twitter) • Hand searches of established literacy journals, including (1) 10 journals hand searched by Baye et al. (2019): *Reading Research Quarterly*, *Journal of Literacy Research, Scientific Studies of Reading, Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy, Reading & Writing Quarterly, Review of Educational Research, Journal of Educational Psychology, The Journal of Educational Research, American Educational Research Journal, Journal of Research on Educational Effectiveness*; and (2) an additional 10 journals: *Literacy Research and Instruction, English Teaching: Practice and Critique, Teachers College Record, Research in the Teaching of English, English Education, English Journal, Journal of Language and Literacy Education, Journal of Research in Reading, Voices from the Middle, The High School Journal*
Selection and Appraisal Procedures	• First-level screening (i.e., review of titles, abstracts, and keywords): 42 articles published January 2000-December 2020 that fit inclusion criteria • Second-level screening (i.e., review of methods and findings): 35 articles • Third-level screening using an appraisal tool adapted from Berry and Thunder (2012) (see Appendix B): 27 articles • Fourth-level screening to choose one representative article for studies represented in more than one publication: 21 articles

Analysis Procedures	• Collaborative coding of final corpus of 21 studies
	• Multiple phases of analysis, including:
	  ○ Initial coding to capture general features related to students' perspectives and experiences (e.g., first-round codes: *literacy practices, entry/exit criteria*)
	  ○ Individually reading a subset of articles and memoing about emerging themes and preliminary codes (e.g., second-round codes: *identities- ascribed, enacted; positioning- by self, by peers, by teacher; engagement; prior experiences- with reading, with RICs; relationships; assessment; placement; labelling*; *exiting*)
	  ○ Co-creating a code list (see Table 1)
	  ○ Coding the full data set (i.e., findings, discussion of findings)
	  ○ Resolving discrepancies or instances of uncertainty through ongoing analytic group check-ins

Appendix B. Appraisal Tool (adapted with permission from Berry & Thunder, 2012, p. 46)

Criteria	Possible Points	Points Given
1. Research Problem, Purpose, and/or Question a) Problem is stated clearly and related to the research literature b) There is a clear statement of research purpose and/or question(s)	2	
2. Conceptual/Theoretical Framework a) There is a clear statement of the theoretical underpinnings of the work b) These underpinnings clearly inform the methods, findings, and interpretations	2	
3. Method: Data Collection and Analysis a) Study (or portion of study) is methodologically qualitative b) Selection and description of participants is included c) Researcher shows an awareness of their influence on the study (describes experiences and/or assumptions with which the researcher entered the research) d) Data collection procedures are fully described e) Data analysis process is clear with examples f) Techniques for credibility and trustworthiness are addressed	6	
4. Findings a) Interpretations are substantiated with data b) Overall findings address the purpose of the study c) Ideas (themes, categories, concepts, etc.) are precise, well developed, and linked to each other d) Results offer new information, insights, or perspectives	4	
5. Discussion & Implications a) Discussion of interpretations and significant findings are linked to purpose, theoretical underpinnings, and research questions b) Implications include recommendations for theory, research, policy, and/or practice	2	
Total Points	16	

High overall standards of quality and credibility = 11-16 points
Moderate overall standards of quality and credibility = 5-10 points
Low overall standards of quality and credibility = 0-4 points

Appendix C. Key Features of 21 Studies Included in the Qualitative Meta-Synthesis

References	Study Participants	Curricula	Data Sources	Research Questions or Foci
Bippert (2019)	Middle school students, teachers, and administrators	Achieve 3000	Observations; interviews; computer screen recordings	What are the cultural perceptions of tools for administrator, teacher, and student groups in one urban middle level school using a computer-assisted reading intervention program? In what ways do the perceptions of administrators, teachers, and students related to these tools differ?
Brooks & Rodela (2018)	High school students and teacher	Read 180	Observations; interviews; artifacts	What were the official entry and exit criteria for ninth-grade reading intervention at Eastbrook High School? How did students enrolled in one section of ninth-grade reading intervention understand these entry and exit criteria?
Cantrell, Pennington, Rintamaa, Osborne, Parker, & Rudd (2017)	High school students	Kentucky Cognitive Literacy Model course	Interviews	What practices, within the context of a supplemental reading course, do students say are most likely to engage them? (a) What activities and tasks that were part of the supplemental intervention resonated with students as engaging? (b) From the students' perspective, how did aspects of the supplemental class influence students' self-beliefs? (c) From students' perspective, how did aspects of the supplemental class influence their learning? (d) How did students perceive that teachers influenced their engagement and learning?
Cantrell & Rintamaa (2020)	High school students and teachers	State-developed curriculum	Observations; interviews	What is the nature of reading engagement, both in and out of school, for rural students who participate in a supplemental reading intervention class?
Frankel (2016)	High school students and teachers	Multiple approaches: • teacher-designed class • University of Kansas Center for Research on Learning's Fusion Reading Program	Observations; interviews; artifacts	How did students' understandings of literacy and their own reading identities interact with the figured worlds of their literacy intervention classrooms?

Gerber, Abrams, Onwuegbuzie, & Benge (2014)	High school students	Teacher/researcher-designed, (video)game-based reader and writer workshops	Teacher/researcher reflections; interviews; questionnaires; artifacts	How can a games-based curriculum that is rooted in connected learning and social constructionism promote equitable and cross-literate experiences? How might the coherence of peer interaction and literate activities provide insight into student meaning making?
Ginsberg (2020)	High school student	Read 180	Interviews	How does a struggling reader describe her experiences in four different English courses? What do her storied experiences suggest about perceptions of her and others' positioning of her as a reader?
Goering & Baker (2010)	High school students	Teacher- and researcher-designed dramatic oral reading intervention	Observations; interviews; reading assessments	Is dramatic oral reading effective in improving comprehension abilities amongst tenth graders and how does the social context of the class impact those activities?
Gomez, Stone, & Hobbel (2004)	Middle school students and teacher	Accelerated Reader + writing workshop	Observations; interviews; focus groups; artifacts	How do students use reading, writing, and media to resist becoming "disciplined" and "remedied" by school? How might we use insights gained from analyzing students' tactical literacies to build what Lankshear and Knobel (2002) call a "pedagogy of tactics"?
Greenleaf, Schoenbach, Cziko, & Mueller (2001)	High school students	Reading Apprenticeship's Academic Literacy course	Observations; interviews; focus groups; reading surveys; artifacts; reading assessments	Description of an instructional framework, Reading Apprenticeship, and a ninth-grade Academic Literacy course grounded in the framework; discussion of students' reading development, including a detailed analysis of one student's reading of an academic text.
Harmon, Wood, Smith, Zakaria, Ramadan, & Sykes (2016)	High school students and teachers	Multiple approaches: • teacher-designed classes • district- or state-developed programs	Interviews	What views do students enrolled in high school reading classes have about themselves as readers and about the reading instruction? What are the perceptions of high school reading teachers about their students and about their reading instructional practices? How are these perceptions similar or different? What do teachers and students have to say about reading in the content areas?

Houchen (2013)	High school students	Teacher/researcher-designed class	Observations; focus groups; artifacts; standardized test scores; in-class assessments; teacher/researcher reflective journal	Description of a conceptual framework and guiding principles for instruction in a high school intensive reading course; discussion of students' perspectives on the course and how those perspectives contributed to the course design.
Learned (2016)	High school students, teachers, and literacy coach	Read 180	Observations; interviews; literacy assessments; artifacts; school records	What school institutional contexts appear to mediate struggling youth readers' demonstration of reading-related practices, identities, and skills? What school institutional contexts do youths, teachers, and I identify? Why and how do the identified institutional contexts appear to mediate struggling youth readers' demonstration of reading-related practices, identities, and skills?
Masterson (2020)	High school students and teacher	District-developed curriculum	Observations; interviews	What are students in a remedial reading class learning about the nature of literacy? How does their compulsory membership in this program impact their sense of identity?
O'Brien, Beach, & Scharber (2007)	Middle school students	Read 180 + teacher-designed, media-rich literacy activities	Observations; interviews; focus groups; talk-alouds; reading assessments	How do students' perceptions of the value and purpose of different media-rich projects, in comparison to more traditional pedagogy, relate to their levels of engagement in those projects? How do the media-rich activities help learners connect their various lived worlds and how do these activities transform their sense of competence and agency, particularly as competence has been defined in relation to traditional print-based activities?
Paterson & Elliott (2006)	High school students	Teacher/researcher-designed class	Observations; interviews; artifacts	Examination of the perceptions and responses of ninth-grade readers who tutored second- and third-grade readers in a cross-age tutoring program that was part of an existing reading class.

Patterson, Eubank, Rathbun, & Noble (2010)	Secondary school students, teachers, counselor, and reading coordinator; school- and district-level administrators	University of Kansas Center for Research on Learning's Strategic Instruction Model literacy course	Observations; interviews; focus groups; artifacts	Description of the implementation of a district-initiated adolescent literacy course in two schools; discussion of the complexities of understanding and implementing such a reform at multiple levels.
Sarroub & Pernicek (2014)	High school students	Teacher-modified classes; unspecified curriculum	Observations; interviews; artifacts	Description of three high school boys' unique individualities and how they view themselves, their schooling, and their literate lives, including what it means to be a young man in a high school reading class.
Skerrett (2012)	High school students and teacher	Teacher-designed class	Observations; interviews; artifacts	Description of one student's multiple reading identities and engagement in diverse literacy experiences; description of the pedagogical practices in the student's ninth-grade reading classroom that supported her to reconstruct a strong reading identity.
Wexler, Reed, & Sturges (2015)	Students, teachers, and administrators at juvenile correctional facilities	Multilevel reading classes focused on lower-level skills	Observations; interviews; student focus groups; student surveys	What are incarcerated adolescents' perceptions of themselves as readers? What are incarcerated adolescents' perceptions of the importance of reading? What reading instruction do these students and their teachers report is implemented in the [juvenile correctional settings] and perceived as beneficial? To what extent are student views of and actual reading instruction aligned?
Wissman, Costello, & Hamilton (2012)	Middle school students and teacher	Teacher-designed class	Observations; interviews with students and teacher; artifacts	Exploration of the experiences and literacy practices of one student in an eighth-grade reading support class that incorporated multimodal literacies.